

Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee

10.00am, Tuesday, 3 October 2023

Housing Service Repairs - Benchmarking Report

Executive/routine
Wards

Routine
All

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee is asked to:
 - 1.1.1 note in general this report which responds to two addendums agreed at this committee on 9 May 2023 requesting a report “which includes analysis and benchmarking of spinal column pay against other local authorities and the private sector workforce in Edinburgh” for trade operative posts;
 - 1.1.2 Note that the report is based on 13 respondents, including nine other Councils from a total of 31 surveyed;
 - 1.1.3 Note that amongst the respondents to the survey, the Council benchmarks very highly when it comes to wider terms and conditions of employment, including pension entitlement and sick pay, and is broadly comparable for salaries when viewed as an hourly rate;
 - 1.1.4 Note that challenges in recruiting to trade operative roles are not considered to be the result of the Council offering less favourable terms and conditions, as the responses indicate this is not the case. Rather, there are recruitment challenges across the housing/ construction sectors due to high demand and skills shortages.

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: Sarah Burns, Head of Housing Operations

E-mail: sarah.burns@edinburgh.gov.uk |

Report

Housing Service Repairs - Benchmarking Report

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 This report responds to two addendums from the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee on 9 May 2023 requesting a report *“which includes analysis and benchmarking of spinal column pay against other local authorities and the private sector workforce in Edinburgh”* for trade operative posts.

3. Background

- 3.1 On 9 May 2023, the Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee considered a report on the proposed upscaling of an in-house repairs team to address issues of damp, mould and condensation. The SNP Group addendum set out at 2.3.1. highlighted support for the proposal but concerns around the Council’s ability to successfully recruit to these posts, citing salary as a contributing factor, and called for salary benchmarking against other organisations.
- 3.2 Separately, committee considered a report setting out proposals to bid for Scottish Government funding to accelerate the turnaround of void properties to support the resettlement of Ukrainian Displaced People. The report stated that the works would be awarded to outside contractors to bring this forward at the pace required. The SNP Group addendum set out at 2.3.2 called for salary benchmarking against other organisations and *“a review of the level required to enable recruitment and retention of an increased void team.”*
- 3.3 The relevant addendum extracts are set out below:

3.3.1 Addendum by the SNP Group in relation to item 7.3 – Damp, mould and condensation in Council homes

“1.5.1 Welcomes the planned increased in-house capacity for the Damp and Mould Team but notes the significant challenges around workforce recruitment both within the Housing Property Service but also across the council more generally, with workforce and service delivery both being graded as at critical level in the council’s risk register.

1.5.2 Further notes that the spinal column pay grades in Edinburgh for skilled trades are reportedly lower than other local authorities.

1.5.3 Agrees the updated HSIP must include analysis and benchmarking of spinal column pay against other local authorities and the private sector workforce in Edinburgh and a review of the level required to enable recruitment, noting increased workforce capacity, both of trades and surveyors in house, will be crucial for Edinburgh to meet our significant obligations on tenant safety.”

3.3.2 Addendum by the SNP Group in relation to item 7.4 – Capital Funding Opportunities for Council Housing

“1.1.8. Notes that there is majority political support for in-housing of services and therefore requests a report in two cycles which includes:

• Analysis and benchmarking of spinal column pay against other local authorities and the private sector workforce in Edinburgh and a review of the level required to enable recruitment and retention of an increased void team.”

- 3.4 This report addresses both addendums and shares the findings from a benchmarking exercise that has been undertaken to better understand salaries and terms and conditions for repair service trade operatives working across Scottish local authorities, housing associations and the private sector.

4. Main report

Challenges with Recruitment and Retention

- 4.1 Recruitment and retention are key challenges across the Council, as [reported](#) in the Workforce Deep Dive – Hard to Fill Roles report to Finance and Resources Committee on 20 June 2023. This report highlighted that other Scottish local authorities, and other sectors, are experiencing recruitment challenges.
- 4.2 Significant difficulties have been experienced in recruiting to a range of posts across the Housing Service. Several recruitment drives for trade operatives have been undertaken since the end of the pandemic.
- 4.3 Recent recruitment for the posts of electrician, gas engineers, joiners, labourers, plumbers, glaziers, painters and decorators, plasterers and slaters has had mixed results. This is detailed at Appendix 3.
- 4.4 A People Strategy and Strategic Workforce Plan for 2024-27 is in development for the Council. Areas such as workforce planning, resourcing, attraction, recruitment, retention and staff development are expected to be key themes. The Housing Service will be working with colleagues in Human Resources to support the development of this strategy.
- 4.5 Within the Housing Service, work is ongoing to manage vacancies and to progress opportunities to attract and retain people within the service. This includes the Apprenticeship Programme the Housing Service delivers in close working partnership with Edinburgh Guarantee and Heriot Watt University, which is further detailed in the *‘Retrofitting and major repairs programmes – response to Motion’* report to this committee.

Benchmarking Exercise

- 4.6 While salary is a key factor for recruitment, it is important to also consider the wider employment package. In response to the addendums set out from 2.3.1 in this report, a benchmarking questionnaire was developed (attached at Appendix 1). The questionnaire captured information on salary, work patterns, wider terms, conditions and benefits, and roles/ remits.
- 4.7 The questionnaire was distributed to the 31 other Scottish Local Authorities and 18 Housing Associations operating across the Edinburgh area. 13 responses were received; nine Local Authorities (29% response rate) and four Housing Associations (22% response rate).
- 4.8 A breakdown of the responses is attached at Appendix 1. The organisations have been anonymised and are categorised as LA1-9 (Local Authority respondents) and HA 1-4 (Housing Association respondents). Responses for the City of Edinburgh Council ('the Council') are included alongside for comparison.

High Level Summary of Responses

- 4.9 **Working arrangements:** the responses indicate that trade operatives are typically undertaking similar working hours and work patterns, ranging from a 36 to a 40-hour week. The Council, along with two other Local Authorities, operate the shortest working week at 36 hours. Eight of the respondents have operatives working in a single trade capacity only and four have either multi skilled operatives or an element of complementary skilling. Only one of the four had a salary differential for this.
- 4.10 **Terms and Conditions/ Wider Benefits:** the responses indicate a fairly consistent picture across the Local Authorities with regard to bonus schemes, guaranteed overtime, sickness absence policies, employer pension contributions and wider staff benefits. The Council is particularly competitive in terms of employer pension contributions (22.7%), with only one other Local Authority respondent making a higher contribution. Seven of the Local Authorities still operate under certain Craft terms and conditions; these typically relate to sickness absence and annual leave entitlement. This is similar to the Council's slightly amended sickness absence policy for trade operatives which entitles these staff members to sick pay from the start of their service whereas LGE terms offer sick pay from 26 weeks service.
- 4.11 **Salary:** There are some variations in salaries across the respondents; however, the Council is broadly comparable with the majority of respondents across most posts. There are some posts, particularly those at [Grade 5](#), where the Council is generally slightly less comparable. In some cases, the Council's starting salary is slightly lower but the top spinal column point for the post is comparable. In other instances, the top spinal column point for the Council is slightly higher. The full breakdown of salaries is set out at Appendix 2.
- 4.12 **Apprenticeships:** It is notable that the Council is particularly competitive in Apprentice salaries. The Housing Service sees high levels of applicants for apprenticeships across a range of trades and this presents opportunities for growth of the scheme.

Private Sector

- 4.13 The benchmarking questionnaire was targeted at local authorities and housing associations, as the most comparable organisations. It is recognised that private sector organisations generally offer a higher level of salary than public and third sector organisations. However, there are often notable variations when it comes to wider benefits such as employer pension contributions and sickness absence policies. Comparisons with the private sector are also challenging due to regional variations, changeable landscape due to peaks and troughs in supply and demand, and the wide range of organisations operating within the private sector, from sole traders and small builders to large-scale companies operating nationwide.
- 4.14 Private sector organisations set their own salaries and are not subject to national pay award agreements. There are various sources which private sector organisations can refer to for guidance and benchmarking purposes. Those which were considered as part of this exercise are the most recent publications around pay from the Construction Industry Joint Council ([CIJC](#)) and the Building and Allied Trades Joint Industrial Council ([BATJIC](#)). It is important to note that private sector organisations may choose to directly follow one of these sets of guidelines; to use both as a benchmark to check how competitively they are paying their operatives; or may decide not to follow these at all, for various reasons. The suggested rates of pay across both are broadly comparable to the public sector but it is acknowledged that many private sector organisations chose to exceed these pay guidelines.
- 4.15 However, other organisations elsewhere in the country also highlight challenges with recruitment. This is symptomatic of a buoyant employment market and workforce supply is an issue across the construction sector.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 The addendum outlined at 2.3.2 calls for a “*review of the level required to enable recruitment and retention of an increased void team*”. While offering a salary higher than other employers would naturally attract greater interest in roles, salaries offered must be determined by job evaluation and must be consistent with the rest of the organisation. The Housing Service cannot simply set salaries at a level that it considers may attract more candidates to vacant posts and must explore other ways to attract and retain employees.
- 5.2 Engagement is currently underway over an organisational review of the Housing Service, with a key objective being to ensure the service has an empowered, committed and supported workforce who can deliver the best possible service to our tenants. Effective recruitment and retention is critical to achieving this.
- 5.3 The commitment to review trade operative terms and conditions remains, and this exercise and report form part of that work.
- 5.4 There is a Housing Service Improvement Plan (HSIP) in place which is driving improvements across the service. An update report on the HSIP is reporting to this

committee. Opportunities for staff development are included within the HSIP, including a dedicated project on developing complementary skilling for operatives.

- 5.5 Fundamental changes to job roles could potentially impact on grading and therefore salary; however this would be subject to the normal job evaluation process.
- 5.6 In addition to the questionnaire responses, this benchmarking exercise has highlighted further opportunities for informal engagement and sharing of best/ new practices across organisations. For example, one of the Local Authority respondents indicated that they intend to review work patterns to ensure repair appointment times meet the needs of the service and tenants, as well as offering flexibility for employees. Another Local Authority respondent indicated that they plan to introduce a small team of multi-skilled operatives. Both of these are areas of interest to the Housing Service and opportunities for shared learning across the sector will be fully explored through the review process and the work of the HSIP.

Future Recruitment

- 5.7 Work will continue to recruit into vacant posts across the Housing Service and the HSIP includes a commitment to develop an action plan around hard to recruit posts. This will include a review of the approach to how opportunities are advertised and how the wider benefits of working for the Council can be more prominent in recruitment campaigns. Managers in the Housing Service will continue to work with colleagues in Human Resources to ensure that the future requirements of the Housing Service are considered as part of the Council's People Strategy and Strategic Workforce Plan.
- 5.8 Further discussions are taking place with regional partners, other local authorities and housing associations to share the findings from this benchmarking exercise and to explore opportunities for collaboration to attract a future workforce into the housing sector.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 This report does not put forward any recommendations for decision or change; therefore, there are no direct financial impacts arising from this report.
- 6.2 Financial implications will be fully considered as part of any future decision making that draws on or is informed by the benchmarking exercise outlined in this report.

7. Equality and Poverty Impact

- 7.1 This report does not put forward any recommendations for decision or change; therefore there are no direct Equality and Poverty Impacts arising from this report.
- 7.2 Equality and Poverty Impacts will be fully considered as part of any future decision making that draws on or is informed by the benchmarking exercise outlined in this report.

8. Climate and Nature Emergency Implications

- 8.1 This report does not put forward any recommendations for decision or change; therefore, there are no direct Climate and Nature Emergency implications arising from this report.
- 8.2 Climate and Nature Emergency implications will be fully considered as part of any future decision making that draws on or is informed by the benchmarking exercise outlined in this report.

9. Risk, policy, compliance, governance and community impact

- 9.1 The social landlord repairs service benchmarking questionnaire outlined in this report was developed with input from the Association of Local Chief Housing Officers (ALACHO) to draw on their expertise and guidance. Informal engagement was also carried out with the Federation of Master Builders to gain insight into the private sector.
- 9.2 The benchmarking questionnaire was intended as an information gathering exercise. This report does not put forward any recommendations for decision or change; therefore, there are no direct risk, policy, compliance, governance or community impacts arising from this report. The findings from the benchmarking questionnaire will help inform future service development; any future proposals for change would be subject to engagement with the staff group, Trade Unions and tenants as appropriate.

10. Background reading/external references

- 10.1 [Damp, Mould and Condensation in Council Homes](#) – Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee, 9 May 2023.
- 10.2 [Capital Funding Opportunities for Council Housing](#) – Housing, Homelessness and Fair Work Committee, 9 May 2023.

11. Appendices

- 11.1 Appendix 1 – Social Landlord Repairs Benchmarking Survey and Responses.
- 11.2 Appendix 2 – Salary Comparison Tables.
- 11.3 Appendix 3 – Recent Recruitment Outcomes.

Appendix 1 – Social Landlord Repairs Benchmarking Survey and Responses

Q1. Does your organisation employ trade operatives within the core housing service, in a Direct Labour Organisation (DLO) model or other model? (Please specify)

Organisation	Employment Model
City of Edinburgh Council	Core housing service
LA1	DLO
LA2	Core housing service
LA3	Core housing service
LA4	DLO
LA5	DLO
LA6	DLO
LA7	Other model (employed by the Council but within Building Services team)
LA8	Core housing service
LA9	DLO
HA1	DLO
HA2	Other model (private contractors)
HA3	Core housing service

Q2. Does your organisation employ trade operatives who: (tick all that apply)

Are qualified and working in a single trade only

Are qualified and working in a main trade with complementary skills across other trades

Are qualified and working across multiple trades

Organisation	Single Trade/ Complementary Skilling/ Multi Trade
	Q4. If you employ trade operatives who are qualified and working across multiple trades, what is the salary range or how are they otherwise rewarded?
City of Edinburgh Council	Single Trade Some operatives have skills outwith their main trade and use these to undertake basic tasks. This is not financially rewarded and not recognised in the job description at present.
LA1	Single Trade / Complementary Skilling Some people do have multi skills (not multi trades). We have several operatives across different trade groups that can do cosmetic repairs, 2 specialist window servicing people one joiner and one glazier, various trades that work in the drainage team to cover out of hours. Additional skills are not given any additional payment.
LA2	Single Trade
LA3	Single Trade

LA4	Single Trade
LA5	Single Trade
LA6	Single Trade
LA7	Single Trade
LA8	Single Trade
LA9	Single Trade Currently looking at utilising a small works team who would be multi skilled, but this is not implemented yet.
HA1	Single Trade/ Complementary Skilling / Multi Trade Multi skilled operatives are paid £30,049
HA2	Single Trade/ Complementary Skilling / Multi Trade Salary variations N/A
HA3	Single Trade / Complementary Skilling There are only a few operatives that carry out some multi skilling which is included in their current salary, they do not receive additional payment for these works.

Q3. Salary Tables set out at Appendix 2

Q5. How many hours are in a standard working week for your trade operatives?

Organisation	Working Hours
City of Edinburgh Council	36
LA1	37
LA2	37
LA3	37
LA4	36
LA5	37
LA6	37
LA7	36
LA8	37
LA9	38
HA1	39
HA2	40
HA3	39

Q6. What is the normal working pattern?

Organisation	Working Pattern
City of Edinburgh Council	Monday to Wednesday 8.00 - 16.30 Thursday

	8.00 – 15.30 Friday 8.00-13.00
LA1	Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 – 13.00
LA2	Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 – 13.00
LA3	Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.00 Friday 8.00 – 15.30
LA4	Monday – Friday 8.00 - 16.30
LA5	Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 – 13.30
LA6	Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.00 Friday 8.00 – 15.30
LA7	Craft operatives work a 9-day fortnight, based on 72 over a 2-week period Week 1 – Monday – Friday 8.00 – 16.30 Week 2 – Monday – Thursday 8.00 – 16.30
LA8	Monday to Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 – 13.00 <i>(with some variations and flexible working)</i>
LA9	Monday to Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 – 14.00
HA1	Monday to Thursday

	8.00 – 17.00 Friday 8:00 - 15.30
HA2	Monday to Friday 8.00 – 16.00
HA3	Monday to Thursday 8.00 – 16.30 Friday 8.00 - 15.30

Q7. Are your trade operatives on any bonus scheme?

Only one Local Authority answered Yes to this. This relates to a consolidated bonus which represents a fixed bonus payment, as well as a productive bonus on contract works for projects negotiated or won in competition. Both of these are to be reviewed.

All other organisations answered No to this question.

Q8. Are your trade operatives on any guaranteed overtime scheme?

All the Local Authority responded answered No to this question, although one noted that a number of Operatives are on a rota for the out of hours service (not guaranteed) which is consistent with the Council.

Three of the housing associations answered N/A, one answered No and one noted that some of the operatives work on Out of Hours Stand by Rota which is compulsory for certain Operative/ Trades.

**Q9. Do your staff work solely on your organisation’s housing stock?; and
Q10. Where you answered No to question 9 can you please state what other types of buildings they work on (e.g. schools, community buildings, other social landlords’ housing stock):**

Organisation	Do your staff work solely on your organisation’s housing stock?	What other types of buildings they work on (e.g. schools, community buildings, other social landlords’ housing stock)
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes	
LA1	No	Other Council owned buildings
LA2	Yes	
LA3	No	Other Council owned buildings

		Owner occupier properties through social work requests
LA4	No	Other Council owned buildings
LA5	No	Other Council owned buildings Leased buildings (both domestic and non-domestic)
LA6	No	Other Council owned buildings Call out service provided to three other social landlords
LA7	CHECK	
LA8	No	Other Council owned building Other social landlords' housing stock
LA9	No	Other Council owned building HMO's
HA1	Yes	
HA2	No	Private contractors – services provided to Other social housing, private letting agents, private businesses
HA3	No	Currently services are provided to partner RSLs within the company group.

Q11. Please provide high level terms of your organisation's sickness absence scheme (e.g. 6 months full pay, 6 months half pay).

Organisation	Organisation's sickness absence scheme																							
City of Edinburgh Council	6 months full pay and 6 months half pay Note there is a separate Craft conditions – trade operatives are entitled to sick pay from first day of service, whereas LGE employees do not receive sick pay until they have 26 weeks service																							
LA1	6 months full pay, 6 months half pay when the person has served 2 years but it is reduced pro rate with shorter service.																							
LA2	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Service</th> <th>Full Pay</th> <th>Half Pay</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Less than 26 weeks service</td> <td>nil</td> <td>nil</td> </tr> <tr> <td>26 weeks but less than 1</td> <td>5 weeks</td> <td>5 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 year but less than 2 years</td> <td>9 weeks</td> <td>9 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 years but less than 3 years</td> <td>18 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 years but less than 5 years</td> <td>22 weeks</td> <td>22 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5 years or more</td> <td>26 weeks</td> <td>26 weeks</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Service	Full Pay	Half Pay	Less than 26 weeks service	nil	nil	26 weeks but less than 1	5 weeks	5 weeks	1 year but less than 2 years	9 weeks	9 weeks	2 years but less than 3 years	18 weeks	18 weeks	3 years but less than 5 years	22 weeks	22 weeks	5 years or more	26 weeks	26 weeks		
Service	Full Pay	Half Pay																						
Less than 26 weeks service	nil	nil																						
26 weeks but less than 1	5 weeks	5 weeks																						
1 year but less than 2 years	9 weeks	9 weeks																						
2 years but less than 3 years	18 weeks	18 weeks																						
3 years but less than 5 years	22 weeks	22 weeks																						
5 years or more	26 weeks	26 weeks																						
LA3	<p><u>Trade Workers Continuous Service at commencement of absence from duty</u></p> <table> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th><u>Full Allowance</u></th> <th><u>Half Allowance</u></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Less than 1 year</td> <td>5 weeks</td> <td>5 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 year but less than 2 years</td> <td>9 weeks</td> <td>9 weeks</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 years but less than 3 years</td> <td>18 weeks</td> <td>18 weeks</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>				<u>Full Allowance</u>	<u>Half Allowance</u>	Less than 1 year	5 weeks	5 weeks	1 year but less than 2 years	9 weeks	9 weeks	2 years but less than 3 years	18 weeks	18 weeks									
	<u>Full Allowance</u>	<u>Half Allowance</u>																						
Less than 1 year	5 weeks	5 weeks																						
1 year but less than 2 years	9 weeks	9 weeks																						
2 years but less than 3 years	18 weeks	18 weeks																						

	3 years but less than 5 years 22 weeks 5 years or more 26 weeks	22 weeks 26 weeks
LA4	6 months full pay, 6 months half pay.	
LA5	6 months full pay, 6 months half pay.	
LA6	6 months full, 6 months half pay.	
LA7	6 months full, 6 months half pay.	
LA8	6 months full, 6 months half pay.	
LA9	6 months full, 6 months half pay.	
HA1	First 3 days of any absence for Tradesman is always unpaid 0 – 6 months SSP only 6 months – 1 year 1 week at 80%, then SSP 1 year – 2 year 2 weeks at 80%, then SSP 2 year – 3 year 4 weeks at 80%, then SSP 3 year – 5 year 6 weeks at 80%, then SSP 5 year + 13 weeks at 80% 14-26 weeks at 50% then SSP	
HA2	6 months full pay, 6 months half pay	
HA3	Length of Service at commencement for full and half pay Up to three months employment 0 weeks 0 weeks From three months up to one year of employment 9 weeks 9 weeks Up to two years of employment 18 weeks 18 weeks Up to three years of employment 22 weeks 22 weeks Thereafter 26 weeks 26 weeks	

Q12. What percentage employer contributions do you make to your employees Pension Scheme?

Organisation	Employer contribution to employee Pension Scheme
City of Edinburgh Council	22.7%
LA1	Not provided
LA2	17%
LA3	22.60%
LA4	24.50%
LA5	19.30%
LA6	19.30%
LA7	22.7%
LA8	17%
LA9	22.2%
HA1	3% Employer – Auto Enrolment Scheme 5% Employer – Stakeholders Pension Scheme
HA2	10%
HA3	Range from 5% to 9% depending on what level operatives are on.

Q13. Do you pay any premiums or uplift for specific qualifications, skills or responsibilities e.g. HGV licence?

City of Edinburgh Council does not, with the exception of First Aid Payment which is available to any suitably qualified employee.

7 of the Local Authorities answered No, 1 noted First Aid Payment, 1 answered Yes – although this relates to contracted work (£0.53 to drivers of Tweepens, telehandlers, cherry-pickers and diggers).

2 of the Housing Associations answered No, 1 noted First Aid Payment for qualified staff.

Q14. Please provide details of any other notable staff benefits

Organisation	Any other notable staff benefits
City of Edinburgh Council	Employee discount scheme Cycle to work Green car scheme Eligibility to participate in Local Government Pension Scheme Annual leave entitlement and sickness absence policy Access to employee assistance resources Monthly tool allowance Uniform allowance (Painters)
LA1	N/A
LA2	All benefits that Single Status staff are entitled to e.g. Flexi-Time scheme, Flexible Working, Paternity Leave, Service Recognition Days, Cycle to Work Scheme. Trade staff are classified as Mobile Workers and therefore have a van at home but not for personal use.
LA3	N/A
LA4	Mobile and flexible working, alternative shift patterns, 6 weeks holiday.
LA5	A wide range of training opportunities both online and in person, flexible working and a number occupational health supports Employee discount scheme – where employees have access a number of discounts.
LA6	Homestart, use of Council Vehicle to travel to and from workplace. Flexible Working
LA7	Generous leave entitlement, (33 days (inc 7 public holidays), increasing to 38 days with length of service). Eligibility to participate in Local Authority pension scheme. Monthly tool allowance. Provision of full uniform including footwear. Ongoing training to help enhance and develop your existing skills enabling you to maximize your full potential. Enhanced company sick pay.

	<p>Family friendly policies.</p> <p>Access to employee assistance programme.</p> <p>Access to employee benefit platform providing a large range of discounts across UK retailers.</p>
LA8	N/A
LA9	N/A
HA1	<p>Techscheme</p> <p>Cycle to Work Scheme</p> <p>Perkbox</p> <p>Healthcare Services</p> <p>Hospital Saturday Fund</p> <p>Buying and Selling of Annual Leave</p>
HA2	N/A
HA3	<p>Salary Sacrifice car scheme</p> <p>Cycle to work scheme</p> <p>Health care</p> <p>Vivup Employee Benefits</p>

Q15. Are your trade operatives working under Craft Terms and Conditions that differ from those of Local Government Employees? If yes, please summarise the main points of difference.

Organisation	Craft T&C's (if applicable)
City of Edinburgh Council	Craft T&C's remain in place for provision of tool/ uniform allowance and slight variation to sickness absence policy as outlined at Q11
LA1	Just transferred from Trade to LGE conditions.
LA2	<p>Yes they have their own T&C's.</p> <p>Salary scales are different from Single Status staff, no increments between salary points.</p> <p>Not entitled to Career Breaks.</p>
LA3	<p>Yes, trade operatives work under Craft Terms and Conditions that differ from those of Local Government Employees.</p> <p>Differences:</p> <p>Trades Operatives are entitled to sickness pay from 1st day of employment, LGE entitled from 6 months.</p> <p>Trades Operatives have 7 fixed public holidays whilst LGE have 8 fixed public holidays</p> <p>Trades Operatives are entitled to public holidays back in lieu if they have been off sick over the public holiday as long as they submit the relevant doctors line</p>
LA4	N/A

LA5	Yes – Craft and manual terms and conditions Differences: 37 hour working week against a 35 hour working week. 6 fixed public holidays per annum, with 6 floating days against 10 fixed days and 2 floating days
LA6	Yes, work under the Scottish Joint Negotiating Committees for Local Authorities' Services Building & Civil Engineering Operatives, Engineering Craftsmen, Electricians & Plumber Scheme of Pay and Conditions of Service.
LA7	Local Craft Agreement Main difference are sickness days on public holidays are returned
LA8	Productive bonus scheme and consolidated bonus scheme
LA9	No
HA1	Yes, the following governing bodies are followed for salary increases. 1) SJIB Electrical 2) SNIJIB Plumbing and Gas 3) CIJC, Joiners , Builder, Operative General, Multi-skilled operatives, Semi-skilled operatives, Operative Stores, Operations Supervisor Cleaning, Operations Supervisor Multi Trade, Painters and Operations Managers
HA2	N/A
HA3	Only apprentice Salaries are paid in line with The Scottish Joint Industry Board

Questions 16 and 17 are for Local Authorities only.

Q16.How is your repairs service funded?

Housing Revenue Account

General Fund with Housing Revenue Account re-charge

Other model (please specify)

Organisation	Funding model
City of Edinburgh Council	General Fund with Housing Revenue Account re-charge
LA1	Housing Revenue Account & General Fund
LA2	Housing Revenue Account
LA3	Housing Revenue Account

LA4	General Fund with Housing Revenue Account re-charge
LA5	Funded through a combination of HRA for all Council Housing stock repairs and General fund for repairs to all other properties.
LA6	Housing Repairs are Housing Revenue Account Funded Operational/Estate Properties, general fund.
LA7	All recharges are based on the Council's best value framework, i.e. all costs relating to Building Services are recovered to either Housing Revenue or General Fund via recharging process per job, labour, overhead & material
LA8	Housing Revenue Account
LA9	Housing Revenue Account

Q17. Where funding is from the General Fund, is a surplus created each year through HRA recharging?

Organisation	General Fund Surplus
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes
LA1	N/A
LA2	N/A
LA3	N/A
LA4	Yes
LA5	Yes, for Capital Works
LA6	Yes, although it's not funded from general services, a surplus is created each year.
LA7	No, all recharges are based on the council's best value framework, i.e. all costs relating to Building Services are recovered to either Housing Revenue or General Fund
LA8	N/A
LA9	No

Q18. Is there any further information you would like to note?

One of the Local Authorities added the following:

- Our Trades team do not undertake Capital funded works – only responsive repairs & voids. We have approx. 7800 houses with 73 in-house trades staff.
- Plan to review the working patterns of Trade staff to support –
 - current needs of customers i.e., no appointments available on a Friday afternoon, evenings or weekends.

- Impact of out of hours service on shifts next day when maximum hours have been met. Our out of hours service is available 365 days per year during non-working hours. Trade staff are unhappy with the compensatory payments made for standby and this will be part of the review.
- We have trade staff who currently work compressed or reduced hours.

We have issues in recruiting Trade staff due to current economic climate – although speaking to other LA's this is nationwide.

Appendix 2. Salary Comparison Tables (in response to Q3)

Q3. Please indicate the salary ranges below as applicable (using the most comparable role if job titles differ and noting N/A where not applicable). Salary ranges to exclude any bonus or guaranteed overtime schemes:

Table 1 – Local Authority Salary Comparison Table (converted to hourly rates)

The salaries for City of Edinburgh Council, LA1, LA2, LA3, LA5, LA6 and LA9 all follow the Scottish Joint Council (SJC) spinal point pay scales.

LA4, LA7 and LA8 follow a different pay arrangement for their Craft groups. They have advised that these arrangements are currently being reviewed.

Trade Operative Role	City of Edinburgh Council Salary	LA1	LA2	LA3	LA5	LA6	LA9	LA4	LA7	LA8
Apprentice	£10.85 - £13.06 (Scottish Local Government Living Wage)	£9.33- £13.48 Min paid is £10.90	Apprentice - Plumber / Electrician - £7.39 - £12.56 (on completion of skills test) - £14.04 Apprentice - Joiner / Mason / Plasterer / Painter / Slater - £7.39 - £13.22	£8.66 - £10.31	£11.11 - £12.76	£6.31- £12.12	£11.55 - £11.96	£8.68 - £10.34	£6.48 - £18.26	£4.33 - £8.22
Bricklayer	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.36 - £16.24	n/a	£13.42- £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£14.96 - £16.24	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Electrician - Approved	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.36 - £16.24	£16.02	£14.40 – £17.44	£19.47 - £20.00	£16.24 - £17.64	£14.96 - £16.24	£21.60	£15.48 – £17.28	£9.70

Electrician	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£14.40 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£16.24 - £17.64	£14.96 - £16.24	£19.87	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.87
Floor Layer	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	£19.75	n/a	£8.81
Gas Engineer	£15.36 - £18.13	£16.91- £18.13	n/a	n/a	£19.47 - £20.00	n/a	n/a	£21.60	£15.48 – £17.28	£9.93 - £10.71
Glazier	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.36 - £16.24	n/a	£13.42 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	n/a	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Joiner	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£13.42 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 - £14.52	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Labourer	£11.81 - £13.25	£11.96 - £12.59	£12.88	£10.98 - £12.33	£11.11 - £12.76	£12.76 - £13.80	£12.11 – £12.59	£16.81	£10.92 - £13.37	£7.71
Painter & Decorator	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£13.42 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 - £14.52	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Plasterer	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£13.42 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 - £14.52	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Plumber – Advanced	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.36 - £16.24	£16.02	£14.40 – £17.44	£19.47- £20.00	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 - £14.52	£21.60	£15.48 – £15.71	£9.70
Plumber	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£14.40 – £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 - £14.52	£19.87	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.87
Slater	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.36 - £16.24	£14.78	£13.42 - £17.44	£14.15 - £17.88	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 – £14.52	£19.75	£13.71 – £14.46	£8.81
Tiler	£13.25 - £15.36	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	£14.33 - £15.36	£13.61 – £14.52	£19.75	£13.71 - £14.46	£8.81
Operative Line Manager	£18.13 - £21.44	£21.14 - £22.88	Craft Team Leader - £18.40 Chargehand Advanced / Approved Operative - £17.16 Chargehand Craft Operative - £15.80	n/a	£19.47 - £22.53 (‘chargehand’ or equivalent)	Craft Supervisor £18.93 - £20.57	£14.96 - £16.24	£21.15 – £23.14	Team Coordinator SJC T&C's - 18.40 – 20.26	n/a

Table 2 – Housing Association Comparison Table (converted to hourly rates)

HA2 has been removed from data set for salary comparisons as this organisations follows a different model (trade operatives privately outsourced rather than directly employed – not comparable).

Trade Operative Role	City of Edinburgh Council Salary	HA1	HA3	HA4
Apprentice	£10.85 - £13.06 (Scottish Local Government Living Wage)	£5.58 to £11.95 (Painter) £5.58 to £10.56 (Plumber) £5.58 to £11.13 (Joiner) £5.94 to £12.27 (Electrician)	Salaries are paid at rates per The Scottish Joint Industry Board	n/a
Bricklayer	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.52	n/a	£15.37
Electrician - Approved	£15.36 - £18.13	£17.69	£17.70 to £18.69	£19.99
Electrician	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.94	n/a	£19.99
Floor Layer	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Gas Engineer	£15.36 - £18.13	£17.19 (new qualified) £17.25 to £18.04	£17.70 to £18.69	£18.56
Glazier	£13.25 - £15.36	n/a	n/a	n/a

Joiner	£15.36 - £18.13	£15.91	£17.04 to £17.99	£16.57 (complementary/ multi skilled role)
Labourer	£11.81 - £13.25	£12.23 - £14.78 (Multi Skilled Operative)	£12.63 to £13.34	£12.67
Painter & Decorator	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.25	£17.04 to £17.99	£14.51
Plasterer	£13.25 - £15.36	£15.52	£17.04 to £17.99	£15.20 (Multi-Skilled Operative)
Plumber – Advanced	£15.36 - £18.13	n/a	£17.70 to £18.69	£16.57 (complementary/ multi skilled role)
Plumber	£15.36 - £18.13	£16.85	n/a	n/a
Slater	£13.25 - £15.36	n/a	n/a	£16.57 (complementary/ multi skilled role)
Tiler	£13.25 - £15.36	n/a	£17.04 to £17.99	n/a
Operative Line Manager	£18.13 - £21.44	£18.45 - £21.12 (Ops Supervisor Multi Trade) £19.39 - £21.38 (Ops Supervisor Electrical) £20.10 - £22.08 (Ops Supervisor Gas)	Trade Supervisor - £21.89 to £24.49 Assistant Trade Supervisor - £19.11 to £21.28	£20.50-£22.33

Appendix 3 – Recent Recruitment Outcomes – Trade Operatives

Recruitment is ongoing for various trades across the core repairs team and new dampness team. This is a continually evolving picture, with new vacancies continuing to arise as recruitment is underway. The table below presents a snapshot of recruitment outcomes for vacancies advertised between 23 May 2023 and 7 August 2023 as at 21 September 2023.

Recruitment outcomes have been mixed. Some posts are attracting reasonable levels of interest. For example, the recent round of recruitment for Gas Engineers attracted 15 applicants, 8 of whom were suitably qualified/ experienced to progress to interview stage and 3 were successfully appointed. Other recruitment has been less successful. For example, there were 6 applicants for the recently advertised Painter & Decorator post, 2 progressed to interview stage but neither turned up, resulting in a failed recruitment. Similarly, there were no applicants for the recently advertised Glazier posts.

Generally, there have been greater challenges in recruiting to the posts at Grade 5. However, there was a high level of interest in the Labourer posts at Grade 4, with 20 applications received.

Trade	Number of Applicants	Number of Appointments
Electrician	2	0
Electrician Approved	6	2 Successful candidates
Gas Engineer	15	3 Successful candidates
Glazier	0	0
Joiner	10	3 Successful candidates
Labourer	20	3 Successful candidates
Painter & Decorator	6	0
Plasterer	2	1 Successful candidate
Plumber	9	3 Successful candidates
Plumber Advanced	2	0
Slater	3	0