

Finance and Resources Committee

10.00am, Thursday, 8 September 2022

Housing Service Asbestos Framework

Executive/routine Wards Council Commitments	Routine All
---	----------------

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 It is recommended that Finance and Resources Committee notes that:
- 1.1.1 A Housing Service Asbestos Framework Agreement was awarded by the Executive Director of Place, in consultation with the Convenor and Vice Convenor of Finance and Resources, in March 2022. This decision was taken under urgency provisions, in accordance with section 4.1 of the Council's Committee Terms of Reference and Delegated Functions; and
 - 1.1.2 The contract commenced on the 1 April 2022, for a period of three years with the option to extend for up to a further 12 months, at a total estimated value of £3,165,593.

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Elaine E Scott, Head of Housing Strategy and Development

E-mail: elaine.scott@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 529 2277

Housing Service Asbestos Framework

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 The Housing Service has an ongoing requirement for professional services and remediation works related to the management of asbestos throughout the domestic estate.
- 2.2 Finance and Resources Committee is asked to note that following a procurement process the Executive Director of Place, in consultation with the Convenor and Vice Convenor of the Finance and Resources, approved the award of the Housing Service Asbestos Framework Agreement for the provision of asbestos management services. This decision was taken under urgency provisions, in accordance with section 4.1 of the Council's Committee Terms of Reference and Delegated Functions.

3. Background

- 3.1 The City of Edinburgh Council has approximately 20,000 homes, inclusive of 44 multi storey blocks, and continued landlord responsibilities in a large number of mixed tenure low rise buildings. The Council has an ongoing requirement for professional services related to the management of asbestos.
- 3.2 This Framework will provide a consistent supply of services from a range of suppliers across the relevant lots and the capacity to meet urgent requirements at short notice.

4. Main report

- 4.1 In August 2021, the Council published a Prior Information Notice on Public Contracts Scotland with a view to alerting the market to this requirement.
- 4.2 On 15 December 2021, the Council published an open tender in accordance with the Public Contracts (Scotland) 2015 Regulations. A cost quality ratio of 40% price, 60% quality was applied.

- 4.3 The quality analysis was based on weighted award criteria questions, which were scored using a 0 to 10 matrix. Tender submissions were evaluated by officers the Council's Housing service, placing an emphasis on quality, as well as price.
- 4.4 The tender results, combining the quality scores and the price evaluation to derive an overall score for each bidder out of a maximum of 100%, are:

Lot 1 - Asbestos Surveying

Supplier	Quality Score 40%	Price Score 60%	Overall Score	Rank
Lucion Services Ltd	52.80	40.00	92.80	1
Franks Portlock Consulting Ltd	51.30	40.00	91.30	2
Environtec Ltd	43.65	32.00	75.65	3
Tenderer 4	37.80	36.36	74.16	-
Tenderer 5	38.55	32.65	71.20	-
Tenderer 6	34.80	29.09	63.89	-
Tenderer 7	37.65	25.00	62.65	-
Tenderer 8	29.40	32.65	62.05	-
Tenderer 9	24.75	32.00	56.75	-
Tenderer 10	20.55	19.28	39.83	-

Lot 2 - Asbestos Sampling and Laboratory Analysis

Supplier	Quality Score 40%	Price Score 60%	Overall Score	Rank
Lucion Services Ltd	52.20	22.59	74.79	1
Environtec Ltd	43.50	25.60	69.10	2
Life Environmental Services Ltd	37.05	32.00	69.05	3
Tenderer 4	27.90	40.00	67.90	-
Tenderer 5	38.85	22.33	61.18	-
Tenderer 6	38.55	21.33	59.88	-
Tenderer 7	22.80	22.59	45.39	-
Tenderer 8	19.80	21.33	41.13	-

Lot 3 – Asbestos Air Testing and 4-Stage Clearance Testing

Supplier	Quality Score 40%	Price Score 60%	Overall Score	Rank
Lucion Services Ltd	53.55	36.63	90.18	1
EDP Health Safety & Environmental Consultants Ltd	49.50	38.80	88.30	2
Franks Portlock Consulting Ltd	52.65	35.08	87.73	3
Tenderer 4	38.55	32.64	71.19	-
Tenderer 5	34.65	35.66	70.31	-
Tenderer 6	27.00	40.00	67.00	-

Tenderer 7	28.50	36.29	64.79	-
Tenderer 8	22.95	38.35	61.30	-
Tenderer 9	25.20	32.59	57.79	-
Tenderer 10	20.85	34.46	55.31	-

Lot 4 – Asbestos Remediation and Removal

Contractor	Quality Score 40%	Price Score 60%	Overall Score	Rank
Erith Contractors Ltd	49.95	40.00	89.95	1
Rhodar Ltd	50.10	32.68	82.78	2
Aspect Contracts Ltd	47.25	29.95	77.20	3
Tenderer 4	41.40	34.71	76.11	-
Tenderer 5	30.75	28.94	59.69	-
Tenderer 6	35.25	22.85	58.10	-
Tenderer 7	25.50	27.48	52.98	-
Tenderer 8	18.15	31.69	49.84	-

- 4.5 The terms of the Framework mean that the stated business will be allocated to the highest ranked provider as established in the above table. For substantial additional works, providers appointed to the Framework Agreement may be invited to participate in a mini competition.
- 4.6 The Summary of the Tendering and Tender Evaluation process is provided in Appendix 1.
- 4.7 The award of the Framework Agreement was approved by the Executive Director of Place, in consultation with the Convenor and Vice Convenor of Finance and Resources in March 2022. This decision was taken under urgency provisions to enable the new Agreement to commence on 1 April 2022. The Agreement will run for a period of three years, with the option to extend for up to a further 12 months, at a total estimated value of £3,165,593.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 The contract will run for a period of three years with the option to extend for up to a further 12 months with contract management resources provided within the Housing Service to manage the contract to ensure compliance with reporting requirements and to evaluate, monitor and manage provider performance.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 The estimated contract value of each of the four Lots being taken forward is reflective of an estimated future pipeline of works and that the scope of works may fluctuate subject to budget allocation and funding approvals. Contract spend will be monitored on an ongoing basis

- 6.2 The costs associated with procuring this Framework are estimated to be between £20,000 and £35,000.

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 The contract recommended for award is compliant with procurement regulations and the Council's Contract Standing Orders.
- 7.2 As part of the procurement process it was identified that all the bidders pay the Living Wage rate and do not use zero-hour contracts.
- 7.3 Where Asbestos removal works are carried out the Contractors will treat this as special waste in line with stringent legislative requirements.
- 7.4 Where possible asbestos contractors use mobile vans fitted out as laboratories which carry out sample analysis. This negates the requirement to travel to a static laboratory and contributes to the Council's target of a net zero city by 2030.
- 7.5 The current Framework mandates that the suppliers will provide a community benefit from the community benefit menu for every service order commissioned.
- 7.6 The Framework utilises the Council's menu of community benefits which currently lists 41 available benefits each with a point value associated. Every supplier is committed to this system. The value of the call off pre-determines the amount of points that the supplier is required to spend, this will occur for every call off. Each community benefit offer will be monitored on the Council's community benefits platform by the Council's contract manager and reported annually.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 None.

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 – Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Process.

Appendix 1 – Summary of Tendering and Tender Evaluation Process

Lot 1	Asbestos Surveying																	
Framework period	Three years with the option to extend for up to a further twelve months, undertaken at the sole discretion of the Council. (3 + 1)																	
Estimated Lot Value (including extensions)	£939,440																	
Procurement Route Chosen	Open procedure using Public Contracts Scotland																	
Tenders returned	10																	
Name of recommended suppliers	Lucion Services Ltd Franks Portlock Consulting Ltd Environtec Ltd																	
Price / Quality Split	60 % Quality	40 % Price																
	<p>The emphasis on Quality was to reflect the need for a high level of service for end users.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>AWARD CRITERIA</th> <th>WEIGHTING</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Implementation & Delivery of The Contract</td> <td>17.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract</td> <td>17.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution</td> <td>15.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets</td> <td>20.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Health & Safety</td> <td>15.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Community Benefits and Engagement</td> <td>7.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fair Work Practices</td> <td>7.5%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING	Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%	Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%	Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%	Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%	Health & Safety	15.0%	Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%	Fair Work Practices	7.5%
AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING																	
Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%																	
Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%																	
Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%																	
Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%																	
Health & Safety	15.0%																	
Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%																	
Fair Work Practices	7.5%																	
Evaluation Team	Tenders were evaluated by Council officers from Housing Service																	

Lot 2	Asbestos Sampling and Laboratory Analysis			
Framework period	Three years with the option to extend for up to a further twelve months, undertaken at the sole discretion of the Council. (3 + 1)			
Estimated Lot Value (including extensions)	£94,869			
Procurement Route Chosen	Open procedure using Public Contracts Scotland			
Tenders returned	8			
Name of recommended suppliers	Lucion Services Ltd Environtec Ltd Life Environmental Services Ltd			
Price / Quality Split	60 % Quality	40 % Price		
	<p>The emphasis on Quality was to reflect the need for a high level of service for end users.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>AWARD CRITERIA</th> <th>WEIGHTING</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> </tbody> </table>		AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING
AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING			

	Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%
	Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%
	Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%
	Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%
	Health & Safety	15.0%
	Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%
	Fair Work Practices	7.5%
Evaluation Team	Tenders were evaluated by Council officers from Housing Property	

Lot 3	Asbestos Air Testing and 4-Stage Clearance Testing	
Framework period	Three years with the option to extend for up to a further twelve months, undertaken at the sole discretion of the Council. (3 + 1)	
Estimated Lot Value (including extensions)	£289,454	
Procurement Route Chosen	Open procedure using Public Contracts Scotland	
Tenders returned	10	
Name of recommended suppliers	Lucion Services Ltd EDP Health Safety & Environmental Consultants Ltd Franks Portlock Consulting Ltd	
Price / Quality Split	60 % Quality	40 % Price
	The emphasis on Quality was to reflect the need for a high level of service for end users.	
	AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING
	Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%
	Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%
	Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%
	Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%
	Health & Safety	15.0%
	Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%
	Fair Work Practices	7.5%
Evaluation Team	Tenders were evaluated by Council officers from Housing Service	

Lot 4	Asbestos Remediation and Removal
--------------	---

Framework period	Three years with the option to extend for up to a further twelve months, undertaken at the sole discretion of the Council. (3 + 1)																	
Estimated Lot Value (including extensions)	£1,841,830																	
Procurement Route Chosen	Open procedure using Public Contracts Scotland																	
Tenders returned	8																	
Name of recommended contractors	Erith Contractors Ltd Rhodar Ltd Aspect Contracts Ltd																	
Price / Quality Split	60 % Quality	40 % Price																
	<p>The emphasis on Quality was to reflect the need for a high level of service for end users.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>AWARD CRITERIA</th> <th>WEIGHTING</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Implementation & Delivery of The Contract</td> <td>17.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract</td> <td>17.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution</td> <td>15.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets</td> <td>20.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Health & Safety</td> <td>15.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Community Benefits and Engagement</td> <td>7.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fair Work Practices</td> <td>7.5%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING	Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%	Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%	Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%	Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%	Health & Safety	15.0%	Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%	Fair Work Practices	7.5%
AWARD CRITERIA	WEIGHTING																	
Implementation & Delivery of The Contract	17.5%																	
Technical and Quality of Delivery of The Contract	17.5%																	
Communication, Monitoring & Dispute Resolution	15.0%																	
Meeting Key Performance Indicators & Targets	20.0%																	
Health & Safety	15.0%																	
Community Benefits and Engagement	7.5%																	
Fair Work Practices	7.5%																	
Evaluation Team	Tenders were evaluated by Council officers from Housing Service																	