

# Minutes

## Culture and Communities Committee

10.00am, Tuesday 7 March 2023

### Present:

Councillors Walker (Convener), Glasgow, Heap, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Meagher, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Staniforth and Thornley.

### 1. Minutes

---

#### Decision

To approve the minute of the Culture and Communities Committee of 13 December 2022 as a correct record.

### 2. Work Programme

---

The Committee's Work Programme was presented for review.

#### Decision

To note the work programme.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Work Programme 13 December 2022, submitted)

### 3. Rolling Actions Log

---

The Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log was presented.

#### Decision

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
  - Action 5 – Thriving Green Spaces
  - Action 10 – Ash Dieback Action Plan
  - Action 12 – Makar's Court – Proposed Additional Transcriptions
  - Action 18 – Business Bulletin Information Review
  - Action 20 – Safer Parks – Motion by Councillor Hyslop
  - Action 21 – Playparks Investment – Motion by Councillor Thornley
  - Action 25 (1&2) – Edinburgh Leisure Pitch Hire Prices – Motion by Councillor Campbell

- Action 30 (2) – Amplification of Sound in Public Spaces
  - Action 32 (2) – Changes to Legislation on the Sale and Use of Fireworks in Scotland
  - Action 33 (1, 3 & 4) – Community Empowerment Update
  - Action 34 - Edinburgh Leisure – Active Communities Programme Update
  - Action 42 – Motion by Councillor Younie – Muirhouse Millenium Centre
- 2) To update the rolling actions log to reflect the decisions taken at this meeting and otherwise note the outstanding actions.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log 7 March 2023, submitted)

#### **4. Business Bulletin**

---

The Culture and Communities business bulletin was presented.

##### **Decision**

- 1) To note the updates in the Business Bulletin.
- 2) To agree that an update on WASPS studio space in Dalry would be included in the Business Bulletin for the May Committee.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Business Bulletin 13 December 2022, submitted)

#### **5. Edinburgh Leisure Annual Report 2021/22**

---

The Edinburgh Leisure Annual Report for 2021/22. The annual report detailed the performance of Edinburgh Leisure as it began the process of recovering its business following the second Covid-19 lockdown in January 2021.

##### **Decision**

- 1) To note the performance of Edinburgh Leisure during 2021/22.
- 2) To refer the report to the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee for noting and scrutiny of the financial performance of the organisation and any risks impacting the Council or Edinburgh Leisure.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

#### **6. Response to Motion by Councillor Campbell – Edinburgh Leisure Pitch Hire Prices**

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Campbell, an update was provided on the pricing structure for 3G and 4G pitches within the school estate and Edinburgh Leisure's own facilities along with a market comparison with other local authorities and other providers.

## **Decision**

To note the report detailing prices of 3G pitches with Edinburgh Leisure's core venue estate and the Council's school estate with a market comparison.

(References – Act of Council No.18 of 27 October 2022; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **7. Capital Theatres Company Performance Report 2021/22**

---

The Capital Theatres Company Performance Report for 2021/22. The performance report covered the period from September 2021 to September 2022 which included the re-opening of the Festival and King's Theatres in a challenging post-Covid environment for the performing arts.

Information was also provided on the impact of continued social distancing capacity restrictions, changes to audience confidence, reductions in ticket sales and later booking patterns. Further restrictions brought about in December 2021 as a result of the Omicron variant caused additional losses and exacerbated the rapidly changing financial and planning scenario.

### **Decision**

- 1) To note the positive performance of Capital Theatres during 2021/22.
- 2) To note that the report focus was on 2021/22 activity which had been delivered in the context of a challenging post-Covid environment for the performing arts.
- 3) To recognise the efforts made by Capital Theatres in spite of the challenges faced.
- 4) To refer the report to the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee for noting and scrutiny of the financial performance of the organisations and any risks impacting the Council and/or Capital Theatres.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **Declaration of Interests**

Councillor McFarlane made a transparency statement as he had performed at the Fringe and the King's Theatre.

Councillor McNeese-Mechan made a transparency statement as she was a Board Member of Capital Theatres.

Councillor Mitchell made a transparency statement as he had been previously employed at a summer festival venue.

Councillor Staniforth made a transparency statement as he had performed at the Fringe.

Councillor Walker made a transparency statement as she was a Board Member and Trustee of Capital Theatres.

## 8. Response to Motion by Councillor Mowat – Festivals Review

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Mowat details were provided of the findings of a review of the Summer Festivals 2022 together with actions being progressed to address the issues which had been identified.

In preparing for the Festivals in 2023, the focus would remain on balancing the needs of residents, businesses, visitors and the festivals. Alongside these preparations, Council officers were also taking forward the actions agreed by Committee on the use of public spaces for events and filming and amplification of sound in public spaces.

### **Motion**

- 1) To note the review of the Summer Festivals 2022 set out in Appendix 1 of the report by the Executive Director of Place and the actions being progressed to address the operational issues identified set out in Appendix 3.
  - 2) To note that the Festivals and Events All Party Oversight Group would be kept updated on progress on these actions in advance of the Summer Festivals 2023, with the first update planned for May 2023.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Meagher

### **Amendment**

- 1) To note the review of the Summer Festivals 2022 set out in Appendix 1 of the report by the Executive Director of Place and the actions being progressed to address the operational issues identified set out in Appendix 3.
  - 2) To note that the Festivals and Events All Party Oversight Group would be kept updated on progress on these actions in advance of the Summer Festivals 2023, with the first update planned for May 2023.
  - 3) To request within two cycles a revised scoresheet and that the appropriate officer(s) consider how it could reflect:
    - i) the City of Edinburgh's new Cultural Strategy
    - ii) the role of the Summer Festivals in tackling climate change
    - iii) the contribution of the Festivals to social justice, especially as it relates to employment
    - iv) the need to expand access to culture to communities with limited access to cultural opportunities
- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, the amendment, as verbally adjusted under Standing Order 22.5, was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the review of the Summer Festivals 2022 set out in Appendix 1 of the report by the Executive Director of Place and the actions being progressed to address the operational issues identified set out in Appendix 3.
- 2) To note that the Festivals and Events All Party Oversight Group would be kept updated on progress on these actions in advance of the Summer Festivals 2023, with the first update planned for May 2023.
- 3) To request a revised scoresheet and that the appropriate officer(s) consider how it could reflect:
  - i) the City of Edinburgh's new Cultural Strategy
  - ii) the role of the Summer Festivals in tackling climate change
  - iii) the contribution of the Festivals to social justice, especially as it relates to employment
  - iv) the need to expand access to culture to communities with limited access to cultural opportunities

(References – Act of Council No.31 of 25 August 2022; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## 9. **Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay 2022/23 – Outcome Report**

---

Details were provided of the outcomes and lessons learned from Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay 2022/23.

Approval was also sought to refer approval of a one-year extension to the contract award to Unique Assembly for Edinburgh's Christmas for 2023/24 and the ratification of the continuation of the contract for Edinburgh's Hogmanay to the Finance and Resources Committee.

### Motion

- 1) To note the performance of the 2022/23 editions of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay.
  - 2) To agree that performance in 2022/23 was satisfactory, recognising the challenges particularly in respect of Edinburgh's Christmas.
  - 3) To refer the report to the Finance and Resources Committee to:
    - a) approve a one-year extension of the contract award to Unique Assembly for Edinburgh's Christmas for 2023/24.
    - b) ratify the continuation of the contract for Edinburgh's Hogmanay as approved by Finance and Resources Committee on 16 June 2022.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Meagher

## **Amendment 1**

- 1) To note the performance of the 2022/23 editions of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay.
- 2) To agree that performance in 2022/23 was satisfactory, recognising the challenges particularly in respect of Edinburgh's Christmas.
- 3) To refer the report to the Finance and Resources Committee to:
  - a) approve a one-year extension of the contract award to Unique Assembly for Edinburgh's Christmas for 2023/24.
  - b) ratify the continuation of the contract for Edinburgh's Hogmanay as approved by Finance and Resources Committee on 16 June 2022.
- 4) To agree points raised in paragraph 5.6 of the report by the Executive Director of Place would be carried out and to add:

5.6.10 Submit any applications for planning permission, civic and alcohol licences in a timely manner so that they could be considered within an appropriate timeframe.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

## **Amendment 2**

- 1) To note the performance of the 2022/23 editions of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay.
- 2) To agree that performance in 2022/23 was satisfactory, recognising the challenges particularly in respect of Edinburgh's Christmas.
- 3) To refer the report to the Finance and Resources Committee:
  - a) To approve a one-year extension of the contract award to Unique Assembly for Edinburgh's Christmas for 2023/24.
  - b) To ratify the continuation of the contract for Edinburgh's Hogmanay as approved by the Finance and Resources Committee on 16 June 2022.
- 4) To express regret that the report failed to include details about the environmental impact of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay as part of the Stakeholder / Community Impact section of the report, especially relating to the impact on trees and failure to ensure adherence to appropriate tree protection zones (TPZs) throughout the event, though recognises that this is referenced in the body of the report.
- 5) To welcome the officer working group which would be established to review practices around TPZs throughout delivery of future events, and to affirm that Unique Assembly should attend this group when invited, if the contract extension is awarded.

- 6) To further note the motion passed at Full Council on 9 February 2023 “Tree Protection Measures East & West Princes Street Gardens” which requested a report to examine failed compliance of TPZs during last year’s Christmas and Hogmanay events; what contractual and other protections may be put in place to ensure future events comply with the applicable Tree Protection Plan and Trees in the City Action Plan, as well as a report outlining the updated tree protection plan for East Princes Street Gardens.
  - 7) To request that Key Performance Indicators relating to adherence to TPZs were added to future contract awards, in line with: i) considerations from the working group outlined at 5) above; ii) reports and learning following the Full Council motion referenced at 6) above and, iii) in such a way to demonstrate the Council’s commitment to a Nature Emergency as declared at Full Council on 9 February 2023 which “recognises the inherent value of nature, as well as its crucial importance as an integral part of culture and society, and for our health, wellbeing and economy”.
- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Heap

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the performance of the 2022/23 editions of Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay.
- 2) To agree that performance in 2022/23 was satisfactory, recognising the challenges particularly in respect of Edinburgh’s Christmas.
- 3) To refer the report to the Finance and Resources Committee:
  - a) To approve a one-year extension of the contract award to Unique Assembly for Edinburgh’s Christmas for 2023/24.
  - b) To ratify the continuation of the contract for Edinburgh’s Hogmanay as approved by the Finance and Resources Committee on 16 June 2022.
- 4) To agree points raised in paragraph 5.6 of the report by the Executive Director of Place would be carried out and to add the following:

5.6.10 Submit any applications for planning permission, civic and alcohol licences in a timely manner so they can be considered within an appropriate timeframe.
- 5) To express regret that the report failed to include details about the environmental impact of Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay as part of the Stakeholder / Community Impact section of the report, especially relating to the impact on trees and failure to ensure adherence to appropriate tree protection zones (TPZs) throughout the event, though recognises that this is referenced in the body of the report.

- 6) To welcome the officer working group which would be established to review practices around TPZs throughout delivery of future events, and to affirm that Unique Assembly should attend this group when invited, if the contract extension is awarded.
- 7) To further note the motion passed at Full Council on 9 February 2023 “Tree Protection Measures East & West Princes Street Gardens” which requested a report to examine failed compliance of TPZs during last year’s Christmas and Hogmanay events; what contractual and other protections may be put in place to ensure future events comply with the applicable Tree Protection Plan and Trees in the City Action Plan, as well as a report outlining the updated tree protection plan for East Princes Street Gardens.
- 8) To request that Key Performance Indicators relating to adherence to TPZs were added to future contract awards, in line with: i) considerations from the working group outlined at 5) above; ii) reports and learning following the Full Council motion referenced at 6) above and, iii) in such a way to demonstrate the Council’s commitment to a Nature Emergency as declared at Full Council on 9 February 2023 which “recognises the inherent value of nature, as well as its crucial importance as an integral part of culture and society, and for our health, wellbeing and economy”.

(References – Finance and Resources Committee 16 June 2022 (item 9) and 10 October 2022 (item 1); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **10. Centre for Moving Image (Edinburgh Filmhouse and Edinburgh International Festival)**

---

In response to an emergency motion by Councillor Heap, an update was provided on the current position regarding the Edinburgh Filmhouse and Edinburgh International Film Festival following the closure of the Centre for Moving Image (CMI) Group.

The closure of the organisation had resulted in over 100 staff becoming redundant and a potential gap in the provision of cultural and community cinema in Edinburgh.

Council officers were working with Creative Scotland and Screen Scotland to scope provision of culture and community cinema across Edinburgh in the short-term. The sale of the Filmhouse property was being handled by Savills and a closing date had been set and several bids received. The preferred bidder for the property was unknown.

### **Decision**

- 1) To note the current position with regard to the Edinburgh Filmhouse and Edinburgh International Film Festival.
- 2) To note that a plan of action was anticipated to be agreed by the end of March 2023 and that this would be brought to Committee in May (subject to volume of agenda business).

(References – Culture and Communities Committee 13 October 2022 (item 4); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)



## 11. Grants to Third Parties – Third Sector Interface and Equalities and Rights Network 2023/24

---

The Council's proposed funding for the Third Sector Interface and Equalities and Rights Network for 2023/24 was submitted as follows:

- Edinburgh Voluntary Organisation's Council	£53,500
- Volunteer Edinburgh	£70,907
- Edinburgh Social Enterprise Network	£10,000
- Equalities and Rights Network	£40,000

The funding would support delivery of volunteering, social enterprise and third sector development and support together with participation of the third sector in community planning arrangements in the city.

### Decision

- 1) To agree to the financial proposals set out at paragraphs 4.3 and 4.6 of the report by the Executive Director of Place.
- 2) To agree to receive a further report on the outcomes for the Third Sector Interface to take account of the priorities within the Council's new Business Plan.
- 3) To agree to invite the Third Sector Interface to present on their achievements at a Committee meeting early in the new financial year.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## 12. Community Centre Strategy

---

An update was provided on the proposal to undertake a strategic review of the current arrangements for community centres. Recognising the importance of both Council and non-Council run community spaces and building on the Council decision of 9 February 2023, it was intended to engage with management committees of non-Council run community spaces in the development of the strategy.

The key workstreams in the review would be:

- service provision and outcomes
- Operational committee structures, function, and sustainability
- Building use
- Property condition, location and accessibility, ownership and lease arrangements
- Staffing
- Finances, including funding, expenditure and income (including accessing available grant funding and other financial support received/required)
- Local context, such as neighbouring community assets/projects.

## **Motion**

- 1) To approve the proposed approach to be taken to the development of a community centre strategy for the city.
  - 2) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the strategic review and development of a community centre strategy.
  - 3) To agree, in principle, a grant funding award of up to £40,000 for Muirhouse Millennium Centre, subject to funding being agreed by the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee.
  - 4) To agree the membership of the APOG and to note that the APOG would be convened at key stages of the review.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Meagher

## **Amendment**

- 1) To approve the proposed approach to be taken to the development of a community centre strategy for the city.
  - 2) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the strategic review and development of a community centre strategy.
  - 3) To agree, in principle, a grant funding award of up to £40,000 for Muirhouse Millennium Centre, subject to funding being agreed by the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee.
  - 4) To note the length of time between funding being agreed at full Council for Drylaw Neighbourhood Centre and the Centre actually receiving the much needed funds.
  - 5) Therefore, to note that a timeline and conditions of funding would be provided as soon as possible so that the Millenium Centre was fully aware of what information was required and could prepare appropriately.
  - 6) To agree the membership of the APOG and to note that the APOG would be convened at key stages of the review.
- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, the amendment, as verbally adjusted in terms of Standing Order 22.5, was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

## **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To approve the proposed approach to be taken to the development of a community centre strategy for the city and to include health and social care and education representatives in the consultation and engagement process.
- 2) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the strategic review and development of a community centre strategy.

- 3) To agree the membership of the APOG should comprise the Convener of the Culture and Communities Committee and Group Spokespersons and to note that the APOG would be convened at key stages of the review.
- 4) To agree, in principle, a grant funding award of up to £40,000 for Muirhouse Millennium Centre, subject to funding being agreed by the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee.
- 5) To note the length of time between funding being agreed at full Council for Drylaw Neighbourhood Centre and the Centre actually receiving the much needed funds.
- 6) Therefore, to note that a timeline and conditions of funding would be provided as soon as possible so that the Millenium Centre was fully aware of what information was required and could prepare appropriately.

(Reference – Act of Council No. 16 of June 2022; Culture and Communities Committee 13 December 2022 (item 12); Act of Council No. 31 of 9 February 2023; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **13. Response to Motion by Councillor Thornley – Playparks Investment**

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Thornley, an update was provided on the investment made by the Council in play areas and the rationale for investment.

Information was also submitted of the sites that had been assessed as a priority for future investment together with a summary of the design considerations to ensure that play areas were a challenging but safe, inclusive and sustainable environment for children and young people to enjoy.

#### **Motion**

- 1) To note the update on investment in Play areas.
  - 2) To approve the rationale for future play area investment.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Meagher

#### **Amendment**

- 1) To note the update on investment in Play areas.
  - 2) To approve the rationale for future play area investment.
  - 3) To note that Appendix 4 highlighted the Play Area investment planned for 2023/24 of around £1.5m.
  - 4) to note that the Scottish Government had agreed further investments in 2024/25 and 2025/26.
  - 5) To agree to receive an update in a year's time setting out:
    - Progress on the investment set out in Appendix 4
    - Investment planned for 2024/25.
- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the update on investment in Play areas.
- 2) To approve the rationale for future play area investment.
- 3) To note that Appendix 4 highlighted the Play Area investment planned for 2023/24 of around £1.5m.
- 4) to note that the Scottish Government had agreed further investments in 2024/25 and 2025/26.
- 5) To agree to receive an update in a year's time setting out:
  - Progress on the investment set out in Appendix 4
  - Investment planned for 2024/25.

(References – Act of Council No. 18 of 22 September 2022; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **14. Response to Motion by Councillor Hyslop - Safer Parks**

---

In response to a motion by Councillor Hyslop, an update was provided on actions which had been implemented to improve safety within the Council's parks and to note the further work underway.

A quarterly forum had been set up to allow Council officers to look at the priority locations for irresponsible parking and to develop options appraisals for improved enforcement, the introduction of traffic restrictions or investment in physical barriers to prevent it.

### **Decision**

To note the update on the actions being progressed to improve safety within the Council's parks.

(References – Act of Council No.16 of 22 September 2022; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **15. Ash Dieback Action Plan Update**

---

An update was provided on the Council's Ash Dieback Action Plan. The action plan highlighted that many thousands of ash trees would need to be felled over the next decade requiring additional tree surveying, collation of data of disease presence and additional resources, officers and equipment, to deal with the workload across the Council's estate.

In addition to the practical elements required to manage the presence of ash dieback across the city, the action plan also included reference to developing and implementing an ash tree recovery plan to mitigate biodiversity, landscape and environmental losses as well as a replacement programme that aligned with the city's ambition to be a million-tree city by 2030.

### **Decision**

To note the progress update on the Ash Dieback Action Plan.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee 1 February 2022 (item 14); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **16. Thriving Greenspaces 2050 Vision and Strategy**

---

An update was provided on the development of the Thriving Greenspaces vision and strategy, the timeline for finalising the strategy and developing the associated delivery and financial plans.

The development had been supported by funding from the Future Parks Accelerator Fund with a total of £1.25m secured. This investment had been used to carry out research, option trialling, partner and public engagement, fundraising, master planning and the drafting of the strategy.

### **Decision**

- 1) To note the Thriving Green Spaces Strategy and the feedback received from the public consultation.
- 2) To note that officers would now proceed with developing detailed action and financial plans to deliver the strategy to allow for Committee approval of the Strategy in consideration of all financial implications by the end of 2023.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee 14 September 2021 (item 5); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **17. Motion by Councillor Burgess – Prestonfield Green**

---

The following motion by Councillor Burgess was submitted in terms of Standing Order 32.1 and verbally adjusted in terms of Standing Order 22.5:

“This Committee:

1. Notes that the bowling club in Prestonfield, Southside-Newington ward has wound up and the bowling green has been handed back to the council.
2. Notes that there is keen local interest in continuing use of the bowling green site as community greenspace with the opportunity to establish community growing space on the site.
3. Notes the success of the existing small area of community raised-beds in Prestonfield established in 2013 and the general demand for growing space within the community.

4. Notes the suitability of the Prestonfield green for a community growing space including; a fenced and gated site, a clubhouse building, a large shipping container for tool storage, water and electricity supplies.
5. Notes that another council-owned former bowling green at Trinity has been successfully turned into growing space, albeit part of this site has been used to increase city-wide allotment capacity rather than as shared community space.
6. Notes that local people and the management committee of the adjacent Cameron House Community Centre are keen to see a local public consultation into the future of the bowling green.

Therefore, agrees that the Council facilitates a local public consultation into the future of the former bowling green in Prestonfield and particularly regarding its potential as a community growing space.

To note that information on the outcome of the local public consultation would be reported back to Committee.

- moved by Councillor Burgess, seconded by Councillor Heap

### **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor Burgess.

## **18. Motion by Councillor Thornley – Parks and Greenspace Investment Following 2023 Council Budget**

---

The following motion by Councillor Burgess was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17.1 and verbally adjusted in terms of Standing Order 22.5:

“Committee:

- 1) Notes that the Liberal Democrat budget was agreed by Full Council on Thursday 23 February.
- 2) Welcomes the £3 million of capital spending now available for Parks and Greenspace Investment.
- 3) Agrees that our parks need to be fit for purpose, accessible to all and safe.
- 4) Agrees a report to be provided to Committee within one cycle, outlining how this money can be best prioritised with a focus on, but not exclusive to:
  - Priority 1 and 2 repairs outlined in the Parks and Greenspace Report considered by Committee on 13 December 2022
  - Lighting in both premier parks and other parks
  - Accessibility including public toilets.”

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler

### **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor Thornley.