

Policy and Sustainability Committee

10:00am, Tuesday, 1 October 2019

Gender Pay Gap Update

Executive/routine
Wards
Council Commitments

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 As requested at Finance and Resources Committee 11 October 2018, this paper provides an update on the gender pay gap for information and noting.

Stephen S. Moir

Executive Director of Resources

Contact: Katy Miller, Head of Human Resources

E-mail: katy.miller@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 5522

Gender Pay Gap up-date

2. Executive Summary

- 2.1 The Council is currently bound by duties arising from the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012, which require the Council to positively eliminate discrimination and publish gender pay gap information every two years.
- 2.2 The Finance and Resources Committee reviewed our most recent gender pay gap information in October 2018.
- 2.3 This paper provides an up-date on the long-term measures identified within the report to support a reduction in our mean gender pay gap of 4.8% (median 5%).

3. Background

- 3.1 It is widely acknowledged that the gender pay gap is influenced by many factors, including wider societal dynamics, some of which will take time to change.
- 3.2 However, understanding the data and trends better has enabled us to target initiatives that will reduce the gap in the short to medium term
- 3.3 Analysis has shown us that close monitoring and gender impact assessments are critical to support the maintenance /improvement of the gap.
- 3.4 Whilst our gap is comparatively low, it is evident that there has been some detrimental movement in the last 12 months due to changes in the demographic profile of our workforce. To provide context to this short-term variance, data and trends from 2011 have also been included.
- 3.5 A number of activities and initiatives are underway to seek to continue to close the Council's gender pay gap.

4. Main report

- 4.1 Whilst we will not undertake the next full gender pay gap report until 2020, we have undertaken further analysis to gain insight into the gender pay gap where
- men occupy more senior roles than women in the same occupation
 - occupational segregation where men and women do different jobs
 - part time versus full-time trends
- 4.2 The analysis and findings, which includes trends from 2011 to 2019 can be found in Appendix 1.
- 4.3 A number of initiatives and activities have been underway, or have been started, which seek to close the current gender pay gap within the Council.
- 4.4 A Diversity and Inclusion focus group with representation from elected members, trade unions and current colleague networks (as well as HR) has been established to review and finalise the Diversity and Inclusion strategy and associated action plan for approval at committee in October.
- 4.5 Awareness raising of diversity and inclusion issues is a fundamental element of both the strategy and the action plan. Although the action plan will evolve over time, the proposal is to focus initially on awareness raising in relation to:
- collection of equalities data and how we will use the data
 - promotion and support of colleague networks
 - key dates across the year that are significant for underrepresented groups
- 4.6 This includes, launching a new Equality and Diversity digital learning module for employees and managers earlier this year. Additionally, we are developing a new digital learning experience for recruiting managers with a sharper focus on inclusive recruitment practice, including a focus on unconscious bias as well as direct and indirect discrimination. Additionally, a Women's Network will be launched in August 2019 which will seek to help to build a culture of inclusion through building a community to support and empower women.
- 4.7 We are collaborating with external partners to help us improve our attraction and recruitment approaches to reach population groups who may not currently consider us as an employer. This includes working in partnership with AMINA to support Muslim women's employability skills and the Department of Work and Pensions to support the employability skills of NEETs (not in education, employment or training). We are also engaging with colleague network groups to help us gain valuable insight in their views on how to attract a diverse workforce. We recently launched our @Edinburgh Council Jobs Twitter feed and use this to raise awareness of any upcoming recruitment campaigns, featured jobs, local stories e.g. Pride, Fringe etc and employees leave testimonials about why they chose to work for us.
- 4.8 We continue to monitor and promote our flexible approach to ways of working and family friendly policies: Maternity, Paternity, Adoption and Shared Parental Leave policy; Parental Leave policy on the Birth or Adoption of a Child; Special Leave

Policy; Working Time Policy. These policies are reflective of best practice and confirm our commitment to a culture of supporting work/life balance.

- 4.9 It is acknowledged that a factor contributing to the gender pay gap, both within the Council and within other organisation, is low female population densities in senior (highest paid) roles. Whilst the organisation workforce demographic is 68% female and 32% male, this distribution is not represented in grades at the senior level. 2019 has seen the launch and first intake for our inspiring Talent programme. An underlying principle of the programme is to ensure the diversity of our employee population is reflected in the successful participants, with a particular emphasis on providing opportunities for women. Of the successful candidates for this year's intake, 75% are women (compared to 56% of applications).
- 4.10 A review of our Reward arrangements for Local Government Employees has been undertaken taking account of the data trends in the most recent Gender Pay Gap report. Initial analysis of the proposals in Total Reward indicate that the gender pay gap could reduce by up to 1% for this employee group.

5. Next Steps

- 5.1 Work will continue on the identified activities and we will report our Gender Pay Gap figures to Committee in October 2020.

6. Financial impact

- 6.1 None

7. Stakeholder/Community Impact

- 7.1 In developing the Diversity and Inclusion strategy and plan we have engaged with a number of stakeholders including elected members, Trade Unions and external organisations such as Close the Gap.
- 7.2 Our new platforms for recruitment, for example use of social media, will help us to reach a diverse as possible pool of potential candidates.

8. Background reading/external references

- 8.1 [Gender Pay Gap – Finance and Resources 11 October 2019](#)

9. Appendices

- 9.1 Appendix 1 – Gender Pay Gap Data Analysis and Insights

Appendix 1 – Gender Pay Gap Data Analysis and Insights

Female Population Density by Grade

The below tables shows the change in female density by grade over the longer term (2011-2019) and over the shorter term (2018-2019).

Percentages

Grade	Female Density			2019 vs 2011	2019 vs 2018
	2011	2018	2019	% change	% change
GR1	78%	77%	79%	1%	2%
GR2	72%	76%	78%	6%	2%
GR3	70%	75%	79%	10%	4%
GR4	70%	67%	63%	-7%	-4%
GR5	63%	67%	68%	5%	2%
GR6	62%	53%	60%	-2%	7%
GR7	64%	65%	66%	2%	1%
GR8	55%	58%	59%	4%	0%
GR9	49%	53%	55%	6%	3%
GR10	36%	58%	53%	17%	-5%
GR11	33%	35%	32%	-1%	-3%
GR12	29%	45%	40%	11%	-5%
	67%	67%	68%	2%	1%

Total Positions

Grade	2011		2018		2019	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
GR1	1041	297	1029	308	990	270
GR2	1017	386	323	103	325	90
GR3	1859	806	2232	743	2269	587
GR4	1780	767	1935	937	1936	1120
GR5	1281	743	1181	593	1278	598
GR6	800	486	787	697	849	570
GR7	1120	618	932	502	1004	513
GR8	432	359	424	305	464	328
GR9	178	183	156	141	174	142
GR10	31	56	73	53	72	64
GR11	15	31	14	26	13	28
GR12	2	5	17	21	18	27
	9556	4737	9103	4429	9392	4337

Females in Senior Roles

Context: The gender pay gap is partly caused by low female population density in the highest paid roles. Whilst the organisation workforce demographic is 68% female and 32% male, this distribution is not represented in grades at the senior level.

Over the Longer Term...(2011 – 2019)

Since 2011 the density of the female population working in senior grades has improved, with an increase of 6% at GR9, 17% at GR10 and 11% at GR12. The female population at GR11 reduced by 1% in this period, which is in part attributable to an overall reduction in the number of GR11 roles in the organisation.

By contrast, the percentage of female representation at the Chief Official level has reduced from 39% to 25% since 2011, driving a bigger gap in pay between females and males at the organisation level (data excludes NHS which reports separately). There has been a reduction of 2 Chief Official roles over the same period.

Over the Shorter Term... (2018 – 2019)

Comparison of 2018 and 2019 data shows that there were reductions in female density at senior grades (GR10, GR11, GR12).

Consideration of the trends observed since 2018/19 suggests that occupational segregation trends are moving in the wrong direction, with a reducing female population in the highest pay quartile. Our Inspiring Talent Programme will form part of our approach to redress this.

Female Density Change – 2011 to 2019

Grade	Female Density		2019 vs 2011
	2011	2019	% change
GR9	49%	55%	6%
GR10	36%	53%	17%
GR11	33%	32%	-1%
GR12	29%	40%	11%

Female Density Change – 2018 to 2019

Grade	Female Density		2019 vs 2018
	2018	2019	% change
GR9	53%	55%	2%
GR10	58%	53%	-5%
GR11	35%	32%	-3%
GR12	45%	40%	-5%

Females in Lower Grade Roles

Context: The gender pay gap is partly caused by high female population density in the lowest paid roles, eg. Cleaner, Pupil Support.

Over the Longer Term...(2011 – 2019)

Since 2011 we've observed an increase in female density (and a decrease in male density) in GR1, GR2 and GR3 roles.

GR4 experienced an increase in male population density between 2011 and 2019.

Over the Shorter Term... (2018 – 2019)

Comparison of 2018 and 2019 data shows there were increases in female density at GR1, GR2 and GR3 and a decrease in female density at GR4 and GR5.

Consideration of the trends observed since 2011 and 2018/19 suggests that occupational segregation trends are moving in the wrong direction, with an increasing female population in the lowest pay quartile. This trend will be one of our key priorities to understand and develop strategies to address this over the medium term.

Female Density Change – 2011 to 2019

Grade	Female Density		2019 vs 2011
	2011	2019	% change
GR1	78%	79%	1%
GR2	72%	78%	6%
GR3	70%	79%	10%
GR4	70%	63%	-7%

Female Density Change – 2018 to 2019

Grade	Female Density		2019 vs 2018
	2018	2019	% change
GR1	77%	79%	2%
GR2	76%	78%	2%
GR3	75%	79%	4%
GR4	67%	63%	-4%

Males into Traditionally Female Roles

Analysis at the job level identifies some increased male population density in traditionally female roles:

- Analysis of the GR4 Social Care Worker population (671 FTE) shows an increase in male density from 12% in 2011 to 15% in 2019
- Analysis of the Pupil Support population (797 FTE) at GR3 shows an increase in male density from 4% in 2011 to 7% in 2019
- Analysis of the Cleaner population (334 FTE) at GR1 shows an increase in male density from 29% in 2011 to 31% in 2019

Females into Traditionally Male Roles

Analysis at the job level identifies some increased female population density in traditionally male roles:

- Analysis of the Facilities Technician population (150 FTE) shows a decrease in male density from 98% in 2011 to 88% in 2019
- Analysis of the Gardener population (104 FTE) shows a decrease in male density from 97% in 2011 to 95% in 2019
- Analysis of the GR4 Refuse Driver population (110 FTE) shows a marginal decrease in male density from 100% in 2011 to 99% in 2019
- Analysis of the GR3 Cleansing Operative population (203 FTE) shows a decrease in male density from 99% in 2011 to 97% in 2019

Drivers for Change to Female Density in Senior Grades 18/19

Analysis of recruitment, selection and leaver data at the senior level provides us with some key insight into the drivers for reduced female density in senior grades over the last 12 months. Of the total applicants for roles at the senior level, 34% were female and 66% were male. Our resourcing strategy looks to establish effective mechanisms to attract more females to senior roles – from both the internal organisation workforce and the external market.

Of the total new appointments made in the 12 months up to March 2019, 54% were female and 46% were male. This tells us that although lower numbers of females applied for senior roles with the organisation, females were equally as successful as males in terms of selection and appointment at the senior level. This analysis perhaps supports the assertion that females are less likely than males to put themselves forward for senior roles.

Despite more females being appointed to senior roles than males in the last year, more females roles were deleted as a result of organisational reviews (with employees taking voluntary redundancy), and this has driven down the overall female population density at the senior level. This will be monitored to identify whether there is an emerging trend.

Recruitment & Selection to Senior Graded Roles

	Job Applications & Appointments 18/19	
Grade	Female Applicants	Female Appointments
GR9	42% (104)	50% (8)
GR10	41% (61)	67% (5)
GR11	24% (43)	50% (1)
GR12	21% (14)	50% (1)

Leavers from Senior Graded Roles Deleted at Org Review

Grade	Female VR Leavers
GR9	-
GR10	100%*
GR11	100%*
GR12	-

*Data set too small too report

Drivers for Change to Female Density in Low Graded Roles 18/19

Analysis of recruitment, selection and leaver data for lower graded roles shows that the applicants for GR1-GR4 roles between April 18 and March 19 were predominantly female.

Of the total new appointments made in the 12 months up to March 2019, 74% were female and 24% were male, although this varies marginally by grade, with lower numbers of female appointments being made at the GR4 level.

Our resourcing strategy looks at approaches to increasing diversity and attracting new types of populations into traditionally female or male roles.

Note – applicant and appointment data might not reflect like for like population and data (e.g. appointments made in April 18 won't have a corresponding record in the applicant dataset as the application was received before April 18)

Recruitment & Selection to Lower Graded Roles

	Job Applications & Appointments 18/19	
Grade	Female Applicants Apr 18 – Mar 19	Female Appointments Apr 18 – Mar 19
GR1	71% (919)	79% (90)
GR2	71% (664)	79% (75)
GR3	83% (12,663)	83% (458)
GR4	67% (3,836)	57% (173)

Workforce Composition - Part Time and Full Time Populations

The overall LGE female workforce density has remained unchanged over the reporting periods. The part-time female population has reduced marginally since 2011. The full-time female population has increased marginally since 2011.

Female Population 2011	Female Population 2018	Female Population 2019
67% (9,556)	67% (9,103)	67% (9,392)

18/19 Part time gender pay gap analysis is underway and will be reviewed against 17/18 outcomes (20%)

Part Time

Part Time Female Population 2011	Part Time Female Population 2018	Part Time Female Population 2019
89% (5,590)	87% (5,325)	87% (5,294)

Full Time

Full Time Female Population 2011	Full Time Female Population 2018	Full Time Female Population 2019
50% (3,952)	51% (3,789)	52% (4,101)

Data analysis in this reporting focuses on the Local Government Employee group (excluding casual/supply), which has a higher pay gap than other employee groups.

Part Time Male Population 2011	Part Time Male Population 2018	Part Time Male Population 2019
11% (780)	13% (773)	13% (773)

Full Time Male Population 2011	Full Time Male Population 2018	Full Time Male Population 2019
50% (3,955)	49% (3,677)	48% (3,838)

Note that totals per year will not always match exactly, due to gaps in the employee data, e.g. contractual basis.