

Minutes

Transport and Environment Committee

10.00am, Thursday 5 December 2019

Present

Councillors Macinnes (Convener), Doran (Vice-Convener), Arthur, Bird, Booth (substituting for Councillor Miller), Jim Campbell (substituting for Councillor Cook), Corbett, Key, Lang, Mowat (substituting for Councillor Douglas), and Whyte (substituting for Councillor Smith).

1. Citywide Ban on 'A' Boards and Other Temporary On-street Advertising Structures – 12 Month Review

(a) Deputation by Living Streets

The Committee agreed to hear deputations from Living Streets, the Edinburgh Access Panel and the Royal National Institute of Blind People (RNIB) in relation to the Citywide Ban on 'A' Boards and Other Temporary On-street Advertising Structures – 12 Month Review.

The deputations highlighted the following issues:

- That the deputations commended the Council for the implementation of the ban on 'A' boards and temporary on-street advertising structures that caused obstruction to access for those with disabilities.
- That 'A' boards and advertising structures on the streets caused injuries for those with sight or mobility impairments and made them fearful to walk the streets.
- That the ban had significantly improved the walking environment of Edinburgh's streets and granted freedom to those with disabilities.
- That there were still issues impeding access on the streets including bins, road works, signage poles and overhanging hedges.

The deputations requested that the Committee considered:

- That the ban became permanent and generated cross-party support.

(b) Report by the Executive Director of Place – Citywide Ban on 'A' Boards and Other Temporary On-street Advertising Structures – 12 Month Review

Following approval of the citywide ban on 'A Boards' and other temporary on-street advertising structures at the Transport and Environment Committee of May 2018, the findings from the 12 month post-implementation review were set out.

Motion

- 1) To note the impact that the citywide ban on 'A' Boards and other temporary on-street advertising had had on making the city's streets more accessible and safe.
 - 2) To note the positive feedback from a variety of stakeholders and members of the public on the difference that the ban had made to how they moved around the city, especially those with sight and/or mobility impairments.
 - 3) To note that the reduction in street clutter had had a positive impact on the appearance of the city, particularly in sensitive historic areas.
 - 4) To note the challenges that some businesses had experienced since the ban's implementation and agree that support would continue to be provided in exploring alternative forms of advertising.
 - 5) To agree that official event-related advertising displayed during the Festival Fringe remained exempt from the ban subject to concerns raised being addressed.
 - 6) To agree that the citywide ban should remain in place now that the 12 month review period had concluded.
 - 7) To agree to circulate to members the decision that was previously taken on community event advertising.
 - 8) To agree that the Executive Director of Place would discuss with senior staff the City of Edinburgh Council's (CEC) policy on the height and width of lamppost wrap communications.
- moved by Councillor Macinnes, seconded by Councillor Doran

Amendment 1

- 1) To note the impact that the citywide ban on 'A' Boards and other temporary on-street advertising had had on making the city's streets more accessible and safe.
- 2) To note the positive feedback from a variety of stakeholders and members of the public on the difference that the ban had made to how they moved around the city, especially those with sight and/or mobility impairments.
- 3) To note that the reduction in street clutter had had a positive impact on the appearance of the city, particularly in sensitive historic areas.
- 4) To agree a report on this support and examples of agreed alternatives would be reported back to committee within two cycles.
- 5) To note that the continuation of the exemption for exempt related advertising displayed during the festival fringe would still allow pedestrian areas to be cluttered with advertising paraphernalia.
- 6) To further note that overcrowding of pavements during summer festivals appeared at item 11 on CLT risk register.

- 7) To therefore agree to continue a decision on the exemption to investigate the possibilities of only allowing advertising in areas that were not footways or road ways that were designated for pedestrian use during the festival. The report would be presented to this Committee on the 27th Feb detailing any contract implications.
 - 8) To agree that the citywide ban should remain in place now that the 12 month review period had concluded.
 - 9) To agree that an annual update would be provided to committee detailing warnings and penalties issues to businesses for non-compliance.
 - 10) To agree to circulate to members the decision that was previously taken on community event advertising.
 - 11) To agree that the Executive Director of Place would discuss with senior staff the City of Edinburgh Council's (CEC) policy on the height and width of lamppost wrap communications.
- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Mowat

Amendment 2

- 1) To note the impact that the citywide ban on 'A' Boards and other temporary on-street advertising had had on making the city's streets more accessible and safe.
- 2) To note the positive feedback from a variety of stakeholders and members of the public on the difference that the ban had made to how they moved around the city, especially those with sight and/or mobility impairments.
- 3) To note that the reduction in street clutter had had a positive impact on the appearance of the city, particularly in sensitive historic areas.
- 4) To note the challenges that some businesses had experienced since the ban's implementation and agree that support would continue to be provided in exploring alternative forms of advertising.
- 5) To agree a report on this support and examples of agreed alternatives would be reported back to committee within two cycles.
- 6) To agree that official event-related advertising displayed during the Festival Fringe remained exempt on the basis that the recommendations set out were progressed; and that any further exemption beyond 2020 would require further approval from the committee.
- 7) To agree that the citywide ban should remain in place now that the 12 month review period had concluded.
- 8) To agree to circulate to members the decision that was previously taken on community event advertising.

- 9) To agree that the Executive Director of Place would discuss with senior staff CEC's policy on the height and width of lamppost wrap communications.

- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Corbett

In terms of Standing Order 21(12), Amendment 1 in full and paragraphs 1 and 3 of Amendment 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion by Councillor Macinnes.

Voting

For the motion - 8 votes

For amendment - 3 votes

(For the motion – Councillors Arthur, Bird, Booth, Corbett, Doran, Key, Lang, Macinnes.

For the amendment – Councillors Jim Campbell, Mowat and Whyte.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Macinnes:

- 1) To note the impact that the citywide ban on 'A' Boards and other temporary on-street advertising had had on making the city's streets more accessible and safe.
- 2) To note the positive feedback from a variety of stakeholders and members of the public on the difference that the ban had made to how they moved around the city, especially those with sight and/or mobility impairments.
- 3) To note that the reduction in street clutter had had a positive impact on the appearance of the city, particularly in sensitive historic areas.
- 4) To note the challenges that some businesses had experienced since the ban's implementation and agree that support would continue to be provided in exploring alternative forms of advertising.
- 5) To agree a report on this support and examples of agreed alternatives would be reported back to committee within two cycles.
- 6) To agree that official event-related advertising displayed during the Festival Fringe remained exempt on the basis that the recommendations set out were progressed; and that any further exemption beyond 2020 would require further approval from the committee.
- 7) To agree that the citywide ban should remain in place now that the 12 month review period had concluded.
- 8) To agree that an annual update would be provided to committee detailing warnings and penalties issues to businesses for non-compliance.
- 9) To agree to circulate to members the decision that was previously taken on community event advertising.

- 10) To agree that the Executive Director of Place would discuss with senior staff the City of Edinburgh Council's (CEC) policy on the height and width of lamppost wrap communications.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee on 17 May 2018 (item 2); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

2. Kirkliston and Queensferry Traffic and Active Travel Study

As requested by Councillors Young and Lang at the Council meeting of 29 June 2017, a detailed Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR) traffic study was undertaken in June 2018 in the Kirkliston and Queensferry area following the opening of the Queensferry crossing. The study results identified current route choices in the area and recommended transport and active travel interventions that could increase mobility and reduce the impact of traffic on key routes and junctions.

Councillor Young attended committee to answer questions as a ward councillor for the Almond ward.

Decision

- 1) To note the completion of the traffic survey in June 2018 and the content of the final Consultant's Report dated October 2019.
- 2) To note the detailed results of the survey with particular reference to Kirkliston Town Centre and the primary Queensferry routes.
- 3) To note the recommendations contained in the report and acknowledge that further consideration would be given to transport interventions and active travel improvements.
- 4) To agree to bring a report to Committee in six months that would review the effectiveness of the actions to be implemented as agreed in the report.

(References – Act of Council (Appendix 1), 22 June 2017; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

3. Minutes

Decision

To approve the minute of the Transport and Environment Committee of 11 October 2019 as a correct record.

4. Transport and Environment Committee Work Programme

The Transport and Environment Committee Work Programme was presented.

Decision

To note the Work Programme.

(Reference – Work Programme, submitted.)

5. Transport and Environment Committee Rolling Actions Log

The Transport and Environment Committee Rolling Actions Log for December 2019 was presented.

Decision

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
 - Action 18(1) - Transport Asset Management Plan (TAMP)
 - Action 21 - Transport Infrastructure Investment – Capital Delivery Priorities for 2019/20
 - Action 25 - Household Waste Recycling Centre Opening Hours
 - Action 30 - Motion by Councillor Corbett - Network Rail
 - Action 35(1) – Tackling Air Pollution – Low Emission Zones
 - Action 36 – Festive Waste and Recycling Collections
 - Action 44(2) - Presentation by Lothian Buses
 - Action 47(1&5) - Transport and Environment Committee Business Bulletin
 - Action 48 - Risk Based Approach to Road Asset Safety Inspections
 - Action 53 - Transport and Environment Committee Rolling Actions Log
 - Action 54(2) - Transport and Environment Committee Business Bulletin
 - Action 55(5) – Evaluation of the 20mph Speed Limit Roll Out
 - Action 56(2) - Household Waste Recycling Centres – Update
- 2) To note that the following actions would be transferred to the Culture and Communities Committee:
 - Action 2 – Water of Leith Valley Improvement Proposals (Dean to Stockbridge Section)
 - Action 16 - Proposal for a Conscientious Objectors Memorial in West Princes Street Gardens
 - Action 28(3) – Grounds Maintenance in the South West Locality
- 3) To agree to amend the wording for Action 50 – Strategic Review of Parking to reflect that updates would take the form of reports.
- 4) To agree that Committee Services and the Directorate would work together to rationalise and reduce the length of the Rolling Actions Log.
- 5) To otherwise note the outstanding actions.
(Reference – Rolling Actions Log, submitted.)

6. Transport and Environment Committee Business Bulletin

The Transport and Environment Committee Business Bulletin for December 2019 was presented.

Decision

- 1) To agree to discuss development plans for the Lothianburn Park and Ride with planning officers.
- 2) To agree to a Business Bulletin update in six months on the progress of the Energy Efficient Street Lighting Programme.
- 3) To agree to bring back an update to the Working in Partnership with Police Scotland with the inclusion of the outcome of discussions with Police Scotland on the lessons learned from the actions taken by the West Midland Police on Operation Close Pass.
- 4) To agree that officers would engage with the strategic context around the solutions for dealing with wider parking pressures and to bring back an update on this in the Business Bulletin.
- 5) To agree to consider options for a simplified road signage guide for members of public. This would include notification that the removal or displacement of signage was an offence.
- 6) To otherwise note the business bulletin.

(Reference – Business Bulletin, submitted.)

7. Progress Update on Edinburgh St James' GAM Works

An update was provided on the progress made with Growth Accelerator Model (GAM) Works being taken forward alongside the development of the new Edinburgh St James centre. A specific focus was provided on the redevelopment of Picardy Place

Decision

- 1) To note the progress made with the Growth Accelerator Model (GAM) Works.
- 2) To note that the design variation to Picardy Place as endorsed by Committee had been successfully integrated into the GAM contract including the reinstatement of Paolozzi sculptures and the Leith Central Station stones.
- 3) To note that the Picardy Place Central Island would be used as a compound to support the Tram Project's implementation, consequently only temporary footpaths and cycleways would be provided to link up with the new routes through Picardy Place.
- 4) To agree the need for further public engagement on the public realm enhancement opportunities on the Central Island and that this should proceed in Quarter 1 2020.
- 5) To agree that a report would be brought back to Committee providing the results of the consultation exercise and seeking approval to proceed with a preferred option for the Central Island.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

8. Decriminalised Traffic and Parking Enforcement Update

On 6 December 2018, the Transport and Environment Committee agreed to receive an annual report updating on the progress made in improving parking enforcement.

An update was provided on recent improvements and ongoing work to enhance enforcement activities in Edinburgh. An Annual Parking Report, providing parking statistics for the last financial year and contractor performance data for the latest contract year, was also appended to the report.

Decision

- 1) To note the improvements made for members of the public to report instances of incorrect parking.
- 2) To approve the inclusion of persistent offenders in the revised Removal Priorities List.
- 3) To approve clamping vehicles with 10 or more outstanding parking tickets.
- 4) To approve the introduction of bus lane cameras on Princes Street as a bus only street.
- 5) To note the annual parking report.
- 6) To agree to a report in six months reviewing the effectiveness of the actions to be implemented as agreed in the report.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee on 6 December 2018 (item 8); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

9. Gilmore Place Driveway Parking Overhanging Footway – Response to Motion

Gilmore Place was a residential street in the city centre ward. Over several years, property owners had created parking spaces replacing front gardens along Gilmore Place that were accessed by driving across the footway. Some vehicles subsequently overhung the public footway, which caused an obstruction of the footway adjacent to a busy road due to insufficient depth of garden space.

In response to a motion by Councillor Mowat to the South East Locality Committee on 21 January 2019, the enforcement regimes (planning, parking and regulatory) available to the Council to enable free access along the footway for pedestrians were set out.

Motion

- 1) To note the report.
 - 2) To discharge the approved motion of the South East Locality Committee on 21 January 2019.
- moved by Councillor Macinnes, seconded by Councillor Doran

Amendment

- 1) To note the report.
 - 2) To agree an update report within the next 12 months, on the impact of activities outlined in the report, any further measures to address the issue, and implications for other streets facing similar pressures.
- moved by Councillor Corbett, seconded by Councillor Booth

In terms of Standing Order 21(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion by Councillor Macinnes.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Macinnes:

- 1) To note the report.
- 2) To agree an update report within the next 12 months, on the impact of activities outlined in the report, any further measures to address the issue, and implications for other streets facing similar pressures.

(References – South East Locality Committee on 21 January 2019 (item 10); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

10. Communal Bin Enhancement Update

An update was provided on the Communal Bin Review project and its governance arrangements.

Decision

- 1) To note the report.
- 2) To agree to an update report every six months.
- 3) To agree to circulate to members the timescales for phase 2 of the Citizen Digital Enablement project to members, once available.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Bird declared a non-financial interest in this item as a Board Member of Changeworks.

11. Waste and Cleansing Services Performance Update

An update was provided on the Waste and Cleansing Services performance for the quarter two (July to September) of financial year 2019/20, along with an update on the progress made towards the activities to revise the suite of performance reporting measures for the service and the next steps involved.

The previous response to a motion by Councillor Webber to Council on 30 May 2019 was also updated, regarding waste collection services and the impact of bin placement.

Decision

- 1) To note the report.

- 2) To agree to circulate to members the data on overflowing bin complaints broken down by ward.
- 3) To agree to provide further detail on the issue where customers could evidence having paid for a permit but those details had not carried through to the service.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

12. 2019 Air Quality Annual Progress Report

An annual update was provided on the most recently available annual air quality monitoring data for 2018, local pollutant trends and emerging issues, fulfilling the requirements of the statutory Local Air Quality Management Framework.

Decision

To note the statutory Annual Progress Report submitted to the Scottish and UK Government as part of the Local Air Quality Management Framework.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

13. Internal Audit – The Council’s Roads Service Improvement Plan – referral from the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee

On 13 August 2019, The Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee considered a report by the Chief Internal Auditor on Internal Audit Annual Opinion for the year ended 31 March, which detailed the outcome of the audits carried out as part of the Council’s 2018/19 Internal Audit annual plan and the status of open Internal Audit findings as at 31 March 2019.

It was agreed to report to the relevant Executive Committee at the earliest opportunity and the subsequent Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee setting out clear plans to ensure the closure of all historic and overdue internal audit management actions to enable an improvement to the overall Internal Audit Opinion for 2019/20.

Therefore the Council’s Roads Service Improvement Plan was referred to the Transport and Environment Committee for consideration.

Decision

To note the Council’s Roads Service Improvement Plan.

(References – Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee, 13 August 2019 (item 7); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

14. Place Directorate – Internal Audit Action Update

Internal Audit’s annual opinion for the City of Edinburgh Council was set out for the financial year ended 31 March 2019 and the outcomes of Internal Audits completed at the end of the 2018/19 Internal Audit Plan which had either a Council-wide finding and were applicable to all Directorates or were specific to the Place Directorate were outlined.

Decision

- 1) To note the 2018/19 Internal Audit opinion and the associated summary findings from the final audits undertaken in the plan relevant to the Place Directorate.
- 2) To note the position in respect of the current open and overdue internal audit findings relating to the Place Directorate, particularly in respect of the actions which were within the responsibility of Transport and Environment Committee.
- 3) To refer the report to the Planning Committee and the Policy and Sustainability to consider the outstanding or overdue actions which related to their Committee remit.
- 4) To agree to refer the report and any feedback from the Committee to the next available meeting of the Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

15. Summertime Street Evaluation

An evaluation was provided of the Summertime Streets programme which took place in the Old Town during the summer festival period 2019. The evaluation included feedback from residents, businesses and stakeholders and a summary of the observations and monitoring information collected by officers.

Motion

- 1) To note that the feedback received on the Summertime Street programme within the Old Town during the summer festival period 2019.
 - 2) To agree to proceed with a Summertime Streets 2020 programme.
 - 3) To note that the proposal for Summertime Streets 2020 would be developed and presented to Committee for approval on 27 February 2020. This would take into account feedback received and analysis of the monitoring information collected during Summertime Streets 2019.
 - 4) To note that the third Managing the Festival City report would be presented to Culture and Communities Committee on 28 January 2020.
- moved by Councillor Macinnes, seconded by Councillor Doran

Amendment

- 1) To note that the feedback received on the Summertime Street programme within the Old Town during the summer festival period 2019.
- 2) To agree in principle to proceed with a Summertime Streets 2020 programme.
- 3) To agree that an outline plan would be submitted to Committee in February 2020 which would include the details of the plans for consultation with residents.
- 4) To agree that an interim workshop would be held for committee members and ward councillors between February and May 2020 to discuss any issues arising from the Summertime Streets programme.
- 5) To agree that a report containing a detailed operational plan would be submitted to Committee in May 2020 which would include details and mitigations for delivery access and bus service access.

6) To note that the third Managing the Festival City report would be presented to Culture and Communities Committee on 28 January 2020.

- moved by Councillor Mowat, seconded by Councillor Whyte

In terms of Standing Order 21(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion by Councillor Macinnes.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Macinnes:

- 1) To note that the feedback received on the Summertime Street programme within the Old Town during the summer festival period 2019.
- 2) To agree in principle to proceed with a Summertime Streets 2020 programme.
- 3) To agree that an outline plan would be submitted to Committee in February 2020 which would include the details of the plans for consultation with residents.
- 4) To agree that an interim workshop would be held for committee members and ward councillors between February and May 2020 to discuss any issues arising from the Summertime Streets programme.
- 5) To agree that a report containing a detailed operational plan would be submitted to Committee in May 2020 which would include details and mitigations for delivery access and bus service access.
- 6) To note that the third Managing the Festival City report would be presented to Culture and Communities Committee on 28 January 2020.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

16. Electric Vehicle Programme: Enforcement and Tariffs – referral from the Finance and Resources Committee

On 10 October 2019, the Finance and Resources Committee approved a report by the Executive Director of Place that set out both a proposed enforcement regime and the tariffs to be applied to both on- and off-street EV charging hubs.

The Finance and Resources Committee referred the report to the Transport and Environment Committee for noting.

Decision

To note the report.

(References – Finance and Resources Committee on 10 October 2019 (item 19); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

17. Place Directorate – Revenue Monitoring 2019/20 – Half-Year Report

The projected month six revenue monitoring position for the Place Directorate was set out, based on analysis of actual expenditure and income to the end of September 2019, and projections for the remainder of the financial year.

Decision

- 1) To note the that the Place Directorate was currently projecting a potential budget pressure of £5.615m for 2019/20.
- 2) To note that the Executive Director of Place was continuing to progress implementation of measures to reduce the potential budget pressure. £3.518m of planned measures had already been identified for implementation before the financial year end, which would reduce the budget pressure to £2.097m. Further measures were being identified to further mitigate the potential budget pressure.
- 3) To note that progress on the implementation of management actions would be reported to the Finance and Resources Committee on 23 January 2020 and the meeting of this committee on 27 February 2020.
- 4) To agree to remove the T&E Part in the Management Actions as part of the table at para 4.7 for future reports.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)