

Development Management Sub-Committee Report

Wednesday 7 December 2022

Application for Listed Building Consent

Site 117 Metres southwest of 6, New Market Road, Edinburgh.

Proposal: Part demolition and alterations of listed buildings in association with proposed mixed-use development.

Item – Other Item at Committee

Application Number – 22/00671/LBC

Ward – B09 - Fountainbridge/Craiglockhart

Reasons for Referral to Committee

The application has been referred to the Development Management Sub-Committee because the proposed works affect category B listed buildings and involve a significant degree of demolition.

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Granted** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposal is acceptable with regard to Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 in terms of preserving the parts and features of the listed buildings that embody the special architectural and historic interest which the buildings possess and there will be no detrimental impact on the setting of any listed buildings.

Overall, the proposals comply with Historic Environment Scotland policy and guidance, with particular regard to securing a sustainable and long-term use of the remaining parts of these category B listed buildings. Whilst the level of demolition will result in a degree of impact, this is justified as being the minimum level of intervention necessary to preserve key elements of the special interest of these listed buildings due to the current condition of the buildings, constraints of the site and need to devise an economically viable scheme which will bring wider public benefits. The treatment of the retained elements of the listed cattle sheds and significant curtilage buildings will preserve their historic and architectural character.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The application site measures 1.78 hectares and is located to the south-west of New Market Road, on the south side of New Mart Road.

The site is occupied by a range of buildings that formed part of the historic 'New Markets' built between 1905 and 1918 which include the Corn Exchange to the north of the site. A significant area of the site is occupied by the category B listed former Livestock Sheds dating from 1912 by James A Williamson, Superintendent of Works, comprising a five-aisled, steel-framed cattle shelter with a corrugated asbestos and glass roof (reference LB30283, listed on 16.06.1992). These are in use as five aside football pitches. The associated rendered range of buildings along the south-east edge of the site comprising the former Milch Cow Byres and Sales Ring are listed as part of the curtilage and are in use as a tenpin bowling alley and snooker/pool hall.

The main buildings of the historic market complex are located to the north-east of the site on New Market Road and north of the site on New Mart Road as follows:

- 11 New Market Road, Corn Exchange, category B listed (reference LB30282, listed on 16.06.1992).
- 8-9 New Market Road, Newmarket Pockets, Former Market Refreshment Rooms, category C listed (reference LB30281, listed on 16.06.1992);
- 6 New Market Road, St Cuthbert`s Association Cattle Depot, category B listed (reference LB30280, listed on 10.06.1992); and
- New Mart Road, John Swan and Sons Livestock Market including Caretaker's House, gates and gate piers, category B listed (reference LB30317, listed on 01.07.1994).

The site is mainly level with a marked drop in level between the adjacent Asda supermarket car park and range of buildings containing the tenpin bowling alley and snooker/pool hall. The primary access into the site for pedestrians and vehicles is off New Market Road and there is a historic entrance to the west of this access which is now used for servicing and deliveries to the Corn Exchange complex. Another vehicular entrance accesses the south-west corner of the site off New Mart Road through locked gates.

The surrounding area is mixed-use in character, including predominantly three-storey, modern residential flats to the immediate north beyond the former John Swan and Sons Livestock Market, now in use as offices and small-scale business units. The Corn Exchange buildings, restored in 1999, are in use as a concert and entertainments venue with a bar/bistro occupying the former Market Refreshment Rooms and a meat wholesaler is in the historic St Cuthbert's Association Cattle Depot. An Asda supermarket and associated car park lies to the south-east of the site and a gym with extensive car parking occupies the land to the south-west of the site. The Risk Factory community centre is beyond the gym site beside the Water of Leith.

Description of the Proposal

The proposal includes the partial demolition of the former cattle sheds, cow byres and modern sheds on the site associated with the erection of a mixed-use development comprising built-to-rent (BTR) apartments and student accommodation and alteration of the remaining sections of these buildings to form associated features and facilities.

Approximately 12% of the former Livestock Sheds will be retained in the form of four central bays of the frames (two bays wide and two bays deep) along with elements of the roof structure, including the cupola frames and timber lined gables. Six additional columns will be retained as freestanding elements within the landscape, including girder trusses to link the two columns immediately behind the retained shed bays. These bays will be moved forward (to the east) by one bay depth to form a central part of the masterplan design. The frames will be dismantled to ascertain which segments are in the best condition and which original/existing cladding materials can be retained. Two new pavilion buildings forming the main entrances to the will be erected below the retained structures.

The proposals seek the retention of three eastmost bays of the Milch Cow Byres and Sales Ring, equating to approximately 38% of the existing range. The section which contained the auction ring is included, along with the former milking byres and one bay of the livestock byres, which has a clock on the front facade. New community uses will be accommodated within these structures involving the removal of existing partition walls and erection of new partitions.

In addition to the larger structures detailed above, several feature elements of the listed buildings will be retained within the proposed landscaping, including several columns of the Livestock Sheds in their existing locations and stonework detailing from the former cow byres.

Scheme 1

The original scheme proposed the retention of only the steel frames of the Livestock Sheds, without key elements of the roof structure and coverings or timber gable infills.

An associated application for planning permission has been submitted for the demolition and alteration of the existing buildings on the site and erection of a mixed-use development comprising 393 built-to-rent (BTR) apartments and student accommodation totalling 406 bed spaces, with ancillary facilities, landscaping and access works (application number 22/00670/FUL).

Supporting Information

- Heritage Statement;
- Condition Survey;
- Planning Statement and
- Design and Access Statement and visualisations.

Relevant Site History

21/04830/PAN
Site 117 metres southwest of 6
New Market Road
Edinburgh

Redevelopment to form build-to-rent housing and purpose-built student accommodation with associated ancillary development, demolitions, public realm, landscaping and access.

Pre-application Consultation approved.
28 September 2021

Other Relevant Site History

None.

Pre-Application process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

Consultation Engagement

Archaeologist

Historic Environment Scotland

Historic Environment Scotland

Refer to Appendix 1 for a summary of the consultation response.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Date of Renotification of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Press Publication Date(s): 4 March 2022;

Site Notices Date(s): 1 March 2022;

Number of Contributors: 1

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

This application for listed building consent is required to be assessed against Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

- Having due regard to HES Policy and guidance, do the proposals harm a listed building or its setting?

- If the proposals do comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for approving them?

Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

a) The proposals harm the listed building or its setting?

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change: Use and Adaptation of Listed Buildings
- Managing Change: Demolition of Listed Buildings
- Managing Change: Setting

Demolition

HES emphasises the importance of retaining listed building and only resorting to demolition if every other option has been explored. Keeping listed buildings in an existing use or finding a new use that has the least possible impact, is the best way to protect them. Alterations to a building, even if extensive, is better than losing the building entirely.

In this case, the approach taken is to retain representative, characteristic parts of the former cattle sheds along with a section of the curtilage buildings, including the part that contained the auction ring and use these elements to inspire positive change within the area. The historic architecture has been used to influence the design of the new development and this, along with a "heritage journey" through the site will retain the essence of the site's historic industrial past and physical evidence of how it once appeared.

The assessment of this proposal falls between the first two HES Managing Change publications listed above. Under the "Use and Adaptation of Listed Buildings" the section on 'selective demolition' is most applicable, although the extent of removal in this case is substantial. However, HES defines selective demolition as involving the removal, or demolition, of parts of a listed building to enable the significant parts of a listed building to be retained. In this sense, the proposed level of demolition falls into this category, given that elements of the structures to be demolished include less important component parts of the original buildings and later additions of little interest.

The final option in the "Use and Adaptation" document is 'enabling development' which in this case would mean using new build development to enable retention of more of the listed asset. However, this site is constrained in area and there is no prospect of obtaining adjacent land, so the enabling development option is not available.

Even then, a fine balance has had to be reached in terms of new build development to allow meaningful retention of key elements of the listed buildings without compromising planning policy and guidance to an unacceptable extent.

HES's publication, "Demolition of Listed Buildings" applies even if part of a building is to be retained, but the proposed works would result in the loss of most of the listed building. The proposed scheme involves minority retention, even if the most representative parts, so has been assessed against the four situations described by HES. If one of the following situations applies, then the loss of a listed building is likely to be acceptable if this is clearly demonstrated and justified.

Is the building no longer of special interest?

The category B listed Livestock Sheds are of special historic interest forming part of a surviving range of buildings that formed part of the historic 'New Markets' complex, dating from the early 20th century. These markets were intended to replace and consolidate the various outmoded market facilities in central Edinburgh and were associated with two major new railway sidings providing the principal transport infrastructure serving the site. The layout for the site was set out in a master plan devised by the Public Works Office under the direction of James Williamson.

Whilst the former cattle sheds are relatively functional, backland structures, in contrast to the more former and decorative, sandstone frontage buildings, which include the Corn Exchange, they have intrinsic historic and architectural interest as a fine example of this building type and construction. This is derived from the structural scale and repetitive rhythms of the functional engineering required at this time to form five large clear span enclosures for sheltering livestock. In addition, the design is high quality with intricately detailed steel framing and glazed roof sections providing natural daylight.

The former Milch Cow Byres, although listed only as curtilage buildings, are part of this agricultural market range and form the south-east edge of the site, although facing into the site. This relatively modest, mainly rendered structure has historic interest as the site of the former auction ring and architectural interest in terms of the rhythm of its gable-on bays and stone wallhead feature panels and glazed cupolas in two of the bays.

Unsympathetic alterations over the years, notably those undertaken to form the current football, bowling and snooker complexes, have had a detrimental impact on the character of both listed structures. In particular, the widening of the westernmost structural bay of the former cattle sheds involved the replacement of original columns with functional steel supports which has upset the internal structural rhythm and authenticity of this bay. Also, partial-height concrete masonry walls, netting and metal cladding were erected to enclose open areas around the perimeter of the sheds detracting from the relatively open nature of the structures. The authenticity of the roof coverings of the sheds has been affected by functional localised repairs and the original interior of the former milch byres was lost in the conversion to the current use, including the installation of suspended ceilings throughout.

However, despite these alterations, the Livestock Sheds and Milch Cow Byres remain listed structures of significant interest.

Is the building incapable of meaningful repair?

This issue is separate to that of the economic viability of any repairs, which is considered below. Most traditionally constructed buildings, even those in an advanced state of decay, can be repaired. A summary of the condition surveys carried out on these listed structures is detailed below.

Livestock Sheds

The former cattle sheds comprise five main bays of steel framed structures, covered with a series of pitched and flat roofs, with a rendered changing room block on the north side. The frames consist of cushion capital columns carrying segmental-arched lattice beams which support segmental-arched roof trusses. The external elevations are formed in a mix of masonry walls with part roughcast finish, timber boarding and corrugated metal cladding and netting.

The condition survey concludes that the metal pitched roofs covering most of the football complex are in a very poor condition and need to be replaced in full, along with the existing roof light formations. Whilst the adjoining and detached pitched roofs are in a serviceable condition, these would require remedial work. The structural steel columns and beams appear to be fair condition, with surface corrosion to the steelwork in some areas and especially at the junction of the steel beams and segmental-arched lattices. However, the structural integrity of these areas has not been established. The various types of external walling are in poor condition and require repairs/replacement.

Milch Cow Byres

The associated milch byres have masonry external walls clad in concrete roughcast with exposed sandstone features and the north elevation is painted. Overall, the structures appear to be in fair condition, with repairs required to the external elevations, although the external structure was not visible during the condition survey due to the extent of the external and internal coverings and numerous cracks in the render finish and areas of bossing were noted. The roof structure and slated pitches are in fair condition, with slates failing in localised areas. The windows which are single glazed, painted Crittal are in reasonable condition with spot corrosion.

In summary, neither of these buildings are incapable of meaningful repair, although the repairs required are extensive and costly, these would not diminish the buildings' special interest.

Is the demolition of the building essential to delivering significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community?

The proposed development will deliver benefits to the wider community in terms of housing and associated economic growth in the area. However, these benefits are not of public significance to the extent that they could be seen to outweigh the strong presumption in favour of retaining listed buildings.

Economic viability?

The final question is whether the repair and reuse of these listed buildings is not economically viable, that is the cost of retaining the structures would be higher than their end value. In such cases, the difference in repair cost to end value is known as the 'conservation deficit'. The principle of demolition should only be accepted where it has been demonstrated that all reasonable efforts have been made to retain the listed building.

In terms of use, the applicant's current operations at New Market Road are no longer sustainable due to the need to modernise the present facilities across the complex to meet and compete with modern requirements along with high ongoing costs of repair and maintenance of the structures across the complex. In particular, the cost of the repair and/or replacement of the roofs and glazed structures of the former cattle sheds and byres is unsustainable and cannot be avoided as some sections are now hazardous. This existing situation was compounded by a period of continuous shut down during the pandemic.

The economic viability of retaining all or parts of the listed fabric has been assessed by the applicant through a series of detailed speculative development appraisals based on condition surveys of the existing buildings and cost estimates, along with a marketing exercise. A substantial "conservation deficit" has been identified across the site which would render the redevelopment of the site with full retention of the existing listed fabric, through minimum intervention, adaptation or extension, not economically viable. Also, the redevelopment of less sensitive parts of the site alone would be insufficient to cross fund the full retention of the existing listed structures. On this basis, the applicant has explored which alternative options would enable the viable retention of the most important representative elements of the listing buildings, within a relevant context. These options included alternative uses along with varying degrees of selective demolition and new build.

In assessing the associated application for listed building consent, Historic Environment Scotland (HES) accepts that there is a substantial conservation deficit, especially if listed buildings on the site are retained, but has noted concerns with the marketing process undertaken in terms of price, which should be the current market value of the site with its existing buildings, reflecting location and condition, and including a guide price on the marketing information. HES has also stated concern that the marketing was over prescriptive by way of considering interest for the retention and refurbishment of the existing premises only, excluding alternative uses. . That acknowledged, these listed buildings, in particular the former cattle sheds, are difficult to re-use and adapt due to their form and scale, so the normal marketing guidance is less applicable for this site.

Economic Development has studied the applicant's calculations and found these to be generally acceptable with a reasonable, if below normal, profit margin. The proposal preferred by HES would not have been economically viable.

Retained Heritage Assets

The elements of the listed structures to be retained encapsulate the functional and historic use of these buildings, illustrating where the livestock were housed, milked and auctioned. These remnants also capture many key historic architectural features, including roof vents, stone banding, access doors, rainwater outlets, a hayloft door and trolley point. The original construction materials of sandstone, harling, slate, timber, metal and glass will also be evident in the retained structures.

Livestock Sheds

The significance of the main listed structures will be acknowledged in the proposed use as covered areas of the proposed "Heritage Square" leading to the entrance lobbies of the new BTR apartments.

The original ornate columns, primary trusses and finer, main-span secondary trusses of the cast iron frames will be fully refurbished and exposed to allow viewing of the original detailing. These are impressive, essential components of the sheds' construction.

Due to structural wind loadings and maintenance concerns, it is not proposed to retain the glazed elements of the roofs. However, the corrugated iron sheeting will be retained to the front two bays of the sheds. Some of this sheeting is understood to be original, but some parts have been replaced and altered for the existing use. The space below the retained frames will form part of the main public realm space of the new development and two pavilion buildings will be sited below the second bays of the historic frames, connecting with the proposed BTR buildings. The omission of roof coverings over these second two bays (to the west) is acceptable to provide sufficient daylight to the new build structures.

The retention of the cast iron cupola structure over all four retained bays will keep an important record of the most visually decorative element of the roof and how daylight and ventilation, through the side louvered vents, was provided. The sheds were constructed with open sides and high-level timber-boarded infills on their end 'gables'. This cladding will be retained, along with the overhanging eaves, bargeboards and decorative plaque on the existing central bay. These are key elements of the historic roof structures which will give the retained bays visual and physical presence when viewed from the "Heritage Square" when entering the site from New Market Road and Asda Road. The decorative plaque will be placed on the first bay seen (to the south) to showcase the detailing of the historic architecture.

This showcasing of essential components of the Livestock Sheds will be continued through the retention of several original columns in their existing locations as part of the landscape design. These columns, in particular the linked columns immediately behind the retained shed bays will indicate the original extent of the livestock sheds.

Conditions have been applied to ensure that all the historic structures on the site are officially recorded and that a robust methodology statement is submitted for approval before any historic structures or features are demolished, relocated or removed from the site.

Milch Cow Byres and Sales Ring

The three bays of this range to be retained will be restored externally using original and matching materials and there are no surviving historic internal features of significance. The proposed uses, including a café/restaurant and wellness/yoga studio acknowledges the historic purpose of the auction area where people would gather to buy and sell livestock and a gives a humorous nod to where the cows were milked and fed in terms of the new food and drink use. Retained stonework and other significant architectural details from the livestock byres will be included in the new landscaping scheme to bring the site's industrial past to life.

There are no significant internal features within the former auction ring/cattle byres range, so the proposed internal alterations will have no detrimental impact on historic or architectural character.

A condition has been applied to ensure that the detailing of any alterations to the main façade to form new openings for the commercial uses will be of appropriate scale and detailing.

The industrial heritage of the site will be encapsulated in physical and narrative form. Apart from the retained elements of the actual structures, elements of the forms, detailing and materials of the proposed new build development will reflect those of the former cattle sheds and byres and this consideration of the history of the site will continue in the proposed landscaping through surface patterns and materials in the landscaping and street furniture. A new storytelling wall within the public square will provide a written and pictorial narrative.

Demolition Summary

In this case, based on a combination of the current condition of the main B listed structures and prohibitive repair costs, combined with the viability of the existing use without essential repairs being carried out, the only realistic way to save any key parts of the buildings is through radical intervention. Whilst the level of demolition is substantial, this is the minimum action necessary to preserve key elements of the special interest of these listed buildings which is also economically viable.

Whilst the extent of retention in terms of percentages of the listed structures on site is low at 12% of the Livestock Sheds and 37% the former Milch Cow Byres, the refined proposals include a level of retention in terms of representative parts and detailing which is sufficient to support the extent of demolition. A level of impact is unavoidable with this amount of demolition, although this is mitigated by the retention of key elements that contribute most to the buildings' respective special characters.

Setting

Historic Environment Scotland's document 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment - Setting' states.

"Setting' is the way the surroundings of a historic asset or place contribute to how it is understood, appreciated and experienced."

The proposed redevelopment of this site will have an impact on the setting of the adjacent listed buildings which formed the public face of the historic 'New Markets' complex and define the street frontages of New Market Road. These buildings include the category B listed Corn Exchange and St Cuthbert's Association Cattle Depot and category C listed Market Refreshment Rooms to the east of the site. The street presence of these buildings as viewed from Hutchison Terrace is emphasised by the extensive area of fenced grass in front.

The category B listed retained façade of John Swan and Sons Livestock Market on the north side of New Mart Road and flanking façade of the Corn Exchange opposite presented the main secondary frontage to the complex. The southeast facade of St Cuthbert's Association Cattle Depot is prominent in views from the east.

Currently, the gables of the Livestock Sheds are just visible in the longer views from Chesser Avenue and in glimpsed views between the buildings fronting New Market and New Mart Road. Due to a change in site levels, only the roofs of the Milch Byres and Sales Ring and Livestock Sheds are visible from the east.

Whilst the proposed new build development will alter these views, most significantly when viewed from the junctions of Hutchison Terrace and New Mart Road and Asda Road and New Market Road, the scale, massing and design of the new structures will maintain an appropriate setting for the historic frontage buildings. Given the projection above the height of the listed buildings on New Market Road, the fragmentation and variation of the roofscape is a well-considered aspect of the new build design and the choice of materials in type and tone will create an appropriate and complementary backdrop to the listed frontage buildings. Importantly, the physical presence of the "New Markets" in the wider local area will be preserved.

In terms of the setting of the retained elements of the former livestock sheds and cow byres and auction ring, the proposed "Heritage Square" will maintain the openness, public nature and hardstanding character of the historic yard, whilst introducing an appropriate level of soft landscaping to provide visual and physical amenity for the new uses whilst improving water attenuation. The re-purposing of the former auction ring building as a community space will help reaffirm the building's importance as a key historical node on the site and emphasise the significance of the retained frames of the former cattle sheds. The proposed storytelling wall retained heritage features and new landscaping elements influenced by the site's historic function and architecture will enrich the setting of the retained listed structures on the site, as well as the historic frontage buildings.

Conclusion in relation to the listed building

Overall, the proposed development will result in a degree of impact to the listed buildings in terms of the substantial loss of original fabric. However, this is justified as being the minimum level of intervention necessary to preserve key elements of the special interest of these listed buildings due to the current condition of the buildings, constraints of the site and need to devise an economically viable scheme which will bring wider public benefits. The treatment of the retained elements of the listed cattle sheds and significant curtilage buildings will preserve their historic and architectural character.

The proposed new buildings are of appropriate scale, massing, detailing and materials and along with new complementary landscaping, will have no detrimental impact on the setting of the retained listed structures on the site and other listed buildings in the immediate vicinity.

Conditions have been applied to ensure that the specifications for all proposed external materials for repairs and alterations to the retained historic assets on the site and proposed new buildings and landscaping are appropriate.

The proposals are acceptable in terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and relevant HES guidance as the proposals preserve the features of these listed buildings that embody the special architectural and historic interest which the buildings possess.

b) There are any other matters to consider?

The following matters have been identified for consideration:

Archaeological Remains

The site is within an area of archaeological significance as it contains historic structures that formed part of Edinburgh's 'new markets' complex constructed by the Public Works Office in the early 20th century. A significant area of the site is occupied by the category B listed Livestock Sheds dating from 1912.

Whilst the scale of retention and re-use of the historic structures on site is limited, in this case there are valid grounds for permitting the extent of demolition proposed. However, it is important that the details of these buildings in their existing form are recorded prior to demolition and any significant archaeological remains revealed

Accordingly, a condition has been applied to ensure that a comprehensive programme of archaeological work is undertaken. This programme will include detailed historic building surveys prior to and during demolition/strip out works affecting the listed buildings on the site, a programme of public/community engagement during development and incorporation of the history of the site in the final design.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

A summary of the representations is provided below:

material considerations

No material objections have been received.

non-material considerations

The comments submitted relate to the associated application for planning permission.

Conclusion in relation to other matters considered

The proposals are acceptable with regard to the other material considerations that have been identified above.

Overall conclusion

The proposal is acceptable with regard to Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 in terms of preserving the parts and features of the listed buildings that embody the special architectural and historic interest which the buildings possess and there will be no detrimental impact on the setting of any listed buildings.

Overall, the proposals comply with Historic Environment Scotland policy and guidance, with particular regard to securing a sustainable and long-term use of the remaining parts of these category B listed buildings. Whilst the level of demolition will result in a degree of impact, this is justified as being the minimum level of intervention necessary to preserve key elements of the special interest of these listed buildings due to the current condition of the buildings, constraints of the site and need to devise an economically viable scheme which will bring wider public benefits. The treatment of the retained elements of the listed cattle sheds and significant curtilage buildings will preserve their historic and architectural character.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following;

Conditions :-

1. No demolition shall start until the applicant has confirmed in writing the start date for the new development by the submission of a Notice of Initiation for planning application reference 22/00670/FUL.
2. A detailed methodology statement for the dismantling, storage and re-erection of the elements of the Livestock Sheds hereby approved for retention shall be submitted and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any demolition works commence on these structures. The materials used for re-installation shall comprise original elements only, with the exception of any sections/areas where there is insufficient original materials to form the entire architectural element/feature. In such cases, details of the proposed repair/replacement materials shall be provided in the methodology statement. No part of the development hereby approved shall be occupied until the elements of the Livestock Sheds approved for retention have been re-erected in a manner satisfactory to the Planning Authority and before written approval has been obtained from the Planning Authority.

3. No demolition/development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (historic building recording, public engagement, interpretation analysis and reporting, publication) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.
This shall include detailed historic building surveys undertaken prior to and during demolition/strip out works of both the former listed Livestock Sheds and Milch Cow Byres and Sales Area Ring. These surveys will include surveyed elevations, phased plans, combined with photographic and written surveys and archival research to provide an accurate and permanent record of these historic buildings.
4. A detailed specification, including trade names (where appropriate) and sources, of all the proposed external materials (including recycled materials from the demolished structures) for repairs and alterations to the retained historic assets on the site shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site. Note: samples of the materials may be required.
5. Details of the proposed new openings for the commercial uses within the retained parts of the Sales Ring/Milch Byres building shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site.

Reasons: -

1. In order to retain and/or protect important elements of the existing character and amenity of the site.
2. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
3. In order to safeguard the interests of archaeological heritage.
4. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
5. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 1 March 2022

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01A-04A, 05B-26B,27A-36A,37B-43B+45A

Scheme 2

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Clare Macdonald, Senior Planning Officer
E-mail:clare.macdonald@edinburgh.gov.uk

Summary of Consultation Responses

NAME: Archaeologist

COMMENT: It is recommended that the designs are re-submitted showing greater retention and reuse of historic fabric either by adding at least a further framed section. If permission is granted it is essential that detailed historic building surveys are undertaken prior to and during demolition/strip out works of both the former listed Livestock Sheds and historic Milch Cow Byres and Sales Ring.

It is further recommended that as part of any agreed programme of archaeological works that a programme of public/community engagement is undertaken during development and that the history of the site is incorporated with the final design.

DATE: 2 October 2022

NAME: Historic Environment Scotland

COMMENT: Scheme 1

We have no concerns with the redevelopment and reuse of the site, and could support the partial demolition of listed buildings, but object to the current application because the total demolition of a category B listed building has not been justified, and we consider a less harmful scheme may be possible. We note the retention of the southern boundary buildings overlooking the 'square' but would prefer more than three buildings to be kept - even keeping a fourth bay would retain the offices, auction ring and one shed of each specific design.

The application proposes the loss of the entirety of the livestock sheds, with the re-erection of only the bare frame of a two double-bay section. As above, the interest of the sheds goes beyond the engineering structure and includes the roof and timber gables.

We consider that the loss of the entirety of the structure would be demolition rather than alteration. This approach would lose the authenticity of the structure and the re-siting of frames could not retain the special interest of the building, leading inevitably to its delisting.

We consider the loss of several of the buildings listed by curtilage is regrettable, but their treatment would not result in an objection. Our main concern is the proposed demolition of the listed sheds. We could support a scheme for partial demolition, provided it retains a meaningful portion of the existing complex in-situ, including the roofing/boarding. This would help retain its special interest as a listed building.

DATE: 11 April 2022

NAME: Historic Environment Scotland

COMMENT: Scheme 2

We have now received these draft conditions and consequently are able to withdraw our objection to the listed building consent application.

Having said the above, we do not consider that the historic environment has been well served in the planning and development of the scheme. We are particularly disappointed

with the extent of demolition, although it is now far less than originally envisaged by the applicants. The planning of the new build within the constrained site, has necessitated a great deal of demolition with seemingly little thought given to the reuse of the sheds for other uses.

Ideally, therefore, we would still recommend that the further retention of the historic livestock sheds is considered, and also the reuse of an additional bay of the masonry buildings which are listed by curtilage.
Should consent be given, if helpful, our HES conservation engineers would be willing to assist with the fulfilment of your Council's conditions.
DATE: 6 October 2022

The full consultation response can be viewed on the [Planning & Building Standards Portal](#).

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420