

Culture and Communities Committee (Additional Meeting)

10.00am, Thursday 8 June 2023

Present:

Councillors Walker (Convener), Key, Heap, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Cameron, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Staniforth and Thornley.

1. Response to Motion by Councillor McVey – Edinburgh's Christmas

In response to a motion by Councillor McVey, information was provided on the options for delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and approval sought to proceed with a prime contractor approach for Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay.

If agreed, the procurement of these contracts would be progressed through a negotiated procedure for the contract durations as set out in paragraph 4.43 of the report by the Executive Director of Place. The outcome of the procurement process would be reported to the Finance and Resources Committee when concluded.

The Convener ruled that Standing Order 22.15 be suspended for this item to allow for full discussion and debate on the matter.

Motion

- 1) To note the report and to recommend a shorter contract duration of 3 years with appropriate break clauses.
- 2) To approve the report and call for a further report to the August meeting of the Culture and Communities Committee which should include:
 - Detailed Key Performance Indicators for the Christmas and Hogmanay Festivals 2024 and beyond which were in keeping with, and promoted Council policies on accessibility, inclusion and sustainability, active travel, fair work and community benefit.
 - Ways in which in-house capacity could be developed, including the establishment of an in-house coordination and oversight team to monitor the Key Performance Indicators and to explore models of provision in more detail to include information on case studies from other cities which delivered Christmas and New Year events.
 - Options for encouraging events to be located in spaces and places outwith the city centre which were close to public transport and active travel routes.

- Ways in which local businesses, social enterprises and cooperatives would have opportunities to be part of the contract supply chain and delivery model.
 - Consideration of investment in sustainable temporary infrastructure, suitable for use in the delivery of Christmas, Hogmanay, and other city festivals and events throughout the year, including possibilities to support in-house delivery.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Cameron

Amendment 1

To delete the recommendations in the report and replace with:

- 1) To agree the importance of ensuring the winter events followed the views captured in the consultation with local residents and businesses set out in 3.11 of the report.
 - 2) To agree that the two options set out in the report did not offer a full spectrum of viable, sustainable models which could deliver most public good for the City.
 - 3) To note the recommendations did not include the Key Performance Indicators of the contract which would be essential for progressing a contract procurement model.
 - 4) To agree the most effective way to maintain public control and maximise benefit while delivering viable, sustainable events were through a joint venture.
 - 5) To agree to procure an operating partner on a 50/50 ownership basis which would be able to deliver high quality events, bringing skills and delivery capacity from a long-term relationship with an operator and utilising the Council's assets as well as publicly owned space to deliver events that were supported by Edinburgh residents.
 - 6) To agree that this model would help retain a city ownership for Hogmanay to retain cultural ownership for the City and of the City.
 - 7) To agree the exercise to secure a joint venture partner would report back to Culture and Communities Committee as soon as practicable to agree the process for deciding which partner to work with, identifying what they were offering in terms of capacity and creativity and this would clarify the Council's commitments within the joint venture, following the commitments already outlined in the report and any other appropriate supports.
 - 8) To further agree this model should be created to allow the Council to participate with minimal investment for maximum public return and provide the partner organisation with a structure where they could use non-council and non-winter based personal and assets to support the rest of the business.
- moved by Councillor McNeese-Mechan, seconded by Councillor McFarlane

Amendment 2

- 1) To agree to proceed with a prime contractor approach for the award of a contract for Edinburgh's Winter Festivals (combining the contracts for Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay).
 - 2) To note that, if agreed, the procurement of these contracts would be through a negotiated procedure for the contract durations set out in paragraph 4.43 of the report.
 - 3) To note with regret that on balance it was not possible at present for the Council to deliver the Winter Festivals in-house.
 - 4) To agree that options for the Break Clause would be circulated along with matters set out at paragraph 5.6 of the report.
 - 5) To agree that all material discussed in paragraph 5.6 would be returned to Committee for final approval prior to publication.
- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment 3

- 1) To welcome the report but believes the decision for a 5 year contract should not be justified predominantly on the grounds of market preferences and therefore believes that the case for a 5-year contract had not been made strongly enough.
 - 2) To note the Local Government Association report *Festive Cheer: The local impact of Christmas Markets* details Christmas Markets successfully run by public and third sector operators, and believes that the In-House and Partial In-House delivery models merited further investigation of their feasibility.
 - 3) Believes the decision to change to a new contact structure and length would benefit from scrutiny by Full Council.
 - 4) Therefore:
 - To agree in principle the decision noted in 1.1 of the report with the modification that the Contract length be changed to 2 years with a possible extension of a further two.
 - To request that, ahead of any contract extension or retendering being brought to the appropriate Committee, a report is provided laying out how (i) an in-house model could be adopted (ii) how a partially in-house model could be adopted.
 - To refer the report to August Full Council for a formal agreement of the recommendations in the report.
- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

Amendment 4

- 1) To agree to proceed with a prime contractor approach for the award of a contract for Edinburgh's Winter Festivals (combining the contracts for Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay).

- 2) To note that, if agreed, the procurement of these contracts would be through a negotiated procedure for the contract durations set out in paragraph 4.43 of the report.
 - 3) To agree that a ‘wash-up’ should take place between the Council and the contractor within two months of Edinburgh’s Hogmanay, and a performance and improvement report produced for Culture and Communities Committee and Finance and Resources Committee prior to summer to assess the successes, shortcomings, lessons learnt, Key Performance Indicators, and any identified actions required to improve both Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay each year in preparation for the next staging of the events.
- moved by Councillor Mitchell, seconded by Councillor Munro

In accordance with Standing Order 22 (5) and (12), the motion was verbally adjusted and Amendment 2 and Amendment 4 were both accepted as addendums to the adjusted motion.

At this point in the meeting amendment 3 by Councillor Heap was withdrawn with the consent of Councillor Staniforth as seconder.

Voting

| | | |
|------------------------------|---|---------|
| For the Motion (as adjusted) | - | 8 votes |
| For the Amendment | - | 3 votes |

(For the motion (as adjusted) – Councillors Cameron, Heap, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Staniforth, Thornley and Walker.

For the Amendment – Councillors Key, McFarlane and McNeese-Mechan.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To agree to proceed with a prime contractor approach for the award of a contract for Edinburgh’s Winter Festivals (combining the contracts for Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay) and call for a further report to the August meeting of the Culture and Communities Committee which should include:
 - The duration of the contract and details of break clauses.
 - Detailed Key Performance Indicators for the Christmas and Hogmanay Festivals 2024 and beyond which were in keeping with, and promoted Council policies on accessibility, inclusion and sustainability, active travel, fair work and community benefit.
 - Ways in which in-house capacity could be developed, including the establishment of an in-house coordination and oversight team to monitor the Key Performance Indicators and to explore models of provision in more detail to include information on case studies from other cities which delivered Christmas and New Year events.
 - Options for encouraging events to be located in spaces and places outwith the city centre which were close to public transport and active travel routes.

- Ways in which local businesses, social enterprises and cooperatives would have opportunities to be part of the contract supply chain and delivery model.
 - Consideration of investment in sustainable temporary infrastructure, suitable for use in the delivery of Christmas, Hogmanay, and other city festivals and events throughout the year, including possibilities to support in-house delivery.
- 2) To note with regret that on balance it was not possible at present for the Council to deliver the Winter Festivals in-house.
 - 3) To agree that options for the Break Clause would be circulated along with matters set out at paragraph 5.6 of the report.
 - 4) To agree that all material discussed in paragraph 5.6 would be returned to Committee for final approval prior to publication.
 - 5) To agree that a ‘wash-up’ should take place between the Council and the contractor within two months of Edinburgh’s Hogmanay, and a performance and improvement report produced for Culture and Communities Committee and Finance and Resources Committee prior to summer to assess the successes, shortcomings, lessons learnt, Key Performance Indicators, and any identified actions required to improve both Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay each year in preparation for the next staging of the events.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee 7 March 2023 (item 9); Finance and Resources Committee 10 March 2023 (item 5); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

2. NHS Lothian Director of Public Health Annual Report 2022

The NHS Lothian Director of Public Health Annual Report 2022 explained who our population are, what affects their health and what the evidence tells us that we should do to improve health outcomes.

The annual report was a source of demographic information for public, voluntary and community sector partners in Lothian to shape local policy and service discussions.

This annual report focused specifically on inequalities and deprivation as they were the biggest influences on population health, including a focus on what could be done to reduce inequalities, both through immediate responses to the cost of living crisis, as well as longer-term poverty-prevention work and efforts to improve children’s early years and reduce child poverty.

Decision

- 1) To note that there was a public health responsibility to improve and protect the health of everyone in Lothian.
- 2) To note the average figures for Lothian and Edinburgh showed that, while many people lived long, largely healthy lives, there were many who lived more difficult lives, had poor health and died younger than they should.

- 3) To note that people's health was shaped from early life by factors wider than health and social care services. Good health required a nurturing, safe, secure childhood; enough money; a decent home; a good education; a decent job and a sense of control and belonging. Socio-economic factors, rather than behavioural choices were the most influential determinants of health.
- 4) To agree that City of Edinburgh Council (CEC) should continue to prioritise primary prevention initiatives that could help address the wider determinants of health, in line with the three priorities set out in the Community Planning Partnership's Local Outcomes Improvement Plan (LOIP), to ensure that people in Edinburgh had Enough money to live on; Access to work, learning and training opportunities; and A good place to live.

(Reference – report by the Consultant in Public Health (Edinburgh), Population Health Division, NHS Lothian, submitted)