

Mr Newsam.
30 Martingale Close
Cambridge
CB4 3TA

Decision date: 10 May 2024

**TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACTS
DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2013**

Change of use of flat to short term holiday let or a flat.
At 3F3 112A West Bow Edinburgh EH1 2HH

Application No: 23/06312/FULSTL

DECISION NOTICE

With reference to your application for Planning Permission STL registered on 17 October 2023, this has been decided by **Local Delegated Decision**. The Council in exercise of its powers under the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts and regulations, now determines the application as **Refused** in accordance with the particulars given in the application.

Any condition(s) attached to this consent, with reasons for imposing them, or reasons for refusal, are shown below;

Reason for Refusal:-

1. The proposal is contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Hou 7 in respect of Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will have a materially detrimental effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents.
2. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework Policy 30(e) in respect of Local Amenity and Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will result in an adverse impact on local amenity and the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

Please see the guidance notes on our [decision page](#) for further information, including how to appeal or review your decision.

Drawings 01 - 02, represent the determined scheme. Full details of the application can be found on the [Planning and Building Standards Online Services](#)

The reason why the Council made this decision is as follows:

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion.

This determination does not carry with it any necessary consent or approval for the proposed development under other statutory enactments.

Should you have a specific enquiry regarding this decision please contact Benny Buckle directly at benny.buckle@edinburgh.gov.uk.



Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

NOTES

1. If the applicant is aggrieved by the decision to refuse permission for or approval required by a condition in respect of the proposed development, or to grant permission or approval subject to conditions, the applicant may require the planning authority to review the case under section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 within three months beginning with the date of this notice. The Notice of Review can be made online at www.eplanning.scot or forms can be downloaded from that website. Paper forms should be addressed to the City of Edinburgh Planning Local Review Body, G.2, Waverley Court, 4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG. For enquiries about the Local Review Body, please email localreviewbody@edinburgh.gov.uk.

2. If permission to develop land is refused or granted subject to conditions and the owner of the land claims that the land has become incapable of reasonably beneficial use in its existing state and cannot be rendered capable of reasonably beneficial use by carrying out of any development which has been or would be permitted, the owner of the land may serve on the planning authority a purchase notice requiring the purchase of the owner of the land's interest in the land accordance with Part 5 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

::

Report of Handling

**Application for Planning Permission STL
3F3 112A West Bow, Edinburgh, EH1 2HH**

Proposal: Change of use of flat to short term holiday let or a flat.

**Item – Local Delegated Decision
Application Number – 23/06312/FULSTL
Ward – B11 - City Centre**

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Refused** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The application site relates to a third floor, two-bedroom flat. Access is gained via a shared stair and ground floor entrance, which are used by a further 11 residential properties. The main door entrance is pedestrian accessed, via Edmonstone's Close from West Bow.

The nature of the immediate vicinity is mixed use, with retail and hospitality uses occupying the ground floor premises with residential uses above. The area has high levels of tourist activity. Although West Bow is a busy mixed-use area the neighbouring

residential properties within the shared residential stair can expect a high level of residential amenity.

The application property is located within a 'B' listed building (29910), listed on 14/12/1970. The property is also located within the Old Town Conservation Area and World Heritage Site.

There are further STL uses within the communal stair, however, at the time of determination the lawful use of these properties is residential.

Description of the Proposal

The application is for retrospective change of use from residential to STL.

Supporting Information

- Supporting Statement

Relevant Site History

22/04934/FUL
3F3 112A West Bow
Edinburgh
EH1 2HH
Change of use of flat to short term holiday let or a flat.
Refused

5 May 2023

Other Relevant Site History

23/06456/CLESTL
Use of property as a short-term let at 3F2, 112A West Bow
Not yet determined

23/05044/FULSTL
Change of Use of a residential flat to form an STL at 2F3, 112A West Bow
Refused - 26.4.24.

23/05043/FULSTL
Formalise use as a STL at 3F2, 112A West Bow.
Not yet determined.

23/04563/CLESTL
STL use since 2018 at 1F1, 112A West Bow
Not yet determined.

Consultation Engagement

No consultations.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: 10 May 2024

Date of Advertisement: 1 December 2023

Date of Site Notice: 1 December 2023

Number of Contributors: 2

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s) and being within a conservation area, this report will first consider the proposals in terms of Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

a) Is there a strong presumption against granting planning permission due to the proposals:

- (i) harming the listed building or its setting? or
- (ii) conflicting with the objective of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the conservation area?

b) If the strong presumption against granting planning permission is engaged, are there any significant public interest advantages of the development which can only be delivered at the scheme's proposed location that are sufficient to outweigh it?

This report will then consider the proposed development under Sections 24, 25 and 37 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act):

Having regard to the legal requirement of Section 24(3), in the event of any policy incompatibility between National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) & Edinburgh Local Development Plan 2016 (LDP) the newer policy shall prevail.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for approving them?

In the assessment of material considerations this report will consider:

- equalities and human rights;
- public representations; and
- any other identified material considerations.

Assessment

The application is in retrospect. The application form stated that the proposed operation of the property as a short term let commenced in March 2017. This is prior to 5

September 2022, when the Edinburgh STL control area came into effect. As the designation does not have a retrospective effect it is necessary to consider whether the use of the property as a commercial STL is a material change of use.

The effect of granting planning permission would be to change the use from a residential flat to STL. The use of the property as STL, as a result of the granting of planning permission, would constitute a material change in the use of the property under section 26 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997, given the associated characteristics of STL use of this property type (third floor flat, sharing a main door access with other residential properties).

a) The proposals harm the listed building or its setting?

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent.
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent sets out the principles for assessing the impact of a development on a listed building.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting sets out the principles that apply to developments affecting the setting of historic assets or places including listed buildings and conservation areas. It includes factors to be considered in assessing the impact of a change on the setting.

There are no external or internal alterations proposed. As such, the proposal will not have an adverse impact on or cause harm to the listed building. The setting of the listed building and the setting of neighbouring listed buildings will be unaffected by the proposal.

Conclusion in relation to the listed building

The proposal does not harm either the listed building or its setting. It is therefore acceptable with regard to Sections 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

b) The proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area?

Section 64(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states:

"In exercise, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, of any powers under any of the provisions in subsection (2), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area."

The Old Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises *"the survival of the original medieval street pattern; the wealth of important landmark buildings; the survival of an outstanding collection of archaeological remains, medieval buildings, and 17th-century town houses; the consistent and harmonious height and mass of buildings; the*

importance of stone as a construction material for both buildings and the public realm; the vitality and variety of different uses; and the continuing presence of a residential community. "

There are no external changes proposed. The change of use from a residential premises to a short term let will not have any material impact on the character of the conservation area. The change of use would preserve the appearance of the conservation area.

Conclusion in relation to the conservation area

The proposals are acceptable with regard to Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997).

c) The proposals comply with the development plan?

National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) was adopted by the Scottish Ministers on 13 February 2023 and forms part of the Council's Development Plan. NPF4 policies supports the planning and delivery of Sustainable Places, Liveable Places and Productive Places and are the key policies against which proposals for development are assessed. Several policies in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) are superseded by equivalent and alternative policies within NPF4.

The relevant NPF4 and LDP 2016 policies to be considered are:

- NPF4 Sustainable Places Tackling the climate and nature crises Policy 1.
- NPF4 Productive Places Tourism Policy 30.
- NPF4 Historic Assets and Places Policy 7.
- Local Development Plan Housing Policy, Hou 7.
- Local Development Plan Transport Policies, Tra 2 and Tra 3

The non-statutory Listed Building and Conservation Area Guidance is a material consideration when considering NPF 4 Policy 7.

The non-statutory Guidance for Business (2024) is a material consideration that is relevant when considering LDP Policy Hou 7 and NPF4 policy 30.

The Edinburgh Design Guidance is a material consideration when considering LDP Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

Listed Buildings, Conservation Area and Edinburgh World Heritage Site

The impact on the setting of the listed building and on the setting of neighbouring listed buildings has been assessed in section a) above which concluded that this would be preserved.

There are no external or internal works proposed and as such there will not be a significant impact on historic assets and places.

The proposal complies with NPF 4 Policy 7.

Proposed Use

With regards to NPF 4 Policy 1, the proposed change of use does not involve operational development resulting in physical changes to the property. The proposals will have a negligible impact on the global climate and nature crisis.

NPF 4 Policy 30 seeks to encourage, promote and facilitate sustainable tourism development which benefits local people, is consistent with our net zero and nature commitments, and inspires people to visit Scotland. Criterion 30 (e) specifically relate to STL proposals.

LDP Policy Hou 7 (Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas), seeks to protect residential amenity.

Amenity

The use as a STL would allow visitors to come and go from the premises for inconsistent periods of time on a regular basis throughout the year in a manner dissimilar to that of permanent residents. Transient visitors may also have less regard for neighbours' amenity than individuals using the property as a principal home.

Despite the property being within a busy, commercial location, neighbouring residential flats can expect a good standard of residential amenity within the stair. The shared access with residential properties creates an opportunity whereby STL users could have a detrimental impact on the internal neighbouring residential amenity. The use as a STL is not consistent with the existing neighbouring residential uses.

The application received an objection which commented that general STL use would increase disturbances and weaken security. The objection further stated that STL users could leave the main door accesses open and conversely also lock residents out of their homes by dead locking the main door.

A change of use to STL would increase the level of ambient background noise beyond what is reasonably expected by neighbouring residents and will have a significant detrimental effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents. The proposal does not comply with NPF 4 policy 30(e) part (i) and LDP policy Hou 7.

Loss of residential accommodation

NPF 4 policy 30 (e) part (ii) requires that where there is a loss of residential accommodation, this will only be supported where the loss is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits.

The applicant provides a supporting statement which details the STL's local economic benefit. It is asserted by the applicant that the STL use contributes an annual economic benefit of at least £40,000 pounds to the local economy. In addition to the annual economic benefit the property gives employment to local trade persons.

The proposed change of use to an STL would result in a loss of residential accommodation. As there is a recognised need and demand for housing in Edinburgh, it is critical to retain the existing supply where appropriate.

Paragraph 220 of the LDP acknowledges that tourism is the biggest source of employment in Edinburgh, providing jobs for over 31,000 people. The use of the property by guests and the required maintenance and upkeep of STL properties are likely to result in a level of job creation and spend within the economy which can be classed as having an economic benefit.

It is important to recognise that having the property within residential use also contributes to the economy, using local services and fulfilling employment opportunities across the City. Long term residents can also make consistent and long-term contributions to the local community.

In this instance, it has not been sufficiently demonstrated that the loss of the residential accommodation is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits. As such, the proposal does not comply with NPF 4 30(e) part (ii).

Parking Standards

Permit and paid on street parking is available on Grassmarket in close proximity to the property. These parking provisions are acceptable as there are no parking requirements for STLs. Cycles could be parked inside the property.

The proposals comply with LDP Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

Conclusion in relation to the Development Plan

The change of use of this property to an STL will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the City as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7.

d) There are any other material considerations which must be addressed?

The following material planning considerations have been identified:

Emerging policy context

On 5 April 2024 the Planning and Environmental Appeals Division published its report into the examination of the Proposed City Plan 2030 and supporting documents in terms of Section 19 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997. The Council is currently considering the recommendations and modifications required to the Proposed City Plan 2030. It is the intention that the modifications will be considered by the Council before the end of June 2024. At this time in the context of the consideration of this particular application limited weight can be given to the relevant policies of City Plan 2030 until the proposed modifications have been fully considered.

Independent economic impact assessment

An independent economic impact assessment was commissioned by the Planning Service, and this resulted in a report on the Economic Impact of Residential and Short-Term Let Properties in Edinburgh (the Economic Report). This was reported to

Planning Committee on 14 June 2023. The Committee noted that the findings of the report are one source of information that can be considered when assessing the economic impacts of short-term let planning applications and that given the report is considering generalities rather than the specifics of an individual case, it is likely that only limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration when making planning application decisions. The study considered the economic impact of various types of properties in Edinburgh if used as a residential property as opposed to being used for short-term holiday lettings.

The Economic Report shows that there are positive economic impacts from the use of properties for both residential use and short-term let use. The Report found that in general the gross value added (GVA) effects are greater for residential uses than short-term lets across all property types and all areas. However, given it is considering generalities rather than the specifics of this individual case, only limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

The application received two public objections. These were received by the Old Town Association and The Grassmarket Residents' Association (GRASS).

A summary of the representations is provided below:

material considerations in objection

- The proposed change of use would result in loss of Edinburgh's housing stock. Assessed in section c).
- The proposed change of use would have a negative impact to neighbouring residential amenity. Assessed in section c).
- The proposed change of use would decrease security within the shared stair. This has been assessed in section c).

non-material considerations in objection

- The STL use would increase litter within the stair and incorrect use of recycling bins.
- STL users flooding neighbouring properties.

Conclusion in relation to identified material considerations

Identified material considerations have been assessed above and do not raise issues which outweigh the conclusion in relation to the development plan.

Overall conclusion

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a STL will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following;

Reason for Refusal

1. The proposal is contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Hou 7 in respect of Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will have a materially detrimental effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents.
2. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework Policy 30(e) in respect of Local Amenity and Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will result in an adverse impact on local amenity and the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the [Planning Portal](#)

Further Information - [Local Development Plan](#)

Date Registered: 17 October 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01 - 02

Scheme 1

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Benny Buckle, Assistant Planning Officer
E-mail: benny.buckle@edinburgh.gov.uk

Appendix 1

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Appendix 2

Application Certification Record

Case Officer

I have assessed the application against the City of Edinburgh Council's Scheme of Delegation (2023) Appendix 6 – Chief Planning Officer and the Statutory Scheme of Delegation (2023) and can confirm the application is suitable to be determined under Local Delegated Decision, decision-making route.

Case Officer: Benny Buckle

Date: 29 April 2024

Authorising Officer

To be completed by an officer as authorised by the Chief Planning Officer to determined applications under delegated powers.

I can confirm that I have checked the Report of Handling and agree the recommendation by the case officer.

Authorising Officer (mRTPI): Lesley Porteous

Date: 10 May 2024

Comments for Planning Application 23/06312/FULSTL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06312/FULSTL

Address: 3F3 112A West Bow Edinburgh EH1 2HH

Proposal: Change of use of flat to short term holiday let or a flat.

Case Officer: Improvement Team

Customer Details

Name: Ms OLD TOWN ASSOCIATION

Address: 1 Trunks Close, 55 High Street, Edinburgh EH1 1SR

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Amenity Body

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: Use as a short-term let will remove this property from the housing stock and deny potential residents a home.

The property shares access with other residential property.

Use of a flat as a short-term let leads to a sense of insecurity as residents do not know who they will encounter on their common stair.

Users of short-term lets are often noisy and active at anti-social hours, including arriving and leaving with luggage at all hours.

Use as a short-term let leads to a lack of security as guests often leave access doors open.

In contrast, users of short-term lets have been known to secure the door to the common stair, locking residents out of their homes.

Users of short-term lets are often careless about the use of household appliances, leading to flooding and other nuisances.

Users of short-term lets are unaware of local regulations and often leave rubbish on the stair and misuse recycling bins.

Comments for Planning Application 23/06312/FULSTL

Application Summary

Application Number: 23/06312/FULSTL

Address: 3F3 112A West Bow Edinburgh EH1 2HH

Proposal: Change of use of flat to short term holiday let or a flat.

Case Officer: Improvement Team

Customer Details

Name: Mrs Elspeth Wills

Address: 3 Brown's Place Edinburgh

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Residents Association

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: GRASS is a small community group operating in the Grassmarket area. We have consistently been affected by the inexorable rise of STLs resulting in loss of amenity to individuals and to the hollowing out of the community. We therefore object to this application on the grounds of Hou7 and it being contrary to both the current and planned national planning guidelines.

Yours sincerely

Elspeth Wills

Planning and Licensing

GRASS