

John Tod Associates.
59 Edinburgh Road
Musselburgh
EH21 6EE

The Owners Group.
59 Edinburgh Road
Musselburgh
EH21 6EE

Decision date: 5 February 2024

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACTS
DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2013

Convert garage into dwelling.
At Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Application No: 23/06323/FUL

DECISION NOTICE

With reference to your application for Planning Permission registered on 17 October 2023, this has been decided by **Local Delegated Decision**. The Council in exercise of its powers under the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts and regulations, now determines the application as **Refused** in accordance with the particulars given in the application.

Any condition(s) attached to this consent, with reasons for imposing them, or reasons for refusal, are shown below;

Reasons:-

1. The proposal is contrary to NPF 4 Policy 8 (Green belts) as it does not meet the relevant criteria for residential development in this green belt location and will be harmful to its landscape quality and rural character.
2. The proposal is contrary to LDP Policy Env 10 of the adopted Local Development Plan (LDP) and the Council's Guidance for Development in the Countryside and Green Belt as it would involve the development of a new build dwellinghouse in a green belt location with no exceptional planning reason to justify its construction.

Please see the guidance notes on our [decision page](#) for further information, including how to appeal or review your decision.

Drawings 01-04, represent the determined scheme. Full details of the application can be found on the [Planning and Building Standards Online Services](#)

The reason why the Council made this decision is as follows:

The proposals do not comply with the National Planning Framework 4 and Edinburgh Local Development Plan.

The proposal does not comply with LDP Policy Env 10, as it fails to satisfy any of the prescribed criteria that would potentially justify development in a Green Belt location and would be an intrusion into the landscape quality and rural character of the area.

This determination does not carry with it any necessary consent or approval for the proposed development under other statutory enactments.

Should you have a specific enquiry regarding this decision please contact Weronika Myslowiecka directly at weronika.myslowiecka@edinburgh.gov.uk.



Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

NOTES

1. If the applicant is aggrieved by the decision to refuse permission for or approval required by a condition in respect of the proposed development, or to grant permission or approval subject to conditions, the applicant may require the planning authority to review the case under section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 within three months beginning with the date of this notice. The Notice of Review can be made online at www.eplanning.scot or forms can be downloaded from that website. Paper forms should be addressed to the City of Edinburgh Planning Local Review Body, G.2, Waverley Court, 4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG. For enquiries about the Local Review Body, please email localreviewbody@edinburgh.gov.uk.

2. If permission to develop land is refused or granted subject to conditions and the owner of the land claims that the land has become incapable of reasonably beneficial use in its existing state and cannot be rendered capable of reasonably beneficial use by carrying out of any development which has been or would be permitted, the owner of the land may serve on the planning authority a purchase notice requiring the purchase of the owner of the land's interest in the land accordance with Part 5 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

Report of Handling

**Application for Planning Permission
Kellerstain Stables, Gogar Station Road, Gogar**

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

**Item – Local Delegated Decision
Application Number – 23/06323/FUL
Ward – B01 - Almond**

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Refused** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposals do not comply with the National Planning Framework 4 and Edinburgh Local Development Plan.

The proposal does not comply with LDP Policy Env 10, as it fails to satisfy any of the prescribed criteria that would potentially justify development in a Green Belt location and would be an intrusion into the landscape quality and rural character of the area.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The site consists of an area of land covering 0.13 hectares situated on the southern side of a single lane access road leading from Gogar Station Road to Kellerstain House. Kellerstain House itself is located 200 metres to the south west of the junction between the access lane and Gogar Station Road.

The site is designated as Green Belt in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan and is also within a Special Landscape Area.

Description Of The Proposal

The application proposes to convert the garage into a dwellinghouse.

Relevant Site History

22/03257/FUL

Kellerstane Stables
Gogar Station Road
Gogar
Edinburgh
EH12 9BS

Demolition of exiting conservatory. Erect sun room extension to rear of dwelling and attic conversion to form bedrooms.

Granted

3 August 2022

18/07199/PPP

Kellerstain Stables
Gogar Station Road
Edinburgh
EH12 9BS

Erection of new one-and-a-half storey dwelling house on Land to the North East of Kellerstain Estate on Land 40 Metres South Of Kellerstain Lodge, Gogar Station Road, Edinburgh.

Refused

17 January 2019

17/05860/FUL

Kellerstane Stables
Gogar Station Road
Edinburgh
EH12 9BS

Change of Use to form 3x studio bedrooms for bed and breakfast (class 7) use from existing garage

Granted

27 March 2018

Other Relevant Site History

N/A

Consultation Engagement

Archaeology

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: 5 February 2024

Date of Advertisement: 10 November 2023

Date of Site Notice: Not Applicable

Number of Contributors: 26

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s), this report will first consider the proposals in terms of Section 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997:

- Is there a strong presumption against granting planning permission due to the development harming the listed building or its setting?
- If the strong presumption against granting planning permission is engaged, are there any significant public interest advantages of the development which can only be delivered at the scheme's proposed location that are sufficient to outweigh it?

This report will then consider the proposed development under Sections 24, 25 and 37 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act):

Having regard to the legal requirement of Section 24(3), in the event of any policy incompatibility between National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) & Edinburgh Local Development Plan 2016 (LDP) the newer policy shall prevail.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for approving them?

In the assessment of material considerations this report will consider:

- equalities and human rights;
- public representations; and
- any other identified material considerations.

Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

a) The proposals harm the listed building or its setting?

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change - Setting

Kellerstain House which is located to the south of the site is a category B listed building (listing reference: LB27299, listing date: 14/06/1991). The proposed dwelling would be sited a sufficient distance from Kellerstain House, so as to ensure that it does not impact on its immediate setting.

The proposal will not have an impact on the setting of the listed building.

Conclusion in relation to the listed building

The works have no adverse impact on the setting of the listed building and are acceptable in regard to Section 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

b) The proposals comply with the development plan?

National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) was adopted by the Scottish Ministers on 13 February 2023 and forms part of the Council's Development Plan. NPF4 policies supports the planning and delivery of Sustainable Places, Liveable Places and Productive Places and are the key policies against which proposals for development are assessed. Several policies in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) are superseded by equivalent and alternative policies within NPF4. The relevant policies to be considered are:

- NPF 4 Sustainable Policies 7, 8
- LDP Housing Policy Hou 1, Hou 3
- LDP Environment Policy Env 10, Env 11, Env 16
- LDP Design Policy Des 5
- LDP Transport Policy Tra 2, Tra 3

The non-statutory Guidance for Development in the Countryside and Green Belt is a material consideration that is relevant when considering NPF 4 Policy 8.

Setting of Listed Building

This has been addressed in section a). The proposal complies with NPF4 Policy 7.

Principle of the Proposal

Housing on the site is contrary to Policy Env 10 of the LDP. The site lies within a Green Belt area and Policy Env 10 (Development in the Green Belt and Countryside) states that development will only be permitted where it meets one of four criteria and would not detract from the landscape quality and/or rural character of the area. A new house on this site would not meet any of the criteria and there is therefore a presumption against granting it unless there are material considerations which would indicate otherwise.

In addition, the Guidance for Countryside and Green Belt states new houses not associated with a countryside use will not be acceptable, unless there are exceptional planning reasons for approving them. These include reuse of brownfield land and gap sites within existing clusters of dwellings.

With respect to LDP Hou 1, where a proposal may be granted due to deficit in land supply, there is no deficit in housing land supply identified in the LDP.

With respect to NPF 4 Policy 8 and LDP Env 10, the proposal does not detail or evidence that the dwelling is for workers linked to a primary industry.

The additional house does not constitute an intensification of the existing residential use. The proposal does not involve the replacement of an existing home. A green belt location is not essential for residential use.

Whilst the land is currently occupied by two timber structures and a tarmac area, it is not a brownfield site in terms of representing an exceptional planning reason to justify development of a new dwellinghouse; the presence of a limited amount of hardstanding and two structures of rural character and design on the site does not constitute the land as brownfield.

The proposed dwelling would form a prominent stand-alone feature which could have the potential to detract from the landscape quality and rural character of the surrounding area.

Having regard to the above, there are no exceptional planning reasons for approving a new house in this location. The proposal would have a detrimental impact on the landscape quality and rural character of the surrounding area.

The proposal is not acceptable in principle as it does not meet the required criteria of NPF 4 Policy 8 and LDP Env 10.

Special Landscape Area

LDP Policy Env 11 (Special Landscape Areas) states permission will not be granted for development which would have a significant adverse impact on the special character or qualities of the Special Landscape Areas.

A landscape visual impact assessment has not been submitted with the application and the impact on the landscape has been assessed above. It has been concluded that it could not be supported.

This would be contrary to LDP Policy Env 11.

Environment

There is potential for the site and immediate area to contain protected species; in this case LDP Policy Env 16 would apply together with NPF4 Policy 4. No ecological information has been submitted with the application.

A preliminary ecological appraisal or any additional biodiversity measures have not been sought, as the proposal is not capable of being supported.

Scale, Form and Design

Having regard to height and form, the scale and proportions of the building and other features on site; materials and detailing. The proposal would be prominent on the site and would affect the rural character of the surrounding area, contrary to LDP Policy Env 10.

Amenity

LDP Policy Des 5 (Development Design - Amenity) requires development proposals to demonstrate that neighbouring amenity of a development will have acceptable levels of amenity in relation to noise, daylight, sunlight, privacy or immediate outlook. It further requires new development to offer suitable level of amenity to future residents.

Amenity of Future Occupiers

Adequate levels of light and outlook will be provided to dwelling by virtue of the windows proposed.

In regard to privacy, there are no houses close to the proposed dwelling. Therefore, a reasonable level of privacy would be achieved for future occupier.

LDP Policy Hou 3 (Private Green Space in Housing Development) requires developments to provide adequate provision for green space to meet the needs of future residents.

Adequate provision of greenspace would be provided on site via land around the dwelling.

The EDG requires a minimum internal floor area of 66 m² for two bedrooms. The proposed dwelling would exceed the minimum space standards.

Neighbouring Amenity

There will be no adverse impact on daylight or outlook from existing windows, or sunlight to garden spaces.

The proposal complies with LDP Policy Des 5.

Parking Provision and Road Safety

LDP Policy Tra 2 states that planning permission will be granted for development where proposed car parking provision complies with and does not exceed the levels set out in Council Guidance.

The site is identified as being within parking standards zone 3 in the Edinburgh Design Guidance (EDG). The proposal does not outline a designated parking space on the site. However, the site is capable of providing a parking space and would comply with the EDG requirements.

The proposal would utilise an existing vehicle access and does not include provision for any new vehicle access from the single lane access road.

The proposal does not raise any issues in respect of parking provision and complies with LDP Policy Tra 2.

Cycle Parking

LDP Policy Tra 3 states cycle parking and storage provision should comply with the standards set out in Council guidance.

No cycle storage is included on the plans. However, there is adequate space to accommodate cycle parking. Details of this could have reasonably been controlled by condition should the proposals have been acceptable overall.

Archaeology

NPF4 Policy 7 states that non-designated historic environment assets, places and their setting should be protected and preserved in situ wherever feasible.

The City Archaeologist has been consulted on the proposals and has stated the site is located within an area of historic and archaeological significance.

A condition could have been imposed, should the proposal have been acceptable overall.

Conclusion in relation to the Development Plan

The proposals do not comply with the Development Plan.

The residential development does not meet relevant criteria of the Green Belt policy and would be an intrusion into the landscape quality and rural character of the area.

The site is not allocated for housing and development of this greenfield site is not supported by policy.

c) There are any other material considerations which must be addressed?

The following material planning considerations have been identified:

Emerging policy context

On 30 November 2022 the Planning Committee approved the Schedule 4 summaries and responses to Representations on the Proposed City Plan 2030 and its supporting documents. These documents have now been submitted for Examination in terms of Section 19 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997. At this time little weight can be attached to City Plan 2030 as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

A summary of the representations is provided below:

material considerations

- no notification has been received of the proposal - A statutory publicity period was carried out and neighbour notification letters sent after validation of the application;
- impact on wildlife and ecosystem - addressed in section (b)
- privacy - addressed in section (b)
- high risk of flooding

non-material considerations

- impact on water pressure and electrical supply - not a planning material consideration
- set a precedent for the future developments - There is no precedent in planning as each application is considered on its own merits;
- increase in traffic - planning cannot control the parking of vehicles; any construction related traffic would need to adhere to any parking regulations.

Support

- more appealing than garage;
- provide family home;
- safer to have house than agriculture use;

Conclusion in relation to identified material considerations

The material considerations support refusal of the planning application.

Overall conclusion

The proposals do not comply with the National Planning Framework 4 and Edinburgh Local Development Plan.

The proposal does not comply with LDP Policy Env 10, as it fails to satisfy any of the prescribed criteria that would potentially justify development in a Green Belt location and would be an intrusion into the landscape quality and rural character of the area. Overall, the material considerations support the presumption against granting planning permission.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following;

Reasons

1. The proposal is contrary to NPF 4 Policy 8 (Green belts) as it does not meet the relevant criteria for residential development in this green belt location and will be harmful to its landscape quality and rural character.
2. The proposal is contrary to LDP Policy Env 10 of the adopted Local Development Plan (LDP) and the Council's Guidance for Development in the Countryside and Green Belt as it would involve the development of a new build

dwellinghouse in a green belt location with no exceptional planning reason to justify its construction.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

Further Information - [Local Development Plan](#)

Date Registered: 17 October 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01-04

Scheme 1

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Weronika Myslowiecka, Planning Officer
E-mail: weronika.myslowiecka@edinburgh.gov.uk

Consultations

NAME: Archaeology

COMMENT: Although the proposals are limited in scale, ground-breaking works associated with this development such as new services may reveal evidence relating to this site. It is therefore recommended that a programme of archaeological work is undertaken during such development works to record, excavate and analyse and report upon any significant archaeological remains that may be affected. It is recommended that the following condition be applied to any permission granted to secure this programme of archaeological work;

'No development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (excavation, analysis, reporting, publication) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.'

The work must be carried out by a professional archaeological organisation, either working to a brief prepared by CECAS or through a written scheme of investigation submitted to and agreed by CECAS for the site. Responsibility for the execution and resourcing of the programme of archaeological works and for the archiving and appropriate level of publication of the results lies with the applicant.

DATE: 13 November 2023

The full consultation response can be viewed on the Planning & Building Standards Portal.

Appendix 2

Application Certification Record

Case Officer

I have assessed the application against the City of Edinburgh Council's Scheme of Delegation (2023) Appendix 6 – Chief Planning Officer and the Statutory Scheme of Delegation (2023) and can confirm the application is suitable to be determined under Local Delegated Decision, decision-making route.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Date: 2 February 2024

Authorising Officer

To be completed by an officer as authorised by the Chief Planning Officer to determined applications under delegated powers.

I can confirm that I have checked the Report of Handling and agree the recommendation by the case officer.

Authorising Officer (mRTPI): Alan Moonie

Date: 5 February 2024

Memorandum

To Head of Planning
City of Edinburgh Council
Planning and Transport
Place
Waverley Court
4 East Market Street
Edinburgh
EH8 8BG

F.A.O Local Planing Team 1

From John A Lawson

Date 7th November 2023

Your ref 23/06323/FUL
Our ref 23/06323/FUL

To whom it may concern,

Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar

Further to your consultation request I would like to make the following comments and recommendations concerning this application to convert garage into dwelling.

The site forms part of the historic farm of Kellerstain show on General Roy's 1753 Military Map as Caller Stone. The site also lies on the southern edge of an extensive area of archaeological importance focused to the north at Gogar and to the east at Millburn with evidence for prehistoric, Roman (2 temporary camps known from Millburn area) early historic and medieval and later settlement. A recent aerial photograph of the area (see fig 1) shows a large linear, E-W, cropmark (marked out by the two arrows) curving southwards towards this site. In form this would appear to depict the NW corner of a Roman Temporary Camp. Given the location of two such camps nearby to the east adjacent to Millburn Tower and it is therefore possible that this cropmark may be the remains of a third such Roman camp.

This application, accordingly, must be considered under terms of Scottish Government's Our Place in Time (OPIT), NPF4 Policy 7, PAN 02/2011, HES's Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS) 2019. The aim should be to preserve archaeological remains in situ as a first option, but alternatively where this is not possible, archaeological excavation or an appropriate level of recording may be an acceptable alternative.

As discussed, the site may overly the site of a Roman temporary camp. Although the proposals are limited in scale, ground-breaking works associated with this development such as new services may reveal evidence relating to this site. It is therefore recommended that a programme of archaeological work is undertaken during such development works to record, excavate and analyse and report upon any significant archaeological remains that may be affected.

It is recommended that that the following condition be applied to any permission granted to secure this programme of archaeological work;

'No development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (excavation, analysis, reporting, publication) in accordance

with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.'

The work must be carried out by a professional archaeological organisation, either working to a brief prepared by CECAS or through a written scheme of investigation submitted to and agreed by CECAS for the site. Responsibility for the execution and resourcing of the programme of archaeological works and for the archiving and appropriate level of publication of the results lies with the applicant.

Please contact me if you require any further information.

Yours faithfully



John A Lawson
(Archaeology Officer)



Fig 1: google image taken from RAD's support document accompanying this application (p4). The Arrows point to a linear crop mark which is suggestive of a corner (NW) of a Roman Temporary Camp.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Izabela Nassar

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I would like to express my strong objection to this planning application.

1) The proposed planning is not for Kellerstain Stables. I am the owner of Kellerstain Stables and this is not our application.

2) We worry another dwelling would affect our already very low water pressure coming to our house.

3) While I understand that the proposed dwelling may seem like a positive development on the surface, it is imperative to consider the broader implications it may have on our community and the unique character of Kellerstain. I am aware of the previous owner's attempts to build a house on this site, which were repeatedly rejected by the planning authorities.

My understanding is that Murray estates are planning to build on the side of the bypass at Gogar to Hermiston and the planning is meant to be granted early next year. At the planning hearing in 2018, it was decided that if the planning was to be granted, then Gogar Station Road would be the new green belt planning boundary.

We worry that if the proposed garage site gets developed, it might set a precedent for the rest of the field surrounding our houses to be developed as well.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Catriona Heiton

Address: Little Kellerstain 8 Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Firstly, I am unhappy not to have been notified of the planning application as a neighbour, as the proposed dwelling would be situated on the shared private driveway leading to my home & will have a direct impact on the water supply to my property. Please confirm the reasons why I was not notified.

Planning has been previously rejected on this site twice and also at appeal. Granting planning now would surely contravene planning regulations & begs the question what has materially changed since the previous applications were rejected. This is a green belt site, the existing garages were built without permission and gained planning retrospectively. To now apply for residential use of a green belt site which became brown belt by the back door feels like an attempt at planning creep.

When planning was previously applied for on this site, concerns were voiced by the residents of the Kellerstain Estate about the water supply being adequate for any extra residential properties. These concerns still remain. My home is at the end of the line of the Kellerstain water supply and I have had to instal a pump system to assist with pressure on the water supply to the house. I believe any further demand on the water supply to the Estate would lead to significant & possibly insurmountable water pressure issues to my property.

For your information, the application is also inaccurate. It states its address as Kellerstain Stables - this is incorrect. The site is not related to Kellerstain Stables, an entirely separate private residence which will also be impacted by the proposal.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Callum Black

Address: 2 Kellerstain House Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I would like to state a strong objection to the proposed build on the land. There are a number of factors and reasons for my objection. Firstly, the existing garage building on site, was built without any planning permission on a Green Belt site and planning was gained retrospectively, against the wishes of the neighbouring properties. The land it sits on is still under the designated Green Belt area. The concern is that by erecting a domestic property on this land, it will become a residential plot, putting the existing Green Belt area at risk of further development, impacting significantly on the surrounding landscape, wildlife and ecosystems. The historical importance of the Kellerstain estate is at risk, due to overdevelopment of the surrounding land.

The current residents are dedicated to preserving the history and original state of the land.

I would also like to bring to the attention of the planning board that this land previously had planning applied for and rejected twice and also rejected upon appeal, as well as being referred to the Secretary of State for Scotland where it was also rejected. The current application has no reference to these previous applications, which leads me to believe the naming of the application (Kellerstain Stables) which is already a registered address within the neighbouring properties, has been used to avoid linking this to the previous planning applications.

By having an additional two-storey dwelling there will be an increased demand and significant effect on the already low water pressure within the area and directly impact the surrounding neighbours.

I also strongly believe the erection of this proposed property would significantly affect the light, views and privacy of the resident who lives at Kellerstain Cottage.

In addition, there will be an increased volume of traffic within the area that will pose a safety risk to the children living within the Kellerstain estate.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Craig Hunter

Address: Kellerstain Lodge Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Main concerns

1. Electrical supply. The property is inside a fixed supply area. The main supply cables have certainly been in place for decades, being designed for existing loads with normal contingencies. This property will have additional load, as there is very little off-grid planning. This will put an additional load, with future potential increases, such as car chargers, etc. This additional load must be checked by the supplier to ensure it falls within supply capabilities. However, these checks will not consider the bath-tub effect to the equipment, which will be adversely affected with potential premature failure. Such failure would cause massive inconvenience and potential costs if equipment has to be replaced.

2. Water supply. The properties in the Kellerstain site have a single water supply. This is already under strain, bringing another user online needs to ensure that flow rates at all times will be satisfactory, as we already see during peak periods significant pressure/flow drops. Water storage is an issue, especially with legionnaires risks, so even if storage is added with this application, enforcing this use into the future will be problematic if not impossible, so unless a separate mains supply is included this will be an issue.

3. Drainage. There is little detail about the septic tank and control of water run-off. The area around Kellerstain lodge is already designated as flooding area by SEPA. The proposed development sits at a higher elevation, so any additional water run-off shall stagnate around Kellerstain Lodge. Management of water run-off is critical to reduce chances of flooding at lower areas. It is not acceptable to mix water run-off with sewage so it is expected that run-off water would be limited to surface channels and soak-away which will inevitably lead to flooding at lower levels when the ground area becomes saturated.

4. Access. The Kellerstain site is accessed through a single lane road, with a single passing point. This private road is already over utilised. Traffic passes directly under the bedroom and living room windows of Kellerstain Lodge. Having an additional property on the opposite side of the road will increase traffic particularly outside normal working hours, as the garages are presently not normally used in the evening.

5. Privacy. Kellerstain lodge was built in 1860 and sits into the hill, having a low position. Therefore, any property built directly opposite would affect the privacy of lodge as persons in the proposed development may look directly into the main bedroom and living area. Erection of courtesy border, such as a hedge or fence would adversely affect the lodge outlook and the natural light into the premises.

The proposed planning application is not supported.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Kayleigh Parker

Address: 3 Kellerstain House Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Dear Ms Myslowiecka,

We write with reference to planning application reference '23/06323/FUL'

The proposal description for this application states, "Proposed change of use from a garage unit into a two bedroom detached house for the owners group of the proposed new house at Kellerstain stables" We note that this application is not for Kellerstain stables but for an area of land on the driveway of the former Kellerstain estate. Kellerstain stables is a distinct separate property. It should be noted that the owner or indeed the 'owners' group' is not a current resident of this community but rather a speculative developer.

We object to the proposal for planning permission in principle for the conversion of the current garage into a dwelling within the former Kellerstain Estate for the following reasons;

- The land in question forms part of the green belt, this was further ratified in the latest local adopted plan.
- When attending planning meetings for the new Garden District application we were informed that should Murray Estates proposals prove successful then the new delineation of the green belt would be Gogar Station Road. This proposal would be the litmus test of this new Green belt delineation and whether Gogar Station Road is in fact a strong enough feature to represent a boundary to the Green Belt.
- The garage that currently occupies the site has been continuously rented circa 15 years. The garage is generally used at weekends by hobby car enthusiasts so there is little traffic, drain on incoming services, impact on the local setting and interface with the residents. The plot was recently sold as a plot with development potential and the new owners have speculated that they can gain permission to erect a house. The plot was not purchased with a view to being an ongoing

concern as a commercial rental.

- The site is experiencing what can only be described as "planning creep" Initially the site was a field and the previous owner (who was a property developer) gained permission to erect some stables, this led to the illegal erection of the garages for which retrospective planning permission was gained. The final step is to convert to a dwelling house.

- It is our belief that the proposed development not only adversely affects the site in question but also the look and feel of the Kellerstain Estate.

- The proposed design is clearly aimed to imitate the current garages and aims to persuade all parties that nothing much will change from how the site currently looks. We have strong concerns that should planning be achieved this will be modified and extended. It is imperative that we see this application as a first step. The claim that the site currently provides parking for 16 cars is disingenuous.

- The site in question is the entrance to the Kellerstain Estate, the proposed development will naturally break the open visual amenity of the setting.

- We would also note that this is the fourth application that has been made for this plot in the last 8 years with each previous application and appeal being declined.

- We note that the proposed development overall height mirrors the existing garage height. This allows for a very cramped and claustrophobic floor to ceiling height of 2m. This reinforces our concerns that this application serves as a gateway to future, alternative development.

- According to SEPA current flood maps the site adjoins an area with a high risk of flooding.

We would respectfully request that the above reasons are considered during your review of this application.

Thank you

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Sian Voy

Address: 1 gogarstation road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I think it's a great idea am all for it

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Cole Cowan

Address: 8 Roddinglaw road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I support this idea as it a cottage would be much more appealing than a run down car garage and tidy the area up

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Ryan Quinn

Address: 4 roddinglaw road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: The space would better as a residential property to give a family a home

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Jack Sim

Address: Gogarstation road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Don't see a issue it's only changing of use of a existing building

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Michael ILES

Address: 1 Kellerstain House Gogar Station Road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Dear Ms Myslowiecka,

I wish to register a strong rejection of the plan to convert garages into a two storey house.

In the Edinburgh publication 'Survey of Gardens and Designed Landscapes' the report by Peter McGowan (June 2007) refers to the Kellerstain area as being where principal features are surviving despite urban fringe pressures.

In particular, the report describes 'garage buildings by drive to east of house (said not to have planning permission and to be demolished).

In fact, the buildings were not demolished and are now being proposed to be converted to a two storey house, in a Green Belt area, and in a design out of keeping with other property in the area.

I consider that it would be more appropriate if the garages were demolished, rather than being converted to residential use.

If converted, this house could increase traffic on an already small drive, change the appearance of the site and affect the privacy of residents of the nearby Kellerstain Lodge and other houses nearby.

I request, please, that this planning application is rejected.

Yours sincerely,

Michael Iles

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Martin Main

Address: Gogarstation road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I think this would make a ideal home

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Lisa Collins

Address: 2 Roddinglaw Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Think this is amazing

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Stephen Oneil

Address: 140 Glasgow road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I love this idea I pass this building for many years walking my dogs and it would be a splendid conversion of an existing building don't so why anyone would object to this

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Dr Dale Cleeton

Address: Kellerstain Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Commercial

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: This site has been overgrown and cars lying all over the place like a scrap yard this would make my passing it the place less sore on the eyes I support a change of use thanks

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Liz Smart

Address: 1a Gogar bank Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Residents Association

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I think this would be great more housing as Edinburgh has a shortage already and it can only get worse if we don't get more accommodation for the ever growing population

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Graham Mackay

Address: 17 hermiston Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Commercial

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: This would be a great upgrade to the area

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Miss Taylor Mcilhone

Address: 4 hermiston Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I would rather a house than a business to be a wee community as some of the people coming and going from the garage with their agricultural tractors and lorry's is more dangerous to our kids

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Maya Jac

Address: Glasgow road Eh288na

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Benefits the community all for it

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Stephanie Carrick

Address: Castle gogar 180 Glasgow road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Residential

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Superb idea

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Reece Smith

Address: 1 Baird grove Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Everything in life changes as some point and this building is looking tired and could do with a new look as looking run down and tired and also the building is not getting any extensions to the one that's has been there for years what would be the problem

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Miss Loiuise Jeffrey

Address: 2 Cammo road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour-Commercial

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: I clean the b&b lodges at Keller stain and the owner and my self think this would look magnificent all for it

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Darrell Hardy

Address: 40 Murray field road Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Public

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Why not it does not affect anyone in anyway I think the change of use is beautiful from the drawing and any neighbour who would disagree is ludicrous

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Mr Dean Wilkes

Address: 26 Lennymuir Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Neighbour

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Looks fantastic bringing a home for someone instead of a old shed

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Org Alan Boultera

Address: Napier university 9sighthill ct Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Community Council

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Great hopefully give a few students somewhere to stay near our campus as the house shortage around the area is bad and in desperate need of places local

Comments for Planning Application 23/06323/FUL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06323/FUL

Address: Kellerstain Stables Gogar Station Road Gogar Edinburgh EH12 9BS

Proposal: Convert garage into dwelling.

Case Officer: Weronika Myslowiecka

Customer Details

Name: Ms Lori Colquhoun

Address: 5 Cammo gardens Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Member of Parliament

Stance: Customer made comments in support of the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Not building another house or extending simply changing for the better