

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00am, Wednesday 10 May 2023

Present:

Councillors Osler (Convener), Bennett, Booth, Cameron (Items 1.1-5.2), Dalgleish, Gardiner, Hyslop, Jones, McNeese-Mechan, Mowat and O'Neill.

1. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

The Sub-Committee considered reports on planning applications listed in sections 4, 5 and 6 of the agenda for this meeting.

Requests for a Presentation:

Councillor Booth – Item 4.2 - 1F4 125 Constitution Street, Edinburgh, EH6 7AE – application no. 22/03457/FUL.

Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

2. Centrum House, 108-114 & 116 Dundas Street, Edinburgh

At its meeting of 1 March 2023, the Development Management Sub-Committee agreed to continue consideration of application's 22/05886/FUL and 22/05884/CON.

The application for planning permission was for the proposed demolition of existing office buildings and the erection of a mixed-use development comprising 49 No. flats with 3 No. commercial units (Class 1, 2 and 3 uses), amenity space, landscaping, basement level car and cycle parking and other associated infrastructure – application no. 22/05886/FUL.

The application for conservation area consent was for the complete demolition in a conservation area – application no. 22/05884/CON.

(a) Report by the Chief Planning Officer

The application was for the demolition of the existing buildings on the site and erection of a mixed-use development comprising 49 flats, including 12 affordable units, with three commercial units in Class 1 (retail), 2 (office), and 3 (café/restaurant) uses at ground and

lower ground level, private and communal amenity space, landscaping and basement level car and cycle parking.

The residential accommodation was as follows:

- General Housing: five-bedroom x 2, three-bedroom x 15, two bedroom x 19 and one-bedroom x 1 = 37
- Affordable Housing: two-bedroom x 4 and one-bedroom x 8 = 12

The commercial units were as follows: Unit A 125sqm, Unit B 181 sqm and Unit C 565sqm at ground and basement level.

An associated application for conservation area consent had been submitted for the demolition of the existing buildings on the site.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/771938

(b) Edinburgh World Heritage – Christina Sinclair

Christina Sinclair from Edinburgh World Heritage circulated a statement as she could not attend the meeting. Ms Sinclair argued that the redevelopment had the potential to add a layer of interest to Edinburgh's rich architectural legacy, however the proposal needed to be revised in order to conserve and enhance the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the Old and New Towns of Edinburgh World Heritage sites. She argued that the building was too tall, and suggested that by revising the height of the building and adding things such as contextual architectural depth would make the development more appealing to Edinburgh World Heritage. She argued that the application as presented was considered to have a harmful impact on the OUV of the World Heritage Site and therefore they could not support the proposals at this stage.

(c) Newtown and Broughton Community Council – Annick Gaillard

Annick Gaillard addressed the Committee on behalf of Newtown and Broughton Community Council. Ms Gaillard stated that the Newtown and Broughton Community Council had concerns over the removal of trees, and the building line – specifically on Dundas Street. The Community Council had acknowledged that the set backs had been amended since the previous application, but they still had concerns about them as they were a partial obstruction. The Community Council also advised that residents had not been consulted, and consideration that there were trees in the basement well which would cause limited parking for residents. The Community Council argued that the development would cause an impact on their day to say lives. They therefore asked for the application to be refused.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/771938

(d) Chris Day – Resident of Dundas Street

Chris Day addressed the Committee on behalf of residents in the area. Mr Day argued that the development would dominate the area for decades, in ways which other building do not. He argued that the street pattern would be different if the development were to

be built, and the grid layout of the street would be impacted. Mr Day also argued that the street trees were important at blending in existing buildings, and believed they were characteristic of the area. They therefore wished that the application be refused.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/771938

e) Nicholas Morris on behalf of Anne Russell

Nicholas Morris addressed the Committee on behalf of resident Anne Russell. Mr Morris advised that the proposal would have a detrimental impact on his client. He explained that there would be a loss of privacy and views from her flat. He argued that sunlight to his clients building would be hugely compromised if the application was granted. He argued that the application be refused using Local Development Plan policy DES 5.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/771938

f) Applicants and Applicant's Agent

Andrew Rennick, Paul Scott, Guy Morgan, Craig Ormond, Andrew Mickel and Chirs Thomson were in attendance in support of the application.

Guy Morgan, the architect for the development, spoke on behalf of the applicant. Mr Morgan argued that the development was an opportunity for positive change in Edinburgh. He argued that the proposed development was recommended for approval by Edinburgh Council and complied with the Local Development Plan. He explained that the flats would introduce 25 affordable flats, and was in line with the 20 minute neighbourhood scheme. Mr Morgan also argued that the development would help contribute to a net zero Edinburgh due to the greenery, and would contribute an additional £100,000 Council Tax and Business Revenue for Edinburgh Council every year. Mr Morgan explained that privacy issues had been mitigated by removing a top floor terrace space.

The presentation can be viewed in full via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/771938

Motion

To **GRANT** planning permission subject to:

- 1) The conditions, reasons and informatives as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
 - 2) An additional condition covering detailing of the specific screen planter in addition to being maintained in perpetuity, but also specific drawing details come in of the planter and the proposed planting that would be in it. (1.20.36)
 - 3) An additional condition that the applicant introduce additional cycle parking at the development.
- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Gardiner.

Amendment

- 1) To **REFUSE** planning permission as the proposal was contrary to Local Development Plan policy Des 5 citing residential amenity and privacy.
 - 2) To **REFUSE** conservation area consent as the proposals were contrary to Policy 7g of NPF 4.
- moved by Councillor Mowat, seconded by Councillor Jones.

Voting

For the motion: - 5 votes

For the amendment: - 5 votes

(For the motion: Councillors Bennett, Dagleish, Gardiner, McNeese-Mechan and Osler.

For the amendment: Councillors Booth, Hyslop, Jones, Mowat and O'Neill.)

There being no overall majority, the Convener exercised her right to a casting vote, and voted for the amendment.

Decision

- 1) To **REFUSE** planning permission as the proposal was contrary to Local Development Plan policy DES 5 citing residential amenity and privacy.
- 2) To **REFUSE** conservation area consent as the proposals were contrary to Policy 7g of NPF 4.

(References – Development Management Sub-Committee of 1 March 2023 (item 7.1), report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

Appendix

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p>4.1 - 1 Baileyfield Crescent, Edinburgh, EH15 1BW</p>	<p>Change of use from commercial units to residential flats to the upper floors, of the existing building (as amended) - application no. 22/05536/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>4.2 – 1F4, 125 Constitution Street, Edinburgh, EH6 7AE</p>	<p>Change of use (retrospective) from flat to short-term let apartment (Sui Generis) - application no. 22/03457/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>4.3 – 4 East Mains Of Ingliston, Ingliston Road, Newbridge</p>	<p>Hotel development (Class 7) with ancillary restaurant / bar (Class 3/Sui Generis), fitness suite (Class 11) and associated facilities with access, landscaping, parking and infrastructure - application no. 22/04151/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons, informatives and conclusion of a legal agreement as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>4.4 – 272 Portobello High Street, Edinburgh, EH15 2AT</p>	<p>Alter hours of operation from 8am to 10pm to 8am to 11pm 7 days a week - application no. 23/00131/FUL</p>	<p>To REFUSE planning permission subject to the reasons as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>4.5 – 16 Ravelston Dykes Road, Edinburgh, EH4 3PB</p>	<p>Demolition/replacement of existing house - application no. 22/04322/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions and informatives as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>4.6 - 67 St Leonard's Street, Edinburgh, EH8 9QR</p>	<p>Change of use from Class 2 stationery /printshop to Class 3 hot-food takeaway - 22/05923/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>4.7 - 1F, 4 Thistle Street North West Lane, Edinburgh, EH2 1EA</p>	<p>Alterations and change use from a vacant art gallery to short-term residential letting with main door access (as amended) - application no. 22/04924/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions and reasons as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>5.1 - 27 & 29 Beaverhall Road, Edinburgh, EH7 4JE</p>	<p>Demolition of existing buildings and erection of mixed-use development comprising residential and other commercial uses, with associated private amenity and open space, landscaping/public realm, car parking, access arrangements, and associated infrastructure (205 units) (as amended) - application no. 22/01654/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and a legal agreement and NPF4 considerations as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>
<p>5.2 - (Site east of) 94 Nicolson Street, Davie Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Partial demolition of the existing retail store and construction of flatted dwellings and associated infrastructure - application no. 22/01355/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons, informatives, a legal agreement and NPF4 considerations as set out in section C of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.</p>

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>6.1 - Centrum House, 108-114 & 116 Dundas Street, Edinburgh - application no's. 22/05886/FUL & 22/05884/CON</p>	<p>Protocol Note by the Service Director – Legal and Assurance</p>	<p>Noted.</p>
<p>6.2 - Centrum House, 108 - 114 & 116 Dundas Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Proposed demolition of existing office buildings and erection of a mixed-use development comprising 49 No. flats with 3 No. commercial units (Class 1, 2 and 3 uses), amenity space, landscaping, basement level car and cycle parking and other associated infrastructure - application no. 22/05886/FUL</p>	<p>To REFUSE planning permission as the proposal is contrary to Local Development Plan policy DES 5 citing residential amenity and privacy.</p> <p>(on a division)</p>
<p>6.3 - Centrum House, 108 - 114 & 116 Dundas Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Complete demolition in a conservation area - application no. 22/05884/CON</p>	<p>To REFUSE planning permission as the proposals are contrary to Policy 7g of NPF 4.</p> <p>(on a division)</p>