

Development Management Sub-Committee Report

Wednesday 8 November 2023

**Application for Planning Permission
31 Duddingston View, Edinburgh, EH15 3LZ**

Proposal: Erection of rear extension to dwelling house and installation of new mansard roof over entire extent of existing and extension footprint to create additional living accommodation on the upper floor.

**Item – Committee Decision
Application Number – 23/03375/FUL
Ward – B17 - Portobello/Craigmillar**

Reasons for Referral to Committee

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Refused** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposals do not raise any issues in respect of the global climate crisis and will not have an adverse impact on neighbouring amenity. However, the proposals are not subservient to the original dwellinghouse and are not of an acceptable scale, form, and design. The proposals would overwhelm the form of the original house and would introduce an incongruous roof design leading to an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding area. The proposals do not comply with the aims of the development plan and are contrary to NPF 4 policies 14 and 16g, LDP policy Des 12 and the Council's Non-Statutory Guidance for Householders.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The application site is a detached bungalow dwelling with a hipped roof, located on a corner plot situated on the southern side of Duddingston View. The surrounding area is entirely residential in nature and is predominantly characterised by bungalow dwellings of a similar design and form. Bingham Park is located directly to the south of the site.

Description of the Proposal

The application proposes a full width ground floor extension to the rear of the premises, and the formation of a new mansard roof at first floor level. The new roof would completely replace the existing roof and would extend out to cover the new ground floor extension. Two new dormer windows would be incorporated within the principal roof plane and one dormer within each of the respective gable roof planes. A Juliet balcony will be situated on the rear of the new roof, with a stainless-steel flue running up the eastern elevation.

Supporting Information

Supporting Statement

This is available to view on the Planning and Building Standards Online Service.

Relevant Site History

23/00222/FUL

31 Duddingston View

Edinburgh

EH15 3LZ

Erect a rear extension to dwellinghouse and install a new mansard roof over whole of existing and extension footprint to create additional living accommodation on upper floor.

Refused

1 May 2023

Other Relevant Site History

No relevant history.

Pre-Application process

There is no pre-application process history.

Consultation Engagement

No consultations undertaken.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: 3 August 2023

Date of Renotification of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Press Publication Date(s): Not Applicable

Site Notices Date(s): Not Applicable

Number of Contributors: 0

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

This report will consider the proposed development under Sections 24, 25 and 37 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act):

Having regard to the legal requirement of Section 24(3), in the event of any policy incompatibility between National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) & Edinburgh Local Development Plan 2016 (LDP) the newer policy shall prevail.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for approving them?

In the assessment of material considerations this report will consider:

- equalities and human rights.
- public representations; and
- any other identified material considerations.

Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

a) The proposals comply with the development plan.

National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) was adopted by the Scottish Ministers on 13 February 2023 and forms part of the Council's Development Plan. NPF4 policies supports the planning and delivery of Sustainable Places, Liveable Places and Productive Places and are the key policies against which proposals for development are assessed. Several policies in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) are superseded by equivalent and alternative policies within NPF4. The relevant policies to be considered are:

- NPF4 Policy 1
- NPF4 Policy 16g
- LDP Design policies Des 12

The non-statutory Guidance for Householders is a material consideration that is relevant when considering NPF4 policies 1 and 16g, and LDP policy Des 12.

Global climate and nature crisis

Policy 1 of NPF4 recognises the global climate and nature crises in all decisions to ensure it is a priority in all plans and decisions. It should be applied together with the other policies in NPF4. The proposed development does not conflict with the intended outcomes of NPF4 and on balance there is not considered to be any significant conflict with Policy 1 or the provisions of NPF4.

The proposals comply with NPF4 Policy 1.

Scale, form, design, and neighbourhood character

Policy Des 12 of the adopted Edinburgh Local Development Plan states that permission will be granted for alterations and extensions to existing buildings which in their design and form, choice of materials and positioning are compatible with the character of the existing building, and which will not be detrimental to neighbourhood amenity. In addition, the Council's Non-Statutory Guidance for Householders outlines that bungalow extensions should be designed in a way that retains the character of the original property and is subservient in appearance. The guidance further advises that any extension to an original bungalow should be in keeping with the roof design of the existing property and that the hipped roof character of the existing building should be respected.

The proposal would result in both a significant enlargement of the original dwelling and the construction of an entirely new roof, with a mansard roof replacing the existing original hipped roof. The proposal would significantly enlarge the floor area of the existing original dwelling, extending it from 134 square metres to 293 square metres. Combined with the significant change in the roof design, the proposal as a whole would overwhelm the original dwelling and significantly alter its original built form, scale, and appearance.

In contrast with the existing roof which has a pitch angle of 30 degrees, the new roof would have a much steeper pitch of 76 degrees on three sides, with the rear plane being a flat with a 90-degree pitch. The proposed changes to the roof represent a fundamental redesign which does not respect the existing hipped roof design, and which, combined with the enlargement of the dwelling, would result in the formation of a highly incongruous development which would have a significantly detrimental impact on the surrounding streetscape.

In addition to the above, the proposal would also result in the formation of two dormers on the principal roof plane. While dormer windows are situated on the principal roof planes of several properties within the streetscape, the established character of the area is for no more than one dormer on the principal roof plane. Therefore, the addition of two dormers would not be compatible with the wider neighbourhood and is only achievable through the fundamental change in the roof form to a mansard roof.

While there are limited examples of mansard style roofs within the wider Duddingston area, there is only one example of a bungalow located on Duddingston View itself where the original hipped roof has been replaced with a mansard roof. This is the premises at number 17 which is situated further to the east of the application site, and which was granted planning permission on appeal by the Local Review Body in 2011 for a new mansard roof (application reference 11/03219/FUL). Within the immediate streetscape of Duddingston View, the vast majority of dwellings retain their original hipped roofs, with any non-original interventions primarily limited to dormer windows which have not fundamentally changed the form of the roofs.

Having regards to the combined impact of the new roof profile and the enlarged footprint of the dwelling, the proposal is not acceptable in respect of its scale, form, design, and impact on neighbourhood character. The proposal does not comply with NPF 4 policies 14 and 16g, LDP Policy Des 12 or the Council's Non-Statutory Guidance for Householders.

Neighbouring Amenity

The position and orientation of the new roof may result in 10.8 square metres garden ground in the neighbouring property to the west being overshadowed to a potentially adverse degree. However, this premises has a total useable garden area of 246 square metres and as such the majority of the garden will not be affected by any additional adverse overshadowing.

The proposal complies with the 45-degree test in relation to the neighbouring premises to the west and will not result in an unreasonable loss of daylight to this premises.

The proposal will not have an adverse impact on the amenity of neighbouring residents.

Conclusion in relation to the Development Plan

The proposals have due regard to global climate and nature crisis and will not have an adverse impact on neighbouring amenity. However, the proposals are not acceptable in respect of scale, form, and design, and are not compatible with the existing building or neighbourhood character. Therefore, the proposals do not comply with the overall objectives of the Development Plan.

b) There are any other material considerations which must be addressed?

The following material planning considerations have been identified:

Emerging policy context

On 30 November 2022 the Planning Committee approved the Schedule 4 summaries and responses to Representations made, to be submitted with the Proposed City Plan 2030 and its supporting documents for Examination in terms of Section 19 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997. At this time little weight can be attached to it as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

A petition in support of the proposed development has been submitted containing a total of 42 signatures. The petition states that the signatories support the proposal and that it will be in keeping with the character and appearance of the surrounding area and this consideration is assessed in section a) of the report. While the volume of support which has been expressed in respect of the application is acknowledged, this does not outweigh the position of the planning authority that the proposals are not acceptable for the reasons stated in the report.

Conclusion in relation to identified material considerations.

The proposals do not raise any issues in relation to other material considerations identified.

Overall Conclusion

The proposals do not raise any issues in respect of the global climate crisis and will not have an adverse impact on neighbouring amenity. However, the proposals are not subservient to the original dwellinghouse and are not of an acceptable scale, form, and design. The proposals would overwhelm the form of the original house and would introduce an incongruous roof design leading to an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding area. The proposals do not comply with the aims of the development plan and are contrary to NPF 4 policies 14 and 16g, LDP policy Des 12 and the Council's Non-Statutory Guidance for Householders.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following.

Conditions

Reasons

Reason for Refusal: -

1. The proposals are contrary to policy 16 (g) (i) of National Planning Framework 4 as they would have a detrimental impact on the character of the home and the surrounding area in terms of size, physical impact, and design.
2. The proposals are contrary to NPF 4 Policy 14c as the works would be detrimental to the amenity of the surrounding area and inconsistent with the six qualities of successful places as the proposal does not reinforce the distinctive local architectural style, design, materials, and traditional sense of place achieved by the neighbourhood.
3. The proposals are contrary to policy Des 12 of the adopted Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) as in their design and form, choice of materials and positioning they are not compatible with the character of the existing building and will be detrimental to neighbourhood amenity and character.

4. The proposals are contrary to the Council's Non-Statutory Guidance for Householders as they are not compatible with the character of the existing building and will have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding neighbourhood.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 31 July 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01 - 06

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: James Allanson, Senior Planning Officer
E-mail: james.allanson@edinburgh.gov.uk

Summary of Consultation Responses

No consultations undertaken.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420