

# Minutes

## Culture and Communities Committee

10.00am, Thursday 7 December 2023

### Present:

Councillors Walker (Convener), Lezley Marion Cameron (Items 1-18), Glasgow, Graham (Substituting for Lezley Marion Cameron from item 19), Heap, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Staniforth and Thornley.

### 1. Deputations

---

#### Gorgie Farm - In relation to item 6.1 – Business Bulletin (Gorgie Farm Site Update)

The deputation noted that their progress to date on the Gorgie Farm project had been community lead and there had been extensive consultation. They had taken a co-design approach to identify aspirations for the site as well as community need. They had received 400 responses to a recent online questionnaire and had 30 ‘cuppa conversations’ as well as 40 on-site tours. They had identified opportunities for training and development for individuals on the site including food growing, gardening and cooking. They were working on a feasibility study and considering the return of animals to the site. Income options from a range of sources were being explored. Their priorities include capital investment and raising revenue. Two community groups were regularly meeting on site.

### 2. Minutes

---

#### Decision

To approve the minute of the Culture and Communities Committee of 05 October 2023 as a correct record subject to the adjustment to item 20 of the minute to show the correct names under the voting section as follows:

“For the motion (as adjusted) - 8 votes

For the amendment (as adjusted) - 3 votes

(For the motion (as adjusted): Councillors Faccenda, Mitchell, Munro Osler, Parker, Staniforth, Thornley and Walker.

For the amendment (as adjusted): Councillors Campbell, Glasgow and McNeese Mechan.)”

(Reference – Minute of the Culture and Communities Committee, submitted)

### 3. Work Programme

---

The Committee's Work Programme was presented for review.

**Decision:**

To note the work programme.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Work Programme, 7 December 2023, submitted)

### 4. Rolling Actions Log

---

The Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log was presented.

**Decision:**

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
  - **Action 4** – Lauriston Farm, proposed lease
  - **Action 5** - Festivals for Europe Seal for Festival Cities and Regions
  - **Action 6** - Cemeteries Strategy
  - **Action 7** – Cemetery Management Rules
  - **Action 12** – Bridgend Farmhouse
  - **Action 20** – Bridgend Farmhouse Reserve Funding
  - **Action 21(b)** – Fundraising for Community Led Heritage Groups
  - **Action 25 (2)** – Parks and Greenspace investment
  - **Action 26.2** – Lawn Tennis Association Investment
  - **Action 27(2&3)** – Edinburgh Museums and Galleries
  - **Action 30** – NHS Public Health Annual Report
  - **Action 37** – Gorgie Farm
  - **Action 39.2** – Amplification of Sound
  - **Action 40 (1&3)** – Trees in the City
  - **Action 41 (1)** – Third Party Cultural Grants
  - **Action 43** – Free Tickets Hogmanay
  - **Action 46.2** – Events Budgeting
- 2) To otherwise note the remaining outstanding actions.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log 7 December 2023, submitted)

## 5. Business Bulletin

---

The Culture and Communities business bulletin was presented.

### Decision

- 1) To note the updates in the business bulletin.
- 2) Park Lighting Improvements – To provide updates to committee members on the progress of the project.
- 3) Park Lighting Improvements – To circulate to committee members a briefing note detailing the four park lighting projects will be completed by the end of the financial year
- 4) Reuse of Tennis Balls at Council Facilities – To circulate via email to committee members the start date of this service.
- 5) Warm Spaces – Officers to work with organisations to identify potential Warm Spaces in areas of the city where there are currently none.
- 6) Management Rules for Public Parks and Openspaces 2023-2033 - To hold a briefing session with committee members prior to the consultation going live.
- 7) Carbon Management – Culture Funded Organisations – Officers to provide an on what happens to data provided by funded organisations after it is gathered.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Business Bulletin, 7 December 2023, submitted)

## 6. Police Scotland – Edinburgh City Division – Scrutiny Report – April to September 2023.

---

An update was provided on Police Scotland's Edinburgh City Division city-wide plans, policies and performance for the period April to September 2023.

Superintendents Mark Rennie and Sam Ainslie spoke to the report and responded to members' questions.

### Decision

To note the report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services.

(References – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted)

## 7. Culture and Communities: Revenue Budget Monitoring 2023/24 – Month Five Position

---

Details were provided on the Culture and Communities Revenue Budget Monitoring 2023/24 - Month Five Position which forecast adverse outturn variances of £1.47m for the Culture and Wellbeing service and a variance of £0.016m for the Parks and Greenspaces service. Measures would continue to be progressed by Place Directorate to offset budget pressures and to fully deliver approved savings targets to achieve outturn expenditure and income in line with the approved revenue budget for 2023/24.

## Decision

- 1) To note the forecast adverse outturn variance of £1.47m for the Culture and Wellbeing service and a favourable variance of £0.16m for the Parks and Greenspaces service, based on the five-month revenue budget monitoring position.
- 2) To note Place Directorate was forecasting a pressure of £0.71m as at month five.
- 3) To note the need for all existing pressures, savings delivery shortfalls and risks to be fully and proactively managed within Directorates.
- 4) To note measures would continue to be progressed by Place Directorate to offset budget pressures and to fully deliver approved savings targets to achieve outturn expenditure and income in line with the approved budget for 2023/24.
- 5) To note the ongoing risks to the achievement of a balanced budget projection for services within the remit of the Culture and Communities Committee.
- 6) To note a further update would be provided to members of the Committee.
- 7) To circulate to committee members, a briefing note in relation to the additional property costs at Saltire Court once negotiations with the landlord were complete.

(Reference - report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## 8. Future Libraries

---

An overview was provided of the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for the library service. Approval was sought to undertake engagement and consultation processes to gather views and suggestions in relation to the development work.

### Motion

- 1) To note the update on Edinburgh's Library Service and the plans for future development.
- 2) To agree the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for Edinburgh City Libraries Service which will provide the framework for service delivery and development over the next five years.
- 3) To agree to commence an engagement and formal consultation process, to be undertaken with residents, service users, elected members, key stakeholders and library staff to gather views and feedback on current and future libraries service provision in order to help shape a new libraries strategy and vision and to inform future proposals for change.
- 4) To agree to receive a future report following completion of the engagement and consultation processes, which will include any specific proposals for change and the new libraries strategy for approval.
- 5) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the development of the libraries strategy and vision.

- 6) If Committee agrees recommendation 5, to agree the membership of the APOG as proposed at paragraph 4.5 and note that the APOG will be convened at key stages of the service review.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Mitchell

### **Amendment 1**

- 1) To note the update on Edinburgh's Library Service and the plans for future development.
- 2) To agree the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for Edinburgh City Libraries Service which will provide the framework for service delivery and development over the next five years with the following additions;
  - a) To agree that no libraries are closed or have their opening hours reduced as a result of the review.
  - b) To agree that work is carried out to maximise the use of the existing estate, with an additional focus on areas with high levels of SIMD 1-4.
  - c) To put tackling poverty at the heart of the strategy and any future proposals
  - d) To enshrine work to enhance literacy in children, and throughout age groups
  - e) To support community-based activity within the buildings for older groups or residents as well as employability and service access services currently facilitated in libraries to enhance residents' wellbeing.
  - f) To seek to retain and enhance services that provide for residents who have English as an additional language.
  - g) To seek to recognise, enhance and protect the existing relationships that have been built between libraries staff and their communities
- 3) To agree to commence an engagement and formal consultation process, to be undertaken with residents, service users, elected members, key stakeholders and library staff to gather views and feedback on current and future libraries service provision in order to help shape a new libraries strategy and vision and to inform future proposals for change.
- 4) To agree to receive a future report following completion of the engagement and consultation processes, which will include any specific proposals for change and the new libraries strategy for approval.
- 5) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the development of the libraries strategy and vision.
- 6) If Committee agrees recommendation 5, to agree the membership of the APOG as proposed at paragraph 4.5 and note that the APOG will be convened at key stages of the service review.

- 7) To note that Blackhall Library remains closed due to the RAAC issues facing the building and asks for an update report in advance of this strategy being considered to Culture and Communities on options for the library's future.

- moved by Councillor McNeese-Mechan, seconded by Councillor Glasgow

### **Amendment 2**

- 1) To note the update on Edinburgh's Library Service and the plans for future development.
- 2) To agree the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for Edinburgh City Libraries Service which will provide the framework for service delivery and development over the next five years.
- 3) To agree to commence an engagement and formal consultation process, to be undertaken with residents, service users, elected members, key stakeholders and library staff to gather views and feedback on current and future libraries service provision in order to help shape a new libraries strategy and vision and to inform future proposals for change.
- 4) To agree to receive a future report following completion of the engagement and consultation processes, which will include any specific proposals for change and the new libraries strategy for approval.
- 5) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the development of the libraries strategy and vision.
- 6) If Committee agrees recommendation 5, to agree the membership of the APOG to be capped at one member per Council Group. The first meeting of the APOG will be in January 2024 and at that meeting it will be decided at what future stages the APOG will meet.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

### **Amendment 3**

- 1) To note the update on Edinburgh's Library Service and the plans for future development.
- 2) To agree the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for Edinburgh City Libraries Service which will provide the framework for service delivery and development over the next five years.
- 3) To agree to commence an engagement and formal consultation process, to be undertaken with residents, service users, elected members, key stakeholders and library staff to gather views and feedback on current and future libraries service provision in order to help shape a new libraries strategy and vision and to inform future proposals for change.
- 4) To agree to receive a future report following completion of the engagement and consultation processes, which will include any specific proposals for change and the new libraries strategy for approval.

- 5) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the development of the libraries strategy and vision.
- 6) If Committee agrees recommendation 5, to agree the membership of the APOG composed of a party spokesperson from each group. as proposed and to note that the APOG will be convened at key stages of the service review and with the remit and review dates agreed at the first meeting and reported in the business bulletin, in line with the guidance for APOGs agreed at Full Council in March 2023.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(13), Amendments 1, 2 and 3 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

### **Voting**

For the Motion (as adjusted) - 9 votes  
 For Amendment 3 (as adjusted) - 2 votes

(For the Motion (as adjusted): Councillors Lezley Marion Cameron, Glasgow, Heap McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Osler, Staniforth, Thornley and Walker.

For Amendment 2: Councillors Mitchell and Munro.)

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted Motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the update on Edinburgh's Library Service and the plans for future development.
- 2) To agree the proposal to develop a new strategy and vision for Edinburgh City Libraries Service which would provide the framework for service delivery and development over the next five years with the following additions;
  - a) To agree that no libraries be closed or have their opening hours reduced as a result of the review.
  - b) To agree that work be carried out to maximise the use of the existing estate, with an additional focus on areas with high levels of SIMD 1-4.
  - c) To put tackling poverty at the heart of the strategy and any future proposals
  - d) To enshrine work to enhance literacy in children, and throughout age groups
  - e) To support community-based activity within the buildings for older groups or residents as well as employability and service access services currently facilitated in libraries to enhance residents' wellbeing.
  - f) To seek to retain and enhance services that provided for residents who had English as an additional language.
  - g) To seek to recognise, enhance and protect the existing relationships that had been built between libraries staff and their communities.

- h) That the strategy would cover, but not be limited to tackling climate change, poverty and promoting social inclusion.
- 3) To agree to commence an engagement and formal consultation process, to be undertaken with residents, service users, elected members, key stakeholders and library staff to gather views and feedback on current and future libraries service provision in order to help shape a new libraries strategy and vision and to inform future proposals for change.
- 4) To agree to receive a future report following completion of the engagement and consultation processes, which will include any specific proposals for change and the new libraries strategy for approval.
- 5) To agree to establish a time limited All Party Oversight Group (APOG) to oversee the development of the libraries strategy and vision.
- 6) To agree the membership of the APOG to be capped at one member per Council Group as a party spokesperson from that Group. The APOG would be convened at key stages of the service review, with the remit and review dates agreed at the first meeting in January 2024. This will be reported in the business bulletin, in line with the guidance for APOGs agreed at Full Council in March 2023.
- 7) To note that Blackhall Library remained closed due to the RAAC issues facing the building and ask for an update report in advance of this strategy being considered to Culture and Communities on options for the library's future

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted).

## **9. New Collections Centre and Museums and Galleries**

---

Details were provided on the context within which officers were proposing to develop an Outline Business Case for the creation of a new collections centre and for the transformation of the Council's museums and galleries service.

### **Motion**

- 1) To note the work undertaken to date in respect of proposals to deliver a new vision for the Museums and Galleries Service: creating a new collections centre, maximising income to drive future innovation and refocussing the estate
- 2) To agree that officers should continue with the development of the Outline Business Case for a new collections centre and Museums and Galleries transformation, and progress with the feasibility study
- 3) To agree to continue investigations into the potential to introduce admission charges for people visiting the city (maintaining free access for residents), noting that if there is a legal basis to do so and Committee agree to proceed, a pilot could take place in 2024/25.



- 4) To approve that, subject to the wider Place Directorate budget financial performance, income from temporary exhibitions could be transferred to the Special Exhibitions Fund.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

#### **Amendment 1**

- 1) To note the work undertaken to date in respect of proposals to deliver a new vision for the Museums and Galleries Service: creating a new collections centre, maximising income to drive future innovation and refocussing the estate.
- 2) To agree that officers should continue with the development of the Outline Business Case for a new collections centre and Museums and Galleries transformation, and progress with the feasibility study.
- 3) To agree to continue investigations into the potential to introduce admission charges for people visiting the city (maintaining free access for residents and accompanying unpaid or paid carers), noting that if there is a legal basis to do so and Committee agree to proceed, a pilot could take place in 2024/25.  
Understanding that there is no barrier to commence training staff within the museums and galleries to greet visitors and encourage a donation as visitors leave the premises via cash or contactless card terminal and that this may provide a solution that drives up visitor donations from those who are able whilst maintaining free access to all visitors. Therefore, agrees that a trial should be undertaken of this method as other options are being further explored, reporting back ahead of any decision to introduce standard charges (maintaining free access as above).
- 4) To request that officers bring a report to Culture and Communities Committee exploring the proposal of setting a % of income from temporary exhibitions that could be ringfenced and automatically transferred into the Special Exhibitions Fund with additional deposits made subject to the wider Place Directorate budget financial performance to aid and protect venue sustainability.
- 5) To request a business bulletin update detailing progress made to utilise Creative Scotland funding to revamp the Museums and Galleries website – specifically to better facilitate digital fundraising via a prominent ‘Donate’ button, and further efforts to make it simpler to join Edinburgh’s ‘Friends of’ membership scheme.
- 6) To agree that restoring and reopening the popular Nelson Monument should be prioritised and therefore requests a further business bulletin to C&C in February 2024 updating on progress to date in achieving this.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

#### **Amendment 2**

- 1) To note the work undertaken to date in respect of proposals to deliver a new vision for the Museums and Galleries Service: creating a new collections centre, maximising income to drive future innovation and refocussing the estate.

- 2) To agree that officers should continue with the development of the Outline Business Case for a new collections centre and Museums and Galleries transformation, and progress with the feasibility study.
- 3) To agree to continue investigations into the potential to introduce admission charges for people visiting the city (maintaining free access for residents and persons with disabilities and low income people), noting that if there is a legal basis to do so and Committee agree to proceed, a pilot could take place in 2024/25.
- 4) To approve that, subject to the wider Place Directorate budget financial performance, income from temporary exhibitions could be transferred to the Special Exhibitions Fund.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the work undertaken to date in respect of proposals to deliver a new vision for the Museums and Galleries Service: creating a new collections centre, maximising income to drive future innovation and refocussing the estate.
- 2) To agree that officers should continue with the development of the Outline Business Case for a new collections centre and Museums and Galleries transformation, and progress with the feasibility study.
- 3) To agree to continue investigations into the potential to introduce admission charges for people visiting the city (maintaining free access for residents and accompanying unpaid or paid carers, and persons with disabilities and low income people”), noting that if there was a legal basis to do so and Committee agree to proceed, a pilot could take place in 2024/25. Understanding that there was no barrier to commence training staff within the museums and galleries to greet visitors and encourage a donation as visitors left the premises via cash or contactless card terminal and that this might provide a solution that drove up visitor donations from those who were able whilst maintaining free access to all visitors. Therefore, to agree that a trial should be undertaken of this method as other options were being further explored, reporting back ahead of any decision to introduce standard charges (maintaining free access as above).
- 4) To request that officers bring a report to Culture and Communities Committee exploring the proposal of setting a % of income from temporary exhibitions that could be ringfenced and automatically transferred into the Special Exhibitions Fund with additional deposits made subject to the wider Place Directorate budget financial performance to aid and protect venue sustainability.
- 5) To request a business bulletin update detailing progress made to utilise Creative Scotland funding to revamp the Museums and Galleries website – specifically to

better facilitate digital fundraising via a prominent 'Donate' button, and further efforts to make it simpler to join Edinburgh's 'Friends of' membership scheme.

- 6) To agree that restoring and reopening the popular Nelson Monument should be prioritised and to therefore request a further business bulletin to Culture and Communities in February 2024 updating on progress to date in achieving this.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **10. Cemeteries Update – Support for Volunteer Groups and Cemetery Rules**

---

An update was provided on revised Cemetery Management Rules agreed in August 2022 together with recommendations for the management and funding of cemetery 'Friends' groups.

### **Decision**

- 1) To agree that income described in paragraph 4.2 of the report by the Executive Director of Place should continue to be distributed between the Friends Groups specified in Appendix 1 to the report on receipt of an appropriate request from the organisation; and that said funding would be provided only for works within the relevant cemetery and must be accounted for by the recipients.
- 2) To note the update on Cemetery Management rules.
- 3) To agree to discharge outstanding remits for these items.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **11. Craigmillar Castle Park Cemetery Commissioning Phase 2**

---

An update was provided on the remaining capacity for burials at Craigmillar Castle Park Cemetery (CCP) and proposals to implement Phase 2 of the planned development of the site.

### **Decision**

- 1) To note the current limited burial space in the city, and the space currently available at Craigmillar Castle Park cemetery.
- 2) To note the intention to implement the Phase 2 development at Craigmillar Castle Park cemetery.
- 3) To discuss with colleagues in planning potential use of section 75 funds to support with the cemetery estate.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **12. Cultural Grants Funding 2018 - 23**

---

Details were provided on the impact an increase in the third party cultural grants revenue budget would have on the scope and sustainability of the city's key cultural infrastructure and deliverability of the Councils Business Plan and Cultural Strategy.

## Decision

To note the report by the Executive Director of Place.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## 13. Amplification of Sound in Public Spaces

---

Details were provided on the evidence required to lodge a byelaw application, together with the on-going work with the artist community and on the Convener's letter to the Scottish Government.

### Motion

- 1) To note the update on the evidence threshold for lodging a byelaw application.
- 2) To note officers would continue to engage with the busking community, Fringe Society, Keep Streets Live and others, exploring opportunities to work with them.
- 3) To note the Convener wrote to the Minister for Local Government, Joe Fitzpatrick MSP on 9 November 2023 to seek an early discussion on this issue and on the potential to extend the powers to local authorities for section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

### Amendment 1

- 1) To note the update on the evidence threshold for lodging a byelaw application.
- 2) To note officers would continue to engage with the busking community, Fringe Society, Keep Streets Live and others, exploring opportunities to work with them.
- 3) To note the Convener wrote to the Minister for Local Government, Joe Fitzpatrick MSP on 9 November 2023 to seek an early discussion on this issue and on the potential to extend the powers to local authorities for section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.
- 4) To acknowledge that whilst busking issues can be dealt with under existing legislation by Police Scotland, this rarely results in any meaningful action to address nuisance amplification in real time, resulting in residents self-enforcing the councils busking guidance rules.

Understands that at times this has led to conflict and agrees that artists busking should adhere to the council's guidance at all times. For clarity these are:

- busk between 9am and 9pm
- play at a considerate volume so passers-by can hear you but nearby businesses and residents are not disturbed
- move on to another pitch at least 50 meters away after one hour
- stop busking if anyone complains about what you're doing or if requested by a Police. Otherwise you'll risk being charged and having any equipment seized.

Please Don't

- set up your pitch within 50 metres of another busker
  - spread out equipment or other items that could get in pedestrians way
  - busk near doorways or cash points
  - act or speak aggressively to people asking you to stop
- 5) To request officers work to see how soft power of street enforcement officers can be utilised in helping buskers resident or visiting the city to understand and comply with the Transport & Environment Committee rules whilst work is ongoing to enable the devolution enforcement powers via section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor Glasgow

### **Amendment 2**

- 1) To instruct the Convener to write to the Scottish Government to provide the evidence gathered from the Council's survey and ask for its support for a bylaw to control the amplification of sound in Edinburgh.
- 2) To note officers would continue to engage with the busking community, Fringe Society, Keep Streets Live and others, exploring opportunities to work with them.
- 3) To note the Convener wrote to the Minister for Local Government, Joe Fitzpatrick MSP on 9 November 2023 to seek an early discussion on this issue and on the potential to extend the powers to local authorities for section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

In accordance with Standing Order 22(13), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To instruct the Convener to write to the Scottish Government to provide the evidence gathered from the Council's survey and ask for its support for a bylaw to control the amplification of sound in Edinburgh.
- 2) To note officers would continue to engage with the busking community, Fringe Society, Keep Streets Live and others, exploring opportunities to work with them.
- 3) To note the Convener wrote to the Minister for Local Government, Joe Fitzpatrick MSP on 9 November 2023 to seek an early discussion on this issue and on the potential to extend the powers to local authorities for section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.
- 4) To acknowledge that whilst busking issues could be dealt with under existing legislation by Police Scotland, this rarely resulted in any meaningful action to address nuisance amplification in real time, resulting in residents self-enforcing the councils busking guidance rules.

To understand that at times this had led to conflict and agree that artists busking should adhere to the council's guidance at all times. For clarity these were:

- busk between 9am and 9pm
- play at a considerate volume so passers-by can hear you but nearby businesses and residents are not disturbed
- move on to another pitch at least 50 meters away after one hour
- stop busking if anyone complains about what you're doing or if requested by a Police. Otherwise you'll risk being charged and having any equipment seized.

Please Don't

- set up your pitch within 50 metres of another busker
  - spread out equipment or other items that could get in pedestrians way
  - busk near doorways or cash points
  - act or speak aggressively to people asking you to stop
- 5) To request officers work to see how soft power of street enforcement officers can be utilised in helping buskers resident or visiting the city to understand and comply with the Transport and Environment Committee rules whilst work was ongoing to enable the devolution enforcement powers via section 54 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee of 13 December 2022 (item 10); Culture and Communities Committee of 5 October 2023 (item 5); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

## 14. **Edinburgh Film Charter Update**

---

Approval was sought for the updated Edinburgh Council Film Charter.

### **Decision**

To approve the updated Edinburgh Council Film Charter.

(References –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## 15. **Edinburgh Million Tree City Update**

---

Details were provided on progress with tree planting activities, procuring supplies, and establishing contacts with stakeholders and suppliers contributing to achieving the ambition to reach one million trees by 2030.

### **Motion**

- 1) To note the progress with the Edinburgh Million Tree City Project in reaching the Council's target of one million trees by 2030.
- 2) To note that a net increase of 55,469 trees (22% of 2030 target) have been planted so far, including 30,362 trees in 2022/23 (which takes into account 911 known tree removals).

- 3) To note the progress with determining planting locations and planting trees, and collating tree numbers.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Osler

#### **Amendment 1**

- 1) To note the progress with the Edinburgh Million Tree City Project in reaching the Council's target of one million trees by 2030.
- 2) To note that a net increase of 55,469 trees (22% of 2030 target) have been planted so far, including 30,362 trees in 2022/23 (which takes into account 911 known tree removals).
- 3) To note the progress with determining planting locations and planting trees, and collating tree numbers
  - 3.1) Part of this programme of work should include planting locations where perished street trees within appropriate pits / infrastructure can be replaced. Eg: Hunter Square.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor Glasgow

#### **Amendment 2**

- 1) To note the progress with the Edinburgh Million Tree City Project in reaching the Council's target of one million trees by 2030.
- 2) To note that a net increase of 55,469 trees (22% of 2030 target) have been planted so far, including 30,362 trees in 2022/23 (which takes into account 911 known tree removals).
- 3) To note the progress with determining planting locations and planting trees, and collating tree numbers.
- 4) To note the significant challenges relating to funding the Million Tree City project going forward, despite it being of clear strategic importance for climate adaptation in the city as outlined in the (forthcoming) Climate Ready Edinburgh plan.
- 5) To note that an amendment passed at Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee on 5th December agreed £560k of capital funding towards projects focused on net zero, climate adaptation and nature recovery.
- 6) To request that given by officers to allocating spending from that funding towards the Million Tree City project, given its clear alignment to the funding criteria and the absolute need for this resource.
- 7) To request that request and future projects are provided to the relevant committees via the Business Bulletin and / or other routine reporting.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

## Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the progress with the Edinburgh Million Tree City Project in reaching the Council's target of one million trees by 2030.
- 2) To note that a net increase of 55,469 trees (22% of 2030 target) had been planted so far, including 30,362 trees in 2022/23 (which took into account 911 known tree removals).
- 3) To note the progress with determining planting locations and planting trees, and collating tree numbers.

Part of this programme of work should include planting locations where perished street trees within appropriate pits / infrastructure could be replaced. eg: Hunter Square.

- 4) To note the significant challenges relating to funding the Million Tree City project going forward, despite it being of clear strategic importance for climate adaptation in the city as outlined in the (forthcoming) Climate Ready Edinburgh plan.
- 5) To note that an amendment passed at Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee on 5th December agreed £560k of capital funding towards projects focused on net zero, climate adaptation and nature recovery.
- 6) To request that given by officers to allocating spending from that funding towards the Million Tree City project, given its clear alignment to the funding criteria and the absolute need for this resource.
- 7) To request that request and future projects be provided to the relevant committees via the Business Bulletin and / or other routine reporting.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **16. Makers' Court: Proposed Additional Inscription for Donnchadh Bàn Mac an t-Saoir**

---

Approval was sought for the addition of a proposed new inscription to Makars' Court.

## Decision

To approve the addition of a proposed new inscription to Makars' Court.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

### **17. Museums and Galleries Edinburgh – Policies and Decolonisation Working Group Update**

---

A summary was provided on how Museums and Galleries Edinburgh's collections and activity progress Council and national museum sector objectives together with updates on the work of the Decolonisation Working Group.



## **Decision**

To note the report by the Executive Director of Place.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **18. Edinburgh Libraries – No Going Back**

---

An overview was provided of the Edinburgh Libraries No Going Back project, a community engagement programme undertaken with young people aged 11 – 18 years, to gather views and suggestions in relation to the Edinburgh Library Service which included what steps were being taken to respond to suggestions for improvement in the form of an action plan.

## **Decision**

To note the report by the Executive Director of Place.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

## **19. Motion by Councillor Walker – Fireworks**

---

The following motion was submitted by Councillor Walker in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee:

- 1) Condemns the events that took place in Niddrie and in other pockets across the city on Bonfire Night and the unnecessary danger this placed our emergency services and residents in.
- 2) Agrees the need for stricter regulations on the general sale of fireworks to members of the public.
- 3) Notes that ideally fireworks would only be permitted as part of organised events.
- 4) Requests a report on the cost and logistics of reinstating Council hosted firework displays and implementing a firework control zone.
- 5) Requests the Council Leader write to the Scottish and UK Government asking for the general sale of fireworks to be banned.”

## **Motion**

To approve the motion by Councillor Waker.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

## **Amendment 1**

To add to the motion by Councillor Walker:

“Notes that Police Scotland investigating officers do not believe the clashes were spontaneous and that Assistant Chief Constable Tim Mairs has stated that although many of those involved were youths, there were undoubtedly adults involved in orchestrating the behaviour.

Condemns unhelpful stigma perpetuated by surrounding coverage of the events in Edinburgh including the Edinburgh Evening News front page on the 8th of November

headed "Adults behind Niddrie Riot", accompanied by a picture showing a masked man throwing a molotov cocktail which later emerged to be a stock image taken of protests in Ukraine in 2014.

Understands that Local Authorities have new powers from Scottish Government to reduce the negative impact of fireworks and that from June 22nd 2023 councils can designate Firework Control Zones that would make it a criminal offence to ignite a firework, or knowingly throw a lit firework in a zone which can include private properties or gardens. The maximum penalties are a fine of up to £5,000 or up to six months in prison and that this does not stop a public organised event happening within a zone. Therefore encourages work to be undertaken to have Control Zones in place for 2024.

Further notes that First Minister Humza Yousaf has stated he would consider a ban on firework sales if it were within the Scottish Governments powers."

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor Glasgow

## **Amendment 2**

Committee

Removes the final paragraph of the motion by Councillor Walker and inserts the following:

- Notes the Fireworks and Pyrotechnic Articles (Scotland) Act 2022
- Notes that the new Act allows for Local Councils to set up "firework control zones" to restrict the use of fireworks in their areas.
- Notes that a new licensing system that will be operated by the Scottish Government is not yet in effect and when it is anyone purchasing and subsequently using fireworks will require a license.
- Requests the Council Leader write to the Scottish Government to encourage implementation of the new firework licencing scheme so that it can be in place prior to bonfire night 2024.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

## **Amendment 3**

Insert in the fourth point of the motion by Councillor Walker, after zone:

"in time for November 2024."

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth.

In accordance with Standing Order 22(13), Amendments 1 2 and 3 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

## **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To condemn the events that took place in Niddrie and in other pockets across the city on Bonfire Night and the unnecessary danger this placed our emergency services and residents in.

- 2) To agree the need for stricter regulations on the general sale of fireworks to members of the public.
- 3) To note that ideally fireworks would only be permitted as part of organised events.
- 4) To a report on the cost and logistics of reinstating Council hosted firework displays and implementing a firework control zone in time for November 2024.
- 5) To note the Fireworks and Pyrotechnic Articles (Scotland) Act 2022.
- 6) To note that the new Act allowed for Local Councils to set up “firework control zones” to restrict the use of fireworks in their areas.
- 7) To note that a new licensing system that would be operated by the Scottish Government was not yet in effect and when it was anyone purchasing and subsequently using fireworks would require a licence.
- 8) To request the Council Leader write to the Scottish Government to encourage implementation of the new firework licencing scheme so that it could be in place prior to bonfire night 2024.
- 9) To note that Police Scotland investigating officers did not believe the clashes were spontaneous and that Assistant Chief Constable Tim Mairs had stated that although many of those involved were youths, there were undoubtedly adults involved in orchestrating the behaviour.
- 10) To condemn unhelpful stigma perpetuated by surrounding coverage of the events in Edinburgh including the Edinburgh Evening News front page on the 8th of November headed "Adults behind Niddrie Riot", accompanied by a picture showing a masked man throwing a molotov cocktail which later emerged to be a stock image taken of protests in Ukraine in 2014.
- 11) To that Local Authorities had new powers from Scottish Government to reduce the negative impact of fireworks and that from June 22nd 2023 councils could designate Firework Control Zones that would make it a criminal offence to ignite a firework, or knowingly throw a lit firework in a zone which could include private properties or gardens. The maximum penalties were a fine of up to £5,000 or up to six months in prison and that this did not stop a public organised event happening within a zone. To therefore encourage work to be undertaken to have Control Zones in place for 2024.
- 12) To further note that First Minister Humza Yousaf had stated he would consider a ban on firework sales if it were within the Scottish Governments powers.

## **20. Motion by Councillor Heap – Free Little Libraries**

---

The following motion was submitted by Councillor Heap in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes:

- 1) That Little Free Library is a worldwide movement that aims to improve access to reading by promoting the installation of Little Free Libraries by local residents and community groups

- 2) That Little Free Libraries are usually small, weather-proof boxes that are installed in public spaces and where communities can donate and collect free books (See Appendix 1), and that some have additional facilities such as mobile device charging points.
- 3) That there are 9 such libraries registered on the LFL website in Edinburgh, and more registered on the Edinburgh Tool Library website.
- 4) The West and South of the city appear to lack LFLs compared to other areas (See Appendix 2).
- 5) The positive work of the Edinburgh Tool Library has done to help build and install the libraries.
- 6) That 500,000 children across the UK do not own a book.

Council believes:

- 1) That an expansion in the number of Little Free Libraries would play a role in broadening access to reading in the city.

### **Actions**

Committee requests:

- 1) A report is presented to the Culture and Communities Committee within 2 cycles outlining what the Council can do to help local residents and community groups install a Little Free Library in their local area, including:
  - a) Support in identifying appropriate locations, including any appropriate Council-owned sites
  - b) Support in identifying areas of the city without LFLs
  - c) Support from appropriately trained Council staff to build and/or install LFLs
  - d) Support for the Edinburgh Tool Library to continue to assist communities to create LFLs
  - e) Assistance to ensure LFLs are accessible to all members of the community
  - f) Grant funding to meet the modest costs of building and installing a LFL
  - g) Small donations of books from the Library Service and other appropriate parts of the Council
  - h) Any other issues officers deem relevant.”

### **Motion**

To approve the motion by Councillor Heap.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

## **Amendment**

To delete the Actions in the Motion by Councillor Heap and replace with:

- 1) Commends Edinburgh Tool Library (ETL) on their support and extensive information about Free Little Libraries.
- 2) Agrees officers will make contact with ETL with a view to understanding what assistance the Council could provide to promote ETLs roll out of Free Little Libraries across the City.
- 3) Provides a Business Bulletin update on progress of above in 3 cycles

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

## **Voting**

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	5 votes
For the amendment	-	6 votes

(For the motion: Councillors Finlay, Glasgow, Heap, McNeese-Mechan and Staniforth.)

(For the amendment: Councillors Graham, Mitchell, Munro Osler, Thornley and Walker.)

## **Decision**

To approve the following amendment by Councillor Osler:

- 1) To note that Little Free Library was a worldwide movement that aimed to improve access to reading by promoting the installation of Little Free Libraries by local residents and community groups.
- 2) To note that Little Free Libraries were usually small, weather-proof boxes that were installed in public spaces and where communities could donate and collect free books and that some had additional facilities such as mobile device charging points.
- 3) To note that there were 9 such libraries registered on the LFL website in Edinburgh, and more registered on the Edinburgh Tool Library website.
- 4) To note the West and South of the city appeared to lack LFLs compared to other areas.
- 5) To note the positive work of the Edinburgh Tool Library had done to help build and install the libraries.
- 6) To note that 500,000 children across the UK did not own a book.
- 7) To believe that an expansion in the number of Little Free Libraries would play a role in broadening access to reading in the city.
- 8) To commend Edinburgh Tool Library (ETL) on their support and extensive information about Free Little Libraries.
- 9) To agree officers would make contact with ETL with a view to understanding what assistance the Council could provide to promote ETLs roll out of Free Little Libraries across the City.

- 10) To provide a Business Bulletin update on progress of above in 3 cycles.

## **21. Motion by Councillor Osler – Right to Grow**

---

The following motion by Councillor Osler was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes:

- 1) The ongoing cost of living crisis faced by many of Edinburgh’s residents and that amongst other things, this can impact the ability to afford good quality fresh food.
- 2) That Edinburgh has a shortage of allotments and that demand far exceeds supply.
- 3) That the last update it received on Allotment and Food Growing Provision was in November 2020.
- 4) That the positive mental and physical wellbeing of communities coming together to grow food.
- 5) That in October 2023, Hull City Council unanimously passed a “right to grow” motion, on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation.

Committee asks:

- 6) For a report in three cycles looking into the possibility of whether Edinburgh could also adopt “a right to grow” policy on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation, and for a Business Bulletin update in two cycles on Allotment and Food Growing Provision”

### **Motion**

To approve the motion by Councillor Osler.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

### **Amendment 1**

Committee notes:

- 1) The ongoing cost of living crisis faced by many of Edinburgh’s residents and that amongst other things, this can impact the ability to afford good quality fresh food.
- 2) That Edinburgh has a shortage of allotments and that demand far exceeds supply.
- 3) That the last update it received on Allotment and Food Growing Provision was in November 2020.
- 4) That the positive mental and physical wellbeing of communities coming together to grow food.
- 5) That in October 2023, Hull City Council unanimously passed a “right to grow” motion, on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation.

Committee asks:

- 6) For a report in three cycles looking into the possibility of whether Edinburgh could also adopt “a right to grow” policy on Council-owned land that is deemed

suitable for cultivation, and for a Business Bulletin update in two cycles on Allotment and Food Growing Provision.

- 7) Request a short-written briefing on available land and costs for development or expansion of CEC allotment service sites to political groups in advance of the budget setting process.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

## **Amendment 2**

Committee notes:

- 1) The ongoing cost of living crisis faced by many of Edinburgh's residents and that amongst other things, this can impact the ability to afford good quality fresh food.
- 2) That Edinburgh has a shortage of allotments and that demand far exceeds supply.
- 3) That the last update it received on Allotment and Food Growing Provision was in November 2020.
- 4) That the positive mental and physical wellbeing of communities coming together to grow food.
- 5) That in October 2023, Hull City Council unanimously passed a "right to grow" motion, on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation.

Committee asks:

- 6) For a report in three cycles looking into the possibility of whether Edinburgh could also adopt "a right to grow" policy on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation, and for a Business Bulletin update in two cycles on Allotment and Food Growing Provision.
- 7) For the report to cover the possible benefits in terms of (1) Promoting low and no carbon food chains and tackling climate change. (2) Addressing food poverty.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

## **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Osler.

- 1) To note the ongoing cost of living crisis faced by many of Edinburgh's residents and that amongst other things, this can impact the ability to afford good quality fresh food.
- 2) To note that Edinburgh has a shortage of allotments and that demand far exceeds supply.
- 3) To note that the last update it received on Allotment and Food Growing Provision was in November 2020.

- 4) To note the positive mental and physical wellbeing of communities coming together to grow food.
- 5) To note that in October 2023, Hull City Council unanimously passed a “right to grow” motion, on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation.
- 6) To agree to a report in three cycles looking into the possibility of whether Edinburgh could also adopt “a right to grow” policy on Council-owned land that is deemed suitable for cultivation, and for a Business Bulletin update in two cycles on Allotment and Food Growing Provision.
- 7) To agree that the report cover the possible benefits in terms of (1) Promoting low and no carbon food chains and tackling climate change. (2) Addressing food poverty.
- 8) To request a short written briefing on available land and costs for development or expansion of CEC allotment service sites to political groups in advance of the budget setting process.

## **22 Motion by Councillor Thornley – Neighbourhood Networks**

---

The following motion by Councillor Osler was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes;

- 1) That showing that only 4 of 13 Neighbourhood Networks across the city meet regularly.
- 2) That Neighbourhood Networks can be complicated and inaccessible bodies for many and are frequently overly dependent upon a few key people to remain operational.
- 3) That Neighbourhood Networks replaced the Neighbourhood Partnership model in 2019.
- 4) The obligations placed upon the Council by the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.
- 5) The stated desire in the Council Business Plan 2023-27 to ‘evolve Community Councils and Neighbourhood Networks to ensure they provide communities with direct input.
- 6) That in some cases, Community Grants Funding is connected to Neighbourhood Networks, but not in others.
- 7) That no updates are currently provided on what is supported by Community Grants Funding, what criteria are required to be met to secure funding, and there for what is being achieved within communities.
- 8) A review of both Neighbourhood Networks and Community Grants Funding is currently ongoing.

Therefore;

- 9) Requests a report, within three cycles, providing an evaluation of the current situation of our Neighbourhood Networks and Community Grants Funding,



including a judgement of the success of the current model, suggestions for how community engagement could be improved, barriers to that engagement removed, processes simplified to improve accessibility and how participatory budgeting can be preserved and enhanced.”

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler

## **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor Thornley.

## **23. Motion by Councillor McFarlane – Third Party Cultural Grants**

---

The following motion by Councillor McFarlane was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

Committee:

- 1) Notes that at the October meeting of Culture and Communities the committee approved in principle the continuation of the three-year Strategic Partnerships Funding Programme.
- 2) Understands that fifteen of these partners are also currently funded by Creative Scotland (with others potentially applying) and that they should expect to understand the outcome of their three-year funding applications in 2024 for implementation from April 2025. The award level will likely impact the sustainability and output of our cultural partners.
- 3) Recognises the limited officer resource within the council to manage and oversee the grant programme and therefore thanks officers for their ongoing hard work and relationship building with the sector meaning the programme has been aligned to the new city culture strategy outcomes and has been further enhanced by sector feedback.
- 4) Committee further recognises the extraordinary output of our strategic partners achieved despite the increasingly challenging financial circumstances.
- 5) Whilst recognising the limitations of the current budget and officer resource allocation for this programme, committee agrees that there may need to be some adjustments made to the three-year Strategic Partnerships Funding Programme after Year 1 to consider:
  - a) Potential impact (positive or negative) of future CEC budget decisions relating to the Third-Party Cultural Grants Fund for following financial years.
  - b) Proposed levels of Creative Scotland support for these organisations.
  - c) The potential opportunity to align CEC and Creative Scotland multi-year funding cycles.
  - d) Ongoing understanding through dialogue and engagement with the Council's Third-Party Cultural Partners monitoring their sustainability considering the many pressures faced by the sector (most acutely felt by building based organisations) including inflation, the continued impact of

the Covid-19 pandemic, obligations to meet Fair Work First and climate adaptation.

- 6) Committee requests that officers take the above into consideration before bringing the recommendations (in principle) for Year 2 of this programme to committee.”

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

### **Decision**

To approve the motion by Councillor McFarlane.

## **24. Motion by Councillor Staniforth – Ending the Use of Fossil-Fuel Powered Leaf Blowers**

---

The following motion by Councillor Staniforth was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes:

- 1) That a 2011 study found that using a fossil-fuel leaf blower for 30 mins emits more carbon than a pick-up truck driving from Texas to Alaska.
- 2) That globally cities such as Portland have banned fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
- 3) That using leaf blowers outside of keeping paths clear of debris is damaging to biodiversity.
- 4) That fumes such as those from fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers have been linked to an increase in the risk of cancer, heart disease and asthma.

Committee therefore:

- 5) Requests a report to culture and communities within 2 cycles detailing options for
  - 5.1) The council ending its own use of fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - 5.2) The council ensuring its contractors do not use fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - 5.3) The council banning or regulating the use of fossil-fuel leaf blowers within the city of Edinburgh.”

### **Motion**

To approve the motion by Councillor Staniforth.

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Heap

### **Amendment**

“Committee notes:

- 1) That a 2011 study found that using a fossil-fuel leaf blower for 30 mins emits more carbon than a pick-up truck driving from Texas to Alaska.

- 2) That globally cities such as Portland have banned fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
- 3) That using leaf blowers outside of keeping paths clear of debris is damaging to biodiversity.
- 4) That fumes such as those from fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers have been linked to an increase in the risk of cancer, heart disease and asthma.

Committee therefore:

- 5) Requests a report to culture and communities within 2 cycles detailing options for
  - a) The council ending its own use of fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - b) The council ensuring its contractors do not use fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - c) Investigates the feasibility of switching to electric leaf blowers.
  - d) The council banning or regulating the use of fossil-fuel leaf blowers within the city of Edinburgh.”

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Heap

In accordance with Standing Order 22(13), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Staniforth

- 1) To note that a 2011 study found that using a fossil-fuel leaf blower for 30 mins emitted more carbon than a pick-up truck driving from Texas to Alaska.
- 2) To note that globally cities such as Portland have banned fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
- 3) To note that using leaf blowers outside of keeping paths clear of debris was damaging to biodiversity.
- 4) To note that fumes such as those from fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers had been linked to an increase in the risk of cancer, heart disease and asthma.
- 5) To request a report to culture and communities within 2 cycles detailing options for
  - a) The council ending its own use of fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - b) The council ensuring its contractors do not use fossil-fuel powered leaf blowers.
  - c) Investigates the feasibility of switching to electric leaf blowers.
  - d) The council banning or regulating the use of fossil-fuel leaf blowers within the city of Edinburgh.

## 25. Future Event Bidding Opportunity

---

The Committee agreed, under Section 50(A)(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, to exclude the public from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they would involve the disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraphs 6 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

### **Decision**

As detailed in the Confidential Schedule, signed by the Convener, with reference to this minute.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)