

Development Management Sub-Committee Report

Wednesday 13 March 2024

Application for Listed Building Consent

7 - 11 & 15 - 19 Hanover Street, 40 Rose Street, & 70 Princes Street, Edinburgh.

Proposal: Selective demolition and alterations to form hotel and ancillary uses with refurbished commercial units and associated works.

Item – Other Item at Committee

Application Number – 23/06565/LBC

Ward – B11 - City Centre

Reasons for Referral to Committee

The proposed works affect several listed buildings within the First New Town and include the demolition of a complete listed building and a significant part of another. Therefore, the application must be determined by the Development Management Sub Committee due to being of significant public interest.

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Granted** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposal is acceptable with regard to Section 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 in terms of preserving the special historic and architectural interest of the listed buildings and their settings. The character and appearance of the conservation area will be preserved and enhanced.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The application relates to a group of buildings of various age, scale, style, use and designation within the block between Princes Street, the east side of Hanover Street and Rose Street. These buildings are in active commercial uses (retail, restaurant and bookmakers) at ground floor and basement level, and the upper floors are vacant or used for retail storage. The site area is 1238 square metres.

The constituent buildings are as follows:

70-71 Princes Street (Block 5)

This four storeys and attic, Early North European Renaissance style building by Hippolyte J Blanc was constructed in 1886 as a café but has been in retail use for several years with shop storage on the upper levels. The building is category B listed (reference LB30146, listed on 12.12.1974) and comprises a sandstone structure with a red polished ashlar, narrow gabled frontage featuring a semi-elliptical central arched recess with canted windows from first to third level, six-over-one pattern, timber-framed sash and case windows, and a slated roof. The shopfront is modern with a white cladding surround.

7-11 Hanover Street (Block 3)

Category B listed under 3-9 Hanover St (reference LB43291, listed on 23.03.1996), this building is one of a former pair of two-storey and attic, classical style townhouses, dating from 1784-90 with subsequent alterations and additions, including modern shops built out at ground floor level. The building is occupied by a restaurant at ground and first floor level and a nightclub at basement level. The upper floors are used for storage and ancillary spaces for the restaurant. The paired buildings are constructed in droved cream sandstone, with timber-framed windows and slated roofs. Nos. 7-11 has undergone significant alterations, including the addition of a new shopfront and large bay window at first floor level in 1959-61. The remaining windows on the principal elevation are casement, whereas the windows in the adjoining building are sash and case.

15-19 Hanover Street (Block 4)

This category C listed, three storey and attic building comprising former tearooms, was designed by A K Robertson in 1923 for David Shiels Crawford (listed under 11-19 Hanover St, reference LB43292, listed on 28.03.1996). The basement, ground floor and mezzanine are in retail use and the upper floors are not being used in any capacity. The main construction material is polished cream sandstone, and the building has a modern projecting rendered shopfront at ground floor level, a balustraded parapet with three corniced dormers, and a slated mansard roof. The windows are six-over-six pattern, timber-framed sash and case.

The internal fabric has deteriorated since it was last in use, with signs of water ingress now apparent.

40 Rose St (Block 1)

This is a two-storey building in use as a bookmaker, on the corner of Rose Street and Rose Street South Lane, dating from the earlier 19th century, but with significant rebuilding including a modern interior. The building is category C listed (under 32 Rose St, (reference LB43336, listed on 28.03.1996) and constructed in painted sandstone, rendered at ground floor level, and droved at first floor level, with a gabled wallhead chimney stack, timber-framed two-over two pattern sash and case windows and a piended slate roof.

38a Rose Street (Block 2)

This earlier 19th-century, four-storey warehouse was built on the site of a late 18th-century mews building and is currently in use as storage. From the 1890s, the building formed a link between 70-71 Princes Street and 15-19 Hanover Street and was used as a kitchen, dairy and bakery for the tearooms and restaurants in the main buildings. The structure, which is included in the listing for 70-71 Princes Street (reference LB30146, listed on 12.12.1974), was altered significantly in the early and mid-20th century to the extent that not much original fabric survives.

The site is within the New Town Conservation Area and the Old and New Towns of Edinburgh World Heritage Site.

Description of the Proposal

The proposal is for demolitions, alterations and extensions associated with the conversion of the upper floors from retail storage to a 61-bedroom hotel, with associated guest amenities and ancillary areas. Commercial uses (retail and café/restaurant) will be retained at basement, ground and mezzanine floor level and a large tearoom for hotel guest/public use will be formed at first floor level within 7-11 and 15-19 Hanover Street.

The hotel accommodation will comprise a series of bedroom suites within the existing and proposed buildings and a first floor circulation link will provide access to the amenity areas, including the new tearoom in the adjoining Hanover Street buildings.

Proposed Demolitions and External Alterations

70-71 Princes Street (Block 5)

- remove the existing modern shopfront and install a new acid etched pre-cast concrete frontage with arched openings and dark-grey PPC aluminium window and door frames (entry point from Princes Street into the hotel);
- replace the existing timber-framed sash and case windows with double-glazed timber-framed sash and case windows to match the existing astragal pattern and
- remove existing historic and modern stairs and partitions and erect new partitions to form an entrance corridor for the hotel at ground floor level, a new stair and lift core (D) between all floors, and suites from first to third floor level.

38a Rose Street (Block 2)

- demolish the existing building, including the link structure to 70-71 Princes Street;
- erect a seven storey (including mezzanine), attic and basement building, externally clad in dark grey/brown brick, a bronze metal clad roof and PPC mid-grey aluminium window and door frames, with a central stair and lift core (B) and two roof terraces; and
- erect a new link structure connecting this building with 70-71 Princes Street, including a stair from mezzanine to first floor level.

7-11 Hanover Street (Block 3)

- replace the existing modern shopfront with a new acid etched pre-cast concrete frontage with arched openings and dark-grey PPC aluminium window and door frames (entry points from Hanover Street into the hotel and retail/cafe unit);
- remove the later bay window at first floor level and restore the frontage in buff sandstone on the original building line, including three six-over-one pattern, timber-framed sash and case windows;
- demolish the existing rendered rear extension and a section of the slated rear roof pitch, including the dormer;
- erect a new extension, one storey higher, externally clad in dark grey metal panels with PPC mid-grey aluminium window and door frames, a roof terrace and link corridor to 70-71 Princes Street at first floor level.
- remove existing modern stairs and partitions and erect new partitions to form suites at second and attic floor level, and ancillary accommodation;
- install a new lift core (C) and stairs between all floors; and
- replace the existing timber-framed casement windows with double-glazed timber-framed sash and case windows (six-over-one pattern).

15-19 Hanover Street (Block 4)

- replace the existing rendered brick rear extension with a new bronze metal clad and grey render structure, one storey higher;
- erect a new rooftop extension, externally clad in profiled bronze metal panels with a blue/green roof, PPC mid-grey aluminium window and door frames, and a glazed façade leading to an open terrace;
- remove the existing access gantry to the former dairy building at first floor level and erect a replacement bronze metal clad/glazed link to the new building at 40 Rose Street;
- replace the existing timber-framed sash and case windows in the Hanover Street elevation with double-glazed timber-framed sash and case windows to match the existing astragal pattern;
- remove existing modern stairs and partitions, retaining the original stair, and erect new partitions to form suites at second to fourth floor level with stair/lift access; and
- form an opening at first floor level between this building and 7-11 Hanover Street to form a linked tearoom.

40 Rose St (Block 1)

- demolish the existing building.

Scheme 1

The original scheme proposed:

- a higher, alternatively detailed roof and light-grey engineered stone elevations for the replacement structure at 38a Rose Street;
- a more advanced position and straight edge for the glazed façade of the rooftop addition to 15-19 Hanover Street;
- profiled bronze metal clad elevations for the new extension to 7-11 Hanover Street and a more substantial roof terrace/lift overrun structure;

- more contemporary style replacement shopfronts at 70-71 Princes Street and 7-11 Hanover Street; and
- eight-over-one pattern windows on the main elevation of 7-11 Hanover St with non-pedimented, shorter windows at first floor level.

Associated Application

An application for planning permission (reference 23/06554/FUL) has been submitted for external alterations (including partial demolition), extensions, and new development, to form a new 61-bedroom hotel (Class 7) with commercial uses (Class 1A and Class 3) at basement, ground and mezzanine floor level.

Supporting Information

- Heritage and Townscape Assessment;
- Heritage Impact Assessment;
- Planning Statement;
- Design and Access Statement;
- Design Statement Addendum and
- Window Survey.

Relevant Site History

No relevant site history.

Other Relevant Site History

No other relevant site history.

Pre-Application process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

Consultation Engagement

Archaeologist

Historic Environment Scotland

Refer to Appendix 1 for a summary of the consultation response.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Date of Renotification of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Press Publication Date(s): 1 December 2023

Site Notices Date(s): 28 November 2023

Number of Contributors: 1

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s) within a conservation area, this application for listed building consent requires to be assessed against Sections 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

- Having due regard to HES Policy and guidance, do the proposals:
 - a. harm a listed building or its setting? or
 - b. conflict with the objective of preserving or enhancing the character or
- If the proposals do comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for approving them?

Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

a) Compliance with Planning Legislation on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas

The following Historic Environment Scotland (HES) guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change: Use and Adaptation of Listed Buildings
- Managing Change: Demolition of Listed Buildings
- Managing Change: Setting
- Managing Change: Interiors

Character of Listed Buildings

Use and Adaptation/Demolition

The proposed development will result in the re-use of four listed buildings in sustainable, longer-term uses, with appropriate levels of adaptation and intervention. The overall strategy involves sensitive re-purposing of the under-used upper floors, the introduction of new build elements that respect and complement the individual listed buildings and surrounding historic environment, and the creation of roof terraces for hotel guests providing views across the city. The supporting information is detailed and informative in terms of understanding the history and significance of the constituent buildings on this site and assessing the proposed demolitions, alterations, and extensions.

This approach is in keeping with the key principle of use and adaptation which is to retain a listed building in a use that has the least possible effect on the elements that make the building special. Even extensive alterations to a building will be better than losing the building entirely. This proposal includes selective demolition of one entire listed building and another distinct structure which is part of a larger, more significant listed building, as part of a comprehensive development to form a fully accessible hotel that is linked through above ground floor level. The following information demonstrates why this level of demolition is acceptable.

Demolition of 40 Rose Street

In order to establish whether the proposed demolition of this building fulfils any of the above criteria, the proposal has been assessed against the four tests set out in the Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement (HESPS) as follows:

Historic Environment Scotland's Managing Change publication "Demolition of Listed Buildings" states that the loss of a listed building is likely to be acceptable if one of the following situations apply and this is clearly demonstrated and justified:

- the building is no longer of special interest;
- the building is incapable of meaningful repair;
- the demolition of the building is essential to delivering significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community;
- the repair and reuse of the building is not economically viable.

Is the building no longer of special interest?

The building is category C listed, dating from the earlier 19th or later 18th century, and is a possible remnant of the earlier phase of the First New Town. However, the structure has undergone significant rebuilding and numerous alterations which have left little original fabric and a disfigured profile to the building.

The construction at the rear of the building suggests that it was originally single storey with gable chimneys and (probably) no windows in the gable. Archive drawings for alterations in 1870 show that, by this time, the gables had been built up and windows had been added in the south elevation of the attic. The form of the roof is unclear, but it was probably still pitched with slates at the centre and flat at the edges with lead sheet covering (as per the details from Robert Kirkwood's 'Plan and elevation of the New Town of Edinburgh' of 1819 and Joseph Ebsworth's watercolour 'View west from the Scott Monument' of around 1845).

In 1933 the building was thoroughly remodelled in Art Deco style as the Black Cat Bar by MacLennan and Cunningham for the wine merchants, Fraser & Carmichael, as per the archive drawings of this date. The works included the removal of the slated pitched roof and installation of a flat asphalt roof. The gables were built up, the early window openings were either built up or expanded and there were significant internal alterations, involving the removal of almost all of the dividing walls.

Further minor alterations were carried out in 1969, when the building was converted to a licensed betting office for Ladbrokes, and more extensive alterations were carried out by Ladbrokes in 1976, including the building up of the ground floor windows on the east elevation and installation of a new shopfront tiled shopfront. A final remodelling was undertaken by Ladbrokes in 1989 (the building's current appearance with only minor changes since).

The building today is therefore no longer of special historic or architectural significance. Historic Environment Scotland considers that a case can be made for demolition on the grounds that the building no longer meets the rigorous criteria for listing, based on the information provided, and does not therefore object to the demolition. As regards the salvage of materials, the stonework has been painted over for years and is too poor a condition to re-use in the proposed new building or elsewhere in the development.

Is the building incapable of meaningful repair?

No detailed information has been provided on the condition of this building as the issue of repair has not been put forward as a justification for demolition, so this question is not relevant.

Is the demolition essential for significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community?

This scenario does not apply to the proposed demolition, as the overall scheme is not of such economic or public significance that its benefits would outweigh the strong presumption in favour of retaining a listed building.

Is the repair and reuse of the building economically viable?

The case for demolition is being made primarily on the basis that the existing building is no longer of special historic or architectural interest. However, the retention of this building would not allow the same volume of development as proposed and this would have repercussions for the viability of the whole scheme.

Demolition of 38a Rose Street (former dairy)

This building is part of the listing for 70-71 Princes Street. The proposed demolition of this structure is assessed against HES's Managing Change publication "Use and Adaptation of Listed Buildings" rather than "Demolition of Listed Buildings", as the principal part of the listed building will remain.

Section 4 on page 13 of the "Use and Adaptation" guidance concerns 'selective demolition' which is "*a different consideration from substantial demolition, which would involve the total or substantial loss of a listed building.*" 'Selective demolition' is described as involving "*the removal, or demolition, of parts of a listed building in order to enable the significant parts of a listed building to be retained.*"

The former dairy at 38a Rose Street is a secondary part of the main listing and has been altered significantly in the past, notably the reconstruction of the upper floors in rendered brick. The precise date of the building is unclear, but John Ainslie's 'Plan of Edinburgh and Leith' of 1804 depicts an L-plan mews structure in the location of 38a Rose Street.

This original building, depicted as single storey in Kirkwood's plan and elevation of the New Town of 1819, had become connected to the rear of 70-71 Princes Street by 1819, also as shown in Kirkwood's plan. This accords with the letting of the premises, i.e. 70-71 Princes Street and mews, around 1812 to a wholesale and retail tea and sugar merchant and likely extension of the original L-plan structure to form a back shop and warehouse.

For much of the mid and later 19th century, the shop was occupied by an ironmongery firm and whilst there is no known documentary evidence for reconstruction, it appears that the original mews building was removed and replaced with a four-storey structure as depicted in a detail from Joseph Ebsworth's watercolour, 'View west from the Scott Monument' of circa 1845. The current stonework in the pend is a random mixture of dressed and rubble sandstone, which suggests that the fabric of the original mews building was re-used in the new construction.

The next significant period in the development of 38a Rose Street was the acquisition of the main premises by the Edinburgh Café Company in 1885 for redevelopment, along with 15-19 Hanover Street. The scheme by Hippolyte Jean Blanc of 1886 included a new frontage to 70-71 Princes Street and the existing warehouse was kept with its lower storeys converted to a bakehouse and the second floor turned into a kitchen (as shown in archive drawings of the proposals). The Company also erected a small bridge structure from the warehouse into its premises at 15-19 Hanover Street. In 1928, the top (laundry) floor was reconstructed and heightened, and a further significant alternation was undertaken in 1953 when two additional storeys were added on the link structure between 70-71 Princes Street and 38a Rose Street. This extension was of cheap post-War construction comprising a steel framework, concrete floors, metal sheeting walls and glazing. Numerous further minor alterations have taken place in the late 20th and early 21st centuries, and the interior contains no significant architectural spaces or features.

The demolition of the former dairy structure is therefore justified, given that it is a secondary element of the principal listing of 70-71 Princes Street, and the fact that the level of alteration carried out from the mid-19th century is substantial to the extent that little remains of the original fabric. The only notable material remaining is the 19th century stonework on the front elevation (facing Rose Street), but this has been altered significantly with new openings and poor quality infills at ground floor level and repaired/patched areas throughout, also of poor quality. Whilst Historic Environment Scotland state a preference for the retention and reuse of the existing stone in the frontage of the replacement building, the poor condition of this fabric is acknowledged. In the revised scheme, a good percentage of the historic sandstone will be re-used in the construction of the ground floor facade facing the lane and on the pend at lower levels.

In summary, the demolition of the category C listed building at 40 Rose Street and former dairy at 38a Rose Street is justified in the circumstances described above and accords with Historic Environment Scotland's respective guidance on total and selective demolition. A condition has been applied to ensure that these structures are officially recorded prior to demolition.

External Alterations

The overall strategy is to retain, restore and enhance the three principal listed buildings on the site, including the replacement of ad hoc additions with more appropriate extensions, rationalisation of the existing jumble of plant and gangways connecting these buildings at the rear, and introduction of new features and services that will enhance the functionality and energy efficiency of the buildings. The special historic and architectural interest of each individual building has been evaluated and the revised proposal will re-purpose each building in a manner that is sensitive and complementary to the unique character of each, as demonstrated below.

70-71 Princes Street (Block 5)

This category B listed purpose-built tearoom for the Edinburgh Café Company, designed by Hippolyte Jean Blanc in 1886, is a distinct building within Princes Street due to its red Dumfriesshire sandstone construction, tall, narrow gable frontage, and unusual single, central recessed bay. The Edinburgh Café Company was established in 1880 specifically to promote the temperance movement in Edinburgh and opened a café at 88 Princes Street in that year, followed by the acquisition of 15-19 Hanover Street in 1895, then 70-71 Princes Street as a major expansion of their original Princes Street business.

The main past alteration to the building's façade is the removal of its original, elaborate shopfront, the date of which is unknown, but likely to be a 20th century alteration. The current shopfront is modern with a deep applied fascia and of no intrinsic value and has a negative impact on the building's architectural character as a result. The proposed replacement of this shopfront is acceptable in principle and the new shopfront is a modern interpretation of the original intricate design by Blanc (seen in an archive drawing from 1924). Whilst little remains of this historic shopfront, the surviving parapet is constructed in light buff stone, so the proposed tone for the new frontage is appropriate. As there is insufficient evidence to replicate the original design, the proposed contemporary version of Blanc's shopfront is acceptable and will reflect the general proportions of the arched openings which relate to the bays above. The use of a modern material is also fitting to mark the fact that the shopfront is new and will provide crisp detailing.

The demolition of the existing conglomeration of structures attached to the rear of the building (linking with the former dairy building at 38a Rose Street) will improve the appearance of the rear elevation, as these structures are poor quality and have been altered haphazardly over time. The proposed replacement link structure is low-lying and sensitively designed with glazed cupolas, so this will form a more elegant rear extension to the historic building.

Otherwise, the proposed external alterations to this building are relatively minor comprising replacement windows that form part of the associated application for listed building consent.

Internally, the ground and basement floors have been altered significantly due to years of retail use, including the insertion of a lift to first floor level. The removal of the existing modern stairs and partitions and erection of new partitions to form an entrance corridor for the hotel at ground floor level will have no adverse impact on the character of this listed building.

The existing historic stair from second to fourth floor level only survives in part. The stair is also in poor structural condition, including damaged treads, and would require significant alteration/upgrading for access and fire purposes to the extent that nothing much of the existing fabric would remain. Instead, the focus has been put on keeping and upgrading the historic stair in 15-19 Hanover Street which is intact and of superior quality.

On the upper floors, the rooms are mainly vacant spaces with little decorative detail. The proposed partitions to form a new lift core and hotel suites will retain appropriately large rooms at the front of the building with no impact on its external appearance.

The replacement of the existing timber-framed sash and case windows is acceptable in principle, as the window survey submitted concludes that these windows are in generally poor condition. The proposed double-glazed timber-framed sash and case windows will match the existing proportions and astragal pattern whilst incorporating important heat insulation and sound-proofing measures. A condition has been applied to ensure that the finer details of the proposed windows are appropriate.

7-11 Hanover Street (Block 3)

This category B listed building was built in the late 1780s as the northern half of a pair of three storey tenements, with 3-5 Hanover Street adjoining to the south (outside the application site). Significant alterations have been made to the building (and its pair) over time, including additions to the front and rear. Kirkwood's 1819 'Plan and elevation of the New Town of Edinburgh' shows that, by this time, the outer bays of the double tenement had been converted to shops with arcaded shopfronts, and a two-storey warehouse had been constructed to the rear of both townhouses. The most significant changes were made in 1958-61, when the shopfront and interior were remodelled by Robert Hurd for the Three Tuns bar and restaurant, including the removal of the early 19th-century arcaded shopfront, and building over the basement area to accommodate a new projecting shopfront. A large bay window was added at first floor level soon afterwards, replacing the original three sash and case windows.

The proposed external alterations include a significant element of conservation gain through the reinstatement of the building's essential 18th century character, even if some of the detailing is a contemporary version of the original. The new shopfront will reflect the three bays of the façade above and is an appropriate design based on an historic photograph from 1880. As at 70-71 Princes Street, the use of a modern material is acceptable, and the proposed tone will restore visual homogeneity to the building's façade.

The removal of the 1960's timber bay window and reinstatement of the 18th century building line and individual six-over-six sash and case windows at first floor level of 7-11 Hanover Street will return the building to its basic original appearance. An objection has been raised to the proportions and detailing of the proposed windows, but these windows cannot be as large as those on the adjoining former townhouse at nos. 3-9 due to the level changes internally and this deviation is acceptable in these circumstances. Also, the windows have been elongated slightly in the revised scheme with added pediments to ensure that they are longer than those at second floor level to reflect the original hierarchy of windows.

Whilst architraves were added to both townhouses forming the pair sometime in the 19th century (as seen in a photograph by George Washington Wilson of circa 1885), it would not be appropriate to include these on the new windows at nos. 7-11 as these are later features and the frontages would still not match.

To the rear, the existing rendered extension is a modern addition of no intrinsic architectural merit, so its replacement with a new extension is acceptable in principle. Whilst the proposed structure will be one storey higher than the existing extension, it is proportionate and subservient to the original building and finished in a contrasting material to distinguish the old from the new. Physical evidence shows that the rear roof pitch has been reconstructed, so the loss of the lower section of the pitch and existing dormer is acceptable to accommodate the required number of hotel suites and accessibility throughout this building and its neighbour at nos. 15-19. In the revised scheme, the rooftop terrace/lift overrun structure on the new extension has been reduced in height and detailed in an alternative way to ensure that it is discreet in any street or elevated views. This addresses HES's concerns regarding the visibility of this feature.

Internally, the original floor plan and detailing has been altered to the extent that virtually nothing survives of the 18th century interior. Another significant remodelling of the interior, in addition to the 1960's alterations detailed above, was carried out in 1986-87 when the original first floor structure was removed and a mezzanine level was introduced.

The proposed works to form retail/restaurant use at ground and basement levels, an open-plan tearoom at first floor level, hotel suites at second and attic floor level, and lift access throughout will therefore have no adverse impact on historic or architectural character.

The existing windows at second floor and dormer level are later casement windows, so the replacement of these with six-over-one pattern, double-glazed timber-framed sash and case windows will restore the original consistency to the fenestration pattern. A condition has been applied to ensure that the finer details of the new windows are appropriate.

15-19 Hanover Street (Block 4)

The current 1920's building at 15-19 Hanover Street replaced the southern half of an 18th century symmetrical double tenement (part of the original First New Town). The northern half of this tenement survives in an altered form. In the early 19th century, the southern half of the former tenement was occupied by a carpet warehouse as well as a bookseller and auctioneer, Charles B Tait, who advertised auctions from his "Great Room", thought to be within the large structure to the rear of the current building at nos. 15-19 Hanover Street (shown on the Ordnance Survey Town Plan of 1853.)

The auction business closed in 1895, when the whole premises were purchased by the Edinburgh Café Company for expansion of their business at 88 Princes Street, before the acquisition of 70-71 Princes Street. In the same year, the Company created a small bridge from the warehouse at 38a Rose Street into the buildings at 15-19 Hanover Street, providing access to the auctioneers' Great Room (renamed the Oak Room) and to the tenement on Hanover Street.

In 1898 the company commissioned Hippolyte Blanc to extend the existing Oak Room northwards into a space that had been occupied by an art gallery behind 21-27 Hanover Street and Blanc created an elaborate wood-panelled dining room within this extension.

Due to the decline of the temperance movement, the Edinburgh Café Company sold their premises at 70 Princes Street and 15-19 Hanover Street in 1922 to the caterer David Shiels Crawford who planned to open a series of tearooms. Crawford's vision was for the tearooms to be an "oasis of calm on bustling Princes Street" and to rival the elaborate tearooms in Glasgow. Crawford commissioned the architect A K Robertson to remodel the tenement facing Hanover Street and the building was reconstructed on an advanced building line around 1925 with reinforced concrete floors throughout. At the same time, a corrugated metal corridor was constructed over the Oak Room to connect to the kitchen in 38a Rose Street.

The interior decoration and furnishing of Crawford's Hanover Street and Princes Street premises were by the artist Robert Burns, an early exponent of the Art Nouveau style in Scotland. This project was his most famous and complete interior designs and featured painted panels for the tearooms/dining rooms at first and second floor level, which had panelled walls and decorative plasterwork ceilings.

In 1925, the back of the building was extended and rebuilt in rendered brick for additional service accommodation and a tunnel was created to link the basements of 38a Rose Street and 15-19 Hanover Street, including the Oak Room. Further alterations have been made to the building since, the most significant of these being the replacement of the original shopfront in the 1960s, formation of an internal electricity substation in 2017, and further remodelling of the shopfront in 2018.

The proposed external alterations are to create a sufficient level of hotel accommodation, facilities and services within this part of the development. A significant feature of the internal scheme is the creation of a new tearoom within the former tearoom at first floor level which will link through to a new tearoom space on the first floor of 7-11 Hanover Street. Another issue is limited street-level access due to the existing ground floor retail unit, which necessitates an alternative access to the upper levels. Also, the existing underground link from the basement of the retail unit to Rose Street Lane is an essential means of escape, so this needs to be maintained. The proposed rooftop extension and expansion of the existing rear extension will provide the required level of accommodation, ancillary spaces and accessibility, including to the new tearoom, and the scale and design of these extensions are appropriate in terms of preserving the character of the historic architecture.

The proposed rooftop extension will sit discreetly between the existing, prominent chimney stacks and has a flat roof in keeping with the existing flat roof behind the slated mansard. In the revised scheme, the glazed frontage is set back further from the mansard eaves level and stepped to minimise visibility from public viewpoints. The external roof terrace will be enclosed by a simple metal railing with vertical balusters which will not be noticeable from street level or reflective from higher viewpoints. The sides of the proposed structure are finished in bronze coloured metal cladding to appear muted behind the sandstone chimney stacks and to ensure that the stacks remain visually prominent, with clearly legible silhouettes. The blue/green roof, although not a traditional roof finish for a building of this era, will not be perceptible in street or elevated views.

The existing rendered brick extension is not of intrinsic architectural merit with an irregular fenestration pattern and functional finish. The reconstruction of this element is acceptable in principle and the proposed blend and location of the external materials will add visual interest to the rear elevation, as well as minimising conspicuousness from elevated viewpoints due to the use of a predominantly darker finish on the upper levels. This will ensure that the modest addition to the existing envelope will have no adverse effect on the character of the listed building.

A further improvement will be the replacement of the existing utilitarian corrugated metal access gantry to the former dairy building at first floor level with a bronze metal clad/glazed link to the new building at 40 Rose Street.

The internal fabric has deteriorated since it was last in use, with signs of water ingress, likely due to the upper floors not being used in any capacity for several years. The aim of the proposed internal works is to incorporate the historic use of the current building (tearooms) as a key part of the proposed hotel use, and a conservation approach has been taken in the retention and restoration of the surviving wall panelling and ceiling plasterwork within the first and second floor dining rooms, and the associated panelled staircase. Unfortunately, Robert Burns' original artwork was removed in the past.

The new tearoom at first floor level will extend into the first floor of 7-11 Hanover Street through a modest scale opening in an appropriate location in the party wall. A modern box structure within the rear of the main tearoom space will be removed, so the original proportions of the original first floor tearoom at 15-19 Hanover Street will be restored. The proposed interior design and fixtures and fittings of the new tearoom will respect and complement the retained and restored historic architectural detailing. This includes the re-purposing of windows with geometric leadwork in the existing rear extension as decorative glazed screens for the tearoom, which will further preserve the original internal character.

Whilst the former dining room at second floor level will be subdivided into two suites, the main partition will run along existing down stands to minimise any disruption to the historic plasterwork ceiling, and bathrooms and kitchen areas will be set within pods to retain legibility of the original room proportions.

The existing panelled stair will be retained and restored, incorporating specialist fire treatment, and the extension of the stair (with central lift) upwards to access the upper floors, including the new rooftop extension, is a logical and non-damaging intervention.

Elsewhere, the interior is plainly detailed without any significant spaces, so the proposed alterations to form hotel accommodation and associated facilities will have no detrimental impact on historic or architectural character.

The existing sash and case windows in the Hanover Street elevation are unrefined modern replacements with block profiles, so the replacement of these is acceptable in principle. The proposed replacement windows will match the original pattern and a condition has been applied to ensure that the finer details of these windows are appropriate.

Setting

The setting of these listed buildings is defined by the surrounding buildings of the First New Town with Princes Street Gardens opposite and the Old Town and Edinburgh Castle on elevated ground across the Waverley Valley. This section assesses the impact of the proposed works on the more immediate setting. The impact of these works on the wider setting is explored in detail in the section regarding the impact on the character and appearance of the New Town Conservation Area.

Demolition of 40 Rose Street

The existing building is no longer of special interest and is not an important element within the site, so the demolition of this structure will have no adverse impact on the setting of the listed buildings. The impact of the proposed new building in this location is assessed in the associated application for planning permission.

38a Rose Street (Block 2)

The current building is part of the listing of 70-71 Princes Street, although due to its substantially altered state, the structure is not an intrinsically significant part of the principal building's setting. The demolition of the existing structure will therefore have no detrimental impact.

The proposed replacement structure will affect the setting of the principal building due to its larger scale. However, the replacement building will not be visible behind 70-71 Princes Street from street level or visually intrusive in elevated views of the principal building. This is due to its sensitive design, which echoes the tall, gabled form of the existing structure and the choice of appropriate materials and careful positioning, refined in the revised scheme to minimise the building's visibility in the immediate and wider historic environment. The façade facing Rose Street South Lane includes contemporary versions of the existing stone-built façade and rhythm of openings at ground floor level, using sandstone salvaged from the historic structure, and has a clear vertical emphasis. These elements evoke the former dairy which was a significant element of the rear setting of 70-71 Princes Street. A condition has been applied to ensure that the stonework detailing reflects that of the existing ground floor facade.

Extensions to Existing Buildings

The proposed extensions are moderate in scale compared to the existing structures attached to the listed buildings and will rationalise the existing mix of ad hoc extensions of varying architectural quality. Only minor changes will occur in terms of the existing level of visibility of the rear elevations of the original buildings and the range of materials to be used in the new extensions is appropriately high quality and complementary to the historic construction materials. The overall immediate rear setting of the listed buildings within this block will be preserved and enhanced as a result.

Conclusion in relation to the listed buildings

The proposed works will respect and reinvigorate these listed buildings through sensitive adaptation in an appropriate range of uses. The re-purposing of the currently under-used spaces above ground floor level will contribute positively to the upkeep of these areas which have deteriorated in condition. The scheme will also reintroduce a modern version of the historical link between 70-71 Princes Street and its former annex building to the rear, acknowledging an important element of the site's past development.

Due to the restrained scale, appropriate massing and careful detailing of the proposed alterations and extensions (including the new structure at 38a Rose Street), the proposed works will have no detrimental impact on the character of the listed buildings or their settings. The level of associated demolition proposed is acceptable and confined to the minimum necessary to achieve the key aim of preserving the principal listed buildings on this site.

Conditions have been applied to ensure that the specifications for all the proposed external materials are appropriate.

The proposals are acceptable in terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and relevant HES guidance.

Character and appearance of conservation area

Section 64(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states:

"In exercise, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, of any powers under any of the provisions in subsection (2), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area."

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal identifies the key characteristics of the First New Town as:

- *"Georgian and early Victorian rectilinear development of grand formal streets lined by fine terraced building expressing neo-classical order, regularity, symmetry, rigid geometry, and a hierarchical arrangement of buildings and spaces with controlled vistas and planned views; and*
- *the important feature of terminated vistas within the grid layouts and the long-distance views across and out of the conservation area."*

The key aim of the proposed works is to focus on the preservation and enhancement of the principal listed buildings facing Princes Street and Hanover Street, given that previous alterations have diminished their historic and architectural integrity to some extent. The rear of the buildings, including later additions, are of significantly less architectural quality than the facades and are not in keeping with the original street hierarchy of the First New Town. The various extensions have evolved in a haphazard manner to service the commercial uses of the buildings on the primary streets and these structures are utilitarian and low in architectural quality.

Demolitions

As detailed in section a) the two structures to be demolished at 40 Rose Street and 38a Rose Street have been altered to a significant degree and in an unsympathetic manner to the extent that their demolition is justified. These buildings do not contribute positively to the character or appearance of the conservation area, so their removal is acceptable in principle.

Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings

The new structure at 38a Rose Street (Block 2) will respect the essential characteristics of the former dairy building in terms of its tall, gabled form and clear vertical emphasis. The proposed grey/brown brick for the elevations will evoke the warehouse character of the existing structure and bronze metal cladding is an appropriate contemporary material within the mixed palette of the First New Town in its evolved form.

The other proposed works will have no impact on the historic plan form of this block. The proposed rooftop addition to 15-19 Hanover Street and redeveloped rear extensions to this building and its neighbour at 7-11 Hanover Street will be inconspicuous in terms of the character or appearance of the First New Town as it is defined today. This is due to modesty in scale and sensitive design using appropriate materials.

The proposed alterations to the facades of the listed buildings comprise the replacement of functional modern shopfronts with contemporary interpretations of the historic versions, and the removal of the later projecting bay window at 7-11 Hanover Street and restoration of the first floor frontage to as close to the original pattern as possible. These alterations will enhance the appearance of the individual buildings as well as the street frontages of the block.

Views

To demonstrate the impacts of the proposed works on the character and appearance of the New Town Conservation Area, verified views of the constructed scheme have been produced from a series of key vantage points. The Edinburgh Design Guidance and supplementary view study set out key views. In this case, the relatively enclosed nature of the site along with the restrained height and appropriate detailing of the new build elements and extensions to the retained buildings will result in minor changes only to the townscape in Views C01b: Castle Lower Ramparts, C02c: Ramsay Lane and Castlehill and C03b: Milne's Close. Also, as the site is largely screened from the surrounding streets by existing buildings and the new structures will not be significantly taller than the neighbouring buildings, the impacts on the long and panoramic view cones will be negligible.

Viewpoint 1: from the junction of Hanover Street and Princes Street looking north-east towards the site

The proposed roofscape will preserve the predominantly horizontal, stepped nature of the existing roofscape and only a limited area of the new rooftop extension to 15-19 Hanover Street will be visible between the large chimney stacks. The darker tones of side elevations of this extension will ensure that the chimney stacks will continue to form bold punctuations in the roofscape.

Any minor impact will be balanced out by the removal of the existing projecting timber bay window at first floor level at 7-11 Hanover Street and reinstatement of single windows to the original opening pattern, along with the installation of a more appropriate shopfront.

Viewpoint 2: from the junction of Rose Street North Lane and Rose Street looking south-west towards the site.

Whilst the level of change is significant from this location, the proposed new building at 38a Rose Street will not have a negative impact on the character or appearance of these secondary streets of the First New Town.

Rose Street's lanes are backland in character, where the design and materials of the constituent buildings have traditionally been of lower quality than those of Rose Street. Within Rose Street itself, a street of lower standing within the architectural hierarchy of the First New Town, significant developments have occurred over the years, including the introduction of buildings of substantially larger scale than the historic buildings. The proposed new structure at 38a Rose Street is not, therefore, out of keeping with its immediate surroundings and its form, design and materials will preserve and even enhance the existing streetscene.

Viewpoint 3: from the north-west corner of the junction of Hanover Street and Rose Street looking south-east towards the site.

Only the east flank of the new rooftop extension to 15-19 Hanover Street is conspicuous in this view and any minor impact will be balanced out by the positive alterations to the façade of 7-11 Hanover Street.

Viewpoint 4: from the west side of Hanover Street looking directly east towards the site.

The glazed façade of the proposed rooftop extension at 15-19 Hanover Street will be unnoticeable behind the existing three dormers, so the visual impact of the development from Viewpoint 4 will be minimal and will include the positive impacts of the façade improvements to 7-11 Hanover Street.

Viewpoint 5: from the Castle Ramparts looking north-east across West Princes Street Gardens towards the site.

In this distant, elevated view of the site, only landmark historic buildings, large-scale modern structures, and church spires really stand out, such as the Royal Scottish Academy in Princes Street Gardens, the former British Homes Stores/Premier Inn development, and the spire on St Andrew's and St George's Church in George Street. Whilst the upper storeys of the proposed new-build elements will be visible from Viewpoint 6, the overall heights, architectural forms and materials palettes have been refined to ensure that these structures not be prominent within the immediate or broader cityscape. The new building in place of the former dairy will rise slightly above the surrounding buildings, but its rear location, pitched roof and dark palette on the top storey will integrate the building into the broader context in an unobtrusive way. Also, the added height in this location will conceal the featureless gable of the former BHS building, thereby improving the appearance of the overall streetscape. Whilst the former department store is a category B listed building, its west gable is utilitarian in form and not complementary to the historic townscape from this viewpoint.

Viewpoint 6: from the corner of Ramsay Lane and Mound Place looking north towards the site.

This is a channelled view through buildings on either side of the street with particular buildings standing out, notably the National Gallery and Royal Scottish Academy, and the spire of St Andrew's and St George's Church in George Street. 70-71 Princes Street is also prominent in this view due to its front-on red sandstone façade, whereas the buildings at 7-11 and 15-19 Hanover Street are visible at a very oblique angle. From Viewpoint 6, The rooftop extension at 15-19 Hanover Street is largely obscured by the existing broad chimney stack and neither the proposed rear extensions, nor the new build structure at 38a Rose Street obscure any key elements of this view.

Viewpoint 7: from New College Steps at Milne's Court looking north towards the site.

This view is a version of Viewpoint 6, but from further east, and the visual impacts of the new structure at 38a Rose Street are similar.

Viewpoint 8: from West Princes Street Gardens, at the junction of the Mound and Princes Street, looking north-east towards the site.

This view is similar to Viewpoint 1, but from further away taking in the corner of the Royal Scottish Academy building, the significantly altered former townhouses at the corners of Princes Street and Hanover Street, and the top of the spire of St Andrew's and St George's Church in George Street. As in Viewpoint 1, the proposed changes will only have a minor impact on the townscape from this location. The broad mutual chimney that punctuates the roofscape between 7-11 and 15-19 will remain a prominent visual feature of the street.

Viewpoint 9: from Mound Place looking north across the National Gallery of Scotland and the Royal Scottish Academy towards the site.

This viewpoint is similar to Viewpoint 6, but from lower down the Mound where the view opens up more widely and the proposed extensions and new buildings are less visible over the existing street-facing buildings. The bronze toned roof of the replacement building at 38a Rose Street will be seen above the slate roof of 70-71 Princes Street from Viewpoint 9 but will be inconspicuous in its dark tone and pitched form against the existing urban backdrop, and will not block any significant features of the building behind on George Street.

Materials

The proposed mixed materials palette is appropriate within the First New Town's diverse palette of external facades and will complement the historic fabric whilst maintaining a clear but subtle visual separation between the historic and new fabric. Special care has been paid to the choice, tone and placement of materials at the upper levels to ensure that these most visible sections blend successfully into the general roofscape. The blue/green roof of the new rooftop extension to 15-19 Hanover Street will not be visible from any key viewpoints.

Conclusion in relation to the conservation area

The proposed external alterations, extensions, including the new structure at 38a Rose Street, as refined in the amended scheme will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the New Town Conservation Area through sensitive, high-quality design and appropriate scale and detailing. At the same time, the diverse range of materials and finishes of each new build element will retain architectural distinctiveness and individuality, which is a strong characteristic of the current site. As a result, the existing views of the site from key street and elevated locations will not change to any extent that would affect the essential appearance of this block and the surrounding area.

The proposals are acceptable in terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

b) Other matters to consider

The following matters have been identified for consideration:

Archaeological Remains

The site lies within an area of archaeological significance in terms of location within the historic New Town and the proposals affect individual listed buildings, including the complete demolition of 40 Rose Street and removal of a significant part of 70-71 Princes Street (under 38a Rose Street).

On this basis, a programme of historic building recording is required to be undertaken prior to demolition/alterations and other development works to provide a detailed record of these buildings and to protect and conserve important historic fabric. In addition, a provision for public/community engagement during this programme of archaeological works should be put in place.

A condition has been applied to ensure that a comprehensive programme of archaeological work is undertaken, incorporating the above requirements.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

A summary of the representations is provided below.

material objections

- the demolition of 40 Rose Street erodes the original hierarchy of buildings and further depletes the dwindling survivals of this era;
- the addition of a floor to the top of 15-19 Hanover Street, set back behind

- railings is not appropriate and will change the scale, massing and appearance of the building and the street;
- the architecture for the central core is too tall, too 'blocky' and heavily massed, and the streetscape when viewed from the Old Town will lose the multiple layering of built heritage;
- the proposed building at 38a Rose Street will be conspicuous behind the facade of 70-71 Princes Street and will block a glimpse of the slated roofs of Queen Street behind, and engineered stone elevations are not appropriate; and
- there is no condition report or photos to justify the removal of the existing windows on all properties in Hanover Street and Princes Street or drawings of the proposed replacement windows.

The impacts of the proposed demolitions, alterations and new buildings on the historic environment are assessed in section a). These are in accordance with the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

general comments

- the reinstatement of the original windows to the first floor of 7-11 Hanover Street is supported, but the windows may have been longer and had pediments at this time;
- has the applicant made a case for the removal of all staircases but one from the listed buildings? and
- the stone cladding at 7-11 Hanover Street should be chosen to match the surviving stone of 7-11 Hanover Street and should be done in consultation with British Geological Survey or an organisation with similar expertise.

These issues are addressed in section a) of the assessment. A condition has been added to ensure that all external construction materials are appropriately specified and detailed.

non-material comments

The comments regarding the proposed new building at 40 Rose Street are addressed in the associated application for planning permission.

Conclusion in relation to other matters considered.

The proposals do not raise any issues in relation to other material considerations identified.

Overall conclusion

The proposal is acceptable with regard to Section 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 in terms of preserving the special historic and architectural interest of the listed buildings and their settings. The character and appearance of the conservation area will be preserved and enhanced.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following.

Conditions

1. No demolition of any listed structures on the site shall commence until the applicant has confirmed in writing the start date for the new development by the submission of a Notice of Initiation for the associated planning application reference 23/06554/FUL.
2. No demolition or works shall take place on the site until the applicant has submitted a proposed programme of archaeological work (historic building recording, public engagement, interpretation analysis and reporting, publication) which has been approved in writing by the Planning Authority, having first been agreed by the City Archaeologist. The applicant shall implement the approved programme of archaeological work, before and during construction works. The report of the findings/recordings shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority, having first been approved by the City Archaeologist.
3. A detailed specification, including trade names where appropriate, and sources of all the proposed external materials shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any of these materials are used on site. Note: samples of the materials may be required.
4. Details of the salvaged stonework construction for the ground floor elevation of the new building at 38a Rose Street shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on this element of the frontage.
5. Details of the proposed replacement windows in all listed building on the site and the new windows at first floor level of 7-11 Hanover Street shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any of these windows are installed.
6. Details of the proposed external lighting strategy, including the proposed fittings and locations, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any external light fittings are installed.

Reasons

1. In order to retain and/or protect important elements of the existing character of the site.
2. In order to safeguard the interests of archaeological heritage.
3. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed buildings and preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area.
4. In order to retain and/or protect important elements of the existing character of the site.

5. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
6. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed buildings and preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 31 October 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01,02,03A,04A,05,06A,07A,08,09A,10A,11,12A,13A,14,15A-18A,19,20A-29A,30-38,39A-51A,52,53A-55A+56-67

Scheme 2

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Clare Macdonald, Senior Planning Officer
E-mail: clare.macdonald@edinburgh.gov.uk

Summary of Consultation Responses

NAME: Archaeologist

COMMENT: The proposed development has archaeological impacts due to the demolition of a C listed building (40 Rose Street) and part of a category B listed building (38a Rose Street under 70-71 Princes Street). Accordingly, a condition should be applied to ensure that a programme of archaeological work, including provision for public/community engagement, is undertaken prior to and during development.

DATE: 11 January 2024

NAME: Historic Environment Scotland

COMMENT: Historic Environment Scotland thinks that this comprehensive development would not result in significant negative impacts on the historic environment. The reuse of long vacant (or underused) upper floors along Princes Street and Hanover Street is welcomed. This includes the reuse of the two highly significant former dining rooms within Crawford's 1920s purpose-built tea rooms. The total demolition of 40 Rose Street would result in the loss of a listed building, which HES would normally resist. The information submitted, outlining the known history of the building, shows it has been much altered since the late eighteenth century, and it is for these reasons that HES has not objected to its loss. However, care should be taken with the design and individuality of its replacement.

For the remaining retained listed buildings, HES is content that the development proposals have been planned with an understanding of their historic and architectural importance. A large and comprehensive scheme will always likely have some adverse impacts. In this response, HES has highlighted the more prominent impacts, specifically on staircases, extensions, and shopfronts.

HES welcomes the commitment given by the applicant and agents to amend the proposals and reduce impacts on the listed buildings.

DATE: 21 December 2023

The full consultation response can be viewed on the [Planning & Building Standards Portal](#).

