

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00am, Wednesday 4 September 2024

Present:

Councillors Osler (Convener), Bennett (substituting for Councillor Thornley), Cameron, Dalgleish, Gardiner, Jones, Mattos-Coelho, McNeese-Mechan, Mowat, Mumford and Staniforth (substituting for Councillor Parker).

1. Minutes

Decision

To approve the minute of the Development Management Sub-Committee of 7 August 2024 as a correct record.

2. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

The Sub-Committee considered reports on planning applications listed in sections 4 and 6 of the agenda for this meeting.

Requests for a presentation:

Councillor Mattos-Coelho requested a presentation on Item 4.3 – 55 Tower Street, Edinburgh (53 metres east of) - application no. 24/01798/FUL

Councillor Mumford requested a presentation on Item 4.1 - 5 Almond Avenue, Ingliston, Edinburgh - application no. 23/04655/FUL and Item 4.3 – 55 Tower Street, Edinburgh (53 metres east of) - application no. 24/01798/FUL

Requests for hearing:

Ward Councillor Booth requested a hearing on Item 4.3 – 55 Tower Street, Edinburgh (53 metres east of) - application no. 24/01798/FUL.

Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted).

3. Bonnington Mains Quarry, Cliftonhall Road, Newbridge, Edinburgh

The Chief Planning Officer had identified an application to be dealt with by means of a hearing

for the extraction of Quartz-Dolerite and erection of plant and ancillary structures (Section 42 application to vary condition 8 associated with air overpressure limits attached to planning permission 22/02514/FUL) at Bonnington Mains Quarry, Cliftonhall Road, Newbridge.

(a) Report by the Chief Planning Officer

The application had been referred to the Development Management Sub-Committee because 142 material objections had been raised and application was recommended for an approval. The planning application was in accordance with the Edinburgh Local Development Plan and National Planning Framework 4 and the proposed removal of condition 8 was acceptable.

The site was described as a quarry and parts of land to its west comprising of 16.1 hectares in total. It was bordered by the disused Craighall Quarry to its north, which was being restored for leisure and recreational use. Agricultural fields were located north and west, with Wilkieston Road to the south. The closest residential settlement is Park Ranger Lodge located within the former Craighall Quarry, approximately 100 m north-east of the site boundary. Beyond this, new residential development was approximately 235 m away at the closest point. Other individual farmhouses were located within the surrounding area. The larger settlement of Ratho was located to the far north-east whilst Bonnington is south-west and Wilkieston is south. To the south, this site led on to Bonnington Road which connected to the A71. It was designated as a minerals site and in the countryside in the Local Development Plan (LDP).

Supporting Information (such as Blast Method Statement – Cover Letter 'Proposed Condition Amendments' – Environmental Statements) and site history were provided. The determining issues and its assessment with other development plan considerations were submitted.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

[Development Management Sub-Committee - Wednesday 4 September 2024, 10:00am - City of Edinburgh Council Webcasts \(public-i.tv\)](#)

(b) It was confirmed by the Clerk there were no representatives, consultees, or Ward Councillors in attendance at this meeting.

(c) Representatives and Objectors

Judy Wightman, Chair of Ratho and District Community Council, expressed concern in relation to safe quarrying practices, and said that blasting should be avoided and the weather conditions taken into account to avoid noise reaching residential areas. Bonnington Village and Craighall would be affected by noise and shaking properties. The community wasn't aware about changes to blasting planning conditions and had been unable to take any action. Ms Wightman stated that the peak linear overpressure level of 120dB should not be exceeded, and noise levels should be monitored.

Paul Fisher, a chartered civil engineer and environmental manager, expressed concern about the report, which he thought was misleading. He said that air pressure would depend on the weather conditions and the noise level of 120dB would affect residents. He referred to blasting quarry guidance produced in 2014 in East Midlands. He encouraged members to retain the existing condition 8.

Ray Godfree, a chartered civil engineer and resident of Bonnington Cottages, said that wind and weather conditions were the main factors to consider. The proposed conditions were described as inadequate and should be refused. A new proposal was requested to fully control blasting at Bonnington Mains Quarry.

Valerie Thrush-Denning spoke on behalf of Stop the Quarry. Stop the Quarry was against the dropping of condition 8 for safety reasons. She stated that the decision would affect people for the next 25 years. The enforcement department should protect people, and, in this situation, she argued that it had put company profit over people's wellbeing.

Steve Warr, a Ratho resident, raised concerns about the planning application which, in his opinion, would lead to expansion of quarry industrial growth in this area due to strong commercial pressures. He questioned how far away the quarry should be allowed to operate from the residential area. He pointed to several environmental issues and concerns which had resulted in an investigation.

(d) Applicants and Applicant's Agent

Donald Wilkins and Richard Kennedy represented Breenon Training Limited. Mr Wilkins explained the geology of the area and company building products. He stated that the company had operated in line with the different planning permissions over the years. The planning permission limited the company to 2 blasts per week which were monitored for ground vibration and air overpressure. Routine blasting operations regularly generated air overpressure levels at the closest of adjacent property of around 120 dB. The pressure equivalent of 120 dB would be generated by a constant wind velocity of just 5ms⁻¹ (Beaufort force 3, gentle breeze) whilst an air overpressure of 130 dB would be equivalent to a wind velocity of less than 8ms⁻¹ (Beaufort force 4, moderate breeze). Those higher magnitudes would be perceived by individuals although they are entirely safe and driven by the weather conditions (clouds and wind). In accordance with the recommendations contained within PAN50, Annex D, paragraph 74, a Blasting Method Statement which had set out measures to control air overpressure was submitted to the City of Edinburgh Council in support of the planning application.

Decision

To **REFUSE** the section 42 application to vary conditions as the proposals were contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Des 5.

Dissent

Councillor Mowat requested that her dissent be recorded in respect of the above decision.

Appendix

Agenda Item No. /	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p>4.1 – 5 Almond Avenue, Ingliston, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Proposal of erection of extensions to hotel (phased) including landscaping, drainage, and car parking - application no. 23/04655/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement, as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer. 2) The correction of the sum for the tram contribution in informative 1 to £542,609, and the correction of the drawing references in Condition 9 to 03C and 04C. <p>Note: The updated list of drawing numbers is: 01,02,03C-06C,07B,08B,09-12,13A,14A,15B,16A,17B,18A,19,20A,21-24,25A,26A,27.</p>
<p>4.2 – 13 East Mains of Ingliston, Ingliston Road, Newbridge</p>	<p>Proposed hotel development, landscaping, access, servicing, car parking and associated ancillary development - application no. 24/00866/FUL</p>	<p>WITHDRAWN from the agenda by Chief Planning Officer.</p>

Agenda Item No. /	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>4.3 - 55 Tower Street, Edinburgh (53 metres east of)</p>	<p>Proposed residential development with associated public realm, access, landscaping, and infrastructure (as amended) - application no. 24/01798/FUL</p>	<p>Decision 1</p> <p>To agree not to hold a hearing and to determine the application at this meeting of the Development Management Sub-Committee.</p> <p>Decision 2</p> <p>To GRANT planning permission subject to:</p> <p>1) The conditions, reasons, informatives and a legal agreement, as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer, and referral to Scottish Ministers.</p> <p>2) The amendment of condition 8 to read:</p> <p>“Notwithstanding the approved drawings, to be reflective of the Council’s standards for Cycle Parking, the developer shall submit:</p> <p>i) A revised layout and design of the integral cycle stores in order to achieve a greater number of Sheffield stand and non-standard cycle spaces than is currently proposed, for the prior written approval of the planning authority and installed as approved thereafter, and</p> <p>ii) A plan showing the location and design of new on-street secure cycle stores to the planning authority for approval, and the cycle stores shall be installed as approved thereafter.”</p>

Agenda Item No. /	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>4.4 – 3 West Coates, Edinburgh, EH12 5JQ</p>	<p>Proposal for change of use from residential flatted property (Sui Generis) to hotel annex (Class 7) including enlargement of opening on west elevation to fit new door and fan light; alter door and screen and fit new double doors on north elevation - application no. 24/01997/FUL</p>	<p>To REFUSE planning permission for the reasons set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>6.1 - Bonnington Mains Quarry, Cliftonhall Road, Newbridge</p>	<p>Protocol Note by the Service Director – Legal and Assurance</p>	<p>Noted.</p>
<p>6.2 - Bonnington Mains Quarry, Cliftonhall Road, Newbridge</p>	<p>Proposal for extraction of Quartz-Dolerite and erection of plant and ancillary structures (Section 42 application to vary condition 8 associated with air overpressure limits attached to planning permission 22/02514/FUL) - application no. 24/01146/FUL</p>	<p>To REFUSE the section 42 application to vary conditions as the proposals were contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Des 5.</p> <p>Dissent</p> <p>Councillor Mowat requested that her dissent be recorded in respect of the above decision.</p>