

Transport and Environment Committee

10.00am, Thursday, 17 June 2021

Cammo Road – Trial Vehicle Prohibition (Road Closure)

Executive/routine Wards Council Commitments	Executive 1 and 6
---	----------------------

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 Transport and Environment Committee is asked to:
 - 1.1.1 Agree that outline designs are developed and promoted as an Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (ETRO) for the trial vehicle prohibition on Cammo Road;
 - 1.1.2 Note that, if 1.1.1 is agreed, an ETRO will be promoted for a period up to 18 months;
 - 1.1.3 After implementation, the ETRO will be monitored for a period of six months and, alongside consideration of feedback received, recommendations on next steps will be presented to Committee;
 - 1.1.4 Agree that a broader notification exercise should be undertaken in advance to ensure that all residents and businesses in the affected area are aware of the proposed ETRO; and
 - 1.1.5 Discharge the Motion agreed at the Transport and Environment Committee on [28 January 2021](#) regarding a trial road closure on Cammo Road.

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: Dave Sinclair, Local Transport and Environment Manager

E-mail: david.sinclair@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 529 7075

Cammo Road – Trial Vehicle Prohibition (Road Closure)

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 This report provides an update on discussions regarding a proposed trial vehicle prohibition to be located on Cammo Road, notes feedback from stakeholders and suggests options going forward.

3. Background

- 3.1 On 28 January 2021 Transport and Environment Committee approved the following motion by Councillor Lang on Cammo Road Trial Closure.

3.1.1 Committee notes:

3.1.1.1 The written deputation signed by 59 people from 30 properties on Cammo Road, Turnhouse Farm Road, Lennymuir, and Nether Lennie, calling for the Council to proceed with a trial closure of Cammo Road to through traffic as a result of safety concerns over the volume and speed of commuting and HGV traffic;

3.1.1.2 The counter written deputation signed by 27 residents from 13 properties at Lennymuir, opposing any such closure because of concerns over adequate access to their homes;

3.1.1.3 That north west locality transport officers agreed in 2018 to the principle of progressing a trial through-road closure of Cammo Road in order to properly assess impact before considering any longer-term measures;

3.1.1.4 That the proposed through-road closure point still ensured all properties could be accessed, with alternative road access available via Craigs Road and/or Turnhouse Road.

- 3.1.2 Committee recognises the long standing concerns of a majority of local residents and the risk that current problems could be worsened by new housing developments; therefore calls on officers to engage with ward councillors and to bring forward a report in one cycle, setting out the options for running a trial through-road closure of Cammo Road during 2021.

- 3.1.3 Committee agrees that any such trial closure should preserve access to the Cammo Estate car park and ensure adequate access for emergency vehicles.
- 3.2 Over the last ten years various parties have suggested the trial or permanent vehicle prohibition of Cammo Road to mitigate the impact of through traffic adjacent to residential properties, the popular Cammo Park and the adjacent River Almond walkways.
- 3.3 Despite these discussions, the proposal to date, has not been considered in any detail. This report has explored the options in more detail, collated feedback from local stakeholders and suggests options to trial a temporary vehicle prohibition under an Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (ETRO).
- 3.4 The principles of taking forward a trial vehicle prohibition were agreed in August 2019, with proposals to carry out wider consultation to gather views from residents and businesses in the overall area were proposed.
- 3.5 Unfortunately, it was not possible to submit a report on the trial vehicle prohibition to the Transport and Environment Committee on 22 April 2021. However, a short [Business Bulletin](#) update was provided.
- 3.6 This set out the options to progress a trial vehicle prohibition (road closure) on Cammo Road during 2021 as:
- 3.6.1 Carry out further Consultation with the broader community;
- 3.6.2 Carry out detailed engagement with Ward Councillors, Community Councils and Council Transport and Planning Officers to try and develop an agreed proposal;
- 3.6.3 Develop a proposal under the context of an ETRO for a trial period up to 18 months; and
- 3.6.4 Undertake and monitoring and assessment exercise to consider the success or otherwise of a trial.
- 3.8 It was recommended that the options at 3.7.2 – 3.7.4 be progressed.
- 3.7 Following the April Committee, local stakeholders including Councillors, Community Councils, Emergency Services and appropriate Council services were asked for their views regarding the proposed trial closure (vehicle prohibition).

4. Main report

- 4.1 Over the last few years the Cammo area has been subject to considerable change and development, including:
- 4.1.1 Housing development on Maybury Road;
- 4.1.2 Significant changes to the road layout on Maybury Road;
- 4.1.3 Housing developments at West Craigs and Turnhouse;
- 4.1.4 Temporary vehicle prohibition (road closure) of Cammo Walk under Spaces for People Programme;

4.1.5 Operation of the new Forrest Kindergarten in the Cammo Estate; and

4.1.6 Funding secured to improve path connections with the River Almond path network.

4.2 It is expected that traffic patterns will continue to change in the surrounding area as a result of new developments, planned junction improvements and an increase in population. Whilst the impact of these changes is not fully known it is hoped that future travel patterns may be better understood over the next 18 months.

4.3 At the time of writing this report the Spaces for People (SfP) Programme had introduced a temporary vehicle prohibition (road closure), on public health grounds, on Cammo Walk. Proposals for the retention of this intervention are set out in a separate report to this Committee. It is also worth noting this particular route is also subject to consideration under the context of the new signalised junction design at Maybury Road and Craigs Road.

4.4 Based on the above, it is recommended that detailed design work is undertaken to define the most suitable location for the introduction of a trial vehicle prohibition point.

Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders (ETROs)

4.5 The Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 provides that the roads authority may make an order for the purpose of carrying out an experimental scheme of traffic control. This is an Experimental Traffic Regulation Order, or an ETRO. ETROs can continue in force for up to 18 months.

4.6 The process to be taken for ETROs is proposed as follows:

4.6.1 Drafting the required orders, following development of detailed designs for each scheme. In doing so, officers will consider the feedback on individual schemes received during the consultation and will incorporate suggestions into the detailed design where possible;

4.6.2 Advertising of ETROs in accordance with legislative requirements;

4.6.3 Consideration of objections in accordance with legislative requirements and in line with Council Scheme of Delegation which requires a report to Committee where more than six material objections received from the public; and

4.6.4 If approved for implementation, the ETROs will be monitored once installed.

Consultees for Traffic Orders

4.7 The statutory consultees for Traffic Orders include Police Scotland, The Scottish Ambulance Service, The Fire Service, The Freight Transport Association, The Road Haulage Association.

4.8 In addition, the legislation indicates that the Council should consult other organisations (if any) representing persons likely to be affected by any provision in the order as the authority thinks appropriate. For this proposed trial prohibition, the

Council would generally include Community Councils, groups representing residents and groups representing local businesses.

Assessment and Monitoring

- 4.9 During the early stages of ETRO, six months from commencement, officers would be required to undertake an assessment to consider feedback and assess the success of the scheme. Recommendations for the next steps would be presented to a future Committee and may include the commencement of the legal process for a permanent Traffic Regulation Order (TRO), if appropriate.
- 4.10 In addition to the statutory consultees, it is suggested that a broader notification exercise is undertaken to ensure that all appropriate residents, businesses and stakeholders are made aware of the proposed Order.

Feedback to date

- 4.11 Current feedback from local stakeholders, Councillors, the Cramond and Barnton Community Council and Council Officers is noted in Appendix 1.
- 4.12 Whilst there is clearly support for the trial to proceed it should be noted the Cramond and Barnton Community Council and residents from the Lennymuir area have both raised concerns regarding road safety and a significant restriction on access should the trial proceed.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 If the report recommendations are approved, officers will develop a detailed design to consider the most appropriate location for a trial vehicle prohibition point (an approximate location is shown in Appendix 2). The detailed designs will include confirmation of the closure point, traffic signage and any other measures required to create a turning area. Some discussion will be required to with local agricultural businesses to ensure that adequate access is maintained.
- 5.2 Once the design is complete, arrangements would be made for the proposed ETRO to be drafted and for the statutory process to commence, as set out above.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 The cost of preparing the detailed design, promoting the ETRO, dealing with any comments or objections, potentially making the Order and installation is likely to be in the region of £10,000 and will be met by the Transport service revenue budget.
- 6.2 The cost of monitoring the trial and considering if a future permanent TRO would be appropriate will cost in the region of £5,000 and will be included in a future transport revenue budget plan, if required.
- 6.3 The anticipated cost of installing a full linked signalised junction at the Maybury Road / Cammo Gardens junction would be in the region of £150,000. If was considered appropriate, additional funding will need to be identified.
- 6.4 Although suggested by the Cramond and Barnton Community Council, it would not be possible to change the established Section 75 Development Contribution.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 Local engagement with stakeholders, local Councillors and the two Community Councils has been undertaken, as requested, to determine the level of support for the trial.
- 7.2 Clearly, a trial of this nature would have some impact on the local communities. Further notification with residents, businesses and all emergency services would be appropriate should the trial be approved to proceed to the formal ETRO stage.
- 7.3 An Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA) for the scheme is still to be undertaken.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 None.

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 – Stakeholder Feedback
- 9.2 Appendix 2 – Approximate location of the trial vehicle prohibition (road closure)

Appendix 1 – Feedback from Stakeholders

Stakeholder	Comments
Police Scotland	<p>No negative comments to note</p> <p>NB. Further engagement to be undertaken with all emergency services as part of statutory ETRO consultation in advance of any public advertising.</p>
Christine Jardine MP	<p>Email on 19 January 2021</p> <p>Subject: FW: Petition Against the Proposed Closure of Cammo Road (Case Ref: CJ9384)</p> <p>I am getting in touch on behalf of the residents of Lennymuir in my constituency. They are deeply concerned at any proposed closure of Cammo Road.</p> <p>They are concerned that the decision to close Cammo Road was based on a survey of residents some time ago and since then numerous new residents now live in Lennymuir.</p> <p>The residents object to closure as they use the road on almost daily basis for essential travel. Alternative routes such as Craigs Road, Turnhouse Road and Maybury Road are subject to longstanding well known traffic problems already without the additional difficulties Lennymuir residents would face accessing them and the additional pressure that housing developments around Turnhouse will bring.</p> <p>Additionally, the residents have pointed out that there is no public transport provision for Lennymuir. There are concerns that problematic access for service Vehicles, trade and Emergency Services will impact on the Health and Safety of residents.</p> <p>If you could provide an overview of how the council intends to mitigate these concerns so I may reassure my constituents I would be most grateful.</p>
Councillor Hutchison	<p>I absolutely support the principal of the closure but would make the following points;</p> <p>In my opinion the closure point should be closer to Turnhouse around the position of the original request made by residents.</p> <p>The introduction of any permanent scheme should be accompanied by the introduction of signalled junctions at Cammo Gardens/Maybury Road and Cammo Road/Queensferry Road.</p>
Councillor Work	<p>As long as full consultation takes place with residents & businesses who will be affected as suggested. I am generally in favour of the trial, but this will divide opinion. Investment is urgently required at the junctions on the Maybury Road at Craigs Road and the Maybury Junction itself to mitigate the impact of any closure.</p>

Councillor Young	Response in support for a trial closure
Councillor Lang	I am fully supportive of a trial closure of the road. All my surveys of residents have shown a clear majority support for a full closure to address local rat running and speeding concerns.
Cramond and Barnton Community Council	<p>The proposed closure was discussed tonight at the CBCC meeting. The result was that the trial closure is supported subject to a commitment to provide traffic lights at Cammo Gardens. Some members also wish traffic lights at the Cammo Road/Queensferry Road junction. You will be well aware of the justification of the demand for traffic lights due to the hazardous nature of these junctions combined with the many elderly and less confident drivers resident at Cammo and Strathalmond, many of whom are dependent on their cars for mobility. Closure of Cammo Road would add to the issues of community severance which are already apparent with the temporary closure of Cammo Walk.</p> <p>There was support also for the need to consult residents on the stretch of Cammo Road which would be affected and for potentially moving the closure to nearer the railway bridge near to Turnhouse.</p> <p>Both CBCC and Friends of Cammo have asked for comment on their Facebook pages and have received well over 40 responses already.</p> <p>I would remind you also that the 2020 survey we undertook in respect of the potential closure of Cammo Walk found that if Cammo Walk is closed, 74 (73%) respondents considered traffic lights are required at Cammo Gardens.</p> <p>A similarly high proportion in favour of lights at Cammo Gardens could be expected if the closure of Cammo Road was to be the subject of a community survey.</p> <p>I have previously indicated that CALA/David Wilson Homes have provided an informal indication that they may be prepared to redirect a proportion of the £367,500 planning agreement for Cammo Walk to the provision of lights at Cammo Gardens if the Council were prepared to make such a commitment.</p> <p>So, funding for lights at Cammo Gardens may be available, it just needs the Council to make a commitment !</p>
Council officer Planning	<p>I see no planning issue with the proposal if it allows right of access to the existing development.</p> <p>My only comment is Cammo Road lacks a decent footway along sections of it and makes it difficult for pedestrian and PT users.</p>
Council officer	<p>As long as the new north car park at Cammo retains access, this is favourable.</p> <p>The new Forest Kindergarten pods are in place at this location and about to be used. I have concerns regarding drop off and collection of children a little</p>

<p>Natural Heritage Service</p>	<p>especially if initially people are unaware of the proposed road layout changes.</p> <p>Also, Ross Woodside from ELGT is looking at improvements to the upper reaches of the River Almond Walkway so changes to this road may impact thoughts on linking routes to and from the walkway to either other quiet routes, circular walks or sites such as Cammo.</p> <p>I have asked Forest Kindergarten managers who now have a facility at the north entrance to Cammo Estate to comment.</p> <p>Information from ELGT: The Edinburgh and Lothians Greenspace Trust have recently been successful in securing a grant from Sustrans for a River Almond Walkway Feasibility Study from Cramond to Kirkliston. We are working alongside the City of Edinburgh Council and Friends of River Almond Walkway to develop this project. We have appointed a consultant to undertake this work and have been engaging with the key stakeholders along the route to determine the best option for a multi-use path at this location. As the project develops, I will share the findings of the report and the proposed next steps as we take the project forward.</p> <p>This is a continuation and development of a piece of work completed by parks a few years ago but now includes dwell spaces and circular routes encompassing local places of interest along the way. The closure of Cammo Road may influence route and design proposals at this section.</p>
<p>Council Officer On behalf of Forest Kindergarten</p>	<p>As you are aware we have an Edinburgh Council Forest Kindergarten at the Cammo Estate and we currently use the North Carpark as this is where our Pods are located to offer our children and staff a place to rest and refuel.</p> <p>As I am aware by the information shared the closure will be from the Turnhouse end so we will still be able to access the North Carpark from Cammo Road, if this is the case we would have no objections to the trial road closure.</p>
<p>Deputations</p>	<p>Deputations to the Transport and Environment Committee on 28 January 2021</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cammo Traffic Group • Residents of Lennymuir

Appendix 2 – Approximate location of the trial vehicle prohibition (road closure) shown in red

