Finance and Resources Committee

10.00am, Thursday, 29 October 2020

Award of Contract for Professional Services Framework

Executive	Executive
Wards	All
Council Commitments	2, 3 and 7

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 It is recommended that the Finance and Resources Committee approve the award of a multi-lot framework agreement for Professional Services to the suppliers set out in Appendix 1. The framework consists of 13 Lots with an estimated value to the Council of £95 million over the maximum four-year term. Lot 9 is not being recommended for approval, reducing the framework to 12 Lots in total that Committee is asked to approve the award of, namely:
 - 1.1.1 the award of Lot 1 Project Management Services at an estimated contract value of £2,000,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.2 the award of Lot 2 Building Surveying Services at an estimated contract value of £2,000,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.3 the award of Lot 3 Quantity Surveying Services at an estimated contract value of £2,500,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.4 the award of Lot 4 Architectural Services Education/Non-residential at an estimated contract value of £2,500,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.5 the award of Lot 5 Architectural Services Residential at an estimated contract value of £2,500,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.6 the award of Lot 6 Architectural Services Landscape at an estimated contract value of £750,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.7 the award of Lot 7 Structural and Civil Engineering Services at an estimated contract value of £3,000,000 per annum;
 - 1.1.8 the award of Lot 8 Mechanical and Electrical Engineering Services at an estimated contract value of £2,500,000 per annum;



- 1.1.9 the award of Lot 10 Interior Design Services at an estimated contract value of £1,500,000 per annum;
- 1.1.10 the award of Lot 11 Multi-Discipline Design Team Services at an estimated contract value of £3,000,000 per annum;
- 1.1.11 the award of Lot 12 Passive House Designer (Architect) Services at an estimated contract value of £500,000 per annum; and
- 1.1.12 the award of Lot 13 Transportation Services at an estimated contract value of £1,000,000 per annum.
- 1.2 Notes the contract values above are reflective of estimated future pipeline of works and that the scope of works may fluctuate subject to budget allocation and funding approvals.
- 1.3 Notes that the Framework Agreement is a collaborative arrangement to be used predominantly by Place Development and Property and Facilities Management. This Framework Agreement can also be utilised by 188 Participating Sector Partners, where this occurs the Council will generate income via a rebate from the suppliers used by those contracting authorities.

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: Tricia Hill, Development & Regeneration Manager Place Development, Place Directorate E-mail: <u>tricia.hill@edinburgh.gov.uk</u> Tel: 0131 529 3954

Stephen S. Moir

Executive Director of Resources

Contact: Peter Watton, Head of Property & Facilities Management Resources Directorate E-mail: <u>peter.watton@edinburgh.gov.uk</u> Tel: 0131 529 5962 Report

Award of Contract for Professional Services Framework

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 This report seeks Committee approval to award a multi-lot framework agreement to the most economically advantageous organisations identified following a competitive tendering process. The framework consists of 12 Lots for professional services to support the Council's technical services in delivering an undefined programme of construction, maintenance and repair programmes.
- 2.2 The estimated Framework value includes £95 million of Council spend.

3. Background

- 3.1 The Council has limited in-house professional design and project management resources to support its various programmes for property asset construction, investment and maintenance and repair, including General Fund, Housing Revenue Account and Capital Investment projects. This includes delivery of new schools, early years centres, sports facilities, civil projects, asset management works and the Council's own house building programme.
- 3.2 To meet critical targets, the internal service often requires support from external professional services who can respond quickly to the service demands and provide professional insurances for the design work and advice they provide. This may be single discipline or require multi-discipline services depending on the nature of the projects and their complexity.
- 3.3 The current Construction Professional Services Framework has been in place since November 2015. It was separated into Lots to reflect the key professional disciplines and is reaching expiry. To ensure compliance with the Council's regulatory obligations, the procurement of a replacement framework was necessary, however in doing so the Council capitalised on the opportunity to further develop the specification of requirements to increase flexibility, increase capacity, maximise economies of scale and deliver contract management efficiencies.
- 3.4 The Framework will be used across the Council Directorates, but in particular by Place Development within the Place Directorate and Property and Facilities Management within the Resources Directorate.

4. Main report

- 4.1 Commercial and Procurement Services (CPS) have been working with key officers within the Place and Resources Directorates on a procurement process for the retendering of the current Professional Services Framework.
- 4.2 CPS placed a Contract Notice in the Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU) on 10th October 2019 inviting interested suppliers to submit a European Single Procurement Document (ESPD) to assess the bidders' financial capacity, business probity, capacity, experience and organisational policies for fair work and environmental practices.
- 4.3 The Lots advertised were:
 - Lot 1 Project Management Services
 - Lot 2 Building Surveying Services
 - Lot 3 Quantity Surveying Services
 - Lot 4 Architectural Services Education/Non-residential
 - Lot 5 Architectural Services Residential
 - Lot 6 Architectural Services Landscape
 - Lot 7 Structural and Civil Engineering Services
 - Lot 8 Mechanical & Electrical Engineering Services
 - Lot 9 Fire Engineering Services
 - Lot 10 Interior Design Services
 - Lot 11 Multi-Discipline Design Team Services
 - Lot 12 Passive House Designer (Architect) Services
 - Lot 13 Transportation Services
- 4.4 The aim of the ESPD process was to allow the Council to identify suitably qualified and experienced bidders to be invited to tender. Up to ten organisations per lot were identified as successful in proceeding to the tender stage.
- 4.5 186 bidders submitted 408 ESPDs across all 13 Lots and following evaluation 131 suppliers were then invited to tender for the opportunity. The invitation to tender was issued to the market on 18th March 2020.
- 4.6 Following tender returns on 15th May 2020, submissions were evaluated by a technical evaluation panel. This placed an emphasis on quality, as well as price, with the aim of selecting the most economically advantageous tenders for each of the 13 Lots based on organisations tendering on a quality/cost ratio of 60% quality and 40% price. The quality/cost ratio was determined due to a need for suppliers to provide quality service at the most economical price.
- 4.7 The quality analysis was based on weighted award criteria questions, which were scored using a 0 to 10 matrix. Following completion of the quality analysis, tenders that passed the minimum threshold of 60% were subject to cost analysis.

- 4.8 The 40% price was sub divided across the various disciplines within each Lot, to provide the Council with the most commercially competitive offer based on a range of roles/construction values. Bidders were also asked to provide a price for a range of additional services as well as hourly rates.
- 4.9 As the 40% final price score is made up of several components parts (i.e. not a single price) it is unlikely that a single supplier would be lowest cost across the board, therefore as shown in the Appendix no single supplier obtained the full 40% price score.
- 4.10 All evaluated elements were combined to provide the final commercial offer. The tender results for each Lot are set out in Appendix 2.
- 4.11 Where organisations have a "0.0" score for price this is due to their quality bid failing to achieve the pre-set quality threshold of 60%. Organisations failing to achieve the 60% threshold were not considered further for appointment and their fee proposal was not reviewed.
- 4.12 As a result of the above, Lot 9 for Fire Engineering Services is not being considered for award at this time. A full review will include tenderer feedback to understand why tender standards were low, prior to deciding next steps for this requirement. Interim arrangements will be put in place to ensure continuation of these services whilst this review is undertaken.
- 4.13 To maximise commercial return and building on the success of the Council's existing Construction Professional Services Framework, this framework can be used by up to 188 Participating Sector Partners (PSPs) from all local authorities in Scotland, the majority of Registered Social Landlords (RSLs), Edinburgh University as well as Police Scotland and the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service.
- 4.14 Where a PSP places a call off within this framework the Council will generate a 5% rebate from the successful supplier based on their project fee, of which the Council retains 4% and returns 1% to the PSP. Depending on call off levels this may generate sufficient income to fund a permanent contract management resource, to assist services in their contract management responsibilities.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 Subject to the Committee's approval, the award of the framework will be completed.
- 5.2 To ensure the Council is able to maximise the financial and non-financial benefits of the framework, including the delivery of community benefits, it has been agreed that one new full-time post will be created to oversee the management of this framework. This post will be funded by those service areas that will use the framework, primarily Place Development (through the HRA) and Property and Facilities Management.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 The estimated contract value of each of the 12 Lots being taken forward is reflective of an estimated future pipeline of works and that the scope of works may fluctuate subject to budget allocation and funding approvals. Contract spend will be monitored on an ongoing basis.
- 6.2 To calculate the saving which will be generated by this framework, CPS have applied the agreed Capital Savings Approach. When applied to each Lot there are potential savings of up to which have been projected £10,343,726 across the lifetime of the framework.
- 6.3 The costs associated with procuring this framework are estimated to be between £20,000 and £35,000.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 The current Framework mandates that the suppliers will provide a community benefit from the community benefit menu for every service order commissioned.
- 7.2 The framework utilises the Council's menu of community benefits which currently lists 41 available benefits each with a point value associated. Every supplier is committed to this system. The value of the call off pre-determines the amount of points that the supplier is required to spend, this will occur for every call off. Each community benefit offer will be monitored on the Council's community benefits platform by the Council's contract manager and reported annually.
- 7.3 This framework provides a strong commitment to SME development, of the 51 unique successful contractors (some won a position on several Lots) 73% identify as SME, 2 registered as micro, 18 registered as small, 19 registered as medium with the remaining 12 having no SME status.
- 7.4 The Council requires every contractor to identify if they pay the living wage, all 51 suppliers on the framework have identified they are committed to paying the living wage with 17 having achieved full Living Wage Accreditation.
- 7.5 In commitment to the Council's 2030 carbon-neutral city target, this framework for the first time introduces a Passive House Architect lot, the aim of this Lot is to ensure that buildings achieve carbon neutrality and environmental considerations are at the heart of future capital projects.

8. Background reading/external references

8.1 N/A

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Processes.
- 9.2 Appendix 2 Tender Evaluation Outcome
- 9.3 Appendix 3 List of Participating Sector Partners

Appendix 1 – Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Processes.

Pricing key

Section	Title
A	Percentage based fee – new works
В	Percentage based fee – refurbishment works
С	Contract administrator percentage-based fee - Increase to
	percentage-based fee for both new and refurbishment works
D	Principal designer percentage-based fee - Increase to
	percentage-based fee for both new and refurbishment works
E	Cost consultancy/quantity surveying services percentage-based
	fee - Increase to percentage-based fee for both new and
	refurbishment works
F	Non-core work – that is a fee for undertaking third party review
	(per schedule of service)
G	Fee to be percentage of Furniture, Fixtures & Equipment, Fixed
	Items and Audio Visual Value
H	Lead Designer percentage-based fee - Increase to percentage-
	based fee for both new and refurbishment works
1	Geotechnical Engineer percentage-based fee - Increase to
	percentage-based fee for both new and refurbishment works
TIME CHARGE	Time charge services
SERVICES	
SUB CONSULTING	Sub-consulting
OUT OF HOURS	Out of hours

Contract	Lot 1 Project Management Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£8,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	11	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Thomas & Adamson, Gleeds, Currie & Brown UK Limited, Turner & Townsend Project Management Limited, WSP UK Ltd, and Faithful+Gould Ltd	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 30% 35% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Communities and Families and Resources	

Contract	Lot 2 Building Surveying Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£8,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	11	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Thomson Gray Ltd, Thomas & Adamson, Summers-Inman, Faithful+Gould Ltd, Currie & Brown UK Limited and Gleeds	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D & E Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 30% 35% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place and Resources	

Contract	Lot 3 Quantity Surveying Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£10,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	12	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Currie & Brown UK Limited, Faithful+Gould Ltd, Robinson Low Francis, Doig and Smith Ltd, Armour Construction Consultants and Thomas & Adamson	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D & E Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Project 3 Performance Management Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 60% 20% 25% 25% 15% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place and Resources	

Contract	Lot 4 Architectural Servi	ces – Education/Non-residential
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£10,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	10	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Architype Limited, Anderson Bell Christie, Holmes Miller Ltd, AHR Architects Limited, Smith Scott Mullan Associates Limited and Reiach and Hall Architects,	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 30% 35% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Communities and Families and Resources	

Contract	Lot 5 Architectural Services - Residential	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£10,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	10	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Anderson Bell Christie, Cooper Cromar Limited, Smith Scott Mullan Associates Limited, Hawkins Brown Design Limited, 7N Architects LLP, Collective Architecture and HYPOSTYLE ARCHITECTS	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40%	Quality 60%
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Framework Delivery Team Method & Approach Performance Management Community Benefits Fair Work Practices Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 60% 35% 30% 20% 10% 5% N/A N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place	

Contract	Lot 6 Architectural Services - Landscape	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£3,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	9	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Atkins Limited, Rankinfraser Landscape Architecture LLP, Hirst Landscape Architects, Sweco UK Limited and LDA Design	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Framework Delivery Team Method & Approach Performance Management Community Benefits Fair Work Practices Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 60% 35% 30% 20% 10% 5% N/A N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place	

Contract	Lot 7 Structural and Civil Engineering Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£12,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	9	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	G3 Consulting Engineers, Harley Haddow, Will Rudd Davidson Ltd, David Narro Associates, Mott MacDonald Ltd and Pick Everard	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40%	Quality 60%
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D & E & H & I Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Out of hours Quality Framework Delivery Team Method & Approach Performance Management Community Benefits Fair Work Practices Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 10% 10% 5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 35% 30% 20% 10% 5% N/A N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place and Resources	

Contract	Lot 8 Mechanical & Electrical Engineering Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£10,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	10	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Harley Haddow, Pick Everard, Blackwood Partnership, Hurley Palmer Flatt, Rybka and TUV SUD LIMITED	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D & E Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Framework Delivery Team Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 60% 25% 20% 20% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Resources	

Contract	Lot 10 Interior Design Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£6,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	8	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	HLMAD Ltd trading as HLM Architect, Holmes Miller Ltd, Space Solutions, Hawkins Brown Design Limited, Scott Brownrigg Ltd and Atkins Limited,	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40%	Quality 60%
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D Section G Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12% 12% 5% 5% 5% 60% 30% 35% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Communities and Families and Resources	

Contract	Lot 11 Multi-Discipline Design Team Services	
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£12,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	10	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Faithful+Gould Ltd, Turner Townsend Project Management Limited, Currie Brown UK Limited, Thomas & Adamson, 7N Architects LLP, and Atkins Limited	
Price / Quality Split	Price 40% Quality 60%	
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Project 1 Project 2 Performance Management Business Continuity Fair Work Practices Community Benefits Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 15% 15% 5% 60% 30% 35% 15% 5% 5% 10% N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers from Place	

Contract	Lot 12 Passive House D	esigner (Architect) Services
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£2,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	11* three withdrew from the pro	ocess
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	Architype Limited, Robert Potte Architects Limited, NPS Proper trading as HLM Architect	r and Partners LLP, ADP, ECD ty Consultants Ltd, and HLMAD Ltd
Price / Quality Split	Price 40%	Quality 60%
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section D Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Framework Delivery Team Method & Approach Performance Management Community Benefits Fair Work Practices Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 12.5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 35% 30% 20% 10% 5% N/A N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers Resources	from Communities and Families and

Contract	Lot 13 Transportation Se	ervices
Contract period (including any extensions)	4 years	
Estimated Contract Value (including extensions)	£4,000,000	
Procurement Route Chosen	Restricted Procedure	
Tenders Returned	10	
Name of Recommended Supplier(s)	· ·	Stantec UK Ltd), WSP, Sweco UK tkins Limited, and Arcadis Consulting
Price / Quality Split	Price 40%	Quality 60%
Evaluation criteria and weightings and reasons for this approach	Price Section A Section B Section C & D & E Time Charged Fee Sub Consulting Quality Framework Delivery Team Method & Approach Performance Management Community Benefits Fair Work Practices Data Protection Zero Hours Contracts and the Living Wage	40% 12.5% 5% 5% 5% 60% 35% 30% 20% 10% 5% N/A N/A N/A
Evaluation Team	Evaluated by Technical officers	from Place

Lot 1 Project Management Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Thomas & Adamson	45.60	37.89	1
Gleeds	53.10	28.63	2
Currie & Brown UK Limited	47.70	30.32	3
Turner & Townsend Project	44.40	29.53	4
Management Limited			
WSP UK Ltd	47.40	21.84	5
Faithful+Gould Ltd	38.70	28.05	6
Bidder Anonymised	46.50	18.17	7
Bidder Anonymised	36.30	24.35	8
Bidder Anonymised	42.00	18.18	9
Bidder Anonymised	25.80	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	35.70	0.00	Fail

Lot 2 Building Surveying Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Thomson Gray Ltd	39.30	34.73	1
Thomas & Adamson	37.50	31.54	2
Summers-Inman	39.30	29.72	3
Faithful+Gould Ltd	42.00	24.49	4
Currie & Brown UK Limited	44.10	19.68	5
Gleeds	42.60	19.21	6
Bidder Anonymised	43.50	11.90	7
Bidder Anonymised	36.60	13.50	8
Bidder Anonymised	32.70	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	29.70	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	35.70	0.00	Fail

Lot 3 Quantity Surveying Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Currie & Brown UK Limited	40.80	36.40	1
Faithful+Gould Ltd	42.90	32.06	2
Robinson Low Francis	36.00	37.80	3
Doig and Smith Ltd	39.60	33.77	4
Armour Construction Consultants	36.00	37.08	5
Thomas & Adamson	39.90	30.09	6
Bidder Anonymised	38.70	25.34	7
Bidder Anonymised	37.80	25.87	8
Bidder Anonymised	38.10	23.40	9
Bidder Anonymised	35.40	0.00	Fail

Finance and Resources Committee – 29 October 2020

Bidder Anonymised	33.60	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	34.80	0.00	Fail

Lot 4 Architectural Services – Education/Non-residential

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Architype Limited	51.90	34.18	1
Anderson Bell Christie	51.30	34.10	2
Holmes Miller Ltd	50.40	32.70	3
AHR Architects Limited	50.10	31.54	4
Smith Scott Mullan Associates Limited	48.30	29.22	5
Reiach and Hall Architects	46.20	29.60	6
Bidder Anonymised	47.70	22.22	7
Bidder Anonymised	47.10	22.24	8
Bidder Anonymised	47.70	14.74	9
Bidder Anonymised	42.90	19.36	10

Lot 5 Architectural Services - Residential

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Anderson Bell Christie	47.10	38.87	1
Cooper Cromar Limited	47.10	35.05	2
Smith Scott Mullan Associates Limited	44.40	35.00	3
Hawkins Brown Design Limited	48.00	24.73	4
7N Architects LLP	44.10	23.30	5
Collective Architecture	40.50	25.84	6
HYPOSTYLE ARCHITECTS	41.70	24.64	7
Bidder Anonymised	35.70	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	31.50	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	28.20	0.00	Fail

Lot 6 Architectural Services – Landscape

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Atkins Limited	44.70	34.78	1
Rankinfraser Landscape Architecture LLP	44.10	27.32	2
Hirst Landscape Architects	41.40	21.75	3
Sweco UK Limited	45.60	13.80	4
LDA Design	44.70	13.64	5
Bidder Anonymised	34.80	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	33.90	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	35.70	0.00	Fail

Finance and Resources Committee – 29 October 2020

Bidder Anonymised	35.10	0.00	Fail
-------------------	-------	------	------

Lot 7 Structural and Civil Engineering Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
G3 Consulting Engineers	46.20	31.04	1
Harley Haddow	45.60	26.29	2
Will Rudd Davidson Ltd	48.90	22.94	3
David Narro Associates	45.00	25.73	4
Mott MacDonald Ltd	44.10	25.68	5
Pick Everard	37.50	28.99	6
Bidder Anonymised	41.40	22.39	7
Bidder Anonymised	39.00	22.32	8
Bidder Anonymised	34.20	0.00	Fail

Lot 8 Mechanical & Electrical Engineering Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Harley Haddow	43.80	31.90	1
Pick Everard	38.70	31.69	2
Blackwood Partnership	41.40	28.35	3
Hurley Palmer Flatt	37.50	31.77	4
Rybka	37.50	30.13	5
TUV SUD LIMITED	36.00	30.36	6
Bidder Anonymised	36.60	23.79	7
Bidder Anonymised	31.80	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	34.20	0.00	Fail
Bidder Anonymised	34.50	0.00	Fail

Lot 9 Fire Engineering Services - nil award

Tenders failed to achieve the minimum quality threshold of 60% therefore a review will be held prior to re-tender of this requirement.

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
HLMAD Ltd trading as HLM Architect	46.50	29.74	1
Holmes Miller Ltd	40.50	22.75	2
Space Solutions	41.70	19.19	3
Hawkins Brown Design Limited	45.00	14.79	4
Scott Brownrigg Ltd	39.30	20.12	5
Atkins Limited	43.20	13.29	6
Bidder Anonymised	37.50	18.38	7

Lot 10 Interior Design Services

Bidder Anonymised	31.50	0.00	Fail
-------------------	-------	------	------

Lot 11 Multi-Discipline Design Team Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Faithful+Gould Ltd	51.90	37.41	1
Turner Townsend Project	47.10	39.31	2
Management Limited			
Currie Brown UK Limited	51.30	34.79	3
Thomas & Adamson	46.20	36.57	4
7N Architects LLP	50.40	31.45	5
Atkins Limited	48.00	33.84	6
Bidder Anonymised	48.60	30.73	7
Bidder Anonymised	37.50	37.00	8
Bidder Anonymised	47.40	24.43	9
Bidder Anonymised	40.50	31.01	10

Lot 12 Passive House Designer (Architect) Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Architype Limited	53.70	28.12	1
Robert Potter and Partners LLP	43.20	28.22	2
ADP	36.90	33.09	3
ECD Architects Limited	42.30	27.03	4
NPS Property Consultants Ltd	43.20	22.86	5
HLMAD Ltd trading as HLM	40.20	18.41	6
Architect			
Bidder Anonymised	38.70	18.21	7
Bidder Anonymised	33.00	0.00	Fail

Lot 13 Transportation Services

Contractor	Quality (Max 60)	Price (Max 40)	Overall Rank
Peter Brett Associates LLP (t/a	48.00	32.44	1
Stantec UK Ltd)			
WSP	51.90	14.75	2
Sweco UK Limited	51.90	11.03	3
Mott MacDonald Ltd	50.40	11.80	4
Atkins Limited	47.10	14.67	5
Arcadis Consulting (UK) Limited	46.80	13.74	6
Bidder Anonymised	49.80	9.44	7
Bidder Anonymised	37.20	18.90	8
Bidder Anonymised	36.90	15.22	9
Bidder Anonymised	33.00	0.00	Fail

Local Authorities Aberdeen City Council Aberdeenshire Council Angus Council* Argyll & Bute Council **Clackmannanshire** Council Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar **Dumfries & Galloway Council Dundee City Council*** East Ayrshire Council East Dunbartonshire Council East Lothian Council East Renfrewshire Council Falkirk Council Fife Council Glasgow City Council Inverclyde Council Midlothian Council Morav Council North Ayrshire Council North Lanarkshire Council **Orkney Islands Council** Perth & Kinross Council* **Renfrewshire Council** Scottish Borders Council Shetland Islands Council South Ayrshire Council South Lanarkshire Council The Highland Council West Dunbartonshire Council West Lothian Council **Tayside Contracts*** * Members of Tayside Procurement Consortium

Scottish Registered Social Landlords (RSLs)

Abbeyfield Scotland Ltd Aberdeen Soroptimist Housing Society Ltd Abertay Housing Association Ltd Abronhill Housing Association Ltd Albyn Housing Society Ltd Almond Housing Association Ltd ANCHO Ltd Angus Housing Association Ltd Ardenglen Housing Association Ltd Argyll Community Housing Association Ltd Ark Housing Association Ltd Arklet Housing Association Ltd Atrium Homes Ayrshire Housing **Barony Housing Association Ltd** Barrhead Housing Association Ltd **Bellsmyre Housing Association Ltd** Berwickshire Housing Association Ltd **Bield Housing & Care** Blackwood Homes and Care Blairtummock Housing Association Ltd **Blochairn Housing Association Ltd** Blue Triangle (Glasgow) Housing Association Ltd Bridgewater Housing Association Ltd BT Loch Aillse agus an Eilein Sgitheanaich Ltd - Lochalsh and Skye HA Ltd Cadder Housing Association Ltd Cairn Housing Association Ltd Caledonia Housing Association Ltd Calvay Housing Association Ltd **Cassiltoun Housing Association Ltd** Castle Rock Edinvar Housing Association Ltd **Castlehill Housing Association Ltd** Cathcart & District Housing Association Ltd Cernach Housing Association Ltd Charing Cross Housing Association Ltd **Cloch Housing Association Ltd** Clyde Valley Housing Association Ltd **Clydebank Housing Association Ltd Clydesdale Housing Association Ltd** Comhairle nan Eilean Siar **Copperworks Housing Association Ltd** Cordale Housing Association Ltd Cube Housing Association Ltd Cunninghame Housing Association Ltd Dalmuir Park Housing Association Ltd Drumchapel Housing Co-operative Ltd **Dumfries and Galloway Housing Partnership Dunbritton Housing Association Ltd Dunedin Canmore Housing Limited** East Kilbride and District Housing Association Ltd East Lothian Housing Association Ltd Easthall Park Housing Cooperative Ltd Eildon Housing Association Ltd Elderpark Housing Association Ltd Fairfield Housing Co-operative Ltd Ferguslie Park Housing Association Ltd Fife Housing Association Ltd Forgewood Housing Co-operative Ltd Forth Housing Association Ltd Gardeen Housing Association Ltd Garrion Peoples Housing Cooperative Ltd

Finance and Resources Committee – 29 October 2020

Glasgow Housing Association Ltd, The **Glasgow West Housing Association Ltd Glen Housing Association Ltd** Glen Oaks Housing Association Ltd Govan Housing Association Ltd **Govanhill Housing Association Ltd** Grampian Housing Association Ltd Hanover (Scotland) Housing Association Ltd Hawthorn Housing Co-operative Ltd Hebridean Housing Partnership Ltd Hillcrest Homes Hillhead Housing Association 2000 Hjaltland Housing Association Ltd Home in Scotland Ltd Homes for Life Housing Partnership Horizon Housing Association Ltd Hunters Hall Housing Co-operative Ltd Irvine Housing Association Ltd Kendoon Housing Association Ltd Key Housing Association Ltd Kingdom Housing Association Ltd Kingsridge Cleddans Housing Association Ltd **Knowes Housing Association Ltd** Lanarkshire Housing Association Ltd Langstane Housing Association Ltd Larkfield Housing Association Ltd Link Group Ltd Linstone Housing Association Ltd Linthouse Housing Association Ltd Lister Housing Co-operative Ltd Lochaber Housing Association Ltd Loreburn Housing Association Ltd Loretto Housing Association Ltd Manor Estates Housing Association Ltd Maryhill Housing Association Ltd Melville Housing Association Ltd Milnbank Housing Association Ltd Molendinar Park Housing Association Muirhouse Housing Association Ltd New Gorbals Housing Association Ltd North Glasgow Housing Association Ltd North View Housing Association Ltd Oak Tree Housing Association Ltd **Ochil View Housing Association Ltd** Ore Valley Housing Association Ltd **Orkney Housing Association Ltd Osprey Housing Ltd Osprey Housing Moray**

Finance and Resources Committee - 29 October 2020

Paisley Housing Association Ltd Paragon Housing Association Ltd Parkhead Housing Association Ltd Partick Housing Association Ltd Pentland Housing Association Ltd **Pineview Housing Association Ltd** Port of Leith Housing Association Ltd **Prospect Community Housing** Provanhall Housing Association Ltd Queens Cross Housing Association Ltd **Reidvale Housing Association River Clyde Homes Rosehill Housing Co-operative Limited Rural Stirling Housing Association Ltd** Rutherglen and Cambuslang Housing Association Ltd Sanctuary Scotland Housing Association Ltd Scottish Borders Housing Association Ltd Scottish Veterans Housing Association Ltd Shettleston Housing Association Ltd Shire Housing Association Ltd Southside Housing Association Ltd Spire View Housing Association Ltd Strathclyde (Camphill) Housing Society Ltd Thenue Housing Association Ltd Thistle Housing Association Ltd **Tollcross Housing Association Ltd** Trust Housing Association Ltd Viewpoint Housing Association Ltd Waverley Housing Wellhouse Housing Association Ltd Weslo Housing Management West Granton Housing Co-operative Ltd West Highland Housing Association Ltd West Lothian Housing Partnership Ltd West of Scotland Housing Association Ltd West Whitlawburn Housing Co-operative Ltd Wheatley Housing Group Ltd Whiteinch and Scotstoun Housing Association Ltd Williamsburgh Housing Association Ltd Wishaw and District Housing Association Ltd Yoker Housing Association Ltd Yorkhill Housing Association Ltd

Other Organisations

Police Scotland Scottish Fire and Rescue Service Edinburgh University