

# Minutes

## Policy and Sustainability Committee

10.00 am, Thursday 20 August 2020

### Present

Councillors McVey (Convener), Day (Vice-Convener), Aldridge, Kate Campbell, Doran (substituting for Councillor Wilson), Fullerton (substituting for Councillor Rankin – items 13-17), Gardiner, Gloyer, Hutchison, Key (Substituting for Councillor Rankin – items 1-12), Lang (substituting for Councillor Gloyer – items 12-17) Johnston (substituting for Councillor Cook – items 1-11), Macinnes, Burgess (substituting for Councillor Main), Mitchell (substituting for Councillor McLellan), Perry, Smith (substituting for Councillor Cook – items 12-17), Staniforth, Webber and Whyte.

### 1. Minutes

---

#### Decision

To approve the minute of the Policy and Sustainability Committee of 6 August 2020 as a correct record.

### 2. Policy and Sustainability Committee Work Programme

---

The Policy and Sustainability Committee Work Programme for 6 August 2020 was presented.

#### Decision

- 1) To note the work programme.
- 2) To agree that Committee Services would issue diary invites for Agenda Planning Meetings and all Committees as soon as possible.

(Reference – Work Programme 20 August 2020, submitted.)

### 3. Policy and Sustainability Committee Rolling Actions Log

---

Details were provided of the outstanding actions arising from decisions taken by the Committee.

#### Decision

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
  - **Action 7** - City of Edinburgh Council - Motions by Councillors Staniforth and Gordon - Fireworks and Fireworks Legislation

Thursday, 20th August, 2020

- **Action 16** – Creating Safe spaces for Walking and Cycling
  - **Action 17(3)** – Decisions Taken Under Delegated Power and Operational Decision Making – Covid-19
  - **Action 22(1&2)** – Schools Re-Opening Update
  - **Action 25** - City of Edinburgh Council – Motion by Councillor Cameron - Impact of Covid-19 on Equalities in Edinburgh
  - **Action 27** – City of Edinburgh Council – Motion by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron – Liberton Primary School
  - **Action 29** – Community Centres Re-Opening
  - **Action 31(2)** – Transport Infrastructure Investment – Capital Deliver for Priorities for 2020/21
  - **Action 39** - Spaces for People Initiative - Motion by Councillor Macinnes
  - **Action 40** – Response to Motion on Black Lives Matter
  - **Action 45** – Concept Masterplan for Waverley Station
  - **Action 36** – Revenue Budget 2020/21 Update
  - **Action 26** – City of Edinburgh Council – Motion by Councillor Rust – Engagement with Employees
- 2) To note that expected completion date for - **Action 21** – Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update – would be updated to September 2020.
  - 3) To note that **Action 13** – Neighbourhood Alliance – Grant Funding Payment would go to Housing, Homelessness and Fairwork Committee in November rather than September.
  - 4) To note that a briefing note relating to **Action 33** – Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update – would be circulated week commencing 24 August.
  - 5) To otherwise note the Rolling Actions Log.

(Reference – Rolling Actions Log, submitted.)

#### **4. Adaptation and Renewal Programme Update**

---

As agreed at the Policy and Sustainability Committee on 28 May 2020, the Adaptation and Renewal Programme would provide regular committee updates. This update was the fourth report to Committee on progress and covered decisions taken in period 16 July to 13 August 2020, the latest COVID-19 Dashboard and a general programme update.

## Decision

- 1) To note the COVID-19 Response Dashboard outlined at Appendix 1 of the report.
- 2) To note the decisions taken to date under urgency provisions from 16 July 2020 to 13 August 2020 outlined at Appendix 2 of the report.
- 3) To note the overall programme update and further indicative dates for Phase 3 outlined in Appendix 3 of the report.
- 4) To agree to provide details of when the leaflet was designed and printed with reference to D181.
- 5) To agree to provide a briefing note on the traffic data at Morningside Station.
- 6) To agree to circulate the briefing on what the plan was for the flu vaccination in the City of Edinburgh which included the timeline for public engagement and public announcement of the plan.
- 7) To note that the Executive Director for Communities and Families would liaise with the Chief Social Work Officer regarding adult protection concerns referrals and would provide further information to Committee if required.

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 28 May 2020 (item 4); report by the Chief Executive, submitted.)

## 5. Annual Performance 2019/20

---

Details were provided on the Council's service performance which continued to measure performance with numerical indicators but also provided members and citizens with a more rounded and wider view of service area performance in 2019/20.

## Motion

- 1) To note the annual performance report for the 2019/20 financial year.
- 2) To refer the annual performance report to the City of Edinburgh Council on 25 August.
- 3) To note that the development of a revised performance framework was underway as part of the A&R programme and the development of a revised Council Business Plan.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

## Amendment 1

To add to the motion:

**Thursday, 20th August, 2020**

To note that the Council had been assessed for its regular Best Value Report this year and was awaiting the final Report and requested that the Chief Executive made inquiries as to when we should expect the findings and that these were incorporated into the development of the revised performance framework and a Best Value Improvement Plan that sought to address areas of Council service where performance improvement was required

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Johnston

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 1 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## **Amendment 2**

To add to the motion:

- 1) To note with serious concern that 27 of the Council's performance indicators showed that performance had declined in the last year and that significant performance challenges remained across the Council.
- 2) To further note that there were 18 council performance areas for which performance was greater than 5% behind the required target or trend and were flagged as having 'Red' status and also 15 areas for which performance was behind target or trend and were flagged as having 'Amber' status.
- 3) To request that a briefing note was circulated to Councillors prior to the Full Council meeting on 25 August 2020 at which this report would be further considered, detailing what plans were in place for each one of these areas to improve performance to within target levels, the expected date for achieving the target or trend and indicating who was the responsible officer.
- 4) To further note that following the Council's decision to adopt a net zero by 2030 target last year, the target for carbon emission reduction of 42% by 2020 had been superseded and was required to be updated.
- 5) To therefore request that revised targets for emissions reduction, specifying the annual increments required to achieve net zero by 2030, were brought forward as a matter of urgency.

- moved by Councillor Burgess, seconded by Councillor Mary Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), the amendment paragraphs 1, 2, 3 and 5 were accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the annual performance report for the 2019/20 financial year.

- 2) To refer the annual performance report to the City of Edinburgh Council on 25 August.
- 3) To note that the development of a revised performance framework was underway as part of the A&R programme and the development of a revised Council Business Plan.
- 4) To note that the Council had been assessed for its regular Best Value Report this year and was awaiting the final Report and requested that the Chief Executive made inquiries as to when we should expect the findings and that these were incorporated into the development of the revised performance framework and a Best Value Improvement Plan that sought to address areas of Council service where performance improvement was required.
- 5) To note with serious concern that 27 of the Council's performance indicators showed that performance had declined in the last year and that significant performance challenges remained across the Council.
- 6) To further note that there were 18 council performance areas for which performance was greater than 5% behind the required target or trend and were flagged as having 'Red' status and also 15 areas for which performance was behind target or trend and were flagged as having 'Amber' status.
- 7) To request that a briefing note was circulated to Councillors prior to the Full Council meeting on 25 August 2020 at which this report would be further considered, detailing what plans were in place for each one of these areas to improve performance to within target levels, the expected date for achieving the target or trend and indicating who was the responsible officer.
- 8) To therefore request that revised targets for emissions reduction, specifying the annual increments required to achieve net zero by 2030, were brought forward as a matter of urgency.

(Reference - report by the Chief Executive, submitted.)

## **6. Coalition Commitments Progress Update – August 2020**

---

The Council had approved its business plan (A Programme for the Capital: The City of Edinburgh Council's Business Plan 2017-22) in August 2017. The plan had been built around 52 commitments the Council Administration had pledged to deliver over five years.

Details were provided on the progress of the plan against the 52 Coalition Commitments in the third year of the Administration.

### **Motion**

- 1) To note the progress at August 2020 on delivering the 52 Coalition Commitments that the Council had committed to deliver by end 2022 (Appendix A of the report).

- 2) To note the steps that would be taken in 2020/21 to progress delivery of the commitments.
- 3) To refer the Coalition Commitments progress update report to the City of Edinburgh Council for consideration on 25 August 2020.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

### **Amendment 1**

To refer simpliciter to Full Council for discussion.

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Johnston

### **Amendment 2**

- 1) To note the progress at August 2020 on delivering the 52 coalition commitments that the Council had committed to deliver by end 2022 (Appendix A of the report).
- 2) To note the steps that would be taken in 2020/21 to progress delivery of the commitments.
- 3) To refer the Coalition Commitments progress update report to the City of Edinburgh Council for consideration on 25 August 2020.
- 4) To note that the use of the term “partially achieved” was so all-encompassing as to be misleading, examples included (but not limited to):
  - Devolution of powers to Locality Committees being listed as “partially achieved” when the Coalition decided to abolish those committees in 2019
  - Street cleanliness being listed as “partially achieved” when fly-tipping was up, street cleanliness was below target and free bulk waste pick up had not been introduced.
- 5) To note the generous use of “fully achieved” against items such as “fair rent zones” when, disappointingly, no Rent Pressure Zone had happened and the Fair Rents (Scotland) Bill was not being progressed in Parliament; and warmly welcomed the prospect of both a Transient Visitor Levy and Workplace Parking Levy, but considered their labelling as “fully achieved” to be premature.
- 6) To note a reluctance to use the “will not be achieved” category, for example, for the regrettable decline in recycling rate to 41% against a target of 60%; and the participatory budgeting percentage falling to 0 against a target of 1%.
- 7) To recognise that the annual commitments report appeared increasingly dated in the context of the twin strategic imperatives of navigating through the coronavirus crisis and the need to deliver on the Council’s net zero carbon commitment by 2030; and therefore considered the emerging priorities within a Green Recovery programme had far greater salience than commitments entered into in a very different context; therefore further believed that the Coalition should urgently refresh its commitments.

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Burgess

## **Voting**

### **First Vote**

The voting was as follows:

For the Motion	-	8 votes
For Amendment 1	-	7 votes
For Amendment 2	-	2 votes

(For the Motion: Councillors Campbell, Day, Gardiner, Key, Macinnes, McVey, Perry and Doran.

For Amendment 1: Councillors Aldridge, Gloyer, Hutchison, Johnston, Mitchell, Webber and Whyte.

For Amendment 2: Councillors Burgess and Staniforth.)

There being no overall majority, Amendment 2 fell and a second vote was taken between the Motion and Amendment 1.

### **Second Vote**

The voting was as follows:

For the Motion	-	8 votes
For Amendment 1	-	7 votes

(For the Motion: Councillors Campbell, Day, Gardiner, Key, Macinnes, McVey, Perry and Doran.

For Amendment 1: Councillors Aldridge, Gloyer, Hutchison, Johnston, Mitchell, Webber and Whyte

Abstentions: Councillors Burgess and Staniforth)

### **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey.

(Reference - report by the Chief Executive, submitted.)

## **7. Local Government Benchmarking Framework 2018/19 – Edinburgh Overview**

---

An overview analysis of the 2018/19 benchmarking data provided by the Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) was provided.

## **Motion**

To note the report setting out the detailed analysis of the Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) benchmarking framework dataset for the 18/19 financial year.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

## **Amendment**

To request a further report setting out a wider review of the data available to seek and implement best practice examples from colleague Councils (not limited to Scotland) and foster a new continuous improvement culture within the Council.

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Johnston

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), the Amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the report setting out the detailed analysis of the Scottish Local Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) benchmarking framework dataset for the 18/19 financial year.
- 2) To request a further report setting out a wider review of the data available to seek and implement best practice examples from colleague Councils (not limited to Scotland) and foster a new continuous improvement culture within the Council, and the scope of this report to be discussed at the APOG in order to clarify with officers how this would be brought forward.

(Reference - report by the Chief Executive, submitted.)

## **8. Update on Liberton Primary School**

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Cameron agreed at City of Edinburgh Council on 30 June 2020, an update setting out the timescale and progress made to date on the rebuilding and refurbishing of Liberton Primary School to a quality and Standard which met 2020 guidelines for class sizes and communal areas; and which also created the necessary additional space to accommodate continually rising school rolls was provided.

## **Motion**

To note the City of Edinburgh Council Motion on the 30 June 2020 to agree an update report to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in three cycles setting out the timescale and progress made to date on the rebuilding and refurbishing of Liberton Primary School.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

## Amendment

To add to the motion:

To agree that further updates on the rebuilding and refurbishing of Liberton Primary School would be provided to the Education Children & Families Committee.

- moved by Councillor Burgess, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 1 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## Decision

The approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the City of Edinburgh Council Motion on the 30 June 2020 to agree an update report to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in three cycles setting out the timescale and progress made to date on the rebuilding and refurbishing of Liberton Primary School.
- 2) To agree that further updates on the rebuilding and refurbishing of Liberton Primary School would be provided to the Education Children & Families committee.

(References – Act of Edinburgh Council (No 19), 30 June 2020; report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families, submitted.)

## 9. Resumption of Youth Work Services

---

In response to the Covid-19 pandemic, the Council took the decision to close all non-essential buildings, including all centres and venues offering youth work. The challenges, risks and considerations which needed to be taken into account in resuming youth work services were provided.

Further details on the plans for future CEC youth work services, including indoor activity, would be included in the wider action plans to emerge from the Adaptation and Renewal workstream on Operations and Services were provided.

## Decision

- 1) To note the youth work that had taken place under lockdown to date and the further work which was proposed.
- 2) To note the approach being adopted to resume safely City of Edinburgh Council youth work in outdoor spaces.
- 3) To approve that further details on the resumption and prioritisation of wider youth work services were included in the action plans which would emerge from the Adaptation and Renewal workstream on Operations and Services.

- 4) To note that preparations were underway for the resumption of indoor youth work once the Scottish Government Guidance permitted this.
- 5) To note that the Policy and Sustainability Committee had agreed that access to community centres for resources to support detached youth work provision, i.e. non-building based, could be approved.
- 6) To note the work going on to encourage youth work in schools given its important role in the education recovery process.

(Reference - report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families, submitted.)

## **10. Victoria Primary School, Newhaven Main St, Newhaven, Edinburgh EH6 4HY – Community Asset Transfer**

---

Approval was sought to dispose of Victoria Primary School to Heart of Newhaven (HoN) on terms as specified in the Community Asset Transfer (CAT) request which were outlined in the report. The proposed sale was a Community Asset Transfer under Part Five of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.

### **Decision**

To approve the disposal of Victoria Primary School to Heart of Newhaven (HoN) on the terms outlined in the report and on such other terms and conditions to be agreed by the Executive Director of Resources.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Resources, submitted.)

## **11. St Oswald's Hall, 41 Montpelier Park, Edinburgh EH10 4NH – Community Asset Transfer**

---

### **a) Ward Councillors**

In accordance with Standing Order 28.1, the Convener agreed to hear a presentation from Ward Councillor Watt in relation to the report on St Oswald's Hall, 41 Montpelier Park, Edinburgh EH10 4NH. Councillor Watt spoke in support of the proposal and noted the proposal had support within the community.

### **b) Report by the Executive Director of Resources**

Approval was sought to dispose of St Oswald's Hall, 41 Montpelier Park, Edinburgh to Bruntsfield St Oswald's Ltd on terms as specified in the Community Asset Transfer (CAT) request which were outlined in the report. The proposed sale was a Community Asset Transfer under Part Five of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.

### **Decision**

To approve the disposal of St Oswald's Hall to Bruntsfield St Oswald's Ltd on the terms outlined in the report and on such other terms and conditions to be agreed by the Executive Director of Resources.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Resources, submitted.)

### **Declaration of Interests**

Councillor Key declared a non-financial interest as the parent of children attended Bruntsfield Primary School.

## **12. 15a Pennywell Court and 15 Pennywell Court, Edinburgh, EH4 4TZ – Community Asset Transfer**

---

Approval was sought to dispose of 15a Pennywell Court and part of 15 Pennywell Court to North Edinburgh Arts (NEA) on terms as specified in the Community Asset Transfer (CAT) request which were outlined in the report. The proposed sale was a Community Asset Transfer under Part Five of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.

### **Motion**

- 1) To approve the disposal of 15a Pennywell Court to North Edinburgh Arts (NEA) on the terms outlined in 4.9 in the report and on such terms and conditions to be agreed by the Executive Director of Resources.
- 2) To note the section outlined in the report as part of 15 Pennywell Court was currently occupied by part of the existing Library and would be a shared access space in the future designs and agree to retain this section of land in Council ownership.
- 3) To note the Council's future interests in the wider regeneration proposals would be protected by a proposed Development Agreement with NEA should Committee agree to the Community Asset Transfer and requested that the Development Agreement would ensure that shared access mentioned in point 1.2 would be taken forward in partnership by the Council, taking forward with NEA to meet their access needs and any others relevant to the development of Macmillan Square.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

### **Amendment**

- 1) To approve the disposal of 15a Pennywell Court and part of 15 Pennywell Court to North Edinburgh Arts (NEA) on the terms outlined in the report and on such other terms and conditions to be agreed by the Executive Director of Resources
- 2) To note that the Council's future interests in the wider regeneration proposals would be protected by a proposed Development Agreement with NEA should Committee agree to the Community Asset Transfer.

- moved by Councillor Hutchison, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

## Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	8 votes
For the amendment	-	9 votes

(For the motion: Councillors McVey (Convener), Kate Campbell, Day, Key, Doran, Gardiner, Macinnes and Perry)

For the amendment: Councillors Aldridge, Burgess, Gloyer, Hutchison, Johnston, Mitchell, Staniforth, Webber and Whyte.)

## Decision

To approve the amendment by Councillor Hutchison.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Resources, submitted.)

## 13. Spaces for People Initiative – Response to Motion

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Macinnes, evidence was outlined from UK and international research which looked at the economic impact for high street businesses when walking and cycling was prioritised and provision for vehicles was reduced.

### Motion

- 1) To note UK and international evidence and case studies showing the beneficial economic impacts to businesses in high streets when space for walking and cycling was prioritised.
- 2) To note the relevance of this evidence to the Spaces for People initiative along with existing and emerging transport policy in the city.
- 3) To note the ongoing commitment to engage with businesses and evaluate impacts from the Spaces for People programme to inform medium to longer term sustainable transport and public realm investment
- 4) To agree to provide an update to Committee on the work regarding Local Champion Networks.
- 5) To agree to provide a briefing note regarding the Dublin specific example on the area of Dublin the study related to and details of the measures that had been put in place.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

### Amendment

- 1) To note the report

Thursday, 20th August, 2020

- 2) To note that the report failed to provide the balanced analysis called for the by the Conservative Group at the time of instigation
- 3) To call for improved consultation and engagement to be carried out regularly with businesses that took account of their comments and evidence of the real impact of the Spaces for People programme on business sustainability.
- 4) To call for the details on the evaluation methodology to be published and made available to members of the Policy and Sustainability Committee within one cycle.
- 5) To agree to provide an update to Committee on the work regarding Local Champion Networks.
- 6) To agree to provide a briefing note regarding the Dublin specific example on the area of Dublin the study related to and details of the measures that had been put in place.

- moved by Councillor Webber, seconded by Councillor Mitchell

### **Voting**

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	12 votes
For the amendment	-	5 votes

(For the motion: Councillors McVey (Convener), Aldridge, Burgess, Kate Campbell, Day, Doran, Gardiner, Key, Lang, Macinnes, Perry and Staniforth.)

For the amendment: Councillors, Hutchison, Mitchell, Smith, Webber and Whyte.)

### **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey.

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 23 July 2020 (item 19); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

## **14. Spaces for People – Programme Update**

---

### **a) Deputation – Craigmount-East Craigs-North Gyle-Drumbrae Residents group**

A written deputation was circulated to Committee on behalf of Craigmount-East Craigs-North Gyle-Drumbrae Residents group.

The deputation wished to make clear their unambiguous objection to the planned changes to the road network in East Craigs and Craigmount outlined in the Spaces for People / Low Traffic Neighbourhood initiative. The deputation urged Committee not to dismiss the overwhelming and rapidly growing number of

objections to these proposals, or to underestimate the strength of feeling among a large number of residents.

**b) Report by the Executive Director of Place**

Policy and Sustainability Committee approved creating safe spaces for walking and cycling in May 2020 in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. An update on the schemes implemented by a Temporary Traffic Regulation Order (TTRO), under delegated authority and recommended continuation of each scheme was provided.

An update was also provided on the prioritised project list, details of the prioritisation scoring arrangements and a map of all proposed schemes

**Motion**

- 1) To note the project list relating to Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders (TTROs) promoted to create safe spaces for people to walk and cycle in the city, as part of the Spaces for People programme.
- 2) To approve the recommendations for the existing schemes as set out in Table 1 of the report.
- 3) To note the Programme Priority Scheme list as described in Appendix 1 of the report.
- 4) To note the Programme Scoring Criteria (Appendix 2) and the Priority Scoring Sheet (Appendix 3 of the report).
- 5) To note that low traffic neighbourhoods were listed as part of the Spaces for People (SfP) Programme in the 11th June 2020 Policy and Sustainability Committee update and no party proposed the removal of this as part of the SfP approach.
- 6) To reaffirm that low traffic neighbourhoods should continue to be taken forward by officers as part of SfP for reasons of public health and public safety.
- 7) To note some residents in East Craigs had expressed concerns relating to the lack of public consultation on the proposed low traffic neighbourhood for their area. To further note the current process of stakeholder engagement for the rollout of SfP projects and that widescale public consultation unfortunately could not be part of that process due to the need to act quickly
- 8) To therefore agree that as well as moving forward with the SfP low traffic neighbourhood proposals, also agree to accelerate the permanent TRO process for East Craigs low traffic neighbourhood to the earliest possible time to allow full public consultation to take place at the earliest opportunity with residents as part of the permanent TRO process.
- 9) To note that a supplementary note on 7 town centre TTROs would be circulated.

- 10) To note that discussions would be held offline regarding Carrington Road and details would be circulated to Inverleith Ward Councillors.
- 11) To note that the Executive Director of Place would have discussions with relevant officers to look at the relationship between the different measures in the Braid Road area of the City to review what would be taken forward and members would be informed of results of those discussions.
- 12) To note that details would be provided to confirm who the data owner for the Commonplace mapping tool was.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

### Amendment 1

- 1) To note, with regret that the Council continued to focus on quantity rather than quality of schemes and, that some schemes reduced the attractiveness of high streets and did not deliver the high-quality schemes that would enhance the City.
- 2) To note the widespread dissatisfaction with several schemes from the communities that they would affect and impact directly and that residents' views had been largely overlooked.
- 3) To call for the immediate re-opening of Braid Road, Silverknowes Road, Links Gardens, Cammo Walk, Warriston Road and Stanley Street/ Hope Street listed in Table 1 of the report
- 4) To call for the immediate termination of the following schemes, from Appendix 1 Prioritised Scheme List either due to them being "on hold" or that the schemes were yet to be implemented, published or reach the deadline for stakeholder comment.
- 5) The note with concern that several of the schemes had been identified as having a negative impact on the ability of Emergency Services to respond to incidents and access to emergency care settings

Location	Intervention	Estimated Cost
Newington Corridor	Subject to design	TBA
Telford Road	Cycle Segregation	HOLD
Melville Drive	Cycle Segregation	HOLD
Wester Hailes Road	Cycle Segregation	HOLD
Kingston Avenue	Road Closure	HOLD
Comiston Road	Cycle Segregation	£115,000
Inglis Green Road	Cycle Segregation	£98,000
Pennywell Road	Cycle Segregation	£129,000
Quiet Corridor – Meadows/ Greenbank	Closures	£29,000
Queensferry Road	TBA	£81,000
A1 Corridor	TBA	£70,000
Slateford Road	Cycle Segregation	£48,000
Lanark Road	Cycle Segregation	£165,000

Murrayburn Road	Cycle Segregation	£12,000
East Craigs LTN	Closures / Bus Gates	£66,000
Granton Square / Gypsy Brae	Cycle Segregation	£111,000
Carrington Road	Road Closure	HOLD

- 6) To request the budget allocation against each of the above schemes, totalling £924k, to be re-allocated to enhance and improve the current schemes and tackle their limitations.
- 7) The request an update to either Policy and Sustainability Committee or Transport and Environment Committee, whichever was soonest, on the impact of the active Spaces for People schemes on winter maintenance and preparedness including but not limited to street sweeping, gully cleaning and road and footpath maintenance.
- 8) To note that a supplementary note on 7 town centre TTROs would be circulated.
- 9) To note that discussions would be held offline regarding Carrington Road and details would be circulated to Inverleith Ward Councillors.
- 10) To note that the Executive Director of Place would have discussions with relevant officers to look at the relationship between the different measures in the Braid Road area of the City to review what would be taken forward and members would be informed of results of those discussions.
- 11) To note that details would be provided to confirm who the data owner for the Commonplace mapping tool was.

- moved by Councillor Webber, seconded by Councillor Mitchell

## **Amendment 2**

Insert additional points at the end of recommendations:

- 1) To request, in recognition of the flexible approach taken to design, implementation and alterations in situ, that the next update report to the Transport and Environment Committee should include an interim appraisal of the measures implemented by the programme, insight gained into the benefit of rapid delivery versus detailed preparatory work, in order to inform future approaches to interventions for walking, wheeling and cycling.
- 2) To agree that the Council Leader continued to make representation to the Scottish Government regarding increasing funding for Spaces for People Programme.
- 3) To note that a supplementary note on 7 town centre TTROs would be circulated.
- 4) To note that discussions would be held offline regarding Carrington Road and details would be circulated to Inverleith Ward Councillors.
- 5) To note that the Executive Director of Place would have discussions with relevant officers to look at the relationship between the different measures in the Braid

Road area of the City to review what would be taken forward and members would be informed of results of those discussions.

- 6) To note that details would be provided to confirm who the data owner for the Commonplace mapping tool was.

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Burgess

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 2 was accepted as an addendum to the motion

### **Amendment 3**

Replace 1.1.2 with the following:

- 1) To approve the recommendations for the existing schemes as set out in table 1 of the report with the following exceptions;
  - in recognition of the significant issues which had arisen from the closure of Braid Road, agreed that this road should be re-opened as a priority and the planned improvements progressed, along with an uphill cycle lane and traffic calming measures.
  - believed there was insufficient evidence to justify the ongoing closure of Silverknowes Road and therefore agreed that this road should be re-opened, with appropriate cycleways installed and an investigation into the installation of additional pedestrian crossings.
  - agreed to the continued closure of Warriston Road but sought a full review in advance of the next scheduled Committee approval in light of ongoing delivery access issues.
- 2) To note the substantial concern expressed by residents in Craigmount, East Craigs and North Gyle over the proposed spaces for people changes in these communities and believed it was inappropriate to use the emergency five-day consultation process for this significant set of proposals; and therefore agreed not to proceed with these changes until a full public consultation and engagement programme was carried out and a report submitted to the Transport and Environment Committee.
- 3) To reaffirm the Committee's decision that every Spaces for People project should come to the first Transport and Environment Committee meeting that followed the two-month point of that project being put in place, with a recommendation to either continue or end the scheme; and for a similar report on that project to come to Committee every two-months thereafter.
- 4) To note that a supplementary note on 7 town centre TTROs would be circulated.
- 5) To note that discussions would be held offline regarding Carrington Road and details would be circulated to Inverleith Ward Councillors.

**Thursday, 20th August, 2020**

- 6) To note that the Executive Director of Place would have discussions with relevant officers to look at the relationship between the different measures in the Braid Road area of the City to review what would be taken forward and members would be informed of results of those discussions.
- 7) To note that details would be provided to confirm who the data owner for the Commonplace mapping tool was.

- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Aldridge

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), paragraph 3 of Amendment 3 was accepted as an addendum to the motion

### **Voting**

The voting was as follows:

For the motion (as adjusted)	-	10 votes
For Amendment 1	-	5 votes
For Amendment 3	-	2 votes

(For the motion (as adjusted): Councillors McVey (Convener), Burgess, Kate Campbell, Day, Doran, Fullerton, Gardiner, Macinnes, Staniforth, and Perry

For amendment 1: Councillors Hutchison, Mitchell, Smith, Webber and Whyte

For amendment 2: Councillors Aldridge and Lang.)

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To note the project list relating to Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders (TTROs) promoted to create safe spaces for people to walk and cycle in the city, as part of the Spaces for People programme.
- 2) To approve the recommendations for the existing schemes as set out in Table 1 of the report.
- 3) To note the Programme Priority Scheme list as described in Appendix 1 of the report.
- 4) To note the Programme Scoring Criteria (Appendix 2 of the report) and the Priority Scoring Sheet (Appendix 3 of report).
- 5) To note that low traffic neighbourhoods were listed as part of the Spaces for People (SfP) Programme in the 11th June 2020 Policy and Sustainability Committee update and no party proposed the removal of this as part of the SfP approach.

- 6) To reaffirm that low traffic neighbourhoods should continue to be taken forward by officers as part of SfP for reasons of public health and public safety
- 7) To note some residents in East Craigs had expressed concerns relating to the lack of public consultation on the proposed low traffic neighbourhood for their area. To further note the current process of stakeholder engagement for the rollout of SfP projects and that widescale public consultation unfortunately cannot be part of that process due to the need to act quickly.
- 8) To therefore agree that as well as moving forward with the SfP low traffic neighbourhood proposals, to also agree to accelerate the permanent TRO process for East Craigs low traffic neighbourhood to the earliest possible time to allow full public consultation to take place at the earliest opportunity with residents as part of the permanent TRO process.
- 9) To request, in recognition of the flexible approach taken to design, implementation and alterations in situ, that the next update report to the Transport and Environment Committee should include an interim appraisal of the measures implemented by the programme, insight gained into the benefit of rapid delivery versus detailed preparatory work, in order to inform future approaches to interventions for walking, wheeling and cycling.
- 10) To agree that the Council Leader continued to make representation to the Scottish Government regarding increasing funding for Spaces for People Programme.
- 11) To reaffirm the Committee's decision that every spaces for people project should come to the first Transport and Environment Committee meeting that followed the two-month point of that project being put in place, with a recommendation to either continue or end the scheme; and for a similar report on that project to come to Committee every two-months thereafter.
- 12) To note that a supplementary note on 7 town centre TTROs would be circulated.
- 13) To note that discussions would be held offline regarding Carrington Road and details would be circulated to Inverleith Ward Councillors.
- 14) To note that the Executive Director of Place would have discussions with relevant officers to look at the relationship between the different measures in the Braid Road area of the City to review what would be taken forward and members would be informed of results of those discussions.
- 15) To note that details would be provided to confirm who the data owner for the Commonplace mapping tool was.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

## **15. Coronavirus (COVID-19): Deferral of Licensing Fees**

---

- a) **Deputation – Central Taxis**

A written deputation was circulated to Committee on behalf of Central Taxis.

The deputation stated the Taxi trade had suffered significant hardship as a consequence of Covid-19 and urged Committee to support a further deferral of fees.

**b) Deputation – Unite the Union Cab Branch**

A written deputation was circulated to Committee on behalf of Unite the Union Cab Branch.

The deputation thanked the Council for deferring test fees since March 2020 due to the Taxi Examination Centre being closed which helped their members and non-members financially.

The deputation asked for a reduction in the test fee as some drivers were unable to work until their taxi had passed its test, so they were struggling to finance this and with no facility for licensing to accept a credit card payment, drivers were feeling overwhelmed and were considering their future within the trade.

**c) Report by the Executive Director of Place**

As part of the immediate response to the COVID-19 emergency, an urgent decision was made to defer certain licence fees for three months from 16 March 2020. That deferral period had expired, and the Council had received requests from members of the taxi and private hire car trade to extend the deferral for a further three months (six months in total).

An update was provided on the costs of the measures that were put in place on 16 March and information was provided to assist the Committee to consider the financial implications of a further payment deferral period.

**Decision**

- 1) To note the cost of deferral of licence fee income
- 2) To agree that no further deferral would be offered

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

## **16. Update on Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay 2020/2021**

---

**a) Deputation - New Town & Broughton Community Council, Old Town Community Council, Southside Community Council, West End Community Council, Tollcross Community Council and the Cockburn Association**

A written deputation was circulated to Committee on behalf of New Town & Broughton Community Council, Old Town Community Council, Southside

Community Council, West End Community Council, Tollcross Community Council and the Cockburn Association.

The deputation offered a short analysis and some propositions for consideration by the Committee. The deputation proposed:

- The Council affirmed that in planning and delivering these events, absolute priority would be given to public health and safety. This would require a thorough and open risk analysis, covering inter alia ensuring sufficient security at all venues, as well as means by which the Council and other agencies would monitor the levels and effectiveness of such measures.
- A more ambitious target of 60% was set for the representation of local businesses, micro-businesses and social enterprises in the market, which would also be downsized from the scale of 2019.
- Outlets and stalls in the dispersed market would complement rather than compete with nearby local businesses, most notably in the food and drink sector.
- Approval of the Update on Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay 2020/2021 report should not have any influence on the Council's consideration of any planning or licensing applications.
- Underbelly as contractors would be required to comply with ISO20121 and demonstrate that the events were consistent with Edinburgh's carbon reduction targets.

**b) Report by the Executive Director of Place**

The impact of Covid-19 required the producers of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay to alter plans for both events to meet public health guidelines while still delivering events to celebrate Christmas and Hogmanay. An update was provided on the headline approach for both Christmas and Hogmanay 2020/21.

**Motion**

- 1) To approve the headline approach for delivering Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in 2020/2021.
- 2) To note that the Big Wheel and Star Flyer in East Princes Street Gardens would require Planning Permission and were subject to approval.
- 3) To note that the proposed programme would be developed fully through the Event Planning Operations Group and would be subject to licences being approved by Council officers in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Regulatory Committee.
- 4) To note that the delivery of any events for Christmas and Hogmanay would be dictated by, and depend on, the public health position at that time.
- 5) To note that a full programme launch would take place later in the year for both events.

**Thursday, 20th August, 2020**

- 6) To note that these plans were entirely dependent on public health guidance and if guidance did not support these events they would not go ahead. To request that officers ensured there was no additional financial input from the Council above the existing budget if the plans in part or in full could go ahead.
- 7) To note the recent input by the All Party Oversight Group on the Christmas and Hogmanay proposals and the positive contribution by all parties.
- 8) To welcome that these discussions with elected members helped form the recommendations and commended officers and the operator for the positive way they had engaged in these issues under difficult circumstances
- 9) To agree an update report on how local business can get involved in the Christmas and New year festivals

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Day

**Amendment 1:**

- 1) To approve the headline approach for delivering Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in 2020/2021.
- 2) To note that the proposed programme would be developed fully through the Event Planning Operations Group and would be subject to licences being approved by Council officers in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Regulatory Committee.
- 3) To note that the delivery of any events for Christmas and Hogmanay would be dictated by, and depend on, the public health position at that time.
- 4) To note that a full programme launch would take place later in the year for both events.
- 5) To agree that the above decisions were subject to a full risk assessment being carried out which would consider operational, reputational risks with particular focus on risks to public health which would be reported back to Committee in two cycles; and further increased opportunities for local businesses (both hospitality and retail) to benefit from these events which should include being given priority to take stands at an affordable rate to maximise their opportunities after such a difficult trading year.
- 6) To note that the Big Wheel and Star Flyer in East Princes Street Gardens would require Planning Permission and were subject to approval, but requested that officers continued work to find alternative sites on hard standing to site the Big Wheel and Star Flyer and that this work was reported back to Committee.

- moved by Councillor Mitchell, seconded by Councillor Whyte

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 1 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## Amendment 2

- 1) To approve the headline approach for delivering Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in 2020/2021.
- 2) To note that the Big Wheel and Star Flyer in East Princes Street Gardens will require planning permission and are subject to approval and further notes that committee's preference is that such attractions be held on areas of hard standing rather than public parks. Therefore Acknowledges the work officers have undertaken in finding areas of hard standing, and instructs officers to seek an appropriate area of hard standing for the Big Wheel and Star Flyer - subject to the requirements of contractual obligations and planning permission - and to hold those attractions in East Princes Street Gardens only if there is no possible alternative.
- 3) To note that the proposed programme would be developed fully through the Event Planning Operations Group and would be subject to licences being approved by Council officers in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Regulatory Committee.
- 4) To note that the delivery of any events for Christmas and Hogmanay would be dictated by, and depend on, the public health position at that time.
- 5) To note that a full programme launch would take place later in the year for both events.

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Burgess

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 2 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## Amendment 3

- 1) To approve the headline approach for delivering Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in 2020/2021.
- 2) To note that the Big Wheel and Star Flyer in East Princes Street Gardens would require Planning Permission and were subject to approval.
- 3) To note that the proposed programme would be developed fully through the Event Planning Operations Group and would be subject to licences being approved by Council officers in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Regulatory Committee.
- 4) To note paragraphs 4.22-4.25 of the report that outlined how events would operate within health guidance; recognised that current guidance might change between now and late November 2020 and that the report confirmed significant work was required to finalise detailed planning including possible crowd control; therefore sought a further report with that detail by mid-November 2020 to allow for proper

scrutiny and to assure the Committee that participants and observers would be able to enjoy Christmas and Hogmanay events in a safe and secure way.

- 5) To note that a full programme launch would take place later in the year for both events.

- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Aldridge

In accordance with Standing Order 19(12), Amendment 3 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor McVey:

- 1) To approve the headline approach for delivering Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in 2020/21.
- 2) To note that the Big Wheel and Starflyer in East Princes Street Gardens would require Planning Permission and were subject to approval and to further note that the Committee's preference was that such attractions be held on areas of hard standing rather than public parks. To acknowledge the work officers had undertaken in finding areas of hard standing and to instruct officers to seek an appropriate area of hard standing for the Big Wheel and Star Flyer, subject to the requirements of contractual obligations and planning permission, and to hold those attractions in East Princes Street Gardens only if there was no possible alternative, and to report this work back to Committee.
- 3) To note that the proposed programme would be developed fully through the Event Planning Operations Group and would be subject to licences being approved by Council officers, in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Regulatory Committee.
- 4) To note that paragraphs 4.22 – 4.25 of the report that outlined how events would operate within health guidance, and recognised that the current guidance might change between now and late November 2020 and that the report confirmed significant work was required to finalise detailed planning, including possible crowd control, and therefore sought a further report with that detail by mid-November 2020 to allow for proper scrutiny and to assure the Committee that participants and observers would be able to enjoy Christmas and Hogmanay events in a safe and secure way.
- 5) To note that a full programme launch would take place later in the year for both events.
- 6) To agree that decisions 1, 3, 4 and 5 were subject to a full risk assessment being carried out which would consider operational, reputational risks with particular focus on risks to public health which would be reported back to Committee in two cycles; and further increased opportunities for local businesses (both hospitality and retail) to benefit from these events which should include being given priority to

take stands at an affordable rate to maximise their opportunities after such a difficult trading year.

- 7) To note the recent input of by the All Party Oversight Group on the Christmas and Hogmanay proposals and the positive contributions by all parties.
- 8) To welcome that these discussions with elected members helped form the recommendations and commends officers and the operator for the positive way they had engaged in these issues under difficult circumstances.
- 9) To note that these plans were entirely dependent on public health guidance and if guidance did not support these events they would not go ahead. To request that officers ensured that there was no additional financial input from the Council above the existing budget if the plans in part or in full could not go ahead.
- 10) To agree that an update report was brought on how local businesses could get involved in the Christmas and New Year festivals.

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee of 25 February 2020 (item 8); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

## **17. Award of Contracts for Edinburgh Carer Supports**

---

Approval was sought to appoint 4 lead suppliers to provide Edinburgh Adult Carer Support Services.

### **Decision**

- 1) To agree the contract duration would be for 60 months (with the possible extension of a further 36 months) from 01 January 2021.
- 2) To agree the approximate maximum total value of the contract over the eight years was £17,373,169 the annual value varied throughout the term of the contract to incorporate annual increments based on the Scottish Government Funding

(Reference – report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh Health and Social Care Partnership, submitted.)

## **18. Emergency motion by Councillor Webber - Pentland Hills Regional Park – Overnight Parking**

---

The Convener ruled that the following item, notice of which had been given at the start of the meeting, be considered as a matter of urgency to allow the Committee to give early consideration to the matter.

The following motion by Councillor Webber was submitted in terms of Standing Order 14;

“Committee notes:

**Thursday, 20th August, 2020**

- 1) New information has just come to light regarding a significant increase in the numbers of people camping within Pentlands Regional Park, with much higher numbers than in previous years.
- 2) Notes camping is taking place around the Council-owned reservoirs at Harlaw, Threipmuir and Bonaly.
- 3) Regrets, some campers are not behaving responsibly, leaving significant amounts of litter, including human waste, sanitary items and toilet paper. Campers also appear to be sourcing wood for campfires from living trees, and swimming in the water impacting on recreational anglers who have paid to fish on the reservoirs
- 4) Recognises the potential immediate threat to the environment and the natural resources of the Regional Park.
- 5) Notes that the wider community would support the immediate closure for overnight parking at the carparks.
- 6) Calls for the Executive Director of Place to consider if these carparks could be closed overnight, and report back to this committee in one cycle.”

### **Motion**

- 1) To note that new information had just come to light regarding a significant increase in the numbers of people camping within Pentlands Regional Park, with much higher numbers than in previous years.
- 2) To note camping was taking place around the Council-owned reservoirs at Harlaw, Threipmuir and Bonaly.
- 3) To regret that some campers were not behaving responsibly, and had left significant amounts of litter, including human waste, sanitary items and toilet paper. Campers also appeared to be sourcing wood for campfires from living trees, and swimming in the water impacting on recreational anglers who had paid to fish on the reservoirs.
- 4) To recognise the potential immediate threat to the environment and the natural resources of the Regional Park.
- 5) To note that the wider community would support the immediate closure for overnight parking at the carparks.
- 6) To call for the Executive Director of Place to consider if these carparks could be closed overnight, and report back to this Committee in one cycle.
- 7) To agree that the report from the Pentland Hill Regional Park (PHRP) management team would come back to the Policy and Sustainability Committee or Transport and Environment Committee.

- moved by Councillor Webber, seconded by Councillor Mitchell

## Amendment

- 1) To note on 5 August 2020 a meeting concerning the impact of a significant increase in the numbers of people overnight camping at Harlaw and Threipmuir, and related matters was held, attended by stakeholders (including local councillors, MSP, Park Management, Police, Friends of the Pentlands, Balerno Community Council, Maleny Anglers, Youth Vision Scotland and National Farmers Union).
- 2) To note camping was also taking place around the Council-owned reservoir at Bonaly.
- 3) To regret that some campers were not behaving responsibly, and had left significant amounts of litter, including human waste, sanitary items and toilet paper. Campers also appeared to be sourcing wood for campfires from living trees, and swimming in the water impacting on recreational anglers who had paid to fish on the reservoirs
- 4) To recognise the potential immediate threat to the environment and the natural resources of the Regional Park.
- 5) To note that Pentland Hills Regional Park (PHRP) Joint Committee would meet in September 2020 with a date being agreed between the City of Edinburgh Council Committee Services and Midlothian Council and West Lothian Council.
- 6) To note that a report was under preparation by PHRP management team for consideration at PHRP Joint Committee. This would consider implementation of a range of measures, including restricting overnight car park access.

- moved by Councillor Gardiner, seconded by Councillor Day

## Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the Motion (as adjusted)	-	7 votes
For the Amendment	-	9 votes

(For the Motion (as adjusted): Councillors Aldridge, Hutchison, Lang, Mitchell, Smith, Webber and Whyte

For the Amendment: Councillors McVey (Convener), Burgess, Kate Campbell, Day, Doran, Fullerton, Gardiner, Macinnes, Staniforth.)

## Decision

To approve the Amendment by Councillor Gardiner.

**Thursday, 20th August, 2020**