

Planning Committee

2.00pm, Wednesday, 7 August 2019

Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal Review

Executive/routine	11 -
Wards	Trinity
Council Commitments	15

1. Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that:

1.1.1 the Committee approves the revised Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal (CACA).

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: John Inman, Service Manager, Place Development

E-mail: john.inman@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3721

Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal Review

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 On [22 August 2018](#), the Committee approved an updated programme of review of the existing conservation area character appraisals. This report presents the revised Trinity CACA. The revised appraisal has been the subject of community consultation.

3. Background

- 3.1 It is a statutory requirement in terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 for local authorities to periodically review conservation area boundaries and consider whether new conservation area designations are appropriate.
- 3.2 On [22 August 2018](#), the Committee approved an updated programme of review of the existing conservation area character appraisals. This was based on the age of the character appraisal, with the earliest being given priority, and development pressure, based on the number of applications submitted for planning permission and the extent of recent housing development.
- 3.3 The resulting priority conservation areas were: South Side, Marchmont and Meadows, Colinton, Merchiston and Greenhill, West End, Coltbridge and Wester Coates, Craigmillar Park and Morningside. Trinity Conservation Area was added to the priority list due to local community requests for a review of the boundary of the area. The Committee approved the revised South Side Conservation Area Character Appraisal and boundary amendment at its meeting on [27 February 2019](#).

4. Main report

- 4.1 This report presents the revised Trinity CACA which was approved as a priority by the Committee on [22 August 2018](#). The appraisal has been the subject of community consultation.
- 4.2 The statutory definition of a conservation area is an 'area of special architectural or historic interest the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or

enhance'. The Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement on the criteria for the designation of conservation areas specifies that it is the character or historic interest of an area created by individual buildings and open spaces and their relationship one with the other which the legislation covering conservation areas seeks to preserve.

- 4.3 The principles of selection for designation as a conservation area include:
 - 4.3.1 areas of significant architectural or historic interest in terms of specific listed buildings; and
 - 4.3.2 areas of significant architectural or historic interest in terms of building groupings.
- 4.4 The Trinity Conservation Area was originally designated in October 1976 and the character appraisal for the area was approved in 2001.
- 4.5 Conservation area character appraisals are intended to help manage change. They provide an agreed basis of understanding of what makes an area special. This understanding informs and provides the context in which decisions can be made on proposals which may affect that character.
- 4.6 The revised character appraisal (Appendix 1) updates and refines the text of the original appraisal for its final publication as a digital document which will include images, photographs and interactive maps. The main change to the format of the appraisal is the separation of structure, the overall organisation and macro-scale features of the area, from key elements, the smaller-scale features of the area. The review involved a comprehensive re-drafting of the original appraisal and it is not practical to highlight changes. No changes to the conservation area boundary are proposed.

Consultation

- 4.7 The draft revised Trinity CACA was the subject of a consultation from 22 March to 20 May 2019. An on-line questionnaire was set up on the consultation hub to capture views on the draft appraisal.
- 4.8 The consultation generated 30 responses via the online survey. The Trinity Community Council suggested including details of the consultation in the local newsletter. Appendix 2 lists the comments received. The majority of respondents agreed with the contents of the draft revised appraisal.
- 4.9 There were a number of suggestions for extensions to the boundary of the Conservation Area (Appendix 3). The areas suggested have a different overall character from that of Trinity in terms of date, built form and architectural style. It is, therefore, not considered appropriate to extend the boundary to include these areas. However, they will be the subject of a further appraisal in order to assess their merits for potential separate conservation area status. Priority consideration will be given to Lower Granton Road, Wardie Square, Granton Square and the Wardie Estate.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 Publication of the finalised appraisal.

6. Financial impact.

- 6.1 There are no immediate financial implications for the Council arising from this report.
- 6.2 The new format for the character appraisals is intended to be viewed online. The Council would not stock a traditional, printed version. However, individual copies could be photocopied on request for customers with difficulties accessing the web version. Demand for this service is expected to be low and the minimal additional costs could be absorbed in existing budgets.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 The draft revised Trinity CACA was the subject of a consultation. An on-line questionnaire was set up to capture views on the appraisal and to encourage comments about how well it defines the special characteristics of the Conservation Area.
- 7.2 The impacts of this report in relation to the three elements of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 Public Bodies Duties have been considered, and the outcomes are summarised below.
 - 7.2.1 The proposals in this report will reduce carbon emissions by encouraging the conservation of resources and energy embodied in existing buildings, rather than demolition and reconstruction, major generators of carbon emissions.
 - 7.2.2 The need to build resilience to climate change impacts is not relevant to the proposals in this report because conservation of the built environment is not considered to be significantly affected, positively or negatively, in this regard.
 - 7.2.3 The proposals in this report will help achieve a sustainable Edinburgh because the conservation and management of the historic environment contributes directly to sustainability in a number of ways. These include the energy and material invested in a building, the scope for adaptation and reuse, and the unique quality of historic environments which provide a sense of identity and continuity.
- 7.3 There are no significant risks associated with approval of the document as recommended. Completion of the review of the appraisal ensures the Council's compliance with its statutory duty to review its conservation areas, as established in the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

- 7.4 If not approved, the appraisal review would be delayed with a consequent impact on the quality of decision making and outcomes on the ground in the conservation. There may be also be a degree of reputational damage: the Council's relationship with community groups could be affected due to delay or the failure to complete the review process on time.
- 7.5 The aim of conservation area status is to enhance the quality of the area. This has the potential to improve quality of life and supports sustainable communities.
- 7.6 No infringements of rights have been identified. No negative impacts on equality have been identified.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 [Report to Planning Committee of 22 August 2018, Review of Conservation Area Character Appraisals.](#)
- 8.2 The current [Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal.](#)

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 - Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal – revised August 2019.
- 9.2 Appendix 2 - Consultation responses.
- 9.3 Appendix 3 - Map of Trinity Conservation Area.

Appendix 1

TRINITY CONSERVATION AREA CHARACTER APPRAISAL

Revised August 2019

Location and Boundaries

The Trinity Conservation Area is situated approximately two miles north of Edinburgh City Centre with outlooks over the Firth of Forth.

The northern boundary of the Conservation Area is formed by the Firth of Forth; to the south, the boundary follows East Trinity Road cutting in at enclaves of residential development; to the east, a clear line is drawn following Laverockbank Road and to the west, Netherby Road and Boswall Road form the main boundary.

Dates of Designation/Amendments

The Trinity Conservation Area was originally designated in 1975. The original boundary included villa developments on Russell Place, York Road, and Laverockbank Road, including Starbank Park. The boundary was substantially extended west of Trinity Road in 1986 to include the Lomond Park development and Boswall Road.

A boundary change was implemented in 1998 to include villa areas between Boswall Road and Lower Granton Road and at East Trinity Road and Netherby Road; these shared the character of the existing Conservation Area and contributed to the enhancement of the setting of the area. Tenements on Lower Granton Road at the north edge of the Conservation Area were also included to create a more rational boundary.

A boundary change was implemented in 2001 to include 127-137 and 143 East Trinity Road, the west side of Clark Road to the junction with Denham Green Avenue, Denham Green Place and 54-82 South Trinity Road within the Conservation Area.

Statement of Significance

The Trinity Conservation Area is characterised by a wealth of high quality stone built detached and semi-detached residential villas of restricted height, mainly in traditional building materials, set in substantial gardens with mature trees and generous spacing to their neighbours.

CONSERVATION AREA CHARACTER APPRAISALS

Purpose of Character Appraisals

Conservation Area Character Appraisals are intended to help manage change. They provide an agreed basis of understanding of what makes an area special. This understanding informs and provides the context in which decisions can be made on proposals which may affect that character. An enhanced level of understanding, combined with appropriate management tools, ensures that change and development sustains and respects the qualities and special characteristics of the area.

“When effectively managed, Conservation Areas can anchor thriving communities, sustain cultural heritage, generate wealth and prosperity and add to quality of life. To realise this potential many of them need to continue to adapt and develop in response to the modern-day needs and aspirations of living and working communities. This means accommodating physical, social and economic change for the better.

Physical change in Conservation Areas does not necessarily need to replicate its surroundings. The challenge is to ensure that all new development respects, enhances and has a positive impact on the area. Physical and land use change in Conservation Areas should always be founded on a detailed understanding of the historic and urban design context.”

From PAN 71, Conservation Area Management.

www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2004/12/20450/49052

How to Use This Document

The analysis of the Trinity Conservation Area’s character and appearance focuses on the features which make the area special and distinctive. These are considered in terms of:

- Historical Origins and Development;
- Structure, which describes and draws conclusions regarding the overall organisation and macro-scale features of the area;
- Key Elements, which examines the smaller-scale features and details which fit within the structure; and
- Management: The Management section outlines the policy and legislation relevant to decision-making in the area. Issues specific to the area are discussed in more detail and recommendations or opportunities identified.

This document is not intended to give prescriptive instructions on what designs or styles will be acceptable in the area. Instead, it can be used to ensure that the design of an alteration or addition is based on an informed interpretation of context. This context should be considered in conjunction with the relevant Local Development Plan(LDP) policies and planning guidance.

HISTORICAL ORIGINS AND DEVELOPMENT

The Trinity Conservation Area occupies the former Wardie Muir, an area of wasteland between Inverleith and the sea. It was the location of Wardie Castle, a large and ancient house, which was in a ruinous condition by the mid-seventeenth century and from which stones were used to build Cromwell's Citadel in Leith. It was later rebuilt as a mansion house and was the property of Sir Alexander Boswall in 1780. A relic of the original Castle survives at the end of the cul-de-sac formed by Wardie House Lane.

Trinity was part of the lands granted by David I to his new Abbey of Holyrood in about 1128. In 1505, James IV purchased 143 acres from Holyrood, in order to establish a naval base or New Haven; and it was the western part of this Crown land that was acquired in 1713 by Trinity Hospital and developed as Trinity Mains farm. Part of the old farmhouse at Trinity Mains was used to form Hay Lodge on East Trinity Road, which was subsequently demolished. The origin of the place name is, therefore, based on the dedication of Leith's charitable institutions to the Holy Trinity.

Trinity had 'all the makings of a fine healthful holiday resort', and the development of Trinity reflected changes in the settlement pattern and the suburban expansion which occurred in Edinburgh in the mid-nineteenth century. A large part of Trinity was developed around 1830 for the benefit of the growing number of merchants and professionals who were seeking a more secluded environment. Trinity had the advantage of physical separation from the overcrowded medieval city core and offered individual dwellings in a predominantly suburban setting, in contrast to the terraces of the Georgian New Town. The convenience of its situation to the neighbouring port of Leith also presented advantages for the wealthy ship-owners and merchants as an attractive place of residence – Christian Salvesen, of the Leith based Salvesen & Co. whaling company, lived at Mayfield House in East Trinity Road.

The area was developed with villas from the late eighteenth century. Building plots on a large site to the north of Ferry Road were advertised in the Edinburgh Evening Courant to a plan 'constructed in a new and beautiful manner as an assemblage of villas, bounded upon the outer line by a plantation of forest trees and the internal boundaries of each lot by a continuation of flowering shrubs; and each Villa situated in such a manner as not to overlook another.'

This scheme of large villas in substantial garden grounds was not completed and following the initial start to the development, most of the land was subdivided into smaller plots on which an extraordinary variety of mid- to late-Victorian villas were built, the density increasing with time. Trinity Lodge on Stirling Road is the only surviving building from the original feuing plan. The house was built in 1774 by Robert Johnston, an Edinburgh Merchant, but is now divided and a modern house has been built within its much-reduced grounds.

Detached and semi-detached houses with their own private gardens bounded by high stone walls provided an attractive contrast to the communal living of the central area, and the fashions and desires of the property owners are reflected in the profusion of architectural styles and idiosyncratic features. About 1835, Trinity House began feuing the ground at Laverockbank Road, but the short line of villas and gardens at the south east end was not completed.

Trinity Station, on the Edinburgh, Leith & Granton Railway, opened in 1846 as part of a mixed rail and ferry service from Edinburgh to Dundee and further north. The introduction of a rail link to Trinity was an added incentive to the development of the area. The railway was still in position in 1969, but the tracks were lifted soon afterwards. Much of the route is now a footpath and cycleway and the Station building, at the end of Trinity Crescent, has been converted into a pair of dwellings.

The Chain Pier situated opposite the Georgian porticos of Trinity Crescent, feued about 1824, was opened on 14 August 1821. The Chain Pier was used by small steam driven boats that plied up and down the river Forth but, as it did not accommodate larger vessels, was soon abandoned for Granton Harbour. This was also a period when sea bathing was becoming popular at Trinity and the Chain Pier was the site of 'Great Swimming Competitions'. The Chain Pier was destroyed in a severe storm on 17 October 1898. The Chain Pier Bar now occupies the building that was once the booking office for the pier.

The spatial layout of Trinity was well established by the end of the late nineteenth century, affording little opportunity for new development. Change during the twentieth century has mainly been associated with conversion of the villas into flats and some development within garden grounds. However, the overall character and appearance of Trinity has not been substantially changed since the nineteenth century.

STRUCTURE

Topography

Trinity is located on the coast to the northern side of the city between Newhaven and Granton. The Conservation Area has natural boundaries on three sides, the coast line to the north, Wardie Playing Field to the west, a former railway cutting to the south and the eastern boundary of Starbank Park to the east. Much of Trinity is physically separated from surrounding development and from major traffic routes, and it forms a fairly secluded residential enclave.

The combination of the area's location in proximity to the port, the topography giving views out to sea of incoming vessels, and the suburban environment,

made Trinity an attractive area for residential development, initially by wealthy merchants.

Spatial Structure

Much of the residential development is in the form of villas. Larger villas, from the earliest development of the area, are located at the higher levels at a point where the ground breaks into two spurs facing out to sea. The former Trinity Station is located between these spurs. The Station served residents and visitors to the pier. It is now converted to residential use and the former branch line leading to it is a footpath and cycleway.

These larger villas are set in substantial plots, though earlier plans show them to have originally been in considerably larger grounds. The later subdivision of the feu into plots retains the formality set by the original boundaries and access routes. The boundaries are still marked by high stone walls. With generous spacing to their neighbours, they are positioned to take advantage of sea views, and south facing gardens. Their gardens contain mature landscaping and are large enough for woodland trees.

Laverockbank Road and York Road run parallel and to the east of the former branch line, with Russell Place to the west of it. To reduce costly bridge building, these roads are joined east-west only by Lennox Row. The north-south orientation of this part of the area is further emphasised by the length of frontage and by the height and continuity of the boundary walls. The layout retains a linear form, which is emphasised by subsequent development.

Open views to the Forth made the coastline route attractive for residential development. Development is necessarily one-sided due to the location of roads close to the edge of the water. Development is again linear in character but given interest by terraced villas set round a crescent with later tenements round a three-sided square.

Subsequent development up to 1914 continued to the west and south on the 'plateau' above the shore road, with the density gradually intensifying. At the same time, property types change from detached, to semi-detached, to terraces. This results in a change in the relationship between the houses and the street and between houses themselves. The space between houses reduces, the boundary walls become more of a token feature; with houses now addressing the street.

Lennox Row, Primrose Bank and Boswall Road run east to west between the shore and East Trinity Road, whilst other roads maintain a north-south emphasis at right angles to the shoreline. The area changes from a formal Georgian origin to a more informal Victorian expansion, with the arrangement of roads and the buildings setting up a more irregular 'grid iron' pattern.

In this later development, there is also a transfer of open space from private gardens to the public realm where they act acting as a focus, either as a central square or as a termination to a street. The original fine ornate

Victorian gates and stone pillars to Wardie Playing Field terminate the view at the end of Lennox Row, though they are now the frontage to a modern chalet style house which closes access off to the Park.

The short stretch of former railway line forms an attractive cycle and walk way. It also contributes to the mature landscaping and wooded character of the area, and the natural heritage and bio-diversity. The line is set in a cutting, which allows roads to pass over without changing level minimising visual intrusion of bridges and retaining privacy.

Trinity is characterised by changing spatial structures with low-density villa development in a variety of forms and settings. The reducing plot size, changing relationship to the street and intensification of development radiate out from those original grander villas, and change the emphasis of the spatial structure from a linear to a grid pattern. Despite this, spatial pattern the areas do not dominate each other; the change is softened by the irregularity of the grid, by frequent changes in building forms, the maturity of the landscaping and a townscape unity.

The coastal location, seclusion from surrounding areas and the separation from major traffic routes provide a high quality residential environment with a sense of space and a setting in which to appreciate the townscape.

Townscape

The roads accessing Trinity act as gateways to the Conservation Area, which is characteristically quieter and more suburban than the surrounding areas. This is a result of the predominant residential nature of the area and the almost complete absence of commercial or institutional uses. The impression of seclusion is accentuated by the enclosure created by high stone boundary walls down the whole length of older streets.

The Conservation Area has a wealth of detached properties, ranging from small lodges to grand Baronial villas, taking inspiration from Greek, Roman, Venetian, and Gothic architecture.

The effect of a reduction in plot size is most clearly demonstrated by the difference in the number of houses along almost equal length sides of the block between Stirling Road and Netherby Road. On Stirling Road there are 12 semi-detached houses, whilst on Netherby Road there are 26 terraced houses. The visual impression of the lengths of the two streets is in stark contrast to the fact that they are in fact almost equal.

The variation in villa types and sizes is also marked in terms of building lines. The denser the form, the closer buildings come to the pavement edge with the front boundary walls diminishing gradually to ever smaller dwarf walls and railings. The area of house footprint, and the space between footprints, also reduces with the size of the plot.

The predominance of villas, the generally uniform height and the restricted palette of materials - natural stone, slate and cast iron details - creates an overall unity of appearance within the Conservation Area. Detail such as pilastered wall head parapets, decorative cast iron roof finials, carved barge boards and colourful stained glass contribute to individuality.

Roads running north – south provide contrasting views, to Arthurs Seat and the Old Town skyline to the south and out over the coast to Fife to the north. The large villas are particularly prominent in views into the Conservation Area from the seashore.

KEY ELEMENTS

Architectural Character

The style and mix of Georgian and Victorian villas in Trinity is unique in Edinburgh. Some are embellished with Gothic details, and ornamental ironwork; others have towers and attractive stone porches. Although the area is overwhelmingly domestic in scale and suburban in nature, it includes more variety than other stone built Edinburgh suburbs. Despite the variety of architectural styles, a significant degree of unity of appearance is achieved by the restricted height and the predominant use of traditional building materials: local grey sandstone for buildings and Scots slate for roofs. Stone boundary walls define the visual and physical seclusion of the villas.

The over-riding architectural form is substantial stone built villas set in extensive garden grounds. A variety of architectural styles are adopted, which contribute to and enliven the character of the area. The diversity of styles ranges from terraced villas on the east side of Laverockbank Road, Gothic in Russell Place and at 24 York Road, Elizabethan at Mayville Gardens. An abundance of eclectic Victorian picturesque styles and features prevail in Lennox Row and York Road.

Villa development also afforded the opportunity for architectural enrichment. This includes cast iron railings, evident throughout the Conservation Area, with particularly well detailed ironwork at Boswall Road, and hand carved decoration in polished ashlar. Finials, trellis, towers, gazebos and campaniles are evident throughout the area and all contribute to the overall character.

In areas such as York Road and Laverockbank Road, most houses are concealed by trees and walls. The walls provide definition to the street layout and create a clear distinction between public and private spaces.

Trinity is predominantly a residential area with few public buildings, and it is essentially the quality and architectural significance of the individual buildings that establish the character of the area. The following are a few examples:

Wardie Parish Church, Primrose Bank Road (Category B Listed) is prominently located at the corner of Primrose Bank Road and Netherby Road.

It is a rectangular-plan gothic church with octagonal-plan towers in a sneaked grey sandstone, and dates from 1892. It is the only church in ecclesiastical use within the area. It has associations with St. Serf's Church in Clark Road.

The former Christ Church Episcopal Church, 118 Trinity Road (Category B Listed). A simple gothic church dating from 1854 with south-facing entrance porch and small spired tower to the Southwest. The church is no longer in use for ecclesiastical purposes following its conversion in 1980 to a private dwelling.

Silverton, 90 Trinity Road (Category B Listed). A large two-storey house with seventeenth century Scottish references. Its gables, bay windows and tall open topped gazebo tower typify the solidity and substance of Victorian Edinburgh. It has been converted into three flats, with a further fifteen flats in the garden.

Gothic House, 24 York Road (Category A Listed). A two-storey, three-bay Tudor Gothic House dating from 1820 with a pinnacled porch, projecting windows and Tudor arched windows with timber mullions to the principal elevation.

Gothic Cottage, 24 Russell Place (Category A Listed). An elegantly detailed early example of a Gothic cottage ornee.

North and South Gothic cottage (Category C & B Listed). The cottages form part of the early nineteenth century projected development on the lands of Trinity Mains by the lawyer Alexander Scott.

St Columba's Hospice (the former Challenger Lodge), Boswall Road (Category B Listed). An austere Greek Revival three-bay villa with Greek Doric portico dating from 1825. Its former occupation by naturalist and oceanographer Sir John Murray gives it historic significance. It was converted into a home for disabled children before being extended in 1978, to become St Columba's Hospice. There have also been more recent additions to the Hospice facilities.

The three symmetrically composed villas including Boswall House at the centre create a linked 'palatial' frontage, all offer distinctive elements and interest to the townscape.

Natural Heritage

The buildings in Trinity are complemented by the profusion of mature trees, spacious private garden settings, stone boundary walls and green open spaces. The abundance of mature trees in garden grounds unifies the Conservation Area and makes an essential contribution to the overall character. Large trees are of particular importance as they provide a setting and screening for houses, a habitat for wildlife, and other environmental and aesthetic benefits.

The cycleway/walkway that runs through the eastern side of the Conservation Area follows the old railway line. It includes areas of woodland and a rich diversity of grass and herbs which provide a variety of habitats and a valuable corridor for wildlife and recreation.

The shoreline between Granton Harbour and Star Bank is a site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI), which provides statutory protection for its ecological importance.

There are five Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs): two on Boswall Road, two on York Road and one adjacent to the corner of Spencer Place and Trinity Road. Mature street edge trees make an important contribution to the character of the Conservation Area.

Two principal areas of public open space also contribute to the character of the area:

- Lomond Park is a private recreation ground with tennis courts, a bowling green, and lawn area with tall trees (rowan, elm, lime and horse chestnut). It was formed towards the end of the eighteenth century as a cricket ground and is situated towards the western boundary of the Conservation Area. Lomond Park provides the only large expanse of open space within Trinity. Although access to the Park is limited to subscribers, it still contributes to the overall amenity of the area. The use of wrought iron railings makes it a defensible and definable space, and it improves the perception of permeability in the area.
- Starbank Park is situated on the eastern boundary of the Conservation Area, adjacent to Laverockbank Road. The park was laid out on the shoreward slope of the garden of Starbank House in the late nineteenth century. The space is characterised by large star shaped flowerbeds and is enclosed on one side by high sandstone walls. Since 2013, the Friends of Starbank Park help to maintain the Park and have developed it into a community hub with events held several times a year. An active group of volunteers work on improving the facilities and offering opportunities.

Activities & Uses

Trinity is primarily a residential area with few shops, public houses and other community buildings. The general atmosphere of the area is of calmness and high amenity. This is reinforced by open spaces at Lomond Park and Starbank Park. St Columba's Hospice, in the former Challenger Lodge, provides a health care facility of regional importance.

In contrast to the central villa area, the coastal road and the north-south routes are characteristically places of activity in terms of traffic movement.

There is also greater pedestrian movement, resulting in more activity than in the central part of Trinity.

MANAGEMENT

Legislation, policies and guidance

Conservation Areas

The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states that Conservation Areas are 'areas of special architectural or historic interest, the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or enhance. Local authorities have a statutory duty to identify and designate such areas.

Special attention must be paid to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area when planning controls are being exercised. Conservation Area status brings a number of special controls:

- The demolition of unlisted buildings requires Conservation Area Consent;
- Some permitted development rights, which allow improvements or alterations to the external appearance of dwelling houses and flatted dwellings, are removed; and
- Works to trees are controlled (see Trees for more detail).

The removal of buildings which make a positive contribution to an area is only permitted in exceptional circumstances, and where the proposals meet certain criteria relating to condition, conservation deficit, adequacy of efforts to retain the building and the relative public benefit of replacement proposals. Conservation Area Character Appraisals are a material consideration when assessing applications for development within Conservation Areas.

Alterations to windows are also controlled in Conservation Areas in terms of the Council's guidelines.

Listed buildings

A significant number of buildings within the Conservation Area are listed for their special architectural or historic interest and are protected under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. Listed building consent is required for the demolition of a listed building, or its alteration or extension in any manner which would affect its special character.

Planning guidance

More detailed, subject-specific guidance is set out in Planning Guidance documents. Those particularly relevant to the Trinity Conservation Area are:

- Guidance for Householders
- Guidance for Businesses
- Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas
- Developer contributions and affordable housing
- Edinburgh Design guidance
- Communications Infrastructure
- Street Design Guidance

In addition, a number of statutory tools are available to assist development management within the Conservation Area.

Article 4 Direction Orders

The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Scotland) Order 1992, amended 2012, (abbreviated to GPDO), restricts the types of development which can be carried out in a Conservation Area without the need for planning permission. These include most alterations to the external appearance of dwelling houses and flats. Development is not precluded, but such alterations will require planning permission and special attention will be paid to the potential effect of proposals.

Under Article 4 of the GPDO the planning authority can seek the approval of the Scottish Ministers for Directions that restrict development rights further. The Directions effectively control the proliferation of relatively minor developments in Conservation Areas which can cumulatively lead to the erosion of character and appearance. The Trinity Conservation Area has Article 4 Directions covering the following classes of development:

- 7 The erection, construction, maintenance, improvement or alteration of a gate, fence, wall or other means of enclosure;
- 38 water undertakings;
- 39 development by gas suppliers; and
- 40 development by electricity undertakers.

Trees

Public and private mature trees contribute to the character of the Conservation Area. Larger trees are also complementary to the scale of Trinity's wide streets and large villa grounds.

Trees within Conservation Areas are covered by the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended by the Planning Act 2006. This Act applies to the uprooting, felling or lopping of a tree having a diameter exceeding 75mm at a point 1.5m above ground level. The planning authority must be given six weeks' notice of the intention to uproot, fell or lop trees. Failure to give notice will render the person liable to the same penalties as for contravention of a Tree Preservation Order (TPO).

Tree Preservation Orders are made under planning legislation to protect individual and groups of trees considered important for amenity or because of their cultural or historic interest. When assessing amenity, the importance of trees as wildlife habitats will be taken into consideration. There is a strong presumption against any form of development or change of use of land which is likely to damage or prejudice the future long term existence of trees covered by a Tree Preservation Order. The removal of trees for arboriculture reasons will not imply that the space created by their removal can be used for development.

Trees in the City contains a set of policies with an action plan used to guide the management of the Council's trees and woodlands.

Assessing Development within the Trinity Conservation Area

The richness of Trinity's built heritage is considerable. It is this complexity and diversity which make it attractive yet make these qualities hard to define. It also has a fragility and human scale which often does not sit easily with the demands of present day development requirements. These are qualities and conflicts that must be resolved if the character of Trinity is to be sensitively interpreted and enhanced.

General Criteria

General issues to be taken into account in assessing development proposals in the Conservation Area include the appropriateness of the overall massing of development, its scale (the expression of size indicated by the windows, doors, floor heights, and other identifiable units), its proportions and its relationship with its context i.e. whether it sits comfortably. Development should be in harmony with, or complimentary to, its neighbours having regard to the adjoining architectural styles. The use of materials generally matching those which are historically dominant in the area is important, as is the need for the development not to have a visually disruptive impact on the existing townscape. It should also, as far as possible, fit into the "grain" of the Conservation Area, for example, by respecting historic layout, street patterns or existing land form. It is also important where new uses are proposed that these respect the unique character and general ambience of the Conservation Area, for example certain developments may adversely affect the character of a Conservation Area

through noise, nuisance and general disturbance. Proposals outside the boundaries of the Conservation Area should not erode the character and appearance of Trinity.

New Buildings

New development should be of good contemporary design that is sympathetic to the spatial pattern, scale and massing, proportions, building line and design of traditional buildings in the area. New development should also reflect the proportion and scale of the traditional window pattern. The quality of alterations to shop fronts, extensions, dormers and other minor alterations should also be of an appropriately high standard.

The development of new buildings in the Conservation Area should be a stimulus to imaginative, high quality design, and seen as an opportunity to enhance the area. What is important is not that new buildings should directly imitate earlier styles, rather that they should be designed with respect for their context, as part of a larger whole which has a well-established character and appearance of its own. Therefore, while development of a gap site in a traditional terrace may require a very sensitive design approach to maintain the overall integrity of the area; in other cases modern designs sympathetic and complimentary to the existing character of the area may be acceptable.

Alterations and Extensions

Proposals for the alteration or extension of properties in the Conservation Area will normally be acceptable where they are sensitive to the existing building, in keeping with the character and appearance of the particular area and do not prejudice the amenities of adjacent properties. Extensions should be subservient to the building, of an appropriate scale, use appropriate materials and should normally be located on the rear elevations of a property. Very careful consideration will be required for alterations and extensions affecting the roof of a property, as these may be particularly detrimental to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Definition of 'Character' and 'Appearance'

Conservation Areas are places of special architectural or historic interest, the character and appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or enhance.

The character of an area is the combination of features and qualities which contribute to the intrinsic worth of an area and make it distinctive. Special character does not derive only from the quality of buildings. Elements such as the historic layout of roads, paths and boundaries, paving materials, urban grain and more intangible features, such as smells and noises which are unique to the area, may all contribute to the local scene. Conservation Area designation is the means of recognising the importance of all these factors and of ensuring that planning decisions address these qualities.

Appearance is more limited and relates to the way individual features within the Conservation Area look.

Care and attention should be paid in distinguishing between the impact of proposed developments on both the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR DEVELOPMENT

Development opportunities for infill or replacement may arise within the area and will be considered in terms of the relevant guidance. The Edinburgh Design Guidance, Guidance for Householders and Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas explain the Council's approach to design in historic contexts.

There has been pressure to erect new dwellings within the extensive garden grounds of the larger villas. The unsympathetic subdivision of garden grounds can erode the quality of a building's form and proportion, and the historic relationship between buildings.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENHANCEMENT

The character appraisal emphasises the more positive aspects of character in order that the future can build on what is best within the Conservation Area. The quality of urban and architectural design needs to be continuously improved if the character of the Conservation Area is to be enhanced. The retention of good quality buildings (as well as listed buildings) and the sensitive interpretation of traditional spaces in development are of particular importance.

Streetscape

Careful consideration needs to be given to floorscape which is an essential part of the overall appreciation of Trinity's rich townscape heritage. Repair and renewal work to street surfaces should be carefully detailed and carried out to the highest standards using quality natural materials.

High Buildings

Trinity has generally consistent heights and is particularly susceptible to buildings that break the prevailing roof and eaves height and impinge on the many important views. It is also important to protect the character of the Conservation Area from the potentially damaging impact of high buildings outside the Conservation Area.

Repair, Maintenance and Alterations

The character of the Conservation Area is maintained through regular maintenance of the built fabric in appropriate quality materials. Alterations must maintain the character and appearance.

Appendix 2

Trinity Conservation Area Character Appraisal: Analysis of Survey Results

The community consultation ran from 22 March 2019 to 20 May 2019. Thirty respondents completed the evaluation of the draft appraisal.

Do you agree with the contents of the Character Appraisal?

22 respondents Agreed or Strongly Agreed with the contents of the Character Appraisal.

3 Neither Agreed or Disagreed with the contents of the Character Appraisal.

5 Disagreed or Strongly Disagreed with the contents of the Character Appraisal.

The following comments were submitted (responses are in brackets after the comments):

Boundaries

The description of the boundaries should be altered as the east boundary clearly lies to the east of Starbank Park.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

Consideration should be given to extending the Trinity Conservation Area boundary on Lower Granton Road beyond Wardie Square and Steps towards Granton Square in order to protect the terraced cottages and gardens on Granton Road.

Consideration should be given to whether the boundary should be extended to protect the risk of unsympathetic development either side of Trinity.

Consideration should be given to an extension of the boundary to the east side of Granton Road to include Wardie Playing Fields.

Perhaps there is a case to extend the boundary to include the block south of Denham Green Avenue to protect both the existing open spaces and character of the shops on the South Trinity Road/Ferry Road junction from unfavourable development.

(A number of suggestions have been made for the inclusion of areas around the existing Trinity Conservation Area. This will be the subject of an additional report and may result in proposals for new conservation areas).

Trees

The protection for trees should be increased.

(Trees within Conservation Areas are covered by the Town and Country Planning Act. This Act applies to the uprooting, felling or lopping of a tree having a diameter exceeding 75mm at a point 1.5m above ground level. The planning authority must be given six weeks' notice of the intention to uproot, fell or lop trees. Failure to give notice will render the person liable to the same penalties as for contravention of a Tree Preservation Order).

The importance of street-edge mature trees could be emphasised.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

Traffic

Heavy traffic on Lower Granton Road should be banned or subject to a toll.

(This is beyond the scope of the Character Appraisal).

Starbank

There are mixed references to Starbank Gardens and Starbank Park.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

Details of the work of the Friends of Starbank Park were forwarded as part of the consultation.

(These have been summarised in the appraisal).

Development

Stricter criteria for new builds and extension/enhancements to existing properties to ensure additions to the area are more in keeping with the style and ethos of the conservation area are required.

Care needs to be exercised to ensure that any future development is sympathetic to the area and on a scale (building mass etc.) appropriate to the area's topography and character.

(These are beyond the scope of the Character Appraisal which takes an overview of the character).

Miscellaneous

There are references to Newhaven Road which actually forms part of the Victoria Park Conservation Area.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

The reference to Wardie Parish Church being the only current ecclesiastical use in the area is questionable - it may be true within the strict Trinity boundary, but does not acknowledge St. Serf's Church in Clark Road as being linked and in active use by the community.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

An important group of villas that has been dropped from the draft is Boswall House and the adjoining villas.

(The appraisal has been amended to take this comment into account).

Appendix 3 Trinity Conservation Area Plan

