

Education, Children and Families

10:00, Tuesday, 7 December 2021

Learning Estate Update

Executive/routine Wards Council Commitments	Executive all 28
---	--

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 The Education, Children and Families Committee is asked to:
 - 1.1.1 Note the intention to publish the latest school roll projections in January 2022.
 - 1.1.2 Note the intention to return a report to Committee in March 2022 setting out how any accommodation pressures arising from the new projections will be addressed.
 - 1.1.3 Note the update on Trinity Academy Phase 2 replacement project.
 - 1.1.4 Approve that a detailed informal consultation on future learning estate infrastructure requirements in West Edinburgh be progressed with an outcomes report to Committee in May 2022.

Amanda Hatton

Executive Director of Education and Children's Services

Contact: Crawford McGhie, Senior Manager - Estates and Operational Support

E-mail: crawford.mcghie@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3149

Report

Learning Estate Update

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 Production of the annual school roll projections has been delayed and the projections will instead be published in January 2022.
- 2.2 This paper seeks Committee approval to undertake an informal consultation process in the west of the city which will help shape a Learning Estate strategy for the west of the city to address current and future accommodation pressures. The projections published in January will support this consultation.
- 2.3 This paper also provides an update on the Trinity Academy Phase 2 replacement project.

3. Background

- 3.1 A regular report on school roll projections is targeted to be presented to Committee every December. Last year due to delays with data availability caused by the COVID pandemic the projections were published in [March 2021](#).
- 3.2 A similar delay has occurred this year and it is anticipated that projections will now be published in January 2022. These will be circulated to Committee members prior to publication.
- 3.3 The "[West Edinburgh High School](#)" paper presented to Committee in October 2021 provided an update on learning estate infrastructure in West Edinburgh. Committee requested further information on these issues be presented to them in December 2021. Accordingly, this paper sets out in more detail the key issues to be addressed in West Edinburgh and proposes an informal consultation to elicit the views of school communities and residents and inform a Learning Estates Strategy for West Edinburgh.
- 3.4 An update to this Committee on Phase 2 of the Trinity Academy Wave 4 replacement project has also been requested.

4. Main report

School Roll Projections

- 4.1 Due to a delay in the provision of new housing data the production of the 2021 based annual school roll projections is delayed. It is proposed that these are

published on the Council website when they become available in January 2022. A copy of the projections will be circulated to Committee members in advance of their publication.

- 4.2 A report to Committee in March 2022 will set out the issues arising from the new projections and, where necessary, how any pressures identified will be addressed.

West Edinburgh

- 4.3 A full update on the complex education infrastructure issues in West Edinburgh is provided in Appendix 1. It is suggested that a detailed informal consultation with all the school communities is carried out in the first quarter of 2022 with a report setting out the findings of the consultation and any recommendation arising presented to the Education, Children and Families Committee in May 2022.

Trinity Phase 2

- 4.4 Committee previously asked for an update on this project. The latest status of this project is provided in the report in Appendix 2.

Other projects

- 4.5 Updates on all the other projects are provided on the Future Schools website: www.futureschoolsedinburgh.com

Projects in Construction

- 4.6 Additional costs associated with COVID Lockdown (recognising Supplier Relief requirements) are still emerging and are being managed at a project level.
- 4.7 Completion delays are presenting a significant challenge with projects experiencing repeated changes to handover dates. Shortages of skilled labour increases the risk of construction quality issues.
- 4.8 Learning Estate projects in construction currently exposed to delay include:
- 4.8.1 Cannan Lane Primary school
 - 4.8.2 Victoria Primary School
 - 4.8.3 St Crispin's Special School
 - 4.8.4 Early Years Phase 2 (5 Sites)
 - 4.8.5 Castlebrae Community High School
 - 4.8.6 Trinity Academy Phase 1 – Bangholm Sports Centre
 - 4.8.7 James Gillespie's High School Darroch Annexe
 - 4.8.8 Boroughmuir High School extension
 - 4.8.9 Wester Hailes High School – Phase 1
- 4.9 Assessing the impact of delays and then communicating and, where possible, mitigating their impact are considered on a project by project basis.

Tender returns

- 4.10 Projects tendered post COVID lockdown are experiencing extreme tender price increases and sometimes difficulty in securing any tender returns.
- 4.11 Analysis suggests that projects are experiencing price uplift of around 30%. This is due to increased materials costs and the additional costs to cover contractor risk

associated with materials price variation over the contract period. The figure of 30% is an average figure based on a sample ranging from 10% to over 40%.

4.12 Projects currently exposed to issues around tender pricing include:

- 4.12.1 New Maybury Primary School
- 4.12.2 Sciennes Primary School extension
- 4.12.3 Dean Park Primary School extension
- 4.12.4 Kirkliston Primary School Early Stages Annexe
- 4.12.5 Carrick Knowe Primary School Nursery extension
- 4.12.6 Gilmerton Primary School Nursery extension
- 4.12.7 Ratho Primary School Nursery and Public Library
- 4.12.8 Currie Community High School

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 Updated school roll projections will be circulated to Committee members and published on the Council website in January 2022.
- 5.2 If Committee approve the recommendations in this paper, it is proposed that a consultation process with parents, residents and landowners be progressed in January 2022 based around the three questions set out in Appendix 1:
 - i. Should South Scotstoun feed to a new primary school at Builyeon Road or Queensferry Primary?
 - ii. Should the new Maybury Primary School feed to Craigmount High School or to a new West Edinburgh High School?
 - iii. Which secondary school should Kirkliston Primary School feed too?
- 5.3 Council Officers will continue to work with landowners and developers in the Kirkliston area to identify what scope there may be to acquire land for a new Kirkliston High School.
- 5.4 All of the learning estate projects in the capital programme are essential in order to meet statutory provision requirements. For these projects, consideration will be given to whether contingency measures are required to be brought forward to ensure statutory provision continues when delivery of new schools are significantly delayed.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 Any financial implications will be captured in the annual review of the Capital Investment Programme.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 If approved by Committee, a process of informal consultation and engagement will be progressed in the West of the City to seek views on a Learning Estate strategy for this area of the city. The views and opinions gathered will be reported to Education, Children and Families Committee in May 2022 together with a

recommendation on how to progress, including identifying any statutory consultation processes that may be required.

- 7.2 Any statutory consultation required for changes to the school estate will be undertaken according to the procedures set out in the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 as amended by the Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 [“School Roll Projections and Rising School Rolls”](#), Education Children and Families Committee, 2 March 2021
- 8.2 [“West Edinburgh High School”](#), Education, Children and Families Committee, 12 October 2021

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 Developing A Learning Estate Strategy for West Edinburgh
- 9.2 Appendix 2 Trinity Academy Replacement – Phase 2 Update

APPENDIX 1

Developing A Learning Estate Strategy for West Edinburgh

Introduction

- 1.1 The publication of the CityPlan 2030 makes clear the Council's strategy in regard to the allocation of housing sites across the west of the city. It provides a clearer picture of where future pressures on the Council's Learning Estate may arise and establishes a platform from which to develop a coherent and connected Learning Estate Strategy for the west of the city.
- 1.2 This cannot and should not be developed by Council officers alone as its potential impact on communities existing and planned is significant. Accordingly, a consultation and engagement process is proposed to provide communities an opportunity to have their say on what our future Learning Estate in this part of the city should look like.
- 1.3 However, the Learning Estate cannot be viewed in isolation. It must be planned around the principles that underpin the Council's Business Plan and the aspirations of CityPlan 2030. This means considering the opportunities that development of the Learning Estate presents to rethink service delivery, to connect people and places and build a sustainable future. A vision for west Edinburgh is required to set the strategy's direction.
- 1.4 The major issue is time. The timescales by which housing sites develop, the availability of sites for new schools and the time required for designing and building new facilities do not always align. This means that a Learning Estate Strategy for West Edinburgh needs to be phased so that it can address existing pressures without losing sight of the longer-term vision for the area.

Overview of Issues

- 1.5 There are three main issues that require to be addressed by a Learning Estate Strategy for West Edinburgh and which are either directly or indirectly connected:
 - 1) Primary School provision in Queensferry
 - 2) Secondary School provision for the new Primary School at Maybury
 - 3) Secondary School provision for Kirkliston

Primary School provision in Queensferry

- 1.6 The school roll projections for Echline and Queensferry Primary Schools show that both schools will exceed their capacity as a result of pupils generated from the high number of housing developments within their catchment areas. The most significant of these is the Builyeon Road development which is located within Echline's catchment area.
- 1.7 As part of the Local Development Plan a site for a new primary school in the Builyeon Road development has been set aside. A statutory consultation proposing the establishment of a new Builyeon Road Primary School and setting its catchment area is required. An informal consultation process undertaken in 2019 identified strong support for a new school in the area. However, it also identified concerns

that the route to the proposed new primary school from the existing housing at Ferrymuir and the 'South Scotstoun' housing site was poor and some support for keeping South Scotstoun within Queensferry Primary School's catchment area.

- 1.8 A catchment change approved by City of Edinburgh Council in March 2021 following a statutory consultation process in October/November 2019 resulted in the realignment of the catchment boundary between Queensferry Primary School and Echline Primary School. This proposal was brought forward as a stand-alone consultation following the informal consultation process in order to provide spaces at Queensferry Primary School for pupils from the early phases of the 'South Scotstoun' housing development. However, Queensferry Primary School cannot accommodate all South Scotstoun within its existing capacity.
- 1.9 During the informal consultation process in 2019 some people also suggested that the catchment area of Dalmeny Primary School should be extended to include sections of South Scotstoun. However, due to its proximity to the large oil storage facilities south of Dalmeny, securing Planning Approval for any expansion of Dalmeny Primary School is currently unlikely.
- 1.10 Accordingly, the key question for a consultation on Primary School provision in Queensferry is: ***should South Scotstoun feed to a new primary school at Builyeon Road or Queensferry Primary?***
- 1.11 If the preferred option is for South Scotstoun to feed to a new school at Builyeon Road then it will be possible to realign catchment areas with minimal impact on existing residential addresses other than those in the Ferrymuir and South Scotstoun areas. The consultation would be used to inform the catchment boundary locations. The new school at Builyeon Road would be built as a double stream (14 class) school with an expansion strategy should it be required in the future.
- 1.12 If the preferred option is for South Scotstoun to feed to Queensferry Primary School then Queensferry would need to be extended. Options to achieve this will form part of the consultation discussions but would mean either further development of the existing school site or the establishment of annexe accommodation.
- 1.13 A consequence of South Scotstoun feeding to Queensferry Primary School would be that the new school at Builyeon Road would be smaller. Accordingly, it may be possible to free up space for expansion on Queensferry Primary School's existing site by relocating Queensferry Early Years Centre to the Builyeon Road site. Alternatively, relocating St Margaret's RC Primary School to the new school site would provide annexe accommodation for Queensferry Primary School which could potentially be shared with other services (for example, Queensferry High School, the Community Centre, Library Services) and provide St Margaret's with a new building.
- 1.14 Through the informal consultation process these ideas and others can be discussed and explored so that the statutory consultation which will follow better reflects the views of the communities affected.

Secondary School Provision for the new Primary School at Maybury

- 1.15 Maybury Primary School received planning approval on 1 November 2021. Maybury will offer capacity for up to three streams (630 pupils) and its catchment area will cover the new housing developments at Cammo and West Craigs. Maybury is currently scheduled to open in August 2023. However, the scheduled opening date had been based on the site for this new school being made available by the developers in January 2021. Various site issues have now put that date into question. Confirmation of the developer's project delays and the anticipated completion date of the site infrastructure which would allow handover of the school site is being sought.
- 1.16 School roll projections also show that secondary schools in the area will face increasing accommodation pressures as the proposed new housing is built and demand for places rises. During the public consultation in 2019 to establish the new 'Maybury' primary school it was proposed that the school feed to Craigmount High School as it had capacity to support some growth in pupil numbers in the short term. It was expected at that time that additional secondary school capacity would be required from 2024, although it had not yet been determined how this would be delivered. The main options considered were extending existing provision or construction of a new secondary school.
- 1.17 The latest school roll projections continue to show Craigmount High School having capacity to accommodate demand until 2026. However, the school includes a high percentage of non-catchment pupils – particularly from the Forrester High School catchment – and the projections assume a continuation of this pattern. Blocking all non-catchment pupils would move accommodation pressures to other schools; however, careful monitoring and control of non-catchment numbers and intake levels between schools should provide additional time beyond 2026 to develop infrastructure plans and more fully assess the impact of CityPlan 2030 as it progresses.
- 1.18 Further possible measures to provide additional capacity for pupils generated in the early phases of the Maybury development could also include catchment change. Realigning Roseburn Primary School with Tynecastle High School was considered in 2017 as part of the West and South West Schools Review but was dropped in the early stages as it was clear that at that time there was no immediate pressure to progress this.
- 1.19 Accordingly, in the short-term Craigmount High School continues to offer a solution for the Maybury and Cammo developments. The question for consultation is, ***should this arrangement become permanent with Craigmount High School extended at the appropriate time or should the new primary school at Maybury feed to a new West Edinburgh High School?***
- 1.20 In the longer-term if the housing developments in CityPlan 2030 are delivered according to the current proposals, a new secondary school in West Edinburgh will certainly be required. The CityPlan 2030 sites are projected to generate approximately 1,200 secondary age pupils.

- 1.21 Maybury and Cammo are projected to generate approximately 400 secondary age pupils. Accordingly, if Maybury and Cammo were to be realigned with a new West Edinburgh High School then that school would require capacity for 1,600 pupils. If the option were to extend Craigmount High School then it could eventually accommodate up to 1,800 pupils.
- 1.22 Feasibility work undertaken at Craigmount High School shows how the school could be extended and address some of the capacity pressures the school already experiences in its social areas. Considering the pros and cons of an extension will form a significant part of the engagement exercise with Craigmount's school community.
- 1.23 There are two other significant factors impacting on the decision on whether to extend Craigmount High School or have the new primary school at Maybury feed to a new West Edinburgh High School.
- 1.24 The first issue is timescales. While delivering an extension is complex, it is a project that could progress relatively quickly subject to reaching agreement with the PPP provider. However, it is not clear how quickly a new secondary school could be delivered.
- 1.25 CityPlan 2030 is in its early stages and has not yet been adopted and this will take time. The developers of the sites in CityPlan 2030 may not be willing to release a site for a new secondary school until the first phases of housing from their sites are in development which could be many years away. Accordingly, it may be realistic to assume that a new West Edinburgh High School may not be delivered until the end of the decade. Even allowing for careful management of non-catchment places and catchment change, Craigmount High School may require temporary accommodation before a new high school is delivered.
- 1.26 The second issue is the impact Kirkliston could have on a new West Edinburgh High School.

Secondary School provision for Kirkliston

- 1.27 Kirkliston Primary School currently feeds to Queensferry High School. However, the South Scotstoun and Bulyeon Road developments will cause Queensferry High School to exceed its capacity. Given that these two developments are part of the Queensferry urban area it would not make sense for them to feed to any other secondary school. Accordingly, the question is: ***which secondary school should Kirkliston Primary School feed too?***
- 1.28 There are four potential options for discussion:
- 1) An extended Queensferry High School;
 - 2) A new High School in or around the Kirkliston urban area;
 - 3) A new West Edinburgh High School;
 - 4) Another existing High School either in West Edinburgh or West Lothian.
- 1.29 While each of these options present different challenges, all of them can be the focus for discussions as part of the informal consultation process. Some of the challenges are outlined below.

1) An extended Queensferry High School

- 1.30 In November 2016 at a meeting of the full Council a recommendation not to consider extension of Queensferry High School and bring forward a catchment review for Kirkliston Primary School to feed into a new West of Edinburgh High School at an appropriate time in the future was approved. In order to deliver this option that decision would need to be overturned.
- 1.31 The new school building opened in June 2020 and it was built to accommodate a capacity of 1,200 pupils. Due to the Council approval noted above, it does not have an expansion strategy. The additional 400 pupils that the school would potentially be required to accommodate represents a significant extension. In addition to the classrooms that would be required; social spaces, sports facilities, dining and assembly spaces are all sized to meet the requirements of a school operating at a maximum capacity of 1,200 pupils. As is the case with the option of an extension at Craigmount High School, it would not simply be a case of bolting on a new classroom block.
- 1.32 There is also the question of where this expansion could take place? The existing school site does not have significant areas of free space. Annexe accommodation on a nearby site may be a possibility – perhaps utilising the adjacent Sports & Community Hub or even creating an all-through annexe with Queensferry Primary School on the site of St Margaret’s RC Primary School (see section 1.13). The potential for an annexe of Queensferry High School in Kirkliston could also be explored but would be subject to similar issues to a new secondary school in Kirkliston (see section 1.34 to 1.38).
- 1.33 One of the main advantages of an extension option is that, subject to where the school is extended, the timescales are largely within the Council’s control. However, regardless of the long-term option progressed, given the current complexities in the construction and development sector it would be prudent to prepare contingency plans for some form of temporary accommodation at Queensferry High School should it be required after 2024. This would be required if housing growth takes place as quickly as is currently projected although this could now be considered unlikely.

2) A new High School in or around the Kirkliston urban area

- 1.34 There are currently 346 non-denominational secondary school pupils living in the Kirkliston Primary School catchment area. 322 of those pupils attend Queensferry High School. However, primary school rolls are at a peak and there are 656 non-denominational primary pupils living in Kirkliston Primary School’s catchment area (609 attend Kirkliston Primary School). Allowing for drop off at S4-S6 based on the average at Queensferry High School it would be reasonable to estimate the maximum capacity of a new secondary school serving only Kirkliston as being 550 pupils with a roll varying from 350-550. This would make a Kirkliston High School one of the smallest in Edinburgh, similar in size to Drummond High School and the only secondary with a single feeder primary school.

- 1.35 Consideration could be given to incorporating other schools such as Hillwood Primary School and Ratho Primary School into a Kirkliston High School's catchment area. This would have consequences for Craigmount High School and Balerno High School both of which have accommodation pressures of their own. This strategy would also most likely be dependent on where a new Kirkliston High School was built.
- 1.36 There is currently no site available to the Council for a Kirkliston High School. The land around Kirkliston is mainly privately owned and it would be necessary for a landowner to sell land to the Council or for the Council to progress a Compulsory Purchase Order (CPO) to provide a site for a new Kirkliston High School. A CPO could take several years to conclude. There would need to be agreement that a site was deliverable before a statutory consultation could progress.
- 1.37 The land around Kirkliston is green belt and its development is not part of the Council's CityPlan 2030 strategy which seeks to avoid the development of green field sites. The release of land for a school site could establish grounds for developers to challenge this approach – particularly around Kirkliston itself – undermining the CityPlan entirely. It is likely that were land to be made available to the Council by a landowner, it would be with the expectation from the seller that additional housing would follow at a later date.
- 1.38 However, if an appropriate new secondary school site south of Kirkliston could be acquired, this could be well located to also serve new developments along Glasgow Road and around Ratho Station.

3) A new West Edinburgh High School

- 1.39 If a new secondary school is to be built in West Edinburgh, at present, it seems most likely that it would be built on the site of the International Business Gateway (IBG). As set out in section 1.20, this school would have capacity for 1,200 pupils unless the Maybury and Cammo developments were also to be included in its catchment area in which case the capacity would be 1,600. Adding the pupils from Kirkliston to the school would mean it having a capacity of 2,200 pupils. The largest school in Edinburgh currently has capacity for 1,450 pupils. Accordingly, the new West Edinburgh High School would be the largest in Edinburgh by a significant margin and would be one of the largest in Scotland.
- 1.40 Ensuring safe and direct travel routes to a new school at the IBG from Cammo and Kirkliston would be challenging. An informal consultation undertaken in 2017 highlighted concerns from residents in Kirkliston about the impact on traffic and travel times to a new school on the IBG site. Improved transport infrastructure would therefore be required if this were to be an option.
- 1.41 The same timescale issues as described for Craigmount High School under section 1.25 also apply here. It is not clear how quickly a new secondary school in West Edinburgh could be delivered and it is dependent on the speed at which housing development progresses.

4) Another existing High School either in West Edinburgh or West Lothian

- 1.42 The informal consultation process undertaken in 2017 concluded that Kirkliston Primary School parents opinions on an option of feeding to a new Winchburgh High School in West Lothian were evenly split. Different term dates between authorities and a sense of belonging to the City of Edinburgh rather than West Lothian were both raised as concerns and the proposal was not developed. Winchburgh High School is now under construction with a capacity that does not include Kirkliston within its planning.
- 1.43 After Queensferry High School the next closest City of Edinburgh Council secondary schools are Craigmount High School and Forrester High School. However, travel distances would make these difficult options. Furthermore, when a new West Edinburgh School is established it would be considerably closer than either of these schools.

Next Steps

- 1.44 It is proposed that the informal consultation process run from January 2022 to May 2022. Further engagement with landowners will be necessary and this will run until March 2022 allowing greater clarity on some aspects of the consultation in its later phases.
- 1.45 The report to Committee in May 2022 will summarise the consultation and the engagement undertaken and its output and make recommendations on the actions that need to be progressed. Where a statutory consultation is proposed, a draft consultation paper will be prepared over the summer period for approval at Committee in August 2022.

APPENDIX 2

Trinity Academy Replacement – Phase 2 Update

Background

- 1.1 Early engagement with Trinity staff, students and community, facilitated by Architecture and Design Scotland in October 2018, set out a strategic vision for the project. The outputs of that engagement informed a masterplan study completed by Holmes Miller Architects in March 2019 which proposed a number of options for development.
- 1.2 Following further engagement with the school community, it was agreed to implement a two phase strategy for the project, whereby the first phase would involve the provision of new indoor PE accommodation at the nearby Bangholm site as part of an enhanced community facility which also retained and improved the existing hockey pitch, rugby pitch and operations base for the Council's Outdoor Education team. Phase 2 would involve the provision of all other accommodation and facilities for 1200 learners on a redeveloped main school site, through a combination of new build and refurbishment. Phase 1 of the project is currently under construction and is due to be completed in early summer 2022.
- 1.4 Initial feasibility work for Phase 2 was completed in June 2020 and looked at options involving the existing buildings on the site. It was concluded that the original Victorian building would definitely remain as part of the new scheme, and that it may also be beneficial to retain the existing Science and Home Economics building, subject to further investigations. As the study was undertaken during the COVID-19 pandemic and while the school was experiencing a change in leadership, survey work to support the study was limited to desktop data and no additional engagement with the school staff or wider school community was undertaken.

Current Position

- 2.1 More recent engagement with the school community, led by the headteacher Nick Burge, has created a more specific School Brief for the project (October 2021) which sets out background to the current school curriculum review, summarises the school community's project requirements which emerged from the recent consultation and reflects on existing user experience of the Victorian and Science block buildings.
- 2.2 CEC's Learning Estate Strategy – Guiding Principles document was approved by the Education, Children and Families Committee on 12th October 2021. This document draws on the strategic context of the Council's Business Plan, the Scottish Government's and COSLA's joint Learning Estate Strategy as well as the vision and goals of Edinburgh Learns for Life. In doing so, it seeks to set out the principles which will guide decision making and project briefing for all new investment in Edinburgh's learning Estate.
- 2.3 A full design team for the project was appointed in summer 2021 and is currently undertaking a RIBA Stage 1 feasibility study. This study will develop the outputs of

the 2020 feasibility study but will draw on more detailed building and site survey work, construction logistics and decant strategies. It will refer to CEC's guiding principles document, to the Trinity Academy school brief, and to work currently being undertaken to support the Council's 20-minute neighbourhood principles.

- 2.4 The study is due for completion in December 2021 after which the results will be shared with the school community.