

Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal Joint Committee

10am, Friday 4 December 2020

City Region Deal Benefits Realisation Plan – Approach Towards Developing an Implementation Plan

Item number

Executive Summary

The [City Region Deal Document](#) states that each project approved by the Joint Committee will: *“be subject to review and evaluation.”*

The City Region Deal Benefits Realisation Plan (BRP) was [approved by Joint Committee on 4 September 2020](#), and sets out the overarching approach to reviewing and evaluating benefits. At this meeting, Joint Committee also agreed that the monitoring and evaluation outputs will be regularly reported to and appropriately acted upon by the Joint Committee.

Since then, the City Region Deal Programme Management Office has been working with all project and programme leads to agree relevant accountabilities and responsibilities for BRP delivery for each theme and each key step (e.g. data collection, evaluation design and delivery, etc.) who will undertake these steps and when, as well as how outcomes and impacts will be reported.

This report sets out a proposed approach and seeks views from the Joint Committee, as part of a wide consultation. The finalised implementation plan will be submitted to Joint Committee for approval in March 2021.

Monica Patterson

Chief Officer, Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal

Contact: Andy Nichol, Programme Manager, Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal

E-mail: andy.nichol@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 529 4461

City Region Benefits Realisation Plan – Approach Towards Developing an Implementation Plan

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 To note the proposed approach towards developing an Implementation Plan for the Benefits Realisation Plan.
- 1.2 To feed back any comments to the City Region Deal Programme Management Office (PMO).

2. Background

- 2.1 The City Region Deal Benefits Realisation Plan was [approved by Joint Committee on 4 September 2020](#), and sets out the overarching approach to reviewing and evaluating benefits. At this meeting, Joint Committee also agreed that the monitoring and evaluation outputs will be regularly reported to and appropriately acted upon by the Joint Committee.

3. Main report

- 3.1 The approved Benefits Realisation Plan set out the overarching steps, across each of the five Programme themes, to collecting relevant data, monitoring progress and evaluating impacts.
- 3.2 The City Region Deal PMO has since been working with all project and programme leads to agree relevant accountabilities and responsibilities for delivery for each theme and each key step (e.g. data collection, evaluation design and delivery, etc.). This includes determining the individuals will undertake these steps, when this will happen, and how outcomes and impacts will be reported.
- 3.3 Appendix 1 sets out the progress to date in establishing protocols across each City Region Deal theme in relation to responsibilities for reporting, baselining and how and when outputs and impacts will be recorded. As reflected by the different timescales in taking forward theme projects and programmes for this 15-year Programme, some themes already have these protocols in place (e.g. the majority of the Innovation projects) whereas others have yet to finalise their approaches (e.g. Transport and IRES) and, in the case of the Culture theme, any approach adopted will be subject to the outcomes of the revised business planning process.

- 3.4 In finalising implementation, and more importantly reporting outcomes and impacts on a consistent and regular basis, the City Region Deal PMO from now to the end of February 2021, is undergoing a period of consultation on the Implementation Plan where it is:
- Seeking views from the Directors' Group, Executive Board and Joint Committee on how the proposed frameworks may be enhanced and/or improved;
 - Engaging with the Regional Enterprise Council, elected members, Governments and other agreed stakeholders to confirm the adequacy of both the measures and reporting cycles implied in order to best meet their requirements;
 - Consulting with relevant health and social care colleagues to assess how best to integrate well-being measures across the current themes;
 - Finalising, for consultation across theme leads and all the above, approaches to capturing "Strategic Added Values" impacts.
- 3.5 Following this period of consultation, Joint Committee will receive a final implementation plan for consideration at their next meeting on 5 March.

4. Financial impact

- 4.1 There is no financial impact relating to this report; however, the Implementation Plan for approval in March will outline the resources and responsibilities required to monitor the impacts in the Benefits Realisation Plan.

5. Alignment with Sustainable, Inclusive Growth Ambitions

- 5.1 Inclusion is a key driver for the City Region. Deal Business cases for projects demonstrate how they will reduce inequalities and tackle the inclusion challenges specific to the City Region.
- 5.2 The Plan sets out how the potential benefits of applying consistent monitoring and evaluation of equalities, community benefits and social innovation across themes including:
- **Positive Actions** by monitoring and improving City Region Deal Programme outcomes for women, people with disabilities, those facing age barriers and individuals from ethnic minority communities (EMCs);
 - **Use of procurement data for Regional economic impact and innovation**, creating a baseline of Regional spend to understand the impact of public spending on inclusive growth, testing the robustness of the current multiplier values and also mapping key sectors in each authority and leveraging for social innovation, engagement and opportunity generation;
 - **Fair work practices and the UK real Living Wage**, ensuring all City Region Deal projects incorporate consideration of fair work and workers are paid the Living Wage; and,
 - **Showing the benefits of partnership working and innovation opportunities**, including alignment with other City Region Deal programmes or existing partner capacity, and opportunities for DDI and Social Innovation.

6. Background reading/external references

[The Magenta Book](#) (HM Treasury, Last Updated 1 April 2020)

[Guide for Effective Benefits Management in Major Projects](#) (Infrastructure and Projects Authority and Cabinet Office, October 2017)

[A Playbook for Designing Social Impact Measurement](#) (Gwendolyn Reynolds, Lisa C. Cox, Nicholas Fritz, Daniel Hadley, & Jonathan R. Zadra Dec. 21, 2018)

[City Region Deal Benefits Realisation Plan](#) – report by the Chief Officer, Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal, 4 September 2020

7. Appendices

7.1 BRP Implementation Approaches and Schedule

7.2 Proposed Approach to Measuring Strategic Added Value

Appendix 1 – BRP Implementation Approaches and Schedule

Theme	Who?	Outputs	When?	How?	Impacts	When?	How?
DDI (UoE and Heriot-Watt)	Operational team DDI PMO (Lead: John Scott)	Construction Employment	Annually	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Construction Employment	Annually	Based on agreed multiplier ratio
		Expenditure draw down	Annually with quarterly updates on a rolling basis to track actual v projected levels	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Expenditure draw down	N/R	N/R
		Number of DDI Students	Annually	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Number of DDI Students	Every three years after post-graduation (i.e. from 2027)	Benchmark DDI cohort progress against average sector wage data both weighted where possible by regional differences
		Research Income	Annually	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Research Income	Every three years for research awards over £1 million (i.e. from 2024)	The Universities will agree with funders - the likely timescales, scale of innovation and financial and other returns potentially associated with such grants and agree how best and when to track these returns.
		Adoption Income	Annually	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Adoption Income	Every three years (i.e. from 2024)	Each (adoption) partner will be asked to provide anonymised information concerning the projected annual financial returns anticipated with associated time lags in relation to their investment both at the

							relevant University and as a proportion of their total company investment if relevant.
		Entrepreneurs hip	Annually	Via DDI dashboard analysis (currently being developed)	Entrepreneurs hip	Every three years (i.e. from 2024)	Each company on securing seed or other forms of funding will be contacted by the Universities every three years to provide anonymised data in relation to any further funding secured and current employment levels.
Edinburgh Innovation Park (QMU Food and Drink Innovation Hub)	Operational Team ELC/QMU	Innovation Hub grants access to: 1. Commercial rental space for Food & Drink businesses. 2. Generic service support from QMU/Business Gateway. 3. Equipment/infrastructure/expertise to develop/market new products.	Annually	Dashboard approach to be tailored for individual inputs and outputs	Construction employment	Annually	Difference in jobs created for those with protected characteristics measured against national data
	PMO Primary Contact – Catherine Molloy (ELC) PMO Secondary Contact – Steve Scott (QMU)	Catalyse knowledge transfer by leading on coordination of food and drink innovation activities and skills development	Annually	Dashboard approach to be tailored for individual inputs and outputs	Generate new processes/products for Food and Drink businesses/SME to aid development of new products by the provision	Annual tracking of successful new product development and product	Comparison to local and national datasets for start-ups and growth businesses

		on a national/international scale/hosting events for local/regional/national SME to share knowledge			of specialist facilities within the Innovation Hub.	reformulation	
		Increase resilience of Scottish SME. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop food science pathway. • Collaboration with other organizations working in F&D/R&D by identifying synergy complimentary services 	Annually	Dashboard approach to be tailored for individual inputs and outputs	Increase commercialisation of research/innovation.	Annual tracking of sales of new product development and product reformulation	Comparison to local and national datasets for start-ups and growth businesses
	Entrepreneurship				Annually	Regular and ongoing monitoring of SME/start up sustainability / growth	
	Contribute to inclusive growth in the region				Quarterly and Annually	Additional regular reporting mechanisms so as to establish additionality achieved	
	Community Benefits				Quarterly and Annually	Additional regular reporting mechanisms so as to establish additionality achieved	
	Contributing to the achievement of Ambition 2030's skills agenda, by				Annually on graduation	Comparison to national average wage and employment data compared to above and other HESA data	

					increasing international reach of graduates		
					Catalyst for development of 52-acre innovation park – further associated developments/ Inward Investment		
Innovation Parks (Fife i3 Programme)	Lead: Fife Council i3 Programme Manager (Contact: Kirstin Marsh, City Deal Project Manager)	Business space constructed (m ²) Land serviced and available for sale (Ha) Jobs supported by construction investment Modern Apprenticeships supported by construction investment	Annually (from 2021) Annually (from 2021) Annually Annually Annually	Floorspace completed Land marketed / sold Fife Council Construction procurement Fife Council Construction procurement Fife Council Finance tbc	Jobs Supported at Fife i3 Programme locations Innovation active businesses / businesses engaged in DDI performing more strongly than Fife average Private sector investment leveraged	Annually (from 2022) Annually (from 2022) Annually (from 2021)	Tenant Application / Surveys Tenant Application / Surveys and GVA and R&D averages for Fife and DDI Programme benchmarks Tenant Application / Surveys; building warrants from Fife i3 Programme locations; JV agreements

		Total Expenditure (£ invested in Fife i3 Programme delivery)	Annually	Business Property Team			
		Use of Community Benefits	Annually (from 2021)	Tenant Application / Surveys			
		Office and Industrial space occupied (m ² and % of completed space)	Annually (from 2022)				
		Number of innovation active businesses / businesses engaged in DDI					
Innovation Parks (Borders Innovation Park)	Economic Development, SBC (Stuart Kinross)	Office and Industrial space constructed (m ²)	Annually	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Office and Industrial space occupied (m ²)	Annually	Based on the difference in space when comparing occupied space to total space available (expressed in percentage terms).
		Expenditure drawdown	Annually with quarterly updates on a rolling basis to track actual v. projected levels	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)			

		Construction jobs created	Annually	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Construction jobs created	Annually	Number of construction jobs created.
		Jobs created	Annually	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Jobs created	Annually (from 2021)	Number of jobs created per employer with breakdown by role and protected characteristics.
		Use of community benefits	Quarterly	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Use of community benefits	Quarterly	Use of mandatory and supplementary indicators. Impacts additional to regular reporting mechanisms so as to establish additionality achieved.
		Number of business start-ups	Annually	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Number of business start-ups measured against national datasets	Annually (from 2021-22)	Number of start-ups in innovation park; number of start-ups proceeding to growth pipeline. Comparison to national datasets for start-ups and growth businesses.
		Number of innovation active businesses and businesses engaged in DDI	Annually	All via dashboard analysis (to be developed)	Number of innovation active businesses and businesses engaged in DDI	Annually (from 2021-22)	Comparison to national datasets for innovation active businesses; use of DDI programme data as benchmark.
IRES	IRES Programme Management Office	Direct jobs Generated	Annually (with Quarterly updates to the IRES Board as required)	Via IRES Programme Monitoring and Evaluation (currently being developed)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uplift in Employment • Jobs linked to DDI and HCI Skills Gateways Community Benefits across all themes (happy to remove If	After the first 3 years	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employment Rates • Linked to DDI and HCI Gateway outcomes • Linked to IEE indicator for community benefits (Actual indicators will be developed through the IRES Monitoring and Evaluation work, currently being prepared)

					CB is picked up elsewhere)		
		Skills Enhancements			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Skills uplifts Improved Workforce representation across under-represented groups 	Over 5 Years	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Linked to number of participants completing skills enhancement projects • Linked to National Statistics on represented groups <p>(Actual indicators will be developed through the IRES Monitoring and Evaluation work, currently being prepared)</p>
		Enhanced Jobs			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sustained employment / wage rate uplift Sustained increases in recruitment for under-represented groups 	Over the 8 Years of the Programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Linked to employment rates and average income statistics • Linked to National Statistics on represented groups <p>(Actual indicators will be developed through the IRES Monitoring and Evaluation work, currently being prepared)</p>
Transport (West Edinburgh)	The City of Edinburgh Council, West Lothian Council and Transport Scotland	Construction Employment (including those with protected characteristics)	Annually	Via WETIP Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (currently being developed)	On-going measurement of Transport benefit improvements	After 2023	Through a range of Monitoring and Evaluation tools to be confirmed in the M&E and Benefits Realisation Plan (eg Public Transport Journey Times, patronage, surveys etc)
		Expenditure Drawdown	Annually with quarterly updates	Via the PMO Financial Reporting Channels	Connectivity and Environmental Impact stock takes	Over the 7 year programme	As agreed
Culture (Dunard)	<i>To be completed</i>	Construction Employment (including those with protected	Annually	To be completed	Attendee levels	<i>To be completed</i>	<i>To be completed</i>

		characteristics)					
		Expenditure Drawdown	Annually with quarterly updates	To be completed	Outreach programmes	<i>To be completed</i>	<i>To be completed</i>
					Jobs maintained	<i>To be completed</i>	<i>To be completed</i>
					Construction and Centre employment/ attendees over the period of the Programme	<i>To be completed</i>	<i>To be completed</i>
Housing Programme	David Baxter EESCR Deal PMO	Construction Employment	Annually	TBC – likely dashboard approach	Construction Employment	Annually	Based on agreed formula.
		Expenditure draw down	Annually with quarterly updates		Expenditure draw down	Annually	Regional Affordable Housing Programme, Strategic Sites and Edinburgh Living. Sources – National AHSP programme, 6 x SHIPs and project lead/Council held data
		Affordable and market homes (approved and completed)	Annually		Total number of homes delivered.	Annually	Regional Affordable Housing Programme, Strategic Sites and Edinburgh Living. Sources – National AHSP programme , 6 x SHIPs and 6 x Housing Land Audits, 6 x LA housing statistics returns
		Tenure mix (affordable, market, midmarket and build to rent)	Annually		Tenure breakdown of total homes delivered.	Annually	Regional Affordable Housing Programme, Strategic Sites and Edinburgh Living. Sources – National AHSP programme, 6 x SHIPs, 6 x Housing Land Audits and for

							BTR/MMR - project lead/Council held data ¹ , 6 x LA housing statistics returns
		Specialist provision including Wheelchair Accessible Housing	Annual - when HNDA 3 is complete (aim of achieving “robust and credible status” from the CHMA by March 2022)		Total accessible and other specialist provision homes.	Annually	Regional partners have commenced the next Housing Need and Demand Assessment (HNDA 3) this work aims to establish a robust evidence base and will have an increased focus on specialist provision (including need for wheelchair accessible, other accessible, adapted housing and housing for specialist groups for example Gypsy/Travellers and veterans). When this work is completed a regional target and five-year delivery number will be developed.

Type of info required	Financials		Progress Report	BRP Quantitative info	BRP Qualitative info
Who to send?	Finance Lead		Project Lead	Project Lead	Project Lead, Comms Lead, Procurement Lead
Details	Monthly forecast	Quarterly claim	RAG, SAV score and comments	Quantitatively info: Outputs and impacts	Case studies and community benefits
When?	5 th working day of the month	TBC	5 th working day of the month	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monthly info: 5th working day of the month Quarterly info: 5th working day of February, May, August and November Annual info: 5th working day of July 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5th working day of the month (when there is information available)

¹ Tenure breakdown – BTR and MMR is sought from project leads on strategic sites and Edinburgh Living

Strategic Added Value – Proposed Measurement System for Benefits Realisation Reporting

The Deal document describes five main ways our interventions will ensure that the benefits of City Region Deal investment are shared as widely as possible and support inclusive growth across the region:

1. Investing in the city region to deliver **economic growth**, especially through construction and data-driven innovation.
2. **Unlocking physical barriers to growth**, especially through the housing and transport programmes.
3. **Community Benefits** through procurement to target inclusive employment practices and other opportunities.
4. Targeted **employability and skills interventions** to ensure that job opportunities are available to those who need them most.
5. **Social benefit through innovation**, for example through challenge-based programmes, to help tackle challenges specific to this region.

One of the ways to meeting these objectives is through partnership working across themes and beyond the City Region Deal structure (i.e. with the private and third sectors, academia and other public bodies as well as other city regions).

To monitor the maturity of such arrangements we propose, as illustrated in Table 1, a scoring system out of three. Project leads should assign a score based on what they feel the realistic ambition for any project or programme is. They will update this annually.

Table 1: Strategic Added Value Scoring System

S.A.V. Score	Description
1 (Low)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are opportunities for links with one or two other CRD themes that may add value to the proposal. • Partnership working with wider stakeholders, e.g. private/third sector to add value to the proposal has not been thoroughly considered, but may be possible, and should be explored further. • One or two of the five “inclusive growth” measures could be incorporated into the delivery of the project.
2 (Medium)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are opportunities for links with two or three other CRD themes that may add value to the proposal. • Partnership working with wider stakeholders, e.g. private/third sector to add value has been factored into the business case to some extent, but there are opportunities to enhance this to further add value. • Two or three of the five “inclusive growth” measures could be incorporated into the delivery of the project.
3. (High)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are opportunities for links with three of four other CRD themes that may add value to the proposal. • Partnership working with wider stakeholders, e.g. private/third sector is already taking place and strategic added value effects are clear. • Three, four or five “inclusive growth” measures could be incorporated into the delivery of the project.

In addition – **where a ranking of 3 is agreed**, we propose, as illustrated in Table 2 below, to capture the “Strategic Added Value” benefits of such new partnership arrangements across five dimensions.

Table 2: Potential Strategic Added Value Elements of the City Region Deal

Definition	Examples
<p>Strategic leadership & catalyst: Articulating and communicating Regional development needs, opportunities and solutions to partners and stakeholders in the Region and elsewhere.</p>	<p>Creating confidence in the prospects for economic growth and in the capacity of partners and stakeholders to realise the potential for growth and improved CRD performance.</p>
<p>Strategic influence: Carrying out or stimulating activity that defines the distinctive roles of partners, gets them to commit to shared strategic objectives and to behave and allocate their funds accordingly.</p>	<p>Generating cross-Regional partnerships of mutual benefit to the growth prospects of each participating area. Achieving alignment and inter-locking of the priorities and investment plans of CRD and other partners.</p>
<p>Leverage: Providing financial and other incentives to mobilise partner and stakeholder resources – equipment, people as well as funding.</p>	<p>Levered funding and other resources from partners and stakeholders in support of CRD objectives.</p>
<p>Synergy: Using organisational capacity, knowledge and expertise to improve information exchange and knowledge transfer and coordination and/or integration of the design and delivery of interventions between partners.</p>	<p>Reduced duplication of service provision from Regional partners – e.g. in business development support. Scaling up of projects and programmes to beneficial levels that achieve scale economies and provide for critical mass in securing benefits.</p>
<p>Engagement: Setting up the mechanisms and incentives for more effective and deliberative engagement of stakeholders in the design and delivery of Regional and sub-Regional priorities and programmes.</p>	<p>Introducing quality and innovation in CRD interventions through the transfer of good practice, the development and use of benchmarks and the adoption of new processes.</p>

Finally every year we will select up to five Strategic Added Value exemplars for a more detailed case study review and to support our “annual conversation” with Governments as well as on going engagement with regional stakeholders and communities.