

Amendment by the Coalition

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.1 Potential retention of Spaces for People measures

Committee:

Accepts recommendations 1.1.1-1.1.6

Adds

1.1.7 - Welcomes the high level of public engagement through the consultation and recognises the complexity of competing needs expressed around road space allocation, particularly in ensuring accessibility.

1.1.8 - Notes that officer recommendations are based on:

- Public consultation
- Market Research
- Stakeholder surveys
- Assessment against previously agreed criteria
- Assessment in light of existing transport policy and direction

1.1.9 - To better reflect the consultation responses of residents and businesses, in particular where feedback has been fairly definitive in the views of respondents, Committee agrees to:

- Remove the scheme at Lanark Road, as one of this scheme's main purposes was to relieve lockdown pressure on the water of Leith paths. However requests officers retain the speed limit at 30mph which has improved safety for all residents and consider any actions to minimise conflict for all Water of Leith path-users at this section and to improve winter travelling conditions in this location.
- Ask officers to further engage with the local residents and community representatives ahead of an ETRO to further address resident parking pressure along the Longstone Corridor.
- Bring a report to the September Transport and Environment Committee on options for modifications to Silverknowes Road South, including possible removal of the scheme.
- Bring a report to the August Transport and Environment Committee on options for Comiston Road, to improve public transport connectivity and reduce impacts on local residents.
- Bring a report to the August Transport and Environment Committee on options for modifications to Drum Brae North based on the concerns expressed through the public engagement.

- Bring a report to the September Transport and Environment Committee on options for retaining Forrest Road and George IV Bridge, based on the support identified in the consultation, until the permanent scheme can be implemented- including options to accelerate the delivery of those schemes.
- Bring a report to the August Transport and Environment Committee on Braid Road, with options for the reopening of the road in both directions, including analysis of impacts on traffic levels, resident connectivity and vulnerable road users walking, wheeling and cycling.
- Improve signage at West Harbour Road/West Shore Road to more clearly inform motorists of the closure and increase disabled parking bays at the closed point to improve disabled access.

1.1.10 - Agree the remaining recommendations for schemes as set out in the report however also agrees to:

- Continue to work with Living Streets, local businesses and the access panel to explore long term replacements for the Shopping Streets schemes being removed to give adequate safe space for pedestrians.
- Continue to make any changes required to improve safety and accessibility for residents and disabled people for all other schemes progressing to an ETRO through those statutory processes.'
- Recognise the importance of engagement in communities as schemes go through the ETRO, particularly in protecting vulnerable road users.

Moved by Councillor L Macinnes

Seconded by Councillor K Doran

Amendment by the Conservative Group

Transport and Environment

17th June 2021

Item 7.1 - Potential retention of Spaces for People Measures

Delete recommendations and replace with:

1.1 Transport and Environment Committee:

- 1.1.1 Notes it is the intention that the measures introduced under the existing Spaces for People Programme, under Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders (TTROs) be retained while public health advice continues to advocate maintaining physical distancing measures;
- 1.1.2 Requests that detail of the ongoing liaison with Transport Scotland on the duration of these measures be reported back to Committee each cycle to validate the need for the retention of the Spaces for People measures;
- 1.1.3 Notes the update in Appendix 1 on the existing schemes;
- 1.1.4 Notes the concerns raised by the deputations drawing our attention to the flaws in both the city-wide consultation and the City of Edinburgh Council commissioned market research;
- 1.1.5 Agrees that the outcome of the city-wide consultation, which contains the clearly stated views of Edinburgh residents and businesses with over 17,600 responses, (and NOT the market research), form the basis of the decision making on the retention or removal of the current Spaces for People Schemes as was agreed at Committee in January 2021 as noted in the Annex to this motion below;
- 1.1.6 Note that to date any work to minimise the impact on people with limited mobility and other disabilities, including sensory impairments, has fallen short of what is required, and has led to incidences of isolation, loneliness and mental health issues;
- 1.1.7 Refer this report to the City of Edinburgh Council meeting on 24th June 2021 for approval of the revised recommendations as per 1.1.5 and for commencement of the statutory processes and the localised development of the necessary school schemes that gained public support;
- 1.1.8 Considers that any individual measures that officers seek to adapt or partly implement that were previously Spaces for People schemes should be brought forward through a full Traffic Regulation Order process (as opposed to further experimentation) with an assessment of impact on the overall transport network and a full equalities impact assessment.

Annex A – Extract from the Minutes of the Meeting of the Transport and Environment Committee of January 2021

“To note the intention to review the current measures to determine if it would be beneficial to retain or adapt them to support the Council’s wider strategic objectives. The arrangements for doing so were set out in paragraphs 4.30 – 4.33 and in Appendix 3 of the report and it was intended to update Committee on this in April 2021.

Potential Scheme Retention

4.30 There are strong strategic reasons to continue or adapt existing schemes to align with the aims and objectives of the Council’s Local Transport Strategy, draft City Mobility Plan, the Active Travel Action Plan 2016, and the Edinburgh City Centre Transformation programme to protect vulnerable road users, provide opportunities for active travel and/or improve safety on the street environment.

4.31 It is therefore proposed to assess the existing SfP measures to determine whether it is appropriate to retain or adapt measures beyond the period of the pandemic using separate legal powers.

4.32 Assessment considerations have been developed to determine if it would be appropriate to retain existing SfP projects, or elements of them. In most cases retention would initially be for a limited period on an experimental basis aligned with the economic recovery, in order to monitor how the city’s transport network is used and to ensure that there is protection for active travel modes. This is likely to mean Page 110the use of Experimental TRO (ETRO) powers as opposed to continuation of using TTRO powers. Draft considerations are set out in Appendix 3.

4.33 In parallel with the assessment of projects discussed above, it is proposed to carry out a consultation exercise to seek views on the retention or adaptation of appropriate measures. Following the consultation and assessment, it is intended to bring an update on this to Committee in April 2021.”

Moved by: Councillor Susan Webber
Seconded by: Councillor Stephanie Smith

Amendment by the Green Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.1 - Potential retention of Spaces for People measures

Inserts additional recommendation:

- Edinburgh has an opportunity after the pandemic to lead a green recovery, as is being seen in capitals across Europe. The measures introduced by Spaces for People are one element of our opportunity, giving Edinburgh a chance to re-think the way public spaces are allocated and utilised, experimenting with change, and working collaboratively and inclusively with all members of society to improve our city while responding to the climate crisis. Taking Spaces for People measures as a starting point, embracing the feedback and engagement from our residents and stakeholders, and using this moment as a chance to innovate and recover from the pandemic, will make Edinburgh a stronger, more prosperous, and greener capital city.

Accepts recommendations 1.1.1 - 1.1.3

Amends recommendation 1.1.4 as follows:

In response to officer recommendations on schemes by category (report paragraphs 4.75-4.113):

- Retains **schools** measures during the summer in locations where schools will be the venue for activities for children and young people; identifies solutions in collaboration with Sciennes Primary School to use Sciennes Road as per the specific issues raised by the deputation
- Regarding **city centre**, in dialogue with relevant authorities, identifies ways to bridge between the SFP measures and the final Meadows-George Street scheme to avoid removal of measures on George IV Bridge and Forrest Road
- Retains **shopping streets** and **protected cycle lanes** and commits to co-production of improvements and changes that mitigate the issues raised, prioritising accessibility and improvements benefiting disabled people
- Retains **leisure and quiet connections** including Links Gardens and two-way closure of Braid Road by taking additional measures and actions to mitigate displacement
- Retains measures that are recently implemented and scheduled for assessment, to enable complete consideration of the benefits or disbenefits

Accepts recommendations 1.1.5 - 1.1.6

Inserts additional recommendations:

- Thanks organisations representing disabled people for engaging with the council, notes the issues raised, calls for officers to implement the feedback, including but not limited to Guide Dogs Scotland *Covid-19 street design guidance* and RNIB *Coronavirus Courtesy Code* with a special emphasis on the routine use of tactile paving and fully accessible consultations
- Notes the previous decision to provide more pedestrian priority at signalled crossings and removal of pavement clutter, and undertakes to implement both at pace
- Agrees that dedicated spaces for walking, wheeling and cycling are a priority for surface improvements; agrees regular clearing to keep free of leaves, grit and snow/ice; and for sustained enforcement to ensure vehicles are not encroaching on dedicated space

Moved by: Councillor Claire Miller

Seconded by: Councillor Gavin Corbett

Amendment by the Liberal Democrat Group

Transport & Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.1 - Potential Retention of Spaces for People Measures

Delete 1.1.5 and 1.1.6 and insert;

1.1.5 agrees to refer this report and the proposed recommendations to the 24 June meeting of the Council for decision.

Moved by Cllr Kevin Lang

Seconded by

Amendment by the Conservative Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17th June 2021

Item 7.2 - East Craigs Proposed Low Traffic Neighbourhood

Committee agrees to:

Delete the words “at this time” at the end of recommendation 1.1.2

Add at the end of 1.1.4 -

“Further notes that, once again, reporting on these matters has been subsumed within a report that is titled East Craigs which limits transparency and fails to alert the public and consultation bodies such as Community Councils to its existence. Therefore, agrees that any future reports on these proposals should be a stand-alone report for each area”.

Moved by: Councillor Iain Whyte
Seconded by: Councillor Stephanie Smith

Amendment by the Green Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.3 - Petition for Consideration: Pedestrianise Elm Row

As per the option set out in paragraph 4.5 of the report, once the Tram construction works are completed, calls on officers to work with local businesses and residents in the area to investigate options to pedestrianise Elm Row at least one day per week, and to provide committee and ward members with updates/briefings as appropriate

Moved by: Councillor Claire Miller

Seconded by: Councillor Gavin Corbett

Amendment by the Conservative Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17th June 2021

Item – 7.4 Low Emission Zone – Preferred Scheme for Consultation

Replace recommendations with:

1.1 Committee:

- 1.1.1 Notes the potential conflict between the Scottish Government insistence on mandating Low Emission Zones in the four major Scottish Cities whilst also requiring an evidence led approach when other changes may quickly make the scheme redundant in evidence terms – these including but not limited to dramatic reductions in traffic in the zone as proposed by the current Council Administration, continuing air quality improvements in the City, the ever cleaner nature of modern vehicles with internal combustion engines and the expected wholesale introduction of electric vehicles;
- 1.1.2 Notes with concern the Scottish Government’s decision to implement a penalty charge regime that is dramatically more punitive than elsewhere in the UK with the result that the scheme will not raise any funds to cover operating costs and will have an ongoing revenue deficit of £400k per annum;
- 1.1.3 Therefore agrees to request that, should the scheme be imposed, additional funding support is provided by the Scottish Government to cover this cost for so long as the scheme is operational given the decision making has been by the Scottish Government;
- 1.1.4 Notes with concern that the scheme would limit access to important “park and walk” sites providing off street car parking for visitors to City Centre businesses such as at the Omni Centre, the new St James Centre and Castle Terrace along with limiting access to the designated drop off area for Waverley Station, used by many with mobility difficulties, and agrees that an alternative option be developed to allow access to these sites.
- 1.1.5 Nevertheless agrees to approve the “Preferred” Low Emission Zone Scheme for consultation over the Summer in order that the views of the Edinburgh public can be sought and that this is undertaken in line with the Council’s approved and updated public consultation policy.

Moved by: Councillor Iain Whyte
Seconded by: Councillor Stephanie Smith

Amendment by the Green Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.4 - Low Emission Zone – Preferred Scheme for Consultation

Replaces recommendations 1.1.1 and 1.1.2 as follows:

- Thanks officers and partner organisations for the extensive and detailed analysis enabling Edinburgh to create a Low Emission Zone so that everyone benefits from clean air in our city
- Voices the strong commitment of this council to improving health outcomes for all, particularly noting the current serious mortality impacts of air pollution
- Welcomes the objective of greenhouse gas emission reduction which is now built into the LEZ programme and the alignment this has with our climate strategy
- Notes that there are areas of poor air quality in central Edinburgh which fall outside the city centre LEZ boundary options presented in the report, and instructs officers to model a larger central LEZ boundary which includes these known areas of low air quality, using an evidence-based approach as required by the National Low Emission Framework
- Approves the Low Emission Zone (LEZ) scheme option 3 for consultation over the summer, with adjustment to the city centre boundary as described

Accepts report recommendations 1.1.3 - 1.1.6

Inserts additional recommendation as follows:

- Agrees to work in partnership with Police Scotland to ensure enforcement of vehicle restrictions in Holyrood Park; to publish detailed modelling of the impact of LEZ on the private roads within Holyrood Park; and to engage again with Historic Environment Scotland to take forward the community request for the park roads to be closed to through traffic

Moved by: Councillor Claire Miller

Seconded by: Councillor Gavin Corbett

Amendment by the Liberal Democrat Group

Transport & Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.4 - Low Emission Zone Proposed Scheme for Implementation

Committee,

1. notes the findings of the Council's 2019 Low Emission Zone (LEZ) consultation in which:
 - 78% of respondents supported the proposed city-wide LEZ applying to buses and coaches, with 81% support for the city-wide LEZ applying to HGVs, LGVs and vans.
 - 54% of respondents supported the proposed city centre LEZ boundary compared to 62% support for the city-wide LEZ boundary.

2. notes that the proposals contained in the report for a city centre only LEZ represent a substantially scaled back proposal compared to that set out in 2019, a change which risks leaving too many residents across the city exposed to unacceptably low levels of air quality.

3. recognises that, whilst general improvements in air quality are expected, a city-wide LEZ covering goods vehicles, coaches and buses could accelerate that change.

4. recognises that, without a city-wide LEZ zone, there remains a significant risk that some communities close to but outwith the city centre zone will see increased levels of pollution as non-compliant vehicles seek to avoid the restricted area.

5. therefore agrees that officers should revise their proposals and return to committee within one cycle with a more ambitious scheme, which includes a city-wide LEZ for goods vehicles, coaches and buses.

Moved by Cllr Kevin Lang

Seconded by

Amendment by the Conservative Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17th June 2021

Item – 7.7 A71 Dalmahoy Junction Improvements

Deletes 1.1.2 to 1.1.5 and replaces with:

1.1.2 Regrets that decades of delays on improvements to the junction have led inevitably to significantly increased costs.

1.1.3 Notes that large housing developments at Calderwood further west of this junction have now added significantly more traffic to the already congested A71 and this will increase further as new housing development continues apace in West Lothian.

1.1.4 Acknowledges that while there has been some reduction in personal injury collisions since a 40mph speed limit was introduced the council does not collect data on non-injury accidents and therefore cannot retrieve a complete picture of the number of collisions that occur at this junction.

1.1.5 Notes the limitations of the road junction layout proposed in the officer recommendations, which would not.

(i). Help vehicles turning right onto the A71 from Dalmahoy Road, nor does it help vehicles turning right on the north side adjacent to businesses, church and residents who live and work in this locality as there is still a blind spot.

(ii). Allow vehicular traffic to pass safely when buses are alighting passengers on either side of the road and has the potential to lead to increased vehicle collisions/injuries/fatalities.

1.1.6 Recognises that safety should be the paramount consideration in taking this decision and therefore agree that plans for a fully signalised junction with the required funding model (as was proposed in the Conservative Group Budget Motion for 2021/22) should be brought back to this Committee for approval in one cycle.

Moved by: Councillor Graeme Bruce

Seconded by: Councillor Iain Whyte

Amendment by the Conservative Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17th June 2021

Item 7.8 - City Centre West to East Cycle Link and Street Improvements Project

Agrees

1.1.1, 1.1.2 and 1.1.4

Replaces 1.1.3 with:

Notes that the value engineering has removed the changes to Melville Crescent and submissions to the advertised RSO 18/21 expressed concern about the significant loss of parking in Melville Street in a very oversubscribed residents' parking zone and calls for a report to respond to these concerns to detail;

- how Melville Crescent will be laid out
- what materials will be used as a result of the value engineering
- and to consider whether additional residents' parking can be found as part of the revised, value engineered scheme;

Moved by: Councillor Iain Whyte

Seconded by: Councillor Stephanie Smith

Addendum by the Green Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.8 - City Centre West to East Cycle Link and Street Improvements Project – Proposed design changes and Statutory Orders update

Additional recommendation:

- Notes the progress to date on the Walker Street to Rutland Square spur, and instructs officers to progress towards implementation as a standalone scheme as part of the review of the Active Travel programme

Moved by: Councillor Claire Miller

Seconded by: Councillor Gavin Corbett

Amendment by Green Group

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.9: Garden Waste Registration 2021/22

Replace 1.1.1

1.1.1 Approve that from 1 December 2021 onwards residents will be able to sign up during an expanded registration window and that, with a target of 31 May 2022 the aim will be to extend that window to be continuously open in addition to the main summer period sign-up/renewal period; noting that residents will still have an incentive to register during the main period to receive a full year service for the charge and to receive a service without time-lags at the point of introduction.

Moved by: Councillor Gavin Corbett

Seconded by:

Addendum by the Liberal Democrat Group

Transport & Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Item 7.10 - Cammo Road - Trial Vehicle Prohibition (Road Closure)

at end of 1.1.1, insert “with a view to commencement by the end of 2021”.

Moved by Cllr Kevin Lang

Seconded by

Amendment by the Coalition

Transport and Environment Committee

17 June 2021

Motion 9.1 Cllr Miller- Vision Zero

Committee:

Replace paragraph 3 with:

Recognises that there should be a two-step process to creating a new Vision Zero Road Safety Plan for Edinburgh and requests that officers return to the November Transport and Environment Committee with an updated draft plan or overview following partnership working with stakeholders and elected members. This to be followed by the finalised Road Safety Plan in spring 2022.

Adds paragraph 4:

Welcomes the opportunity that this process will give to reaffirm Edinburgh's commitment to making our roads a safer environment for all those who use them, irrespective of how they get around our city.

Moved by Councillor L Macinnes

Seconded by Councillor K Doran