

# Development Management Sub-Committee Report

**Wednesday 24 August 2022**

**Application for Listed Building Consent  
Gas Holder north of Waterfront Broadway, Edinburgh.**

**Proposal: To repair and refurbish the existing Granton Gas Holder  
Category B Listed Guide Frame.**

**Item – Delegated Decision  
Application Number – 22/01327/LBC  
Ward – B04 - Forth**

## **Reasons for Referral to Committee**

The application has been submitted by the Council and is for more than a routine minor development. It is also significant in terms of the wider public interest as it is associated with a significant listed structure in this part of the city.

### **Recommendation**

It is recommended that this application be **Granted** subject to the details below.

### **Summary**

The proposals will not have an adverse impact on the special architectural character or historic interest of the listed structure and are therefore judged to be in accordance with Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

## **SECTION A – Application Background**

### **Site Description**

The site, covering 1.48 hectares, is rectangular in shape and consists of the gasholder which is category B listed (LB reference 45793, listed 10/11/1998) and the surrounding land.

The gasholder was designed by WR Herring and was built between 1898 and 1902. It was part of the Granton Gasworks which served the City of Edinburgh and the surrounding district throughout the 20th Century.

The steel frame consists of a series of double lattice columns positioned equidistantly around its perimeter, with curved lattice box girders spanning between the columns to complete the circular configurations at four levels. Lateral stability is provided by two planes of diagonal cross bracing between the lattice columns, over the full height of each bay. The entire holder frame is founded on the circular perimeter wall of the substantial brick and concrete tank recessed into the ground. It is approximately 76 metres wide and 46m tall above ground level. Much of the frame is now in poor condition.

The land around the gasholder that forms the application site is vacant scrubland. The northern edge is defined by an existing stone wall, which runs east/west and will be retained as part of the initial works to the gasholder and associated public realm. There is a significant level change from the gasholder 'plateau' down to the wall.

To the north are various industrial uses which sit at a much lower level to the site. To the northeast is the Social Bite village which supports people affected by homelessness. Vacant land is to the east, south and west of the site. Further to the southwest is the Forthquarter Park and to the southeast is the Scottish Gas office building. The wider area is one of ongoing development and regeneration.

Access to the site is currently from the junction of Waterfront Broadway and Caroline Park Avenue.

The site is located within the Urban Area as shown on the Local Development Plan proposals map. The land is identified as being within Edinburgh Waterfront. Proposal EW 2a (Forth Quarter) states that the area is for a housing-led mixed use development. It sets out a number of Development Principles for the area.

## **Description of the Proposal**

The proposal is to repair and refurbish the gasholder guide frame. The main elements of the proposal are:

- sections of the steelwork are to be repaired and replaced as necessary.
- replacement of the top hat (curved) section of the main columns outer face with a flat plate. Glass Reinforced Plastic (GPR) is proposed to replicate the top hat appearance. Rivets are to be replaced with round-headed bolts;
- removal of the access ladders fixed to the guide frame and
- removal of parts of the existing structural cross bracing at ground level to allow access into the central area

The bellhousing will also be removed. However, this currently benefits from an earlier extant consent approved under application reference 00/01169/LBC.

## **Supporting Information**

- Heritage Statement (Revised)
- Planning Statement
- Guide Frame Refurbishment Methodology Study;

- Granton Gasholder Preliminary Environmental Dismantling Assessment Report and
- Granton Gasholder, Derivation of Infill Criteria.

### Relevant Site History

00/01169/OUT

11 West Shore Road

Edinburgh

EH5 1RH

(4 Marine Drive/ 11 West Shore Rd) Outline planning permission for mixed use development (including retail, food and drink, public house, residential education, business, leisure/assembly/hotel, open space, and assoc. landscaping)(as amended)

Granted

28 February 2001

00/01169/LBC

11 West Shore Road

Edinburgh

EH5 1RH

(4 Marine Drive/ 11 West Shore Road) Listed Building Consent for the demolition of Gas Holder Number 1, the fitting shop, the stores block and the control house

Granted

13 March 2001

08/02357/LBC

11 West Shore Road

Edinburgh

EH5 1RH

Demolition of category B listed gasholder

Refused

25 November 2010

12/04566/LBC

11 West Shore Road

Edinburgh

EH5 1QB

Proposed demolition of Category B listed gasholder at Forthquarter, Granton.

withdrawn

20 April 2018

22/01324/FUL

Gas Holder North Of

Waterfront Broadway

Edinburgh

Public realm improvements to the site surrounding the Gas Holder. The design proposals for the public realm element have been set out to create a multi-functional public space, which aims to respect and complement the existing Listed-B Gas Holder frame, whilst remaining flexible to future change and uses.

## Other Relevant Site History

Planning Committee approved the Granton Waterfront Development Framework as non-statutory planning guidance to guide development, service delivery and investment decisions for the regeneration of Granton Waterfront.  
29 February 2020

## Pre-Application process

There is no pre-application process history.

## Consultation Engagement

Historic Environment Scotland

Archaeologist

Refer to Appendix 1 for a summary of the consultation response.

## Publicity and Public Engagement

**Date of Neighbour Notification:** Not Applicable

**Date of Renotification of Neighbour Notification:** Not Applicable

**Press Publication Date(s):** 25 March 2022;

**Site Notices Date(s):** 22 March 2022;

**Number of Contributors:** 0

## Section B - Assessment

### Determining Issues

This application for listed building consent is required to be assessed against Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

- Having due regard to HES Policy and guidance, do the proposals harm a listed building or its setting?
- If the proposals do comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for approving them?

## Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

### a) **The proposals harm the listed building or its setting?**

The following Historic Environment Scotland (HES) guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Engineering Structures

HES's guidance on Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Engineering Structures set out the principles that apply and how they should inform planning policies. The guidance states that work to historic engineering structures must be based on a thorough understanding of their design, construction and use of materials.

The gasholder provides a distinctive connection to the local history of the area. It was an essential piece of the gasworks and the most visible representation of it. The gasholder also reinforces the significance of other structures retained from the gasworks site and their relationship to the earlier use of the site.

Although previous demolitions and redevelopment of the wider site have weakened its setting, the gasholder survives largely in its original form and much as it was when added to the statutory list.

The application has been supported by several technical studies. The Refurbishment Methodology Study considered options for repairing the structure and settles on the refurbishing the guide frame in situ as the most appropriate method. This approach is supported.

The 'Managing Change' guidance goes on to state that existing materials should be replaced only where essential to structural stability or other safety related issues, and where the consequences of that intervention are understood. In general, existing material should be retained and augmented, rather than replaced, by new construction where stability or other safety-related issues are of concern.

The focus of the work is repairing and replacing the frame as required on a like-for-like basis, these elements in themselves would not require listed building consent.

The main components of the proposal consist of the removal of access ladders, removal of some sections of cross bracing at the ground level and replacement of top hats (and replacement of rivets with bolts). These are all relatively minor matters that although will change the appearance do not ultimately alter the overall structure or significance of the holder.

Historic Environment Scotland are supportive of the proposal and indicate that it hopes the application will be approved due to the significant heritage and regeneration benefits that will be secured by the completed project. Having reviewed the proposals it comments that the alterations proposed are minor and in context of the considerable conservation and regeneration benefits that will be achieved by the project, appear reasonable.

Overall, there are some alterations to the listed structure, but these have been proposed in a sympathetic manner. It is acknowledged that elements such as the top hats and associated rivets will be altered, and openings will be created, but this allows for the long-term survival of a neglected structure and appropriate reuse.

### **Conclusion in relation to the listed building**

The proposals will not adversely impact on the special architectural character or historic interest of the listed structure and are therefore judged to be in accordance with Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

### **b) There are any other matters to consider?**

The following matters have been identified for consideration:

#### Archaeology

The Archaeology Officer notes that the Gasholder is of historic and industrial archaeological significance and that the site also has the potential for earlier remains. Although there will be localised significant adverse impacts from the works, these are seen as necessary to restore and rejuvenate this nationally important industrial structure and wider area. Accordingly, the Archaeology Officer supports the proposals and recommends a condition for a programme of archaeology work.

#### Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

#### Public representations

No representations have been received.

### **Conclusion in relation to other matters considered**

The proposals are in compliance with the other material considerations that have been identified above.

### **Overall conclusion**

The proposals will not have an adverse impact on the special architectural character or historic interest of the listed structure and are therefore judged to be in accordance with Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

## Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following:-

### Conditions :-

1. No development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (Historic building recording, excavation, analysis & reporting, conservation, interpretation, public engagement, publication) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.

### Reasons: -

1. In order to safeguard the interests of archaeological heritage.

### Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

### Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

### Further Information - Local Development Plan

**Date Registered: 17 March 2022**

### Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01-06

Scheme 1

**David Givan**  
**Chief Planning Officer**  
**PLACE**  
**The City of Edinburgh Council**

Contact: Kenneth Bowes, Senior Planning officer  
E-mail: kenneth.bowes@edinburgh.gov.uk

## Summary of Consultation Responses

NAME: Historic Environment Scotland

COMMENT: HES support the proposal. We hope the application will be approved due to the significant heritage and regeneration benefits that will be secured by the completed project.

Supporting information shows that the significance of the guide-frame has been an important consideration throughout the development of the project.

The repair and refurbishment works do not necessarily need listed building consent, including replacement of corroded steel components with steel.

Advice is that consent should be for those aspects of the project that will alter - or permanently remove parts - of the guide-frame. Main parts are:

- Content with the changes to replace the top hat (curved) section of the main columns outer face with a flat plate.
- Content with the permanent removal of access ladders fixed to the guide-frame.
- Supportive of the permanent removal of parts of the existing structural cross bracing at ground level and insertion of horizontal cross beams which will help access the landscaped interior.

Overall, these alterations are minor and, in context of the considerable conservation and regeneration benefits that will be achieved by the project, appear reasonable.

Understand a 2001 approval remains live and therefore do not expect listed building consent is need for the removal of the bell and the decommissioning works

Our view is that the proposals do not raise historic environment issues of national significance and therefore we do not object.

DATE: 13 April 2022

NAME: Archaeologist

COMMENT: The Gasholder is of historic and industrial archaeological significance. The site also has the potential for containing earlier remains dating back to the 9th Millennium BC

Historic Building: Gasholder - proposals will have localised significant adverse impacts, these are not considered overall to be significant and are seen as necessary to restore and rejuvenate this nationally important industrial structure and wider area.

Accordingly, we support this application. However, it is essential that a programme of archaeological work is carried out prior to any alterations and during conservation.

Buried Remains - it is recommended that a programme of archaeological mitigation is undertaken during ground-breaking works to record, analyse and excavate any surviving significant remains and publish the results.



Public Engagement - programme of archaeological public engagement should be undertaken

Recommended that the following condition is attached if permission is granted to ensure that this programme of archaeological mitigation is undertaken:

'No development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (Historic building recording, excavation, analysis & reporting, conservation, interpretation, public engagement, publication) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.'

DATE: 5 April 2022

The full consultation response can be viewed on the [Planning & Building Standards Portal](#).

## Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420